

立法會
Legislative Council

LC Paper No. CB(1)519/19-20
(These minutes have been seen
by the Administration)

Ref : CB1/PL/DEV

Panel on Development

**Minutes of the special meeting held on
Saturday, 13 April 2019, at 9:00 am
in Conference Room 2 of the Legislative Council Complex**

Members present : Hon LEUNG Che-cheung, SBS, MH, JP (Chairman)
Hon Kenneth LAU Ip-keung, BBS, MH, JP (Deputy
Chairman)
Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, GBS, JP
Hon Tommy CHEUNG Yu-yan, GBS, JP
Hon Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung, GBS, JP
Hon CHAN Hak-kan, BBS, JP
Dr Hon Priscilla LEUNG Mei-fun, SBS, JP
Hon Mrs Regina IP LAU Suk-yee, GBS, JP
Hon Paul TSE Wai-chun, JP
Hon Michael TIEN Puk-sun, BBS, JP
Hon Frankie YICK Chi-ming, SBS, JP
Hon MA Fung-kwok, SBS, JP
Hon CHAN Chi-chuen
Hon CHAN Han-pan, BBS, JP
Hon Alice MAK Mei-kuen, BBS, JP
Dr Hon KWOK Ka-ki
Dr Hon Fernando CHEUNG Chiu-hung
Dr Hon Helena WONG Pik-wan
Dr Hon Elizabeth QUAT, BBS, JP
Ir Dr Hon LO Wai-kwok, SBS, MH, JP
Hon Alvin YEUNG
Hon Andrew WAN Siu-kin
Hon CHU Hoi-dick
Dr Hon Junius HO Kwan-yiu, JP
Hon HO Kai-ming

Hon LAM Cheuk-ting
Hon Holden CHOW Ho-ding
Hon Wilson OR Chong-shing, MH
Hon HUI Chi-fung
Hon LAU Kwok-fan, MH
Dr Hon CHENG Chung-tai
Hon Jeremy TAM Man-ho
Hon Gary FAN Kwok-wai
Hon Vincent CHENG Wing-shun, MH
Hon Tony TSE Wai-chuen, BBS

Members attending : Hon WU Chi-wai, MH
Hon YIU Si-wing, BBS
Hon SHIU Ka-fai
Hon AU Nok-hin

Members absent : Hon Tanya CHAN
Hon CHEUNG Kwok-kwan, JP

Public officers attending : **Agenda item I**

Mr Michael WONG Wai-lun, JP
Secretary for Development

Mr LAM Sai-hung, JP
Permanent Secretary for Development (Works)

Mr LIU Chun-san, JP
Under Secretary for Development

Ms Doris HO Pui-ling, JP
Deputy Secretary (Planning & Lands)¹
Development Bureau

Mr Vincent MAK Shing-cheung, JP
Deputy Secretary (Works)²
Development Bureau

Mr Jacky WU Kwok-yuen
Principal Assistant Secretary (Works)
Development Bureau

Mr Ricky LAU Chun-kit, JP
Director of Civil Engineering and Development
Department

Mr Michael FONG Hok-shing, JP
Head of the Sustainable Lantau Office
Civil Engineering and Development Department

Ms Ginger KIANG Kam-yin
Deputy Head of the Sustainable Lantau Office (Planning &
Conservation)
Civil Engineering and Development Department

Mr Robin LEE Kui-biu
Principal Project Coordinator
Civil Engineering and Development Department

Mr Ivan CHUNG Man-kit
Deputy Director of Planning/Territorial

**Attendance by
Invitation**

: Session One

Mr Kent LAM Jing-kwok

Mr Leo LEUNG Kwok-kee

Ir Martin CHEUNG Kin-keung

Ir TAM Ming-fai

Mr Andrew KWOK Chi-wah
President
The Hong Kong Registered Contractors Association

Mr Chris LEE Kai-yuen
Chairman
Contractor's Authorised Signatory Association

Ir Ringo YU Shek-man
President
The Hong Kong Institution of Engineers

張皓傑先生

Mr TONG Kang-yiu
Vice president
Hong Kong Federation of Trade Unions

Mr WONG Tin-hei

Dr Francis CHEUNG Neo-ton

Mr FUNG Kam-lam
Convenor
Peng Chau Reclamation Concern Group

Mr TSE Sai-kit
Convenor
Save Lantau Alliance

Mr CHOW Kin-keung
Chairman of Aggregate Material Committee
HK Construction Materials Association Limited

Miss FUNG Siu-yin

Mr MOK Kam-tai

Mr MOK Wai-hong

Ir Barry SUM
Chairman
The Association of Consulting Engineers of Hong Kong

Mr Ryan IP Man-ki
Head of Land and Housing Research
Our Hong Kong Foundation

Dr CHEN Hai-bo
Chairman
Hong Kong And Southern China Aggregate Association
Ltd

Mr LAU Chun-kong

Mr LAM Tsan-wing

Mr SIT Ka-keung

黎比達先生

Mr Tim CHEUNG
Director
Hong Kong Construction Sub-Contractors Association
Limited

Session Two

Mr CHAN Pui-ming

Mr KWOK Wing-kin
Chairperson
Labour Party

Ms Nicole YIK Hiu-ching

Miss YEUNG Hoi-shan
Senior Campaigner
Greenpeace

Mr YEUNG Tsz-chun

Mr CHAN Lok-chai
President
Hong Kong Bar-Bending Contractors Association

Mr CHAN Kiu-sum
President
The Association of Plastering Sub-Contractors Limited

Ms Iris HOI
President
The Hong Kong Institute of Landscape Architects

Mr WONG Chun-hay

Miss KWAN Heung-ling

Mr Lawrence NG
Hong Kong Construction Sub-Contractors Association

Mr KWAN Kit-yuen

Mr Paul ZIMMERMAN
Chief Executive Officer
Designing Hong Kong

Dr Lesly LAM Lik-shan
Executive Committee Member
Hong Kong Professionals and Senior Executives
Association

Mr YU Hon-kwan

Mr CHAN Kim-kwong

Mr LAW Pink-kwan

Mr NG Kwok-ming

Mr Eric TSE Chun-yuen

Mr Antony LO

Mr Danny NG

Mr John LEE
Vice Chairman of Industry Liaison and Membership
Special Interest Group
Smart City Consortium

Mr LEONG Kam-ho
Senior Technical Manager
The Hong Kong Construction Association, Ltd.

Mr KWOK Chung-man

Ms Cherry WONG Kin-ching
Convenor
Protect Kennedy Town Alliance

Session Three

Mr Dick LOO Kin

Mr LI Tai-yim

Mr WONG Kwan-yin

Mr Billy CHAU King-chung

Mr WONG Chun-man

Mr YUNG Ming-chau

冼雄輝先生
召集人
關注資助房屋權益大聯盟

Mr YU Kam-hung
Vice Chairman
China Real Estate Chamber of Commerce Hong Kong and
International Chapter

黃瑋璋先生

Mr CHAN Siu-fan

王宇軒先生

Mr WU Siu-ting

Mr YIP Hay-hung

Mr CHOW Luen-kiu

Mr Bryan CHUNG Y S

Ms SHIT Hang-sheong

Mr L AI Ngok-wai

Miss Michelle TSANG Ka-wai

Miss KAM Ka-ying

Miss SO Tsz-ching

Mr Benson YAU Wing-kai

Mr CHENG Hau-ki

Mr LAU Tat-pong

永遠榮譽主席

Hong Kong Small and Medium Enterprises Association

Session Four

Mr TSANG Chun-fung

Miss CHAN Ka-lam

Founder

Central Waters Concern Group

Dr Tom YAM

Mr PUNG Chun-nok

Co-Chair

The Association of Consulting Engineers of Hong Kong -
Young Members Committee

CHENG Yiu-fai

Mr TSE Kwok-chau

王潤成先生

SHUM Lok-yin

Mr SHEN Yue

Ms Stephenie SO Ying-hin

Cherry CHAN Chi-tung

Mr LEUNG Kwok-hung

Mr NG Man-yuen
Chairman
League of Social Democrats

Miss CHAN Po-ying

Miss TSUI Ho-yee

Mr LAI Sing-fun

Ms WONG Suet-mei
Assistant Conservation Officer
The Hong Kong Bird Watching Society

Mr WONG Sing-lam

Ms Jennifer QUINTON

Mr LING Ka-leung

Mr Edmond LAI

Session Five

Mr Franki CHAN Shut-ho

Mr AU Moon-tong

Mr KWONG Chun-long

Mr Frank LI

Mr Matthew WHILEY

Mr LO Kai-shing

Mr MOK Kun-ki

Prof NG Mee-kam

Mr CHING Kam-cheong

Past Chairman of HKSAR Government Civil Engineers
Association

A Group of Past Chairman of HKSAR Government Civil
Engineers Association

Mr WU Yee

Mr YEUNG Chi-shing

Mr NG Ho-yin

Mr ZHONG Wei

Mr Sam YIP Kam-lung

Convenor

Island West Dynamic Movement

Mr CHEUNG Tsz-chung

Miss FUNG Ching-yi

Ms YUEN Ka-yee

Clerk in attendance : Ms Doris LO
Chief Council Secretary (1)2

Staff in attendance : Ms Ada LAU
Senior Council Secretary (1)2

Mr Raymond CHOW
Senior Council Secretary (1)10

Mr Keith WONG
Council Secretary (1)2

Ms Christina SHIU
Legislative Assistant (1)2

Action

I Receiving public views on "Studies related to artificial islands in the central waters"

Meeting with deputations and the Administration

- (LC Paper No. CB(1)729/18-19(03) — Administration's paper on studies related to artificial islands in the central waters, Lantau Conservation Fund and work progress of the Sustainable Lantau Office
- LC Paper No. CB(1)729/18-19(04) — Paper on the development of artificial islands in the central waters prepared by the Legislative Council Secretariat (Background brief)
- LC Paper No. CB(1)803/18-19(01) — Letter dated 26 March 2019 from Hon CHU Hoi-dick
- LC Paper No. CB(1)830/18-19(01) — E-mail dated 1 April 2019 from Hon CHU Hoi-dick)

