

**立法會**  
**Legislative Council**

LC Paper No. CB(2)1106/18-19

(These minutes have been  
seen by the Administration)

Ref : CB2/PL/HS+CB4/PL/ED

**Panel on Health Services and Panel on Education**

**Minutes of joint meeting**  
**held on Monday, 21 January 2019, at 3:30 pm**  
**in Conference Room 2 of the Legislative Council Complex**

**Members  
present**

**:**     Panel on Health Services

- Dr Hon Pierre CHAN (Chairman)
- Prof Hon Joseph LEE Kok-long, SBS, JP (Deputy Chairman)
- \* Hon Tommy CHEUNG Yu-yan, GBS, JP
- Hon WONG Ting-kwong, GBS, JP
- \* Hon CHAN Kin-por, GBS, JP
- \* Hon Mrs Regina IP LAU Suk-ye, GBS, JP
- Hon YIU Si-wing, BBS
- \* Hon Charles Peter MOK, JP
- \* Hon CHAN Chi-chuen
- Hon CHAN Han-pan, BBS, JP
- Hon Alice MAK Mei-kuen, BBS, JP
- Dr Hon KWOK Ka-ki
- \* Dr Hon Fernando CHEUNG Chiu-hung
- \* Dr Hon Helena WONG Pik-wan
- Dr Hon Elizabeth QUAT, BBS, JP
- Hon POON Siu-ping, BBS, MH
- \* Dr Hon CHIANG Lai-wan, SBS, JP
- Hon SHIU Ka-fai
- \* Hon SHIU Ka-chun
- Hon KWONG Chun-yu
- \* Hon CHAN Hoi-yan

Panel on Education

Hon IP Kin-yuen (Chairman)  
Hon Vincent CHENG Wing-shun, MH (Deputy Chairman)

Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung  
Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, GBS, JP  
Dr Hon Priscilla LEUNG Mei-fun, SBS, JP  
Hon Claudia MO  
Ir Dr Hon LO Wai-kwok, SBS, MH, JP  
Hon Holden CHOW Ho-ding  
Hon Wilson OR Chong-shing, MH  
Hon Tanya CHAN  
Hon HUI Chi-fung  
Dr Hon CHENG Chung-tai  
Hon Gary FAN Kwok-wai

**Member attending** : Hon Wilson OR Chong-shing, MH

**Members absent** : Panel on Health Services

\* Hon CHU Hoi-dick

Panel on Education

Hon Starry LEE Wai-king, SBS, JP  
Hon Michael TIEN Puk-sun, BBS, JP  
Hon MA Fung-kwok, SBS, JP  
Hon LEUNG Che-cheung, SBS, MH, JP  
Hon Dennis KWOK Wing-hang  
Hon Jimmy NG Wing-ka, JP  
Dr Hon Junius HO Kwan-yiu, JP  
Hon HO Kai-ming  
Hon CHEUNG Kwok-kwan, JP  
Hon LUK Chung-hung, JP  
Hon LAU Kwok-fan, MH  
Hon AU Nok-hin

(\* Also members of the Panel on Education)

**Public Officers attending** : The Administration

Dr CHUI Tak-yi, JP  
Under Secretary for Food and Health

Mr FONG Ngai  
Deputy Secretary for Food and Health (Health) 3  
Food and Health Bureau

Mr Chris FUNG Pan-chung  
Principal Assistant Secretary for Food and Health  
(Health)3  
Food and Health Bureau

Miss Sharon KO Yee-wai  
Principal Assistant Secretary (Higher Education)  
Education Bureau

Miss Winnie WONG Ming-wai  
Deputy Secretary-General (1)  
University Grants Committee Secretariat

The Chinese University of Hong Kong

Professor Rossa CHIU Wai-kwun  
Associate Dean (Development)  
Faculty of Medicine

Ms Nowell WONG Chak-hung  
Director, Resources Management and Development  
Planning Office  
Faculty of Medicine

Mr LI Sing-cheung  
Acting Director  
Campus Development Office

The University of Hong Kong

Professor CHAN Ying-shing  
Associate Dean (Development and Infrastructure)  
Li Ka Shing Faculty of Medicine

Mr Eddie YIU  
Senior Assistant Director, Estates Office

Dr George Tipoe  
School of Biomedical Sciences  
Li Ka Shing Faculty of Medicine

The Hong Kong Polytechnic University

Mr Daniel SUEN  
Director of Campus Development

Professor Hector TSANG  
Professor and Head of Department of Rehabilitation  
Sciences

