For discussion on 21 January 2019

Legislative Council Panel on Constitutional Affairs

An outline of the topics in the fourth report of the Hong Kong Special Administrative Region under the International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights

Purpose

This paper seeks Members' comments on the proposed outline of the topics to be included in the fourth report of the Hong Kong Special Administrative Region (HKSAR) under the International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights (ICESCR).

Application of the ICESCR in the HKSAR

2. The ICESCR was extended to Hong Kong in 1976. The provisions of the Covenant as applied to Hong Kong remain in force after the establishment of the HKSAR on 1 July 1997.

Reporting Obligation under the ICESCR

3. Under Article 16 of the ICESCR, State Parties have obligation to make reports on measures they have adopted and the progress made in achieving the observance of the rights recognized therein. The HKSAR's first report under the ICESCR was submitted to the United Nations (UN) in July 1999 and was considered by the UN Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights (the Committee) in April 2001.

4. The People's Republic of China (PRC) ratified the ICESCR on 27 March 2001. The HKSAR's second report under the ICESCR was submitted to the UN as part of China's initial report in June 2003 and considered by the Committee in April 2005. The HKSAR's third report was submitted to the UN as part of PRC's second report in June 2010 and considered by the Committee in May 2014.

5. The Central People's Government (CPG) is preparing its third report under the ICESCR. In this connection, the HKSAR Government will submit to the CPG a report on the implementation of the ICESCR in the HKSAR for incorporation into PRC's report.

Public Consultation

6. In line with the established practice, we have prepared for public consultation an outline of the topics for inclusion in the report at **Appendix**. It covers developments on the implementation of the ICESCR in the HKSAR since the Committee last examined the HKSAR's report in 2014. The purpose of the consultation is to invite members of the public to submit views on the implementation of the ICESCR in the HKSAR in respect of those topics and to suggest any additional topics that should be included in the report.

7. The public consultation on the report outline has started on 24 December 2018. We have issued the outline to relevant non-governmental organisations and other concerned groups to invite their views. The outline is also available at Home Affairs Enquiry Centres of District Offices, and in electronic form on the website of the Constitutional and Mainland Affairs Bureau at http://www.cmab.gov.hk.

8. The public consultation will close on 4 February 2019. We will consider the comments received in drafting the HKSAR report. The comments will be made available to members of the public, unless the respondents have specifically asked us to keep their views confidential.

Comments Sought

9. Members are invited to comment on the outline. We will carefully consider the views and suggestions received, including those of Members, in drafting the HKSAR report. The HKSAR report will be disseminated to the public and copies will be sent to Members.

Constitutional and Mainland Affairs Bureau January 2019

Appendix

An outline of the topics to be covered in the fourth report of the Hong Kong Special Administrative Region under the International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights

Introduction

The Government is preparing for the submission of the fourth report of the Hong Kong Special Administrative Region (HKSAR) under the United Nations (UN) International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights (the Covenant). It will form part of the third periodic report of the People's Republic of China under the Covenant.

2. In accordance with the established practice, we have prepared an outline of the report. It sets out the broad subject headings and individual topics that we plan to cover in the report. We invite members of the public to submit their views on the implementation of the Covenant in respect of those topics, and to suggest any additional topics that should be included in the report.

3. We will consider carefully all the comments and suggestions received. Any persons or organisations wishing to offer views are invited to send them to the Constitutional and Mainland Affairs Bureau (CMAB) on or before <u>4 February 2019</u>:

by post:	Team 5 Constitutional and Mainland Affairs Bureau Central Government Offices 12/F, East Wing 2 Tim Mei Avenue, Tamar, Hong Kong
by fax:	2840 0657
by e-mail:	icescr_consultation@cmab.gov.hk

4. It is voluntary for members of the public to supply their personal data upon providing views on this outline. The submissions and personal data collected may be transferred to the relevant Government bureaux and departments for purposes directly related to the preparation of the report and subsequent follow-up actions relevant to the report. The Government bureaux and departments receiving the data may only use the data for such purposes.

5. The names and views of individuals and organisations who/which put forth submissions in response to this outline ("respondents") may be published for public viewing or otherwise made available for public inspection, including being uploaded to the Internet. We may, either in discussion with others, whether privately or publicly, or in any subsequent report, cite comments submitted in response to this outline.