Submissions from deputations/individuals not attending the meeting

- (LC Paper No. CB(1)846/18-19(68) — Submission from Jim YEUNG (Chinese version only)
- LC Paper No. CB(1)846/18-19(69) — Submission from Chris FRASER (English version only)
- LC Paper No. CB(1)846/18-19(70) — Submission from Paul LAM (English version only)

Action

- LC Paper No. CB(1)846/18-19(71) — Submission from Mr Ronald TAYLOR (English version only)
- LC Paper No. CB(1)846/18-19(72) — Submission from Rex WONG (Chinese version only)
- LC Paper No. CB(1)846/18-19(45) — Submission from Mr CHEUNG Tat-wing (Chinese version only) (Restricted to Members)
- LC Paper No. CB(1)846/18-19(45) — Submission from Miss CHAN Wai-yan (Chinese version only) (Restricted to Members)
- LC Paper No. CB(1)846/18-19(73) — Submission from a member of the public (Chinese version only)
- LC Paper No. CB(1)846/18-19(74) — Submission from Miss LAM Kwan-pui (Chinese version only)
- LC Paper No. CB(1)846/18-19(75) — Submission from Mr Marco WU Moon-hoi (Chinese version only) (Restricted to Members)
- LC Paper No. CB(1)846/18-19(76) — Submission from a member of the public (唐偉章教授) (Chinese version only)
- LC Paper No. CB(1)846/18-19(77) — Submission from a member of the public (黃玉山教授) (Chinese version only)
- LC Paper No. CB(1)846/18-19(78) — Submission from a member of the public (潘樂陶博士) (Chinese version only)
- LC Paper No. CB(1)846/18-19(79) — Submission from a member of the public (李廣廈博士) (Chinese version only)

Action

- LC Paper No. CB(1)846/18-19(80) — Submission from a member of the public (羅康瑞先生) (Chinese version only)
- LC Paper No. CB(1)846/18-19(81) — Submission from a member of the public (張振明先生) (Chinese version only)
- LC Paper No. CB(1)846/18-19(82) — Submission from a member of the public (陳健碩工程師) (Chinese version only)
- LC Paper No. CB(1)846/18-19(83) — Submission from Dr Allan ZEMAN (English version only)
- LC Paper No. CB(1)846/18-19(84) — Submission from a member of the public (麥萃才博士) (Chinese version only)
- LC Paper No. CB(1)846/18-19(85) — Submission from a member of the public (何順文教授) (Chinese version only)
- LC Paper No. CB(1)846/18-19(86) — Submission from a member of the public (鄒廣榮教授) (Chinese version only)
- LC Paper No. CB(1)846/18-19(87) — Submission from a member of the public (李焯芬教授) (Chinese version only)
- LC Paper No. CB(1)846/18-19(88) — Submission from Mr LAU Chak-pong (Chinese version only)
- LC Paper No. CB(1)846/18-19(89) — Submission from Mr James LEONG (English version only)
- LC Paper No. CB(1)846/18-19(90) — Submission from Miss Koby WONG Lok-yin (Chinese version only) (Restricted to Members)

Action

- LC Paper No. CB(1)846/18-19(91) — Submission from a member of the public (劉瀾昌博士) (Chinese version only)
- LC Paper No. CB(1)846/18-19(92) — Submission from a member of the public (梁紀昌先生) (Chinese version only)
- LC Paper No. CB(1)846/18-19(93) — Submission from Robert FOTI (English version only)
- LC Paper No. CB(1)846/18-19(94) — Submission from a group of civil engineering graduates (1975) of The University of Hong Kong (Chinese version only)
- LC Paper No. CB(1)846/18-19(95) — Submission from The Hong Kong Federation of Electrical and Mechanical Contractors Limited (English version only)
- LC Paper No. CB(1)846/18-19(96) — Submission from Hong Kong Green Schools Alliance (English version only)
- LC Paper No. CB(1)846/18-19(97) — Submission from a deputation (關注基層房屋編配問題小組) (Chinese version only)
- LC Paper No. CB(1)846/18-19(98) — Submission from Ms Louise PRESTON (English version only)
- LC Paper No. CB(1)846/18-19(99) — Submission from Mr Mike WONG Ka-kit (Chinese version only) (Restricted to Members)
- LC Paper No. CB(1)846/18-19(100) — Submission from Sr YU Lap-chu (Chinese version only)
- LC Paper No. CB(1)846/18-19(101) — Submission from The Hong Kong Institute of Architects

Action

- LC Paper No. CB(1)846/18-19(102) — Submission from Mr K CHAU (Chinese version only) (Restricted to Members)
- LC Paper No. CB(1)846/18-19(103) — Submission from Mr K FUNG (Chinese version only) (Restricted to Members)
- LC Paper No. CB(1)846/18-19(104) — Submission from Ms Connie CHAN (English version only) (Restricted to Members)
- LC Paper No. CB(1)846/18-19(105) — Submission from Mr Stephen MAK (English version only) (Restricted to Members)
- LC Paper No. CB(1)846/18-19(106) — Submission from Mr Francis KUNG (English version only) (Restricted to Members)
- LC Paper No. CB(1)846/18-19(107) — Submission from Mr Clifford PHUNG (English version only) (Restricted to Members)
- LC Paper No. CB(1)846/18-19(108) — Submission from Mr Roger LEE (English version only) (Restricted to Members)
- LC Paper No. CB(1)846/18-19(109) — Submission from Institution of Public Private Partnerships (English version only)
- LC Paper No. CB(1)846/18-19(110) — Submission from Ms Aarushi BAHL (English version only)
- LC Paper No. CB(1)846/18-19(111) — Submission from Logie Group Limited (English version only)
- LC Paper No. CB(1)846/18-19(112) — Submission from Robert CLARK (English version only)

Action

- LC Paper No. CB(1)846/18-19(113) — Submission from Ben JONES (English version only)
- LC Paper No. CB(1)846/18-19(114) — Submission from Adam CHEN (English version only)
- LC Paper No. CB(1)846/18-19(115) — Submission from Nedim (English version only)
- LC Paper No. CB(1)846/18-19(116) — Submission from a group of members of the public expressing concerns on the studies (English version only)
- LC Paper No. CB(1)846/18-19(117) — Submission from Construction Industry Council (English version only)
- LC Paper No. CB(1)846/18-19(122) — Submission from a deputation (香港中醫藥膳專業學會) (Chinese version only)
- LC Paper No. CB(1)846/18-19(123) — Submission from Ir CHENG Kin-wah (English version only)
- LC Paper No. CB(1)868/18-19(29) — Submission from WWF-Hong Kong
- LC Paper No. CB(1)868/18-19(30) — Submission from M K TSE (English version only)
- LC Paper No. CB(1)868/18-19(31) — Submission from a member of the public (陳祉杰) (Chinese version only)
- LC Paper No. CB(1)868/18-19(32) — Submission from a member of the public (何肇偉) (Chinese version only)
- LC Paper No. CB(1)868/18-19(33) — Submission from a member of the public (游志龍) (Chinese version only)
- LC Paper No. CB(1)868/18-19(34) — Submission from a member of the public (李詠儀) (Chinese version only)
- LC Paper No. CB(1)868/18-19(35) — Submissions from a number of the same content from members of

Action

the public (only one of these submissions is enclosed) (Chinese version only) (Restricted to Members))

Members noted the above submissions from deputations/individuals not attending the meeting, and the following submissions tabled at the meeting:

- (a) Submission from Howie WAN Ho-yin (English version only);
- (b) Submission from Clara LUI Man-ki (English version only);
- (c) Submission from K T HUNG (English version only); and
- (d) Submission from Eric WONG (Chinese version only).

(Post-meeting note: The submissions tabled at the meeting were circulated to members vide LC Paper Nos. CB(1)892/18-19(18) to (21) by email on 15 April 2019.)

Meeting arrangements

2. The Chairman advised that the meeting would be conducted in five sessions with a five-minute break between the sessions, and a lunch break between 12:55 pm and 2:00 pm. Each deputation/individual would be given three minutes to present their views on "Studies related to artificial islands in the central waters" ("the Study").

Session One

Presentation of views by deputations/individuals

3. At the invitation of the Chairman, 25 deputations/individuals presented their views. A summary of their views was in the **Appendix**.

The responses of the Administration

4. The Secretary for Development ("SDEV") made the following key responses to the views of deputations and individuals:

Action

- (a) according to the initial assessment of the "Hong Kong 2030+: Towards a Planning Vision and Strategy Transcending 2030" study ("Hong Kong 2030+ Study") promulgated in 2016, the total housing demand for 30 years up to 2046 was estimated to be about one million units, while some 300 000 private housing units would be aged 70 years or above. In the interim, the Administration's major land supply initiatives including rezoning of sites and development of New Development Areas ("NDAs") could provide over 610 000 units. Taking into account those built-back from private redevelopment of aged buildings, there would be a shortage of about 300 000 units for meeting the housing demand;
- (b) the proposed development of artificial islands around Kau Yi Chau ("KYC Artificial Islands") could create some 1 000 hectares ("ha") of land within a relatively controllable timeframe, and address the housing shortage by supplying about 150 000 to 260 000 housing units, 70% of which being public housing. The number of about 105 000 to 182 000 public housing units to be provided on the KYC Artificial Islands would be comparable to the total number of about 130 000 public housing units to be provided altogether under the Kwu Tung North/Fanling North ("KTN/FLN") NDAs, Hung Shui Kiu /Ha Tsuen ("HSK/HT") NDA, Yuen Long South Development Area and Tung Chung New Town Extension ("TCNTE"). As a comparison, the New Territories North ("NTN") development was preliminarily expected to provide a total development area of about 720 ha;
- (c) there were about 1 300 ha of brownfield sites in the New Territories ("NT"), around 540 ha of which had already been covered by some large-scale development projects in the pipeline. As for the remaining 760 ha, the Planning Department ("PlanD") would identify plots having potential for public housing development. However, as the existing brownfield sites were being used for various economic activities, it should not under-estimate the costs and difficulties involved in the development of brownfield sites, whilst over-estimate the effectiveness of such option in increasing housing land supply;
- (d) the Administration considered the reclamation and infrastructure development for the KYC Artificial Islands a