Professor Carly LAM  
Associate Dean of Faculty of Health and Social Sciences

**Clerk in  
attendance** : Ms Maisie LAM  
Chief Council Secretary (2) 5

**Staff in  
attendance** : Miss Kay CHU  
Senior Council Secretary (2) 5

Ms Priscilla LAU  
Council Secretary (2) 5

Miss Maggie CHIU  
Legislative Assistant (2) 5

---

Action

**I. Election of Chairman**

Dr Pierre CHAN, Chairman of the Panel on Health Services, advised that as agreed with Mr IP Kin-yuen, Chairman of the Panel on Education, he should chair the joint meeting. In accordance with the rule 22(k) of the House Rules, members agreed that Dr CHAN would chair the joint meeting.

**II. Enhancement of healthcare teaching facilities of University Grants Committee-funded universities**

[LC Paper Nos. CB(2)606/18-19(01) and (02) and CB(2)660/18-19(01)]

2. The Chairman reminded members that in accordance with Rule 83A of the Rules of Procedure, they should disclose the nature of any direct or indirect pecuniary interests relating to the funding proposals before they spoke on the subject.

Action

3. Under Secretary for Food and Health ("USFH") briefed members on the plans for enhancing the teaching facilities of The Chinese University of Hong Kong ("CUHK"), The Hong Kong Polytechnic University ("PolyU") and The University of Hong Kong ("HKU") to enable them to cope with an increase of some 150 healthcare related first-year-first-degree ("FYFD") places in the 2019-2020 to 2021-2022 triennium, details of which were set out in the Administration's paper (LC Paper No. CB(2)606/18-19(01)).

4. Principal Assistant Secretary for Food and Health (Health)<sup>3</sup>, with the aid of powerpoint presentation materials which were tabled at the meeting (LC Paper No. CB(2)660/18-19(01)), gave details on the proposals to (a) construct a teaching-research complex in Tai Po Area 39 for the Faculty of Medicine of CUHK ("CUHK's proposed works project"); (b) construct an academic building at Ho Man Tin Slope for PolyU's Department of Rehabilitation Sciences and School of Optometry ("PolyU's proposed works project"); and (c) carry out enhancement of facilities cum medical campus development of HKU ("HKU's proposed works project") ("the three proposed works projects"). He informed members that the Administration's plan was to submit the funding proposals for Phase 1 of CUHK's proposed works project, PolyU's proposed works project and HKU's proposed works project to the Public Works Subcommittee ("PWSC") and the Finance Committee ("FC") for consideration in the current legislative session.

5. The Chairman, Mr Tommy CHEUNG, Mr IP Kin-yuen, Dr CHENG Chung-tai and Dr KWOK Ka-ki criticized that the Administration's paper and powerpoint presentation materials lacked concrete details to facilitate members' consideration of the three proposed works projects.

6. Members noted the information note prepared by the Legislative Council Secretariat on the subject under discussion (LC Paper No. CB(2)606/18-19(02)).

The three proposed works projects

7. Mr LEUNG Yiu-chung noted that according to the Administration, there was currently already a serious insufficiency in space for healthcare teaching and related activities at CUHK, PolyU and HKU. He was gravely concerned about how the three proposed works projects, some of which would take several years to complete, could cope with the increase of some 150 healthcare-related places from the 2019-2020 academic year. He urged the Administration to devise a long-term plan in respect of the number of University Grants Committee ("UGC")-funded healthcare-related FYFD places based on the projected healthcare service demand, in order to

Action

enhance the teaching facilities of the universities concerned in a timely manner. Mr SHIU Ka-fai was supportive of the three proposed works projects. However, he questioned why the Administration did not submit the funding proposals at an earlier time.

8. USFH explained that various short-term alterations, additions, repairs and improvement works to campuses of the UGC-funded universities costing up to \$30 million each had been funded under the Capital Works Reserve Fund block allocations. Works projects were proposed by CUHK, PolyU and HKU with a view to expanding their capacities for relevant healthcare-related professional training in the short, medium and long term.

Admin

9. Mr IP Kin-yuen sought information about the expected start and completion dates of each short, medium and long-term works projects (including those which were at an exploratory stage) being proposed by CUHK, HKU and PolyU. He was particularly concerned about whether the problem of insufficiency in space currently faced by these universities would be resolved in the short run. Ms Alice MAK sought details about the works projects which were at exploratory stage.