6. To safeguard respondents' data privacy, we will remove respondents' relevant data (<u>other than</u> names), such as residential/return addresses, email addresses, identity card numbers, telephone numbers, facsimile numbers and signatures, where provided, when publishing their submissions.

7. We will respect the wish of respondents to remain anonymous and/or keep the views confidential in part or in whole. If the respondents request anonymity in the submissions, their names will be removed when publishing their views. If the respondents request confidentiality, their submissions will not be published. If the respondents do not request anonymity or confidentiality in their submissions, it will be assumed that the respondents can be named and the views can be published in their entirety.

8. Any respondent providing personal data in the submission to this Bureau will have rights of access and correction with respect to such personal data. Any requests for data access or correction of personal data should be made in writing through the channels mentioned in paragraph 3 above to Assistant Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs (5A).

9. The text of the Covenant and the relevant statement on the application of the Covenant to the HKSAR are available on the CMAB website: <u>http://www.cmab.gov.hk/doc/en/documents/policy_responsibilities/icescr.doc</u>.

10. References to "the previous report" are to the report of the HKSAR submitted by the Central People's Government (CPG) in June 2010 and considered by the UN Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights (the Committee) in May 2014. A copy of the previous report is available on the CMAB website: <u>https://www.cmab.gov.hk/en/issues/prc_3.htm</u>. References to "the second report" are to the report of the HKSAR submitted by the CPG in June 2003 and considered by the Committee in April 2005, available at: <u>https://www.cmab.gov.hk/en/issues/culturalrights_report.htm</u>. References to "the initial report" are to the report of the HKSAR submitted in July 1999 and considered by the Committee in April 2001, available at: <u>https://www.cmab.gov.hk/en/issues/human2.htm</u>.

The Report

- 11. The fourth report will mainly consist of
 - (a) information/explanations about any significant developments since the submission of the previous report in 2010;
 - (b) updates of developments that were ongoing at the time the Committee considered the previous report in 2014 and in respect of which we have undertaken to inform the Committee of future progress or outcomes; and
 - (c) responses to the concerns and recommendations raised in the Committee's Concluding Observations on the previous report (the Concluding Observations) (reproduced at the **Annex**).

12. In suggesting additional topics to be included in the report, please indicate why those issues are significant and relevant to the application of the Covenant in Hong Kong. Respondents may also set out their views on the Government's handling of such issues.

Part I: Common Core Document of the Hong Kong Special Administrative Region (HKSAR)

13. The "Common Core Document" part follows the standard format, form and content as prescribed by the Harmonised Guidelines on Reporting under the International Human Rights Treaties of the United Nations. The Guidelines are available at <u>http://www.ohchr.org/Documents/HRBodies/TB/HRI-GEN-2-REV-6_en.doc</u>. This part of the report contains information of a general and factual nature relating to the implementation of human right treaties in the HKSAR.

Part II: Information in relation to Articles 1 to 15 of the Covenant

14. This part of the report contains specific information relating to the implementation of Articles 1 to 15 in Parts I, II and III of the Covenant in the HKSAR.

Article 1: Progress and development of democracy

15. We will inform the Committee of the implementation of "one country, two systems" and the independence of the Judiciary in the HKSAR.

We will inform the Committee of the progress and development of democracy in the HKSAR.

Article 2: Progressive realisation of the rights recognised in the Covenant and the exercise of those rights without discrimination

16. We will update the Committee of significant developments in respect of Article 2, including –

- Discrimination Law Review
- Implementation of Race Discrimination Ordinance (Cap. 602)
- Discrimination on the grounds of sexual orientation and gender identity
- Discrimination on the ground of age
- Protection for persons with disabilities
- Non-refoulement claimants
- Human rights institution
- The Equal Opportunities Commission

17. We will respond to paragraph 39 of the Concluding Observations on the applicability of the Covenant in the HKSAR courts, paragraph 40 of the Concluding Observations on the establishment of a human rights institution, paragraph 41 of the Concluding Observations on the absence of comprehensive anti-discrimination legislation and on measures to eliminate discrimination against new arrivals and sexual minorities, and also paragraph 42 of the Concluding Observation on legislation on asylum seekers and refugees.