Action

long-term investment and making profits by selling land thereon was not the intention of taking forward the projects. Nevertheless, to allay the public concern that the proposed development of artificial islands would deplete the fiscal reserve, the Administration, on an exceptional basis, had provided a ballpark construction estimate (in the order of \$624 billion in September 2018 prices) of the key projects under the Lantau Tomorrow Vision ("LTV") and the estimate of the land sale revenue to be generated from the KYC Artificial Islands of about \$700 billion to \$800 billion (based on lower-bound parameter) with reference to the estimate of Hong Kong Institute of Surveyors ("HKIS");

- (e) in the Railway Development Strategy 2014, the Coastal Railway between Tuen Mun and Tsuen Wan was not recommended to be implemented due to insufficient patronage in the middle section. Yet, the new population intake of about 400 000 to 700 000 on the KYC Artificial Islands would provide a stronger case for the development of a coastal rail link between Tuen Mun and the urban areas, thereby relieving the traffic pressure in the Northwest NT;
- (f) the KYC Artificial Islands would provide land which was close to the urban areas. Such new land would facilitate the large-scale redevelopment of old districts and provide an opportunity to thin out the dense population in urban areas; and
- (g) in the face of the impact of climate change, the KYC Artificial Islands were expected to be built 6 to 7 metres above Principal Datum. It was worth noting that the said level was even higher than the Hong Kong International Airport ("HKIA") which was also built on reclaimed land and HKIA had been able to withstand extreme weather events including the threat of Super Typhoon Mangkhut. Furthermore, according to the Hong Kong Institution of Engineers, well proven engineering techniques such as placing wave breakers or building higher sea walls were among the feasible measures to address the concern over storm surges and wave impact.

Action

Discussion

5. The Chairman reminded members that in accordance with Rule 83A of the Rules of Procedure of the Legislative Council ("LegCo"), they should disclose the nature of any direct or indirect pecuniary interests relating to the subjects under discussion at the meeting before they spoke on the subjects.

Effectiveness of the development of artificial islands in increasing land and housing supply

6. Mr HUI Chi-fung disbelieved that the Administration could guarantee the provision of affordable housing for the public on the KYC Artificial Islands given the high land value there and no change to the high land price policy, and opined that the development of the KYC Artificial Islands would only benefit those private developers. He requested the Administration to directly respond to the view of some deputations that the Administration was fooling the public.

7. SDEV said that the Administration was not fooling the public. In fact, the preliminary estimation by HKIS on the land value of the private residential and commercial development on the KYC Artificial Islands in the order of \$10 000 to \$12 000 per square foot ("sq ft") and \$8 000 to \$9 000 per sq ft respectively was rather conservative. The Administration hoped to gradually stabilize private property prices by increasing land and housing supply. Importantly, 70% of housing units on the KYC Artificial Islands were for public housing. Meanwhile, the Administration had been taking forward some new initiatives to address the housing problem, including delinking the pricing of the Home Ownership Scheme ("HOS") flats from the market prices of private housing and using the median monthly household income as the reference point.

8. Dr CHENG Chung-tai considered that the discussion on the proposed development of the KYC Artificial Islands was self-deceptive if not underpinned by an examination of the population policy. He said that taking into account the new arrivals of over a million of Mainland residents through the One-way Permit ("OWP") Scheme and other admission schemes since the return of sovereignty in 1997 alone, the capacity of the KYC Artificial Islands to accommodate a population of 400 000 to 700 000 would be far from adequate.

Action

9. In view of the diverse views in the society over reclamation and its environmental impact, Dr Priscilla LEUNG hoped that all parties could build consensus through rational discussion. She considered that it was incumbent upon the Administration to take into account the impact of demographic changes (e.g. declining birth rate and ageing population) in land use planning and the provision of suitable infrastructure including convenient transport facilities. Yet, she could not agree with suggestion of reducing the 150 daily quota under the OWP Scheme as this was meant for family reunion. She also enquired about the feasibility of developing artificial islands in the waters around Tung Lung Island, and why the Administration considered the central waters a better option for developing artificial islands than the waters around Tung Lung Island.

10. Ms Alice MAK and Mr SHIU Ka-fai held that to solve the acute land shortage problem, a multi-pronged approach should be adopted to increase land supply by reclaiming new land and in parallel pressing ahead with other initiatives such as developing brownfield sites and tapping into the agricultural land reserve through public-private partnership.

11. Ms Alice MAK disagreed with some views saying that the proposed development of the KYC Artificial Islands was dumping money into the sea. She called on the Administration to explain more to the public that the proposed development was a worthy social investment for the future development of Hong Kong, instead of overly focusing on a full cost recovery.

12. Mr SHIU Ka-fai took the view that with an increase in land supply, the Government would have better bargaining power in the negotiation with private developers on the resumption of idle agricultural land hoarded by the latter. Pointing out that reclamation had long been used in Hong Kong for creating new land for development, Mr SHIU disagreed with those opposing views that might have worried too much about the adverse environmental/ecological impact of the proposed reclamation.

13. Mrs Regina IP agreed with the Administration that reclamation could be a simpler means to increase land supply comparing with NDAs which usually involved the complicated issues of land resumption and compensation. Yet, she urged the Administration to make more efforts to instill public confidence in the proposed development of the KYC Artificial Islands, given the wide public concerns that the development would suffer serious cost overruns and delays just like some other large-scale infrastructure and railway projects. Furthermore, she called on the Administration to consider giving priority to Hong Kong residents in

Action

the purchase of the private housing flats on the artificial islands to keep the property prices there at a reasonable level, and plan comprehensively for the provision of suitable community facilities there.

14. Mr CHU Hoi-dick considered that the Administration should be more scientific in planning, and state clearly the updated projection of land demand and the strategies to address the land shortage of about 800 ha up to 2026, etc. in order to facilitate members to consider the priority of various land supply options including the development of LTV. He expressed his view that before implementing universal suffrage for the selection the Chief Executive and election of all members of LegCo, favoritism towards large developers in government policies and real estate hegemony would not change.

Scope of the studies related to artificial islands in the central waters

15. Mr Tony TSE enquired whether the Study would comprehensively examine how to develop the artificial islands into a liveable community, instead of simply focusing on the feasibility and technical matters as for a general infrastructure project. Mr TSE also asked if the contract for the Study would be awarded by way of separate tenders with a view to seeking independent expert advice from several consultants specialized in the relevant fields or just under a single tender.

16. SDEV advised that the Study would not simply look into the technical matters and cost of the proposed development of the artificial islands. Instead, a people-oriented planning approach would be adopted and a multi-disciplinary team, comprising engineering, planning and other expertise, would be required for the Study.

[During the first session, the Chairman ordered removal of a representative of a deputation and an individual from the meeting after they had repeatedly interrupted the meeting despite the Chairman's warnings.]

Session Two

Presentation of views by deputations/individuals

17. At the invitation of the Chairman, 25 deputations/individuals presented their views. A summary of their views was in the **Appendix**.

Action

The responses of the Administration

18. In addition to points made in Session One, SDEV made the following key responses to the views of deputations and individuals:

- (a) the development of brownfield sites would take time for planning works involving changes of the existing land uses and the difficulty to relocate affected economic activities. Reclamation was the only way to create new land that did not require relocation of existing occupants/operations;
- (b) the KYC Artificial Islands would be developed into a near carbon-neutral community with ample open spaces and smart city infrastructure, as well as sufficient employment opportunities for the local residents. As many new development projects were concentrated in NT, the proposed development of artificial islands could help relieve the population and development pressure in NT and provide space for better land use planning in NT; and
- (c) the Study would be conducted under a streamlined process in order to be completed within 42 months, yet there was no room for further compressing the schedule. The Study would include a detailed planning and engineering ("P&E") study and an environmental impact assessment ("EIA"). Development proposals under the P&E study would require Environmental Permits ("EPs") for their construction and operation.

Discussion

Effectiveness of the development of artificial islands and other land supply options in increasing land and housing supply

19. Dr Junius HO indicated support for reclamation to create new land, and suggested that the Administration should in parallel tap into the land reserve in NT by resuming land at a reasonable price and re-introducing the type of NT land exchange entitlements that was commonly known as "Letter B", as well as providing temporary housing units near Lok Ma Chau.

20. Mr Holden CHOW considered that reclamation would be a faster way to create a large piece of land to address land shortage than some other land supply options like urban renewal and developing brownfield sites.

Action

He supported taking forward the Study, but considered it incumbent upon the Administration to enhance communication with fishermen groups and appropriately compensate them for the loss of fishing grounds due to reclamation. Taking the opportunity of developing the artificial islands, he considered that the Administration should at the same time improve the north-south transport connection of Lantau as well as the connection between Lantau and the urban areas.

21. Ir Dr LO Wai-kwok pointed out that reclamation had long been an important source of land supply in Hong Kong over the years. A large extent of about 7 000 ha of land had been formed by reclamation, the pace of which had however slowed down in recent decades. The TCNTE project was a rare large-scale reclamation project implemented for housing development in recent years. Ir Dr LO considered that the Administration should formulate forward-looking strategy to increase land supply by reclamation with a view to meeting future development needs including in particular the housing need of the next generation. He also asked whether the Administration would re-consider developing areas on the periphery of country parks for public housing and other public purposes.

22. SDEV said that in light of the lack of majority support in the community for the development of country park periphery and given that this option would likely involve more hurdles and complexities compared with the other medium-to-long term options as pointed out by the Task Force on Land Supply ("TFLS"), the Administration at this stage would not further pursue alternative land use of country park periphery. The Administration had asked the Hong Kong Housing Society not to proceed further with its study on the feasibility of such development at two pilot sites after the completion of those fact-finding tasks already commenced.

23. To allay public concerns over the cost of developing the KYC Artificial Islands, Mr SHIU Ka-fai called on the Administration to clearly state whether the cost required for the reclamation and infrastructure development could be recovered through the sale of private residential and commercial land thereon; and if so, the proposed development of artificial islands should not be considered dumping money into the sea, not to mention that the development would bring about various benefits, such as development of new industries, etc.

