

立法會
Legislative Council

LC Paper No. CB(2)917/18-19
(These minutes have been seen
by the Administration)

Ref : CB2/PS/3/16

Panel on Food Safety and Environmental Hygiene

Subcommittee on Issues Relating to Public Markets

Minutes of meeting
held on Tuesday, 6 November 2018, at 11:00 am
in Conference Room 1 of the Legislative Council Complex

Members present : Hon Wilson OR Chong-shing, MH (Chairman)
Hon HO Kai-ming (Deputy Chairman)
Hon Claudia MO
Hon Steven HO Chun-yin, BBS
Hon CHAN Han-pan, BBS, JP
Hon Alice MAK Mei-kuen, BBS, JP
Dr Hon KWOK Ka-ki
Hon KWOK Wai-keung, JP
Dr Hon Elizabeth QUAT, BBS, JP
Dr Hon CHIANG Lai-wan, SBS, JP
Hon CHU Hoi-dick
Hon SHIU Ka-fai
Hon SHIU Ka-chun
Hon YUNG Hoi-yan
Hon LAU Kwok-fan, MH
Hon Jeremy TAM Man-ho
Hon AU Nok-hin

Member absent : Hon Andrew WAN Siu-kin

Public Officers attending : Items II and III

Dr CHUI Tak-yi, JP
Under Secretary for Food and Health

Mr Gilford LAW Sun-on
Principal Assistant Secretary for Food and Health
(Food) 2

Mr David WONG Fuk-loi
Deputy Director (Administration & Development)
Food and Environmental Hygiene Department

Mr Damian CHAN Kwok-wai
Assistant Director (Market Special Duties)
Food and Environmental Hygiene Department

Item II

Mr Edward TSE Cheong-wo
Project Director 3
Architectural Services Department

Mr Tony LEE Cheuk-ming
Chief Project Manager 301
Architectural Services Department

Clerk in attendance : Ms Alice LEUNG
Chief Council Secretary (2) 6

Staff in attendance : Mr Richard WONG
Senior Council Secretary (2) 8

Miss Meisy KWOK
Legislative Assistant (2) 6

Action

I. Election of Chairman and Deputy Chairman (if required)

Members considered it not necessary to re-elect the Chairman and Deputy Chairman of the Subcommittee on Issues Relating to Public Markets ("the Subcommittee"). Mr Wilson OR and Mr HO Kai-ming agreed to continue to serve as the Chairman and Deputy Chairman respectively in the 2018-2019 session.

II. Development of a new generation of public markets

(LC Paper Nos. CB(2)186/18-19(01) and (02))

2. The Subcommittee deliberated (index of proceedings attached at **Annex**).

3. At the invitation of the Chairman, Under Secretary for Food and Health ("USFH") briefed members on the progress of development of new public markets (LC Paper No. CB(2)186/18-19(01)).

4. The Chairman informed members that a letter from Mr Andrew WAN expressing views on this agenda item was tabled at the meeting for members' reference.

(Post-meeting note: The letter dated 6 November 2018 from Mr Andrew WAN tabled at the meeting was issued to members after the meeting vide LC Paper No. CB(2)204/18-19(01) (Chinese version only).)

III. Reform of public market management

(LC Paper Nos. CB(2)186/18-19(03) and (04))

5. The Subcommittee deliberated (index of proceedings attached at **Annex**).

6. At the invitation of the Chairman, USFH briefed members on the Administration's latest thinking on reforming the management of public markets as a critical part of the on-going fundamental review (LC Paper No. CB(2)186/18-19(03)).

Follow-up actions required of the Administration

Admin

7. The Subcommittee requested the Administration to provide updated information on the implementation of Market Modernization Programme, preferably with a timetable and a list of candidate public markets that were initially identified for minor improvement works or fundamental overhaul.

Action

Admin

8. The Chairman said that at the previous meeting, he had requested the Administration to provide information on whether the Administration had conducted/would plan to conduct any strategic analysis (e.g. a Strengths-Weaknesses-Opportunities-Threats analysis) of existing public markets in contemplating which type of improvement projects (i.e. fundamental overhaul, retrofitting air-conditioning systems and other improvements or refurbishment and minor upgrading works) would best suit individual public markets. He reminded the Administration to provide its response as soon as possible.