Article 3: Equal rights of men and women

18. We will inform the Committee that we have separately prepared HKSAR's fourth report under the Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women (CEDAW). We will also advise the Committee of developments in respect of -

- Women's Commission
- Legislative protection from sex discrimination and sexual harassment
- The "Small House Policy"

Article 4: Permissible limitations of Covenant rights; and

Article 5: Prohibition on destruction of any rights and freedoms recognised in the Covenant

19. We will inform the Committee that the position for Article 4 and Article 5 remains as reported in paragraphs 4.1 and 5.1 of the previous report. In short, the HKSAR Government does not subject the rights provided under the Covenant to any limitations other than those provided for by law (Article 4), and the HKSAR Government imposes no restrictions upon and makes no derogations from any fundamental human rights on the pretext that such rights are not recognised by the Covenant (Article 5).

Article 6: Choice of occupation and labour rights

20. We will update the Committee on significant developments in respect of -

- Employment services
- Youth employment services
- Vocational training
- Protection of employees against unreasonable dismissal
- Employment statistics
- Importation of labour
- Right to work: concerns about discrimination

Article 7: Right to enjoy just and favourable conditions of work

21. We will update the Committee on significant developments in respect of –

- Statutory Minimum Wage
- Employment protection: employees' rights and benefits
- Protection and support for foreign domestic helpers (FDHs)
- Employment protection for women
- Paternity Leave
- Safe and healthy working conditions
- Prevention of accidents and diseases in the workplace: legal protections

22. In particular, we will address paragraph 43 of the Concluding Observations on the working conditions of FDHs, including recommendations in relation to the adoption of comprehensive law to regulate domestic works, repeal of the "two-week rule" and "live-in requirement", provision of effective mechanisms for reporting abuse and exploitation and establishment of an inspection mechanism for monitoring the work conditions of FDHs.

Article 8: Right to trade union membership

23. We will advise the Committee that the position remains largely the same as mentioned in the previous report, and update the Committee on significant developments in respect of -

- Trade Unions Ordinance (Cap. 332)
- Legislative protection against anti-union discrimination under the Employment Ordinance (Cap. 57)
- Number and membership of trade unions
- Promotion of effective communication, consultation and voluntary negotiation between employers and employees
- The right to strike

24. We will respond to paragraph 44 of the Concluding Observations on trade union rights including legislation on collective bargaining.

Article 9: Right to social security

25. We will advise the Committee of significant developments in respect of -

- An overview of the social security system in Hong Kong
- Government expenditure on social security
- The Comprehensive Social Security Assistance (CSSA) Scheme
- The Social Security Allowance Scheme
- Protection of wage payment and statutory rights and benefits
- Employees' compensation
- Retirement benefits and protection

26. We will respond to paragraphs 45 and 46 of the Concluding Observations on the eligibility criteria for application under the CSSA Scheme.

Article 10: Protection of the family

27. We will update the Committee of developments in respect of –

- The family and Family Council
- Commission on Children
- Welfare services for families
- Maternity protection
- Paternity leave
- New arrivals from the Mainland of China
- Single parent families and split families
- Domestic violence
- Protection of children and young persons
- Care and support for the elderly

28. We will respond to paragraph 47 of the Concluding Observations on split families in the Mainland and Hong Kong.

Article 11: Right to an adequate standard of living

29. We will advise the Committee of significant developments in the following areas –

- General economic conditions and income distribution
- The right to continuous improvement of living conditions
- The right to adequate food
- The right to water
- The right to adequate housing

30. We will also respond to paragraph 48 of the Concluding Observations on poverty alleviation measures, and also paragraph 49 on the housing situation in Hong Kong.

Article 12: The right to health

31. We will advise the Committee of significant developments in respect of -

- Health and healthcare
- Combating drug abuse
- Tobacco control
- Reducing harmful use of alcohol
- Food safety

- Services for persons with disabilities
- Services for persons with mental health problems
- Environment and industrial hygiene
- Occupational health

32. We will respond to paragraph 50 of the Concluding Observations on mental health policy and medical personnel in the public health sector.

Articles 13 and 14: Right to education

33. We will advise the Committee of developments in respect of the area of education, including –

- Kindergarten education
- Primary and secondary education
- Language policy biliteracy and trilingualism, and medium of instruction
- Vocational and Professional Education and Training
- Private schools
- Post-secondary education
- Adult education
- Quality Education Fund
- Qualifications Framework
- Education for non-Chinese speaking students
- Education for students with special educational needs
- Education for prison inmates
- Education for children with no right to remain in Hong Kong
- Education and qualification assessment for new arrivals from the Mainland of China
- Education for people of different sexual orientation and gender identities
- Civic education, human rights education and education against discrimination
- Cultural identity and national values
- Public education on the Basic Law

34. We will respond to paragraphs 51 and 52 of the Concluding Observations regarding the education of school-aged children of migrants and non-refoulement claimants and those belonging to ethnic minorities, as well as regarding Chinese language learning for non-Chinese speaking students.