24. SDEV responded that the development cost of the KYC Artificial Islands could be recovered through the sale of land on the islands as the ballpark construction cost estimate for the key projects under LTV was in

Action

the order of \$624 billion in September 2018 prices, whereas the estimate of the land sale revenue to be generated from the artificial islands would be around \$700 billion to \$800 billion. The land sale revenue estimate was based on the lower-bound of the preliminary planning parameter for private residential development and had not yet taken into account the economic value of land for public housing development. Upon full development of the KYC Artificial Islands, it was crudely estimated that the commercial and retail space thereon would generate around \$141 billion in 2018 prices of value-added each year.

25. Mr AU Nok-hin opined that the Administration should fully explain why it was absolutely necessary to go for reclamation while there were other available land supply options. For example, consideration could also be given to the implication of the recent ruling of the Court of First Instance of the High Court on a judicial review of the Small House Policy that the housing development potential of about 900 ha of land zoned for "Village Type Development" could possibly be unleashed to meet the land shortage of about 800 ha up to 2026. Mr AU also urged the Administration to carefully consider that the increasing import price of marine sand for reclamation would cause a significant increase in the final cost for the KYC Artificial Islands over the long construction period. Furthermore, the Administration should make public the details of all studies it had conducted in relation to the KYC Artificial Islands.

26. SDEV indicated that developing the East Lantau Metropolis ("ELM") artificial islands to provide about 1 000 ha of land was recognized by TFLS as a key initiative to resolve the problem of land shortage in the medium-to-long term. He also said that the Administration would release government information as far as practicable provided that the disclosure was in accordance with the Code on Access to Information and excluded sensitive commercial information.

27. Mr WU Chi-wai was disappointed that the Administration had chosen to invest considerable amount of resources to press ahead with the development of the controversial KYC Artificial Islands, but was slow in taking forward the less controversial option of near-shore reclamation outside Victoria Harbour for supplying land within a shorter time. While the Administration had claimed that the development of the KYC Artificial Islands could help thin out the dense population in urban areas, Mr WU asked whether the Administration had formulated corresponding urban renewal and relocation strategies to dovetail with the proposed development, so as to ensure that the tiny and cramped living space in particular in dilapidated urban areas could be improved and more

Action

affordable housing units could be provided to the public on the KYC Artificial Islands and in other districts as well.

28. SDEV replied that the Administration had proposed to take forward detailed studies for the near-shore reclamation projects at Lung Kwu Tan, Siu Ho Wan and Sunny Bay, and these sites would mainly be used for non-housing purposes. The Administration intended to seek funding approval from LegCo for the relevant studies in end-2019. On urban renewal, the Urban Renewal Authority was conducting a holistic urban renewal study (i.e. the Yau Mong District Study) which was expected to be completed by end 2019 or early 2020. The study results would provide a useful basis for the Administration in reviewing and updating the Urban Renewal Strategy promulgated since 2011. That said, it should be noted that land supply would be the key to facilitating urban renewal.

29. Mr CHU Hoi-dick pointed out that the Administration had in the past taken forward various initiatives including the "Metroplan" to deal with the problems associated with the densely populated urban areas, yet no substantial results were seen by the public. He opined that the public had lost confidence in the Administration under the current political structure to ensure a fair distribution of land and housing resources based on public aspirations. He queried that the Administration was taking the more difficult path of developing the KYC Artificial Islands, yet there were easier options available for increasing land supply. Mr CHU further asked for a breakdown of the estimated total housing demand of about one million units up to 2046.

30. SDEV advised that the estimated total housing demand of about one million units from the initial assessment of the Hong Kong 2030+ Study was based on, amongst others, the projection on number of households made by the Census and Statistics Department, number of households displaced by redevelopments and other factors such as number of households living in inadequate housing and transient population.

31. Expressing support for the approach of creating land by reclamation, Dr Priscilla LEUNG followed up her earlier enquiry on the feasibility of developing artificial islands in the waters around Tung Lung Island. Given the massive scale of and the broad policy areas involved in the development of LTV, Dr LEUNG doubted whether the Development Bureau alone would be sufficient to play a leading role in carrying forward the LTV project. She asked whether a steering committee chaired by a Secretary would be established to coordinate the work of various government bureaux on the project.

Action

32. SDEV advised that Tung Lung Island had not been included among the 48 potential reclamation sites identified in the "Enhancing Land Supply Strategy: Reclamation outside Victoria Harbour and Rock Cavern Development" study conducted in 2011. As far as he understood, waters around Tung Lung Island might not be a suitable site for reclamation, given that it was geographically remote from other developments and transport infrastructure and hence with lower potential for creating synergy. To strengthen co-ordination of land supply strategy and initiatives from a high level, the Steering Committee on Land Supply chaired by the Financial Secretary had been expanded to include Directors of Bureaux. The progress of development of the KYC Artificial Islands, alongside other major land supply initiatives, would be monitored by the Steering Committee.

Scope of the studies related to artificial islands in the central waters

33. Mr Tony TSE asked if the Study would explore ways for preserving natural resources and facilitating urban renewal. SDEV replied that the Study would include an EIA to identify environmental mitigation and compensation measures. Also, the proposed development of artificial islands would provide solution space for redevelopment in the urban areas.

34. Ir Dr LO Wai-kwok enquired whether the Study would strategically examine the feasibility of further reclamation in the long run. SDEV advised that the Study would include collection of information on waters within and in the vicinity of the possible artificial islands near Hei Ling Chau and Cheung Chau South for future reference in long-term planning, but there was no specific implementation timetable on these possible artificial islands at the moment.

[The Deputy Chairman took the chair at the remaining sessions of the meeting in the absence of the Chairman.]

Session Three

Presentation of views by deputations/individuals

35. At the invitation of the Deputy Chairman, 22 deputations/individuals presented their views. A summary of their views was in the **Appendix**.

Action

The responses of the Administration

36. In addition to points made in previous sessions, SDEV made the following key responses to the views of deputations and individuals:

- (a) to promote Hong Kong's long-term economic growth, there was a genuine need to develop the third Core Business District ("CBD") at the KYC Artificial Islands. This would provide vast commercial floor area to address the shortage of Grade A office space in traditional CBDs, and high value-added employment opportunities for the local residents;
- (b) the development of the KYC Artificial Islands and supporting transport infrastructures could enhance the transport network not only for the artificial islands but also Northwest NT, thereby facilitating improvement in the overall traffic distribution in the territory;
- (c) the Study would include a detailed P&E study and an EIA. Development proposals under the P&E study that involved designated projects under the Environmental Impact Assessment Ordinance (Cap. 499) ("EIAO") would require EPs for their construction and operation with implementation of environmental mitigation measures; and
- (d) as brownfield sites in Hong Kong were mostly privately owned, development of brownfield sites would involve land resumption and compensation. The cost of resuming brownfield sites at about \$1,400 per sq ft (excluding compensation for eligible business undertakings), making reference to Zone A ex-gratia compensation rate, was not much lower than the cost estimate for reclamation of KYC Artificial Islands.

Discussion

Environmental implications of the reclamation proposal

37. Mr Tony TSE was concerned that large-scale reclamation for the development of artificial islands might cause adverse impact to the ecology of the central waters, and asked whether relevant EIA would be conducted under the Study.

Action

38. Mr SHIU Ka-fai pointed out that the central waters were not ecologically sensitive area, and not a habitat for the Chinese white dolphins. He considered that reclamation at the central waters would not have severe ecological impact.

39. SDEV responded that the Study comprised a detailed P&E study for the KYC Artificial Islands which was a designated project under EIAO. EIA would be carried out and development proposals under the P&E study that involved designated projects under EIAO would require EPs for their construction and operation. He supplemented that the Sunshine Island, which was a known habitat for Bogadek's Burrowing Lizard, was not within the proposed reclamation area.

Financial implications

40. Mr Tony TSE urged the Administration to provide a detailed explanation about the financial implications of LTV to address public concerns that the excessive cost of the projects under LTV would deplete Hong Kong's fiscal reserve, and the cost of the projects might further increase due to cost overruns.

41. SDEV said that the Administration had exceptionally provided the ballpark construction cost estimate (in the order of \$624 billion in September 2018 prices) of the key projects under LTV. As the projects would span over a couple of decades and move forward in phases, it was expected that the construction costs of projects under LTV would be around \$40 to \$50 billion a year on average, and hence would not pose undue financial burden to the Government. On the concern over possible cost overruns, SDEV advised that while there was a 100% increase in the Civil Engineering Works Tender Price Index from 2007 to 2015 and the index showed a drop of about 25% from 2015 to 2017. The Administration would continue to take forward various initiatives to enhance cost management and performance of public works projects.

Duration of the studies relating to artificial islands in the central waters

42. Dr Junius HO and Mr SHIU Ka-fai opined that it would be taking too long for the Administration to complete the Study in 42 months. In order not to delay the commencement of the projects under LTV, they urged the Administration to explore shortening the time required for the Study. Mr Tony TSE also suggested the Administration to explore ways to expedite the land creation process when conducting the Study.

Action

43. SDEV noted members' views, yet, he pointed out that the detailed P&E study for the KYC Artificial Islands was procedurally indispensable and there was no room for further compressing the schedule. If the Study could be commenced as scheduled and completed in mid-2023, the first phase of reclamation works could be commenced in 2025.

44. Mr Tony TSE asked whether the Administration would give priority consideration to local companies when hiring consultants to undertake the Study. SDEV responded that pursuant to the rules set out in the Agreement on Government Procurement of the World Trade Organization, the Administration would ensure open, fair and transparent conditions of competition in government procurement and would not specially accord priority to local companies in the selection.

Root causes of and solutions to the land problem

45. Mr SHIU Ka-fai expressed support to the proposed development of artificial islands in the central waters as this could create large pieces of new land to meet the long-term housing need and improve the average living space per person. He also pointed out that about 1 500 million tonnes of public fill generated locally every year could be used to reclaim about 60 ha of land, hence providing a stable source of material for reclamation.

46. Mr Andrew WAN urged the Administration to take heed of the public sentiment as reflected in a public opinion poll that about 55% of the respondents objected to LTV. He further pointed out that as the development would take decades to complete, LTV would not be a prompt remedy to address the short-term housing shortage.

47. SDEV advised that as pointed out by TFLS, there would be some 800 ha of land shortage in the short-to-medium term from 2017 to 2026. If the funding approval for the Study could be obtained from the Finance Committee within 2019, and if reclamation could start in 2025 upon the completion of the Study, the Administration expected that the first piece of land site would be ready for development in 2028 to meet housing needs in medium-to-long term.