10. Senior Assistant Director, Estates Office, HKU advised that HKU's proposed works project was short-term in nature. Subject to funding approval by FC, the project was aimed to commence in the third quarter of 2019 for completion in September 2020. As regards the medium and long-term works projects, they were targeted for completion by 2026 and 2028 respectively. Associate Dean (Development), Faculty of Medicine, CUHK assured members that the completion dates of various short, medium and long-term healthcare teaching-related works projects of CUHK would meet the curriculum need of the cohort of students admitted in the 2019-2020 academic year. For instance, renovation of certain facilities in Choh-Ming LI Basic Medical Sciences Building, which included expansion of the dissecting laboratory, would be completed before September 2019. It was expected that the long-term projects would be fully completed by 2029.

11. Mr Tommy CHEUNG declared that he was elected by Members to serve on the current-term Council of CUHK. While expressing support for the three proposed works projects, he sought explanation about the high estimated cost in money-of-the-day ("MOD") prices of PolyU's proposed works project which stood at \$1,300 million for the provision of about 10 344 square metre net operational floor area of space. Director of Campus Development, PolyU advised that the estimated cost was worked out in consultation with UGC Secretariat and the Administration. Reference had been made to the relevant benchmark cost data. He added

Action

that the cost of pre-contract consultancy for the preparation of the design and tender documents for the project was less than \$30 million.

12. Mr Tommy CHEUNG noted that CUHK's proposed works project would be carried out in two phases. The Administration would submit the funding proposal of \$60 million in MOD prices for Phase 1 of the project to PWSC in the current legislative session, and leave the submission of the funding proposal for Phase 2 of the project to the next legislative term. He was concerned that the paper and presentation materials provided by the Administration were however silent on the estimated cost for Phase 2 of the project. Acting Director, Campus Development Office, CUHK advised that Phase 1 of CUHK's proposed works project would cover pre-contract consultancy for the preparation of the design and tender documents. The preliminary estimated cost of Phase 2 of the project which involved the construction of the teaching-research complex was about \$3,000 million.

13. Dr CHENG Chung-tai asked about how the three proposed projects could help improving the quality of service in the public healthcare sector under the healthcare manpower constraint. Associate Dean (Development), Faculty of Medicine, CUHK advised that an objective of CUHK's proposed works project was to introduce virtual reality technology at the new teaching-research complex. This would enable trainees to have repetitive training and practices of skills in different simulated scenarios before further training in hospital wards.

14. In response to Mr Tommy CHEUNG and Mr POON Siu-ping's enquiries, Senior Assistant Director, Estates Office, HKU advised that the latest estimated cost in MOD prices of HKU's proposed works projects was \$250 million. The total estimated cost in MOD prices of the short, medium and long-term works projects for HKU was in the range of \$6,000 million to \$7,000 million. Dr KWOK Ka-ki asked whether the future plan of HKU to redevelop a catering facility and the Madam SH Ho Residence for medical students into two new blocks of a Clinical Training Amenities Centre would result in a reduction of hostel places. Senior Assistant Director, Estates Office, HKU and Associate Dean (Development and Infrastructure), Li Ka Shing Faculty of Medicine, HKU advised that under the medium-term projects, the 300-odd hostel places of Madam SH Ho Residence and Patrick Manson Residence would first be relocated to a new facility and some additional 400 hostel places would be provided at a later stage. This would enable all senior medical students and more nursing students attending clinical placement be allocated with hostel places.

15. Mr Tommy CHEUNG, Mr IP Kin-yuen, Mr POON Siu-ping, and the Chairman requested the Administration to provide information in writing

Action

on the total estimated cost in MOD prices of each short, medium and long-term works project, with a breakdown by phase of the project if appropriate. Dr KWOK Ka-ki requested the Administration to advise in writing as to whether part of the estimated cost of each project would be met by other sources of funding (e.g. donation), and if so, the details.

Admin

16. Mr IP Kin-yuen opined the level of capacity of the three proposed works projects should be drawn up on the basis of the number of students. However, the Administration's paper lacked information on the respective number of UGC-funded FYFD places to be provided by CUHK, PolyU and HKU and the healthcare disciplines involved. Mr POON Siu-ping raised a similar question. Dr KWOK Ka-ki requested the Administration to provide the following information on each short, medium and long-term works project in writing: (a) the net teaching, laboratory and research floor areas per undergraduate and postgraduate student before and after completion of the project; and (b) the number of additional publicly-funded hostel places to be provided by the project, if any.

17. USFH advised that starting from the 2019-2020 academic year, there would be an increase of 60 UGC-funded FYFD medical places and 60 UGC-funded FYFD nursing places. For HKU, there would also be seven additional UGC-funded FYFD dentistry places. As regards PolyU, the UGC-funded FYFD places in physiotherapy and optometry would be increased by 20 and five respectively.