Article 15: Right to cultural life, scientific progress and its application

35. We will update the Committee on the developments in respect of -

- Policy on culture and arts
- Access to cultural and arts activities and programmes
- Education and development of culture and arts
- Policy on heritage conservation
- Archives
- Broadcasting
- Promotion of science and technology
- Country parks and conservation areas

Constitutional and Mainland Affairs Bureau December 2018

United Nations

E/c.12/CHN/CO/2

Economic and Social Council

Distr.: General 13 June 2014

Original: English

Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights

Concluding observations on the second periodic report of China, including Hong Kong, China, and Macao, China^{***}

(Note: this document only contains extracts of paragraphs concerning the Hong Kong Special Administrative Region (HKSAR))

1. The Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights considered the second periodic report of China (E/C.12/CHN/2), including the third periodic report of Hong Kong, China (E/C.12/CHN-HKG/3), and the second periodic report of Macao, China (E/C.12/CHN-MAC/2), on the implementation of the International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights at its 17th and 18th meetings (see E/C.12/2014/SR.17–18), held on 8 May 2014, and adopted, at its 40th meeting, held on 23 May 2014, the following concluding observations.

A. Introduction

2. The Committee welcomes the timely submission of the second periodic report of the People's Republic of China, including Hong Kong, China, and Macao, China. The Committee also takes note with appreciation of the written replies which it received to its list of issues (E/C.12/CHN/Q/2/Add.1, E/C.12/CHN/Q/2/Add.2 and E/C.12/CHN/Q/2/Add.3) and welcomes the constructive dialogue held with the State party's delegation, composed of experts from many ministries, including representatives of Hong Kong, China, and Macao, China.

B. Positive aspects

6. The Committee takes note with appreciation of the measures adopted by Hong Kong, China, to promote economic, social and cultural rights, which included:

(a) The adoption of a statutory minimum wage in 2011;

(b) The establishment of the high-level Commission on Poverty in December 2012 and the introduction of the first official poverty line.

^{*} The present concluding observations comprise three parts: part one (paras. 1–38) relating to China; part two (paras. 39–52) relating to Hong Kong, China; and part three (paras. 53–60) relating to Macao, China.

^{**} Adopted by the Committee at its fifty-second session (28 April–23 May 2014).

D. Principal subjects of concern and recommendations: Hong Kong, China

Domestic applicability of the Covenant

39. The Committee notes with concern that, according to article 39 of the Basic Law of Hong Kong, China, the provisions of the Covenant as applied to Hong Kong shall be implemented through the laws of the Hong Kong Special Administrative Region. The Committee therefore notes with regret that the Covenant has not been incorporated in the legislation of the Special Administrative Region and that its provisions are thus not directly applicable by courts and tribunals.

The Committee recommends that Hong Kong, China, take all appropriate measures to incorporate the provisions of the Covenant in domestic legislation and to guarantee their direct applicability by the domestic courts.

National human rights institution

40. The Committee notes that the Equal Opportunities Commission has a limited mandate and regrets that Hong Kong, China, has not taken any further steps to establish an independent national human rights institution (art. 2.1).

The Committee urges Hong Kong, China, to establish a national human rights institution with a broad mandate to promote and protect human rights, including economic, social and cultural rights, in line with the Paris Principles, and to provide it with adequate financial and human resources.

Non-discrimination

41. The Committee is concerned about the prevalent and widespread discrimination against some disadvantaged and marginalized groups, such as migrants and internal migrants, asylum-seekers and refugees, as well as on the grounds of sexual orientation and gender identity, particularly in employment, education, health care and housing. The Committee notes with concern the absence of comprehensive anti-discrimination legislation and regrets that the Race Discrimination Ordinance does not include discrimination on the grounds of nationality, citizenship, resident status or the length of residence in Hong Kong, China (art. 2, para. 2).