48. Mr Andrew WAN enquired about the ratio of public and private housing supply in the new lands created under LTV. Besides, he also urged the Administration to study the use of Village Type Development sites reserved for the development of Small Houses in NT.

Action

49. SDEV responded that the Administration had no plan to reserve the new land created under LTV for low-density residential development. It was expected that the ratio of public and private housing supply in KYC Artificial Islands would be 70:30. As regards the use of sites zoned "Village Type Development", SDEV advised that as concluded by TFLS, while there were over 900 ha of unleased and unallocated government land within "Village Type Development" zones, these land were scattered across the territory, and the development potential of these land parcels was limited by factors such as location, surrounding environment and infrastructural, thus constraints, making them unsuitable for large-scale development.

50. Dr Junius HO suggested the Administration to consider re-introducing NT land exchange entitlements, commonly known as "Letters A/B", for resuming land in NT, as a means to expedite the land resumption process to address the short-term housing shortage.

51. SDEV advised that Letters A/B were issued by the Government before the 1980s to landowners in NT whose land was acquired for development, allowing an entitlement to a future grant of land. Referring to Dr Ho's suggestion, SDEV said the Administration had no plan to revive the system as there was limited supply of land nowadays to meet such commitment.

52. Mr Gary FAN opined that the Administration should have a clear population policy in place and an accurate projection on population growth when assessing the long-term need for land for housing development. He doubted that TFLS had over-estimated the population growth in the next 30 years when coming up with a conclusion in its Report that the long-term land shortage would be more than 1 200 ha.

53. SDEV responded that TFLS's assessment on the long-term land shortage was not solely based on the projection of population or household growth, but also took into account society's aspiration for more spacious living environment and the strong demand for elderly and health care facilities due to ageing population and more decanting space to speed up urban renewal in face of ageing of buildings.

The third Core Business District

54. Mr Gary FAN objected to the Administration's proposal on developing the third CBD at KYC Artificial Islands as it required huge

Action

financial resources for land reclamation works and construction of large-scale infrastructures to link up the third CBD and the traditional business districts on Hong Kong Island and in Kowloon. He opined that Administration should develop a new CBD at NDAs in NTN so as to create job opportunities for the residents in NT.

55. SDEV responded that the KYC Artificial Islands would be in close proximity to the existing two CBDs and it would take only about 10 minutes traveling to Central through the future transportation network. This strategic location was favourable for creating synergy among the CBDs. Also, the cost of providing transport infrastructures for connecting the KYC Artificial Islands to the urban areas would be relatively lower comparing to developing the third CBD in NTN, which was much farther away from Hong Kong Island and Kowloon. Meanwhile, the Administration had been actively taking forward the NDA projects, and planned to provide 150 000 and 40 000 job opportunities, which covered commercial, technology and logistics industries, at HSK/HT NDA and KTN/FLN NDAs respectively. Further, the development of the Lok Ma Chau Loop would also create new job opportunities in NT.

Session Four

Presentation of views by deputations/individuals

56. At the invitation of the Deputy Chairman, 21 deputations/individuals presented their views. A summary of their views was in the **Appendix**.

The responses of the Administration

57. In addition to points made in previous sessions, SDEV made the following key responses to the views of deputations and individuals:

- (a) the Administration would exercise rigorous cost control on the construction projects under LTV. It was worth noting that while there was a 100% increase in the Civil Engineering Works Tender Price Index from 2007 to 2015 and the index showed a drop of about 25% from 2015 to 2017. In fact, while about 10% of the public works projects incurred cost overruns, the remaining 90% were completed within budget. That said, the Administration would continue to take forward various initiatives to enhance cost management and

Action

performance of public works projects such as the implementation of Construction 2.0; and

- (b) the Administration had consulted the Central and Western District Council on the proposed strategic road between KYC Artificial Islands and Hong Kong Island. The Administration would plan carefully to ensure that the proposed transport network would not bring adverse effect to the traffic condition in Kennedy Town and the Western District.

Discussion

Methods to increase land and housing supply

58. Mr SHIU Ka-fai, Mr HO Kai-ming and Mr Tommy CHEUNG expressed support to the proposed development of artificial islands in the central waters. They took the view that by increasing land supply, the property prices in Hong Kong could be stabilized in the long run. Mr SHIU and Mr HO did not concur with the views of some deputations/individuals that increasing land supply would not change the high property prices in Hong Kong. On their requests and with the concurrence of the Deputy Chairman, Miss CHAN Ka-lam, Founder of Central Waters Concern Group, further expressed the view that the problem of high property prices in Hong Kong boiled down to the Government's housing policy and its land use planning. Hence, the high property prices would not necessarily drop with the increase of land supply alone.

59. Mr Gary FAN pointed out that based on the estimates made by HKIS that the land sale revenue generated from the KYC Artificial Islands alone could reach over \$1,000 billion, new lands at KYC Artificial Islands would be sold at sky high prices, making the new flats there unaffordable to the general public.

60. SDEV said the prices of new private flats at KYC Artificial Islands would be pitched at the market level, which would be lowered if there was a sufficient supply of land. He emphasized that 70% of the housing units to be provided at KYC Artificial Islands (i.e. up to about 180 000 units) were public housing, which could meet the society's keen demand for public housing.

61. Dr CHENG Chung-tai opined that given the existing shortfall of housing supply, the Administration should consider adopting multi-pronged measures including tenancy control and vacancy tax.

Action

SDEV responded that, while the Administration had no plan to impose tenancy control, it had proposed to introduce "Special Rates" on vacant first-hand private residential units.

62. Dr KWOK Ka-ki questioned that, given the long duration of the Study and construction period, the development of KYC Artificial Islands would not help meet the short-term demand for public housing. He enquired about the expected date for occupation for the first batch of public housing units on the KYC Artificial Islands.

63. SDEV responded that if the Study could be commenced as scheduled and completed in mid-2023, the first phase of reclamation works would be commenced in 2025, with a view to making available the first population intake in 2032. He supplemented that, as the development of various NDAs such as the First Phase of KTN/FLN NDA were expected to be completed in a few years' time, new public housing estates to be built at these NDAs could meet the demand for public housing in the shorter run.

The duration, costs and scope of the studies related to artificial islands in the central waters

64. Dr Junius HO expressed no objection to reclamation in the central waters to create new land. In view of the high cost of engaging consultancy services externally to conduct the Study, he asked if the Development Bureau could conduct the Study internally. He also urged the Administration to compress the time required for the Study, and consider expanding the scope of the Study to cover the holistic development of Lantau.

65. Mr CHU Hoi-dick considered that the Administration should include other possible nearshore reclamation sites such as Southwest Tsing Yi and east of the Hong Kong Disneyland in the Study, rather than focusing solely on the development of KYC Artificial Islands. He also urged the Administration to include other land supply options in the Study.

66. SDEV responded that after conducting the public engagement exercise for "Enhancing Land Supply Strategy: Reclamation Outside Victoria Harbour and Rock Cavern Development" in 2011, the central waters, together with five nearshore reclamation sites including Southwest Tsing Yi, were shortlisted as suitable locations for reclamation. Among those five shortlisted nearshore reclamation sites, the Administration planned to take forward detailed studies for the reclamation project at three sites, which were planned for non-housing developments, and would seek

Action

funding approval from the LegCo by the end of 2019. He added that the Administration did not intend to proceed with reclamation at Southwest Tsing Yi due to significant site constraints. As for the site at east of the Hong Kong Disneyland, the Administration had no plan to change its intended land uses as the area would be subject to a number of development constraints such as building height and use restrictions imposed by the Deed of Restrictive Covenant.

Planning for transport infrastructure development

67. Dr KWOK Ka-ki expressed concerns that the Administration's proposal to build roads connecting KYC Artificial Islands and Kennedy Town would exert increased pressure on the traffic condition in the Western District.

68. SDEV responded that apart from road transport, the Administration also proposed to construct rail links connecting the Hong Kong Island, Lantau and the coastal areas of Tuen Mun with KYC Artificial Islands, benefiting not only the artificial islands but also residents of the Northwest NT as well as the territory as a whole.

69. Mr Holden CHOW considered that the new rail links to be built for connecting KYC Artificial Islands with Hong Kong Island and the Northwest NT would alleviate the pressure on the existing transport network between the Northwest NT and the metro areas. He urged the Administration to expedite the planning process of the proposed rail links.

70. SDEV said the Administration would accord priority to transport infrastructure when developing KYC Artificial Islands. Under such principle, the planning work of the new rail links would be conducted simultaneously with the development of KYC Artificial Islands. The Administration targeted to complete the construction of the rail links three to five years after the expected population intake in KYC Artificial Islands in 2032.

Session Five

Presentation of views by deputations/individuals

71. At the invitation of the Deputy Chairman, 17 deputations/individuals presented their views. A summary of their views was in the **Appendix**.

Action

[During Session Five, a representative of a deputation attending the special meeting attempted to fly a paper plane towards the public officers. The Deputy Chairman ordered him to remain seated.]