18. Mr POON Siu-ping and Ms Alice MAK expressed concern about whether the healthcare teaching facilities of CUHK, HKU and PolyU, if enhanced as proposed, could cope with further increase in healthcare-related UGC-funded FYFD places in the future in the face of an ageing population. Mr Tommy CHEUNG was concerned about whether the teaching manpower of the three universities would be able to cater for the growth in the number of student intake. Dr CHENG Chung-tai sought elaboration about the respective roles of CUHK, HKU and PolyU in nurturing healthcare talents.

19. USFH advised that the two faculties of medicine of CUHK and HKU had the distinct role to train local medical graduates. They, together with PolyU, also offered UGC-funded FYFD nursing places. Apart from nursing graduates, PolyU offered a wide range of UGC-funded FYFD places to nurture allied health professionals in various disciplines, such as physiotherapists, occupational therapists, optometrists, medical laboratory technologists and radiographers.

Admin

20. Mr POON Siu-ping requested the Administration to provide the schedule for submitting the funding proposals of the three proposed works



Action

projects to PWSC and FC. USFH responded that the Administration targeted to have the funding proposals of the three proposed works projects approved by FC in the second quarter of 2019.

Healthcare manpower planning

21. Mr LEUNG Yiu-chung considered that the proposed increase of seven UGC-funded FYFD dental places was far from adequate to address the growing service demand arising from the ageing population. Mr POON Siu-ping asked if the number of UGC-funded FYFD dental places could be further increased. USFH advised that the Administration had kick-started a new round of healthcare manpower projection exercise, which would be conducted once every three years in step with the triennial planning cycle of UGC. It was expected that the next projection exercise would be completed by 2020.

22. Ms Alice MAK was worried that since the reprovisioning of the Prince Philip Dental Hospital was still under planning, the capacity of the Hospital would limit the supply of local dentists. Deputy Secretary for Food and Health (Health)<sup>3</sup> advised that the number of UGC-funded FYFD places for dental discipline had already been increased by about 40% from 53 to 73 in the 2016-2017 to 2018-2019 triennium, and would be further increased by seven for the 2019-2020 to 2021-2022 triennium. The Administration intended to reserve about \$100 million for the Prince Philip Dental Hospital to undertake urgent renovation and upgrading works at the existing campus, and would in parallel explore options for a reprovisioning site. Given the growing demand for dental services, Ms Alice MAK called on the Administration to take the opportunity to expand the capacity of the Hospital substantially in the long run.

23. Mr IP Kin-yuen was concerned about the arrangement for capping the total number of UGC-funded FYFD places at 15 000 per annum, under which an increase in the number of healthcare-related UGC-funded FYFD places would result in a reduction in the number of non-healthcare-related UGC-funded FYFD places. Dr Helena WONG declared that she was a lecturer of PolyU. While expressing support for the three proposed works projects, she was gravely concerned about the number of non-healthcare-related UGC-funded FYFD places reduced by the three universities for the 2019-2020 to 2021-2022 triennium in order to maintain the above cap.

24. Principal Assistant Secretary (Higher Education) explained that the UGC-funded universities enjoyed autonomy in the academic planning process in determining the distribution of their UGC-funded FYFD places. The universities would draw reference to the Administration's advice on

Action

Admin

manpower requirements before submitting their planning exercise proposals for UGC's consideration. Dr Helena WONG requested the Administration to provide in writing the respective number of non-healthcare-related UGC-funded FYFD places reduced by each of the three universities for the 2019-2020 to 2021-2022 triennium in order to maintain the total number of UGC-funded FYFD places at 15 000 per annum, with a breakdown by disciplines. She remarked that as she had pointed out in her motion which was passed at the meeting of the Panel on Education held on 4 January 2019 in the context of discussing the recurrent funding for UGC-funded universities, any increase in the number of "manpower-planned" UGC-funded FYFD places should not be counted towards the 15 000 cap.

Conclusion

Admin

25. In closing, the Chairman concluded that members did not object to the submission of the funding proposals of the three proposed works projects to PWSC for consideration. He requested the Administration to provide the two Panels with supplementary information as requested by members in paragraphs 9, 15, 16, 20 and 24 before submitting the funding proposals to PWSC for consideration. USFH agreed.

**III. Any other business**

26. There being no other business, the meeting ended at 4:39 pm.

Council Business Division 2  
Legislative Council Secretariat  
27 March 2019