The Committee recommends that Hong Kong, China, take steps to adopt comprehensive anti-discrimination legislation in compliance with article 2, paragraph 2, of the Covenant and taking into account the Committee's general comment No. 20 (2009) on non-discrimination in economic, social and cultural rights. The Committee reiterates its previous recommendation (E/C.12/1/Add.107, para. 91) and urges Hong Kong, China, to eliminate the widespread discriminatory practices against migrants and internal migrants from other parts of China. The Committee also urges Hong Kong, China, to take adequate measures to ensure that lesbians, gays, bisexual and transgender persons are able to fully enjoy their economic, social and cultural rights without any discrimination.

Refugees and asylum seekers

42. The Committee is concerned that the absence of comprehensive legislation granting protection to refugees and asylum seekers prevents them from enjoying economic, social and cultural rights, particularly in accessing legal employment, vocational training and adequate housing (arts. 6 and 11).

The Committee recommends that Hong Kong, China, adopt legislation on asylumseekers and refugees in order to improve their enjoyment of economic, social and cultural rights, granting them access to legal employment, including vocational training, and adequate housing.

Migrant domestic workers

43. The Committee is concerned about the unfavourable working conditions faced by migrant domestic workers in Hong Kong, China, particularly due to the "two-week rule", whereby migrant domestic workers have to leave the territory within two weeks upon termination of their contracts, as well as the requirement for migrant domestic workers to live in the employing household. The Committee regrets that Hong Kong, China, has not taken any concrete measures to repeal these rules, and that migrant domestic workers are therefore exposed to abuse and exploitation. Furthermore, the Committee is concerned about the exclusion of migrant domestic workers from the Minimum Wage Ordinance, social security and maternity leave protection (arts. 7 and 10).

The Committee recommends that Hong Kong, China:

(a) Adopt a comprehensive law to regulate domestic work and ensure that migrant domestic workers enjoy the same conditions as other workers regarding remuneration, protection against unfair dismissal, rest and leisure, limitation of working hours, social security and maternity leave protection;

(b) Take immediate action to repeal the two-week rule and the live-in requirement and eliminate conditions that render migrant domestic workers vulnerable to compulsory labour and sexual assault;

(c) Provide effective mechanisms for reporting abuse and exploitation in light of the difficulty some domestic workers have in accessing telecommunications services;

(d) Establish an inspection mechanism for monitoring the conditions of work of domestic workers, in particular migrant workers.

Trade union rights

44. The Committee notes with concern that, despite the recognition of the right to strike, trade unionists dismissed for participating in a strike cannot be reinstated, and can only claim for compensation. The Committee regrets that Hong Kong, China, has not adopted legislation on collective bargaining (art. 8).

The Committee strongly recommends that, in line with its obligations under article 8 of the Covenant, Hong Kong, China, take all necessary measures to amend the Employment Ordinance to allow the reinstatement of trade unionists arbitrarily dismissed for participating in trade-union activities. The Committee also recommends that Hong Kong, China, accelerate the process of adopting legislation on collective bargaining.

Residence requirement for applicants for social security

45. While noting the information provided by Hong Kong, China, on the recent ruling by the Court of Final Appeal, declaring unconstitutional the seven-year residence requirement for applicants for social security benefits under the Comprehensive Social Security Assistance Scheme, the Committee remains concerned about the limited scope of the implementation of such decision. The Committee also regrets that, under the seven-year residence requirement, new immigrants, including those from other parts of China, have been exposed to unreasonable restrictions in accessing social security benefits (art. 9).

The Committee recommends that Hong Kong, China, take all necessary measures to repeal any residence requirement for applicants under the Comprehensive Social Security Assistance Scheme, taking into account that it provides a safety net, and ensure that all individuals and families, particularly new immigrants, including those from other parts of China, have equal access to social security schemes on a non-discriminatory basis.

Comprehensive Social Security Assistance Scheme

46. The Committee is concerned that the Comprehensive Social Security Assistance Scheme may not provide adequate protection to low-income families and persons with disabilities (art. 9).

In line with its previous recommendation (E/C.12/1/Add.107, para. 96), the Committee recommends that Hong Kong, China, take immediate steps to review the eligibility criteria for the Comprehensive Social Security Assistance Scheme and to ensure that all persons in need are entitled to the benefits thereof.

Right of abode policies

47. The Committee continues to be concerned about the adverse impact of right of abode policies, which impose restrictions on residents of other parts of China with regard to obtaining residence permits, and cause many families to be separated (art. 10).