The responses of the Administration

72. SDEV made the following key responses to the views of deputations and individuals:

- (a) according to the initial assessment of the Hong Kong 2030+ Study, the total housing demand for the 30 years up to 2046 was estimated to be about one million units, while some 300 000 private housing units would be aged 70 years or above. Ongoing land supply initiatives including rezoning of sites, development of NDAs and private redevelopment could provide altogether over 700 000 units, yet still leaving a gap of about 300 000 units to be filled by other means in order to meeting the housing demand. The proposed development of the KYC Artificial Islands could address the housing shortage by supplying about 150 000 to 260 000 housing units, 70% of which being public housing;
- (b) the public/private split of new housing supply had been revised from 60:40 to 70:30 recently. Last year, the Administration had re-allocated nine private housing sites to public housing use, which altogether could provide about 11 000 public housing units. Also, the pricing of HOS flats had been delinked from the market prices of private housing and the median monthly household income was used as the reference point instead;
- (c) the Administration had been requiring private developers through land sale conditions to dedicate certain floor spaces for welfare facilities including subsidized residential care homes and/or day care centres for the elderly within suitable private developments;
- (d) the claim that the proposed artificial islands in the central waters was designed to dovetail with the Greater Bay Area initiative was untrue, given that the idea of developing artificial islands in the central waters had long ago been explored in the study on "Enhancing Land Supply Strategy: Reclamation outside Victoria Harbour and Rock Cavern Development" back

Action

in 2011, and ELM was one of the two strategic growth areas put forward by the Hong Kong 2030+ Study in 2016 as well as a priority medium-to-long term land supply option recommended by TFLS;

- (e) there were about 1 300 ha of brownfield sites in the NT, around 540 ha of which had already been covered by some large-scale development projects in the pipeline. As for the remaining 760 ha, PlanD would identify plots having potential for public housing development;
- (f) those urging for the priority development of more brownfield sites in NT had under-estimated the cost and difficulties involved, whilst over-estimated the effectiveness of such option in increasing housing land supply. It was worth noting that the cost of resuming brownfield sites at about \$1,400 per sq ft was not much lower than the cost estimate for reclamation of KYC Artificial Islands. Also, as the KYC Artificial Islands would only be about 10 kilometres ("km") away from Central, whereas NTN was some 30 km from the metro core via developed areas, the costs for providing transport infrastructures for supporting an NDA in NTN would not necessarily be lower than that for the artificial islands;
- (g) it was a lopsided view that one-way permit ("OWP") holders entering Hong Kong had become a public burden. The OWP system was to facilitate mainly family reunion and the new comers normally lived with their Hong Kong family members at their current homes. Further, the median age of OWP holders were 10 years lower than that of the whole population and increasingly more of them entered into the labour market as frontline workers in nursing and caring sectors or in other labour-intensive jobs which had genuine manpower needs;
- (h) locally generated inert construction waste (i.e. public fill) would make up about half of the reclamation materials required for the reclamation of the proposed KYC Artificial Islands, and manufactured sand, which was in stable supply from the Mainland, could be used instead of marine sand as the remaining reclamation materials; and

Action

- (i) the development of the KYC Artificial Islands and supporting transport infrastructures could enhance the transport network not only for the artificial islands but also Northwest NT.

Discussion

Cost and benefits of the Lantau Tomorrow Vision and other land supply alternatives

73. Dr KWOK Ka-ki was seriously concerned that LTV would suffer from huge cost overruns, given that many other large-scale infrastructure projects implemented in the past few years also experienced significant cost overruns ranging from 20% to 60% of the original cost estimates. Dr KWOK pointed out that based on the estimate of the land sale revenue to be generated from the KYC Artificial Islands published by HKIS and taking into account the construction cost and profit margin of the property developers, the square-foot price of the private residential flats there could be as high as \$20,000. He opined that this was by no means affordable by the younger generation, and he queried that the Administration was encouraging the provision of more nano-sized flats in the private market.

74. SDEV said that the preliminary estimation of the land value of private residential units on the KYC Artificial Islands would be in the order of \$10,000 to \$12,000 per sq. ft., which was rather conservative as references had been drawn to the land value of private housing projects in Kai Tak or near MTR stations. In parallel, by increasing land and housing supply including through taking forward LTV, the Administration hoped to gradually stabilize private property prices. Importantly, it was also worth noting that 70% of the housing units on the KYC Artificial Islands were for public housing. Besides, SDEV added that the proportion of new flats that were ultra-small in size had not increased further in 2018.

75. Regarding the Administration's estimation that the KYC Artificial Islands would support the development of the third CBD providing some 200 000 high-paying jobs, Mr CHU Hoi-dick requested SDEV to respond to the query raised by Professor NG Mee-kam in this session about how the said number of high-paying jobs was arrived at. While the existing two CBDs of Hong Kong (i.e. Central and Kowloon East) were on both sides of the Victoria Harbour, Mr CHU asked whether the Administration would consider developing the third CBD at an NDA in NT, such as HSK/HT NDA, instead of on the KYC Artificial Islands, so as to provide better local employment opportunities for residents living in the more remote areas of NT and hence reducing the need for long commutes to the urban area. He

Action

urged the Administration to release to the public the report of "Technical Study on Transport Infrastructure at Kennedy Town for Connecting to East Lantau Metropolis". Furthermore, Mr CHU expressed the view that the Administration should first tap on the existing developable but non-built-up land with a total area of some 25 000 ha before going for reclamation.

76. SDEV responded that the estimated number of jobs to be provided at the third CBD on the KYC Artificial Islands was around 80% of jobs available in Central, given that the estimated total commercial floor area to be provided at the third CBD on the KYC Artificial Islands (about 4 million sq. m.) was about 80% of the total commercial floor area in Central (about 4.8 million sq. m.). Most but not necessarily all the jobs available in the new CBD were expected to be relatively higher-end and higher value-added positions, like those in Central. The Administration considered that the location of the KYC Artificial Islands, which would be in close proximity to the existing two CBDs and only about 10 minutes away from Central through the future transportation network, was conducive to creating synergy among the CBDs and would be preferred by big enterprises setting up new offices not too far away from the existing CBDs.

77. SDEV further said that under the development approach of NDAs, about 150 000 and 40 000 job opportunities, which covered commercial, technology and logistics industries, would respectively be created at HSK/HT NDA and KTN/FLN NDAs. The provision of such job opportunities in NDAs would help ease traffic congestion at the commuting corridors between NT and the urban area during the peak morning and evening hours. While expediting the development of NDAs, SDEV stressed that the Administration had also been taking forward a number of major land development projects in the NT which involved large areas of brownfield sites to provide land supply in the short-to-medium term. Yet, it was not realistic to assume that all those brownfield sites had the potential for high-density development. Likewise, as TFLS had mentioned, changing the land use of sites in "Village Type Development" zones for high-density development would also be subject to certain constraints.

Duration and scope of the studies relating to artificial islands in the central waters

78. Dr Junius HO queried the high cost and long time required for conducting the Study, given that the feasibility of the development of KYC

Action

Artificial Islands had already been ascertained by previous technical studies conducted by the Administration. In his view, the Administration should instead consider expanding the scope of the Study to cover the holistic development of Lantau.

79. SDEV advised that the detailed P&E study for the KYC Artificial Islands was procedurally indispensable and there was no room for further compressing the schedule. On the development of Lantau, SDEV indicated that the Administration upheld the principle of "Development in the North; Conservation for the South" approach, under which it would take forward the project of TCNTE and enhance the road network at Siu Ho Wan (for which small-scale reclamation might be required) to support more population intake and the development of tourist facilities at Sunny Bay, whereas the suggestion on high-density development of the whole of Lantau would not be pursued.

80. Mr Tony TSE considered that the imbalance between the supply and demand of housing was the root of the housing problem in Hong Kong and had led to sky-high housing prices that were not affordable by the public. Hence, he supported the Administration's multi-pronged approach to get to the root of the problem by increasing land supply, including but not limited to the development of the KYC Artificial Islands. He hoped that by increasing supply in general and by adjusting the public/private split of new housing supply to 70:30, there would be more affordable subsidized housing for different sectors in the community including the middle class. As such, Mr TSE opined that those who were concerned about the high cost of developing the KYC Artificial Islands should also fairly take into account the social benefits to be brought about by the increase in land and housing supply. Mr TSE further asked whether the scope of the Study would include exploring relevant measures to expedite the supply of land and construction of public housing units.

81. SDEV said that the scope of the Study mainly concerned how to implement the key projects under LTV but not include a review of planning and land policies. To expedite the construction of public housing units, the Administration had adopted measures such as Modular Integrated Construction approach and promotion of standardized off-site manufacturing process.

Action

Further response to the views given by deputations/individuals by the Administration

82. Dr KWOK Ka-ki sought the consent of the Deputy Chairman for Professor NG Mee-kam to express her further views on the replies given by the Administration. With the concurrence of the Deputy Chairman, Professor NG said that, in gist:

- (a) the basis of the Administration's estimation that the KYC Artificial Islands would provide some 200 000 high-paying jobs was unsound as it had not taken into account the shrinking population in Hong Kong in the long term and the advance in technology that would make it unnecessary for many types of businesses to cluster at CBDs;
- (b) with a view to improving the living density of public housing, more land should be allocated for public housing developments which took up only 1.4% of the total area of built-up land in Hong Kong. Although the Administration had recently re-allocated several private housing sites for public housing developments, the Administration still had to clarify whether this move had actually resulted in a net increase in the area of land for public housing developments, or was merely substituting other sites sold for the development of luxury private properties; and
- (c) under the current mechanism for implementing public works projects over which the public had little say, it was most likely that the Administration would proceed with LTV whatever the result of the Study might be.

83. Mr CHU Hoi-dick concurred with Professor NG Mee-kam's viewpoints, and requested SDEV to give further responses including providing the respective areas and relative ratios of lands that were used/expected to be used for building public and private housing.

84. SDEV reiterated his earlier response regarding the estimation on the number of jobs to be provided on the KYC Artificial Islands. SDEV considered it not accurate to state that only 1.4% of the total area of built-up land in Hong Kong was allocated for public housing developments without taking into account the large area of land use for the supporting road networks, Government, Institution and Community facilities,

Action

healthcare and welfare facilities, drainage system, sewerages and commercial services, etc. Road networks alone would make up some 20% of the built-up land in some districts. While it was true that the plot ratios of public housing development projects were generally higher than that of private residential projects, those for the residential developments on the KYC Artificial Islands would only be firmed up after completion of the P&E study. As regards the mechanism of implementing public works projects, SDEV stressed that the implementation of each project was subject to the scrutiny of LegCo members.

[At about 7:02 pm, the Deputy Chairman directed that the meeting be extended for 15 minutes to end at 7:15 pm.]

Concluding remarks

85. The Deputy Chairman advised that another special meeting to receive public views on the Study would be held on Saturday, 27 April 2019 from 9:00 am to 7:15 pm.

II Any other business

86. There being no other business, the meeting ended at 7:13 pm.

Council Business Division 1
Legislative Council Secretariat
28 April 2020

Panel on Development

Special meeting on Saturday, 13 April 2019, at 9:00 am

Meeting to receive views on "Studies related to artificial islands in the central waters"

Summary of views and concerns expressed by deputations/individuals

No.	Name of deputation/individual	Submission/Major views and concerns
<u>Session One</u>		
1.	Mr Kent LAM Jing-kwok	● LC Paper No. CB(1)846/18-19(01) (Chinese version only)
2.	Mr Leo LEUNG Kwok-kee	● LC Paper No. CB(1)868/18-19(11) (Chinese version only)
3.	Ir Martin CHEUNG Kin-keung	● LC Paper No. CB(1)846/18-19(02) ● LC Paper No. CB(1)893/18-19(01) (Chinese version only)
4.	Ir TAM Ming-fai	● LC Paper No. CB(1)892/18-19(01) (Chinese version only)
5.	The Hong Kong Registered Contractors Association	● LC Paper No. CB(1)846/18-19(03) (Chinese version only)
6.	Contractor's Authorised Signatory Association	● LC Paper No. CB(1)846/18-19(04) (Chinese version only)
7.	The Hong Kong Institution of Engineers	● LC Paper No. CB(1)868/18-19(07) (English version only)
8.	張皓傑先生	● Expressed support for the Lantau Tomorrow Vision ("LTV"). ● Reclamation project under LTV could generate a large piece of land for new town development and meet the housing need of the young people.
9.	Hong Kong Federation of Trade Unions	● Saw merits in LTV as it was aimed at providing sufficient land for Hong Kong in the long run. Yet, the Administration should engage the community to solicit their views on LTV. ● Apart from reclamation, the Administration should adopt a multi-pronged approach to implement other initiatives (developing brownfield sites and idle

No.	Name of deputation/individual	Submission/Major views and concerns
		farmland, launching the Land Sharing Pilot Scheme, etc.) in parallel to boost land supply.
10.	Mr WONG Tin-hei	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Expressed support for LTV. ● In considering the proposed development of artificial islands, the costs and difficulties involved in pursuing other land supply options (e.g. developing brownfield sites) should be taken into account. ● The Administration should address the public concern on LTV (e.g. high development cost and environmental implication) and learn from the experience of other large-scale infrastructure projects.
11.	Dr Francis CHEUNG Neo-ton	● LC Paper No. CB(1)892/18-19(02) (Chinese version only)
12.	Peng Chau Reclamation Concern Group	● LC Paper No. CB(1)868/18-19(01) (Chinese version only)
13.	Save Lantau Alliance	● LC Paper No. CB(1)892/18-19(03) (Chinese version only)
14.	HK Construction Materials Association Limited	● LC Paper No. CB(1)868/18-19(06) (Chinese version only)
15.	Miss FUNG Siu-yin	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Expressed objection to the proposed development of artificial islands in the central waters. ● The transport infrastructure for the artificial islands was more for realizing the concept of "one-hour living circle" within the Guangdong-Hong Kong-Macao Greater Bay Area than improving the traffic condition of the New Territories ("NT") West. ● The Government's development plan on Lantau was not based on the need of the local residents and would bring benefits to land developers and merchants on the island only.
16.	Mr MOK Kam-tai	● LC Paper No. CB(1)868/18-19(02) (Chinese version only)
17.	Mr MOK Wai-hong	● LC Paper No. CB(1)868/18-19(03) (Chinese version only)
18.	The Association of Consulting Engineers of Hong Kong	● LC Paper No. CB(1)892/18-19(04) (English version only)
19.	Our Hong Kong Foundation	● LC Paper No. CB(1)846/18-19(05) (Chinese version only)

No.	Name of deputation/individual	Submission/Major views and concerns
20.	Hong Kong And Southern China Aggregate Association Ltd	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● LC Paper No. CB(1)868/18-19(04) (Chinese version only)
21.	Mr LAU Chun-kong	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Expressed support for the proposed studies related to artificial islands in the central waters ("the Study"). ● Compared with brownfield sites which were subject to various development constraints and scattered across NT, the artificial islands would have a higher economic value and be more liveable as these islands were surrounded by sea and strategically located between the Central and the Hong Kong International Airport, and the reclaimed land on the artificial islands was larger in size and had a potential for high density development.
22.	Mr LAM Tsan-wing	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● LC Paper No. CB(1)892/18-19(05) (Chinese version only)
23.	Mr SIT Ka-keung	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● LC Paper No. CB(1)868/18-19(22) (Chinese version only)
24.	黎比達先生	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Expressed objection to LTV in view of the cost overrun and poor quality of many infrastructure works in recent years as well as the inadequate monitoring of the public works projects by the Legislative Council. ● Despite public concern over the proposed development of artificial islands, the Administration would only tilt towards consortia.
25.	Hong Kong Construction Sub-Contractors Association Limited	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Expressed support for LTV and the initiative to increase land supply by development of artificial islands in the central waters. ● The proposed development of artificial islands would not only help relieve the land shortage long faced by Hong Kong, hence bring down the business costs (e.g. rent) and maintain the competitiveness of the city, but also alleviate overcrowded living environment, support urban redevelopment and form a new business core for Hong Kong.
<u>Session Two</u>		
26.	Mr CHAN Pui-ming	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Expressed objection to developing the East Lantau Metropolis and various near-shore reclamation proposals outside Victoria Harbour. ● Cast doubt on whether it was appropriate for the

No.	Name of deputation/individual	Submission/Major views and concerns
		<p>Administration to pursue the costly reclamation proposal instead of other land supply initiatives such as developing brownfield sites, idle military sites and farmland.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Expressed concern over the high development cost of the proposed road and rail links on the artificial islands and the adequacy of the carrying capacity of these links to meet the traffic demand of the residents thereon.
27.	Labour Party	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Expressed objection to the proposed development of artificial islands in the central waters. ● Development under LTV would only cause damage to the environment without being able to meet the housing need of the grassroots. ● The Administration should make use of land zoned for "Village Type Development" and idle military sites for housing development.
28.	Ms Nicole YIK Hiu-ching	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● LC Paper No. CB(1)868/18-19(23) (Chinese version only)
29.	Greenpeace	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● LC Paper No. CB(1)868/18-19(24) (Chinese version only)
30.	Mr YEUNG Tsz-chun	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● LC Paper No. CB(1)846/18-19(07) (Chinese version only)
31.	Hong Kong Bar-Bending Contractors Association	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● LC Paper No. CB(1)846/18-19(08) (Chinese version only)
32.	The Association of Plastering Sub-Contractors Limited	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Expressed support for LTV and the initiative to increase land supply by development of artificial islands in the central waters. ● The artificial islands could provide land for the development of housing flats and community facilities to cater for the need of the society.
33.	The Hong Kong Institute of Landscape Architects	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● LC Paper No. CB(1)846/18-19(09) (Chinese version only)
34.	Mr WONG Chun-hay	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● LC Paper No. CB(1)868/18-19(36) (Chinese version only)
35.	Miss KWAN Heung-ling	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● LC Paper No. CB(1)892/18-19(06) (Chinese version only)

No.	Name of deputation/individual	Submission/Major views and concerns
36.	Hong Kong Construction Sub-Contractors Association	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● LC Paper No. CB(1)893/18-19(05) (Chinese version only)
37.	Mr KWAN Kit-yuen	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● LC Paper No. CB(1)846/18-19(10) (Restricted to Members)
38.	Designing Hong Kong	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● In view of the limited resources available, Hong Kong was at the crossroad of pursuing the costly LTV or other land supply options (near-shore reclamation, use of military sites, etc.). ● The Administration should conduct a cost-benefit analysis on various land supply options or undertake other land supply initiatives rather than simply focusing on the Study.
39.	Hong Kong Professionals and Senior Executives Association	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● LC Paper No. CB(1)868/18-19(37) (Chinese version only)
40.	Mr YU Hon-kwan	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● LC Paper No. CB(1)846/18-19(11) (Chinese version only)
41.	Mr CHAN Kim-kwong	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● LC Paper No. CB(1)868/18-19(14) (Chinese version only)
42.	Mr LAW Pink-kwan	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● LC Paper No. CB(1)868/18-19(08) (Chinese version only)
43.	Mr NG Kwok-ming	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● LC Paper No. CB(1)868/18-19(09) (Chinese version only)
44.	Mr Eric TSE Chun-yuen	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● LC Paper No. CB(1)846/18-19(120) (Chinese version only)
45.	Mr Antony LO	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Expressed support for LTV as it was the fastest and most effective solution to land shortage. ● The artificial islands would bring different trades and industries opportunities of sustainable development. ● In developing the artificial islands, the Administration should provide better land use planning, comprehensive transport facilities, and housing for the middle class and young people.
46.	Mr Danny NG	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Expressed support for the proposed development of artificial islands in the central waters. ● The artificial islands could provide the required land for residential development to meet the housing need of the public.

No.	Name of deputation/individual	Submission/Major views and concerns
47.	Smart City Consortium	● LC Paper No. CB(1)949/18-19(01) (Chinese version only)
48.	The Hong Kong Construction Association, Ltd.	● LC Paper No. CB(1)893/18-19(02) (Chinese version only)
49.	Mr KWOK Chung-man	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● The proposed development of artificial islands in the central waters could solve the housing and traffic problem in Hong Kong and make it unnecessary for the Administration to develop NT North. ● The Administration should expedite the engineering study on Road P1 on Lantau and the development of the rail link between the artificial islands and Tung Chung. ● Information about the land use of the possible artificial islands in the southern waters of Cheung Chau should be provided to the public.
50.	Protect Kennedy Town Alliance	● LC Paper No. CB(1)846/18-19(12) (Chinese version only)
<u>Session Three</u>		
51.	Mr LI Tai-yim	● LC Paper No. CB(1)892/18-19(07) (Chinese version only)
52.	Mr WONG Kwan-yin	● LC Paper No. CB(1)868/18-19(21) (Chinese version only)
53.	Mr Billy CHAU King-chung	● LC Paper No. CB(1)893/18-19(03) (Chinese version only)
54.	Mr WONG Chun-man	● LC Paper No. CB(1)868/18-19(19) (Chinese version only)
55.	Mr YUNG Ming-chau	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Expressed concerns that the artificial islands in the central waters would not be able to withstand extreme weather. ● The Administration should include analysis about impact of extreme weather on the artificial islands in the Study. ● It would be irresponsible for the Administration to develop the artificial islands without analyzing the impact of extreme weather.
56.	關注資助房屋權益大聯盟	● LC Paper No. CB(1)846/18-19(13) (Chinese version only)