The Committee urges Hong Kong, China, to guarantee and facilitate family reunification for all citizens and permanent residents irrespective of their status or background. The Committee further urges Hong Kong, China, to remove present obstacles for mothers residing in other parts of China to obtaining residence permits to visit their children in Hong Kong, China, thereby ensuring the widest possible protection of, and assistance to, the family.

Poverty reduction and economic, social and cultural rights

48. While noting the establishment of the Commission on Poverty, an official poverty line and the Low-income Working Family Allowances, the Committee regrets that Hong Kong, China, has not adopted a comprehensive strategy or specific targets for poverty alleviation. The Committee is also concerned about the unequal distribution of wealth in Hong Kong, China (art. 11).

The Committee recommends that Hong Kong, China, formulate and implement effective policies and specific targets to reduce poverty, including by reducing inequalities in the distribution of wealth. In this regard, the Committee refers the State party to its 2001 statement on poverty and the Covenant (E/C.12/2001/10).

Adequate housing

49. The Committee is concerned about the inadequate investment of Hong Kong, China, in providing affordable and adequate housing, resulting in a high percentage of the population living in informal settlements, industrial buildings, cage-homes and bed-space apartments, which do not have adequate services and utilities (art. 11).

The Committee recommends that Hong Kong, China, adopt a human rights approach to reconstruction efforts, thereby ensuring appropriate consideration to the availability, affordability and adequacy of housing, including temporary housing for new immigrants and single applicants.

Mental health and lack of medical personnel in the public health sector

50. Despite the efforts made to improve the access to and coverage of mental health services, the Committee is concerned about the lack of a comprehensive mental health policy in Hong Kong, China. The Committee is also concerned that, despite the expansion of hospitals, there is a lack of doctors, who are absorbed into the higher-paying private health sector (art. 12).

The Committee recommends that Hong Kong, China, adopt a national mental health policy aimed at making mental health services available and accessible, in particular by adopting legislation that is in line with international standards and by training skilled personnel in this area. The Committee also recommends that Hong Kong, China, develop community-based mental health-care services. In addition, the Committee recommends that Hong Kong, China, adopt measures to provide the public health sector with a sufficient number of doctors and other medical personnel.

Access to education

51. The Committee is concerned about the information provided by Hong Kong, China, in its replies to the list of issues (E/C.12/CHN/Q/2/Add.2, para. 90) that the Education Bureau for schooling takes decisions on the school enrolment of children of migrants after consultation with the Director of Immigration. The Committee also notes with concern that, despite the measures adopted by Hong Kong, China, to ensure equal access to 12 years of free education, children of ethnic minorities continue to face discrimination in that respect (arts. 13 and 14).

The Committee recommends that Hong Kong, China, ensure, through legislative and other measures, that all children, including children of migrants, asylum-seekers and refugees and children belonging to ethnic minorities, have free access to compulsory education on an equal basis with other children. The Committee also recommends that the State party take steps to facilitate their access to secondary education.

Chinese language

52. The Committee is concerned that, despite the recent measures adopted by Hong Kong, China, on the Chinese Language Curriculum second language Learning Framework and the allocation of additional funding to support the learning of Chinese, non-Chinese speaking students continue to be de facto discriminated against in the public education system (arts. 13 and 14).

The Committee recommends that Hong Kong, China, urgently take all necessary measures to eliminate de facto discrimination against non-Chinese speaking students, including by the reallocation of resources, and to promote their access to education in mainstream schools. The Committee urges Hong Kong, China, to step up its efforts to implement legislation and policies on bilingual education at all levels of education and provide high-quality education in Chinese as a second language.

F. Other recommendations

61. The Committee notes the absence of reliable statistics that would allow for an accurate assessment of the fulfilment of economic, social and cultural rights in the State party, including Hong Kong, China, and Macao, China.

The Committee urges the State party, including Hong Kong, China, and Macao, China, to develop systematic data collection and the production and use of statistics for human rights indicators, including for economic, social and cultural rights based upon such data. In this respect, the Committee refers the State party, including Hong

E/C.12/CHN/CO/2

Kong, China, and Macao, China, to the conceptual and methodological framework for human rights indicators developed by the Office of the United Nations High Commissioner for Human Rights (HRI/MC/2008/3). The Committee requests the State party to include in its next periodic report statistical data on the enjoyment of each Covenant right, disaggregated by age, sex, ethnic origin, urban/rural population and other relevant status on an annual comparative basis.