No.	Name of deputation/individual	Submission/Major views and concerns
57.	China Real Estate Chamber of Commerce Hong Kong and International Chapter	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● LC Paper No. CB(1)846/18-19(14) (Chinese version only)
58.	黃瑋璋先生	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Expressed support for the proposed development of artificial islands in the central waters. ● The reclamation proposal could address the acute shortage of land in Hong Kong. ● The new lands generated from the development of artificial islands could enable the Administration to create a new green city with holistic planning.
59.	Mr CHAN Siu-fan	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● LC Paper No. CB(1)846/18-19(121) (Chinese version only)
60.	王宇軒先生	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Expressed support for the proposed development of artificial islands in the central waters. ● Reasonable living space could be provided with the new lands created from the development of artificial islands. ● The Administration should consider extending the proposed reclamation area.
61.	Mr WU Siu-ting	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● LC Paper No. CB(1)892/18-19(08) (Chinese version only)
62.	Mr YIP Hay-hung	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● LC Paper No. CB(1)868/18-19(13) (Chinese version only)
63.	Mr CHOW Luen-kiu	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● LC Paper No. CB(1)846/18-19(15) (Chinese version only)
64.	Mr Bryan CHUNG Y S	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● LC Paper No. CB(1)892/18-19(09) (Chinese version only)
65.	Ms SHIT Hang-sheong	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● LC Paper No. CB(1)892/18-19(10) (Chinese version only)
66.	Mr L AI Ngok-wai	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● LC Paper No. CB(1)846/18-19(16) (Chinese version only)
67.	Miss Michelle TSANG Ka-wai	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● LC Paper No. CB(1)868/18-19(18) (Chinese version only)
68.	Miss KAM Ka-ying	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● LC Paper No. CB(1)892/18-19(11) (Chinese version only)
69.	Miss SO Tsz-ching	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● LC Paper No. CB(1)892/18-19(12) (Chinese version only)
70.	Mr Benson YAU Wing-kai	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● LC Paper No. CB(1)846/18-19(17) (Chinese version only)

No.	Name of deputation/individual	Submission/Major views and concerns
71.	Mr CHENG Hau-ki	● LC Paper No. CB(1)846/18-19(18) (Chinese version only)
72.	Hong Kong Small and Medium Enterprises Association	● LC Paper No. CB(1)846/18-19(19) (Chinese version only)
<u>Session Four</u>		
73.	Mr TSANG Chun-fung	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Expressed support for the proposed development of artificial islands in the central waters. ● Reasonable and larger living space could be provided with the new lands created from the development of artificial islands.
74.	Central Waters Concern Group	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Objected to the proposed development of artificial islands in the central waters. ● Considered that reclamation in the central waters could have adverse effect on marine ecology. ● Considered that new flats in the new lands created under LTV would only be sold in a high price and unaffordable to general public.
75.	Dr Tom YAM	● LC Paper No. CB(1)846/18-19(21) (Chinese version only)
76.	The Association of Consulting Engineers of Hong Kong - Young Members Committee	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Expressed support for creating new lands by reclamation. ● Considered that only if there was enough land supply, property prices would go down which would ease the financial burden of young people who hoped to own a property and formed a family.
77.	CHENG Yiu-fai	● LC Paper No. CB(1)846/18-19(22) (Chinese version only)
78.	Mr TSE Kwok-chau	● LC Paper No. CB(1)846/18-19(23) (Chinese version only)
79.	王潤成先生	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Expressed support for the proposed development of artificial islands in the central waters. ● Most of the lands in Hong Kong were created by reclamation in the past, which provided a strong foundation for Hong Kong's economic developments in the last 20 to 30 years. ● Commented that the proposed development of artificial islands in the central waters could ease the shortage of housing and solve the problem of high property prices.

No.	Name of deputation/individual	Submission/Major views and concerns
80.	SHUM Lok-yin	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● LC Paper No. CB(1)846/18-19(24) (Chinese version only)
81.	Mr SHEN Yue	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● LC Paper No. CB(1)868/18-19(05) (Chinese version only)
82.	Ms Stephenie SO Ying-hin	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● LC Paper No. CB(1)846/18-19(25) (Chinese version only)
83.	Cherry CHAN Chi-tung	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Expressed support for the proposed development of artificial islands in the central waters. ● Highlighted the significance to strike a balance between conservation of environment and development.
84.	Mr LEUNG Kwok-hung	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Objected to the proposed development of artificial islands in the central waters on the following grounds. ● Considered that LTV was a project designed by the Administration to allow enterprises from the Mainland to invest and gain profits in the Hong Kong's property market. ● Considered that new flats in the new lands created would be sold in a high price.
85.	League of Social Democrats	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Objected to the proposed development of artificial islands in the central waters. ● Considered that LTV was a project designed by the Administration to allow enterprises from the Mainland to invest and gain profits in the Hong Kong's property market. ● Considered that the Administration should develop brownfield sites under the Lands Resumption Ordinance (Cap.124) instead. ● Considered that the Administration should adopt multi-pronged measures including tenancy control and vacancy tax.
86.	Miss CHAN Po-ying	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Objected to the proposed development of artificial islands in the central waters. ● Considered that the Administration's ultimate target of developing artificial islands in the central waters was to construct new roads and rails connecting the Mainland and Hong Kong core business districts.
87.	Miss TSUI Ho-yee	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Expressed concerns that road to be built from KYC Artificial Islands to Kennedy Town would exert increased pressure on the traffic condition in West Hong Kong Island. ● Considered that the Administration had ignored views

No.	Name of deputation/individual	Submission/Major views and concerns
		and concerns from the residents of West Hong Kong Island on development of KYC Artificial Islands.
88.	Mr LAI Sing-fun	● LC Paper No. CB(1)846/18-19(26)
89.	The Hong Kong Bird Watching Society	● LC Paper No. CB(1)868/18-19(15) (English version only)
90.	Mr WONG Sing-lam	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Expressed support for the proposed development of artificial islands in the central waters. ● Considered that creating new lands by reclamation could address the acute shortage of land in Hong Kong.
91.	Ms Jennifer QUINTON	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● LC Paper No. CB(1)892/18-19(13) (English version only) ● LC Paper No. CB(1)949/18-19(02) (English version only) (Further submission)
92.	Mr LING Ka-leung	● LC Paper No. CB(1)846/18-19(27) (Chinese version only)
93.	Mr Edmond LAI	● LC Paper No. CB(1)846/18-19(28) (English version only)
<u>Session Five</u>		
94.	Mr Franki CHAN Shut-ho	● LC Paper No. CB(1)892/18-19(14) (Chinese version only)
95.	Mr AU Moon-tong	● LC Paper No. CB(1)846/18-19(29) (Chinese version only)
96.	Mr KWONG Chun-long	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Expressed support for the Study and raised no objection to the initiative to increase land supply by development of artificial islands in the central waters, which could meet the long term development needs of Hong Kong. ● The Administration should (a) make reference to the experience of implementing large-scale public works projects in the past to avoid cost overruns and construction blunders; (b) carry out the advance stage preparatory works properly; and (c) monitor the works quality.
97.	Mr Frank LI	● LC Paper No. CB(1)846/18-19(31)
98.	Mr Matthew WHILEY	● LC Paper No. CB(1)868/18-19(10) (English version only)
99.	Mr LO Kai-shing	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Expressed support for LTV and the initiative to increase land supply by development of artificial islands in the central waters. ● Opined that late marriage and low birth rate among

No.	Name of deputation/individual	Submission/Major views and concerns
		Hong Kong youths stemmed from the acute shortage of land for housing.
100.	Mr MOK Kun-ki	● LC Paper No. CB(1)846/18-19(118) (Revised) (Chinese version only)
101.	Prof NG Mee-kam	● LC Paper No. CB(1)892/18-19(15) (Chinese version only)
102.	A Group of Past Chairman of HKSAR Government Civil Engineers Association	● LC Paper No. CB(1)846/18-19(33) (Chinese version only)
103.	Mr WU Yee	● LC Paper No. CB(1)892/18-19(16) (Chinese version only)
104.	Mr YEUNG Chi-shing	● LC Paper No. CB(1)893/18-19(04) (Chinese version only)
105.	Mr NG Ho-yin	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Expressed support for the initiative to increase land supply by development of artificial islands in the central waters. ● The Administration should address the following concerns among the members of public: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (a) the public/private split of new housing supply; (b) impact on the transport facilities in the vicinity; (c) given the high implementation cost of the development of the artificial islands, whether the implementation of other large-scale infrastructure projects would be deferred or stalled; (d) measures to facilitate the development of the CBD3; (e) supply of labour to implement projects under the Vision; (f) the sources of construction materials for reclamation; and (g) reservation of land plots for factories of construction materials so as to lessen the traffic flow to and from the construction sites at artificial islands. ● The Administration should properly conduct the environmental impact assessment and ensure comprehensive planning.
106.	Mr ZHONG Wei	● LC Paper No. CB(1)846/18-19(35) (Chinese version only)

No.	Name of deputation/individual	Submission/Major views and concerns
107.	Island West Dynamic Movement	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Cast doubt on (a) the objective of developing artificial islands in central waters, asserting that the project was designed to accommodate the influx of mainland immigrants on one-way permits; and (b) the effectiveness of the Vision in solving the problem of high property prices. ● Criticized the Administration for redacting most of the information in the information paper concerning the impact of the proposed artificial islands on the traffic of Western District on Hong Kong Island.
108.	Mr CHEUNG Tsz-chung	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● LC Paper No. CB(1)846/18-19(36) (Chinese version only) (Restricted to Members) ● Expressed support for the Study and the initiatives to develop artificial islands in the central waters in increasing land supply, bringing down the property prices, strengthening land reserves for Hong Kong Government, providing job opportunities and boosting GDP for Hong Kong.
109.	Miss FUNG Ching-yi	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● LC Paper No. CB(1)846/18-19(37) (Chinese version only)
110.	Ms YUEN Ka-yee	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● LC Paper No. CB(1)846/18-19(38) (Chinese version only)