Members' letters awaiting the Administration's responses

Admin

9. The Chairman reminded the Administration that it should expeditiously provide written responses to the following four letters from individual members issued previously: (a) letter dated 29 June 2018 from Ms Claudia MO (LC Paper No. CB(2)1754/17-18(01)); (b) letter dated 3 July 2018 from Mr Andrew WAN (LC Paper No. CB(2)1754/17-18(02)); (c) letter dated 6 July 2018 from Mr LEUNG Yiu-chung (LC Paper No. CB(2)1780/17-18(01)); and (d) letter dated 31 October 2018 from the Deputy Chairman (LC Paper No. CB(2)179/18-19(01)).

IV. Any other business

10. At the suggestion of the Chairman, members agreed to invite public views at the next Subcommittee meeting to be held in December 2018. Members also noted that the Chairman would take into account members' concerns raised at previous meetings and consult the Deputy Chairman after the meeting on the agenda item, and that they would be informed of the detailed arrangements for the next meeting in due course.

(Post-meeting note: Members were informed that the next meeting would be held on 17 December 2018, from 9:00 am to 12:00 noon to receive views from the public on "Issues relating to planning and provision of public markets" vide LC Paper No. CB(2)274/18-19 issued on 16 November 2018.)

11. There being no other business, the meeting ended at 1:00 pm.

**Proceedings of the meeting of the
Subcommittee on Issues Relating to Public Markets
on Tuesday, 6 November 2018, at 11:00 am
in Conference Room 1 of the Legislative Council Complex**

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s) / Discussion	Action required
<i>Agenda item I – Election of Chairman and Deputy Chairman (if required)</i>			
000443 – 000538	Chairman Deputy Chairman Dr KWOK Ka-ki Dr CHIANG Lai-wan	Members considered it not necessary to re-elect the Chairman and Deputy Chairman.	
<i>Agenda item II – Development of a new generation of public markets</i>			
000539 – 001002	Chairman Deputy Chairman Admin	<p>The Chairman's advice that the Administration had been requested to provide a written response to the letter dated 31 October 2018 from the Deputy Chairman (LC Paper No. CB(2)179/18-19(01)), and that a letter dated 6 November 2018 from Mr Andrew WAN was tabled at the meeting.</p> <p>Opening remarks by the Chairman, and briefing by the Administration on the progress of development of a new generation of new public markets (LC Paper No. CB(2)186/18-19(01)).</p>	
001003 – 001519	Chairman Dr KWOK Ka-ki Admin	<p>Dr KWOK Ka-ki considered that the management of public markets should not be outsourced, and new public markets to be provided by the Food and Environmental Hygiene Department ("FEHD") should not adopt the "Single Operator Market" model used by the Hong Kong Housing Authority ("HA")/the Housing Department ("HD"). He also considered that new public markets in Tin Shui Wai and Tung Chung under planning should each be provided with a cooked food centre ("CFC") to meet the needs of the local communities.</p> <p>The Administration responded that it maintained an open attitude on the management mode of new public markets and would continue to listen to different views. While the Administration noted the views of members and the communities concerned on the provision of CFCs in the aforesaid two public markets under planning,</p>	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s) / Discussion	Action required
		<p>it had to balance the needs for wet markets and CFCs given the limitation on the size of the selected sites.</p>	
001520 – 001934	Chairman Deputy Chairman Admin	<p>In the Deputy Chairman's view, FEHD should consider collaborating with HA/HD to take revitalization measures in wet markets in various districts, particularly those districts (such as Tsz Wan Shan Estate, Fu Shan Estate and Lok Wah Estate) in which wet markets in their vicinity were owned by the Link Real Estate Investment Trust ("Link").</p> <p>The Administration responded that the Food and Health Bureau ("FHB")/FEHD had consistently looked into ways to improve the operating environment of public markets so as to benefit the community at large, and would be open to collaboration with other bureaux and/or departments in taking forward relevant measures as appropriate.</p>	
001935 – 002418	Chairman Ms Alice MAK Admin	<p>Ms Alice MAK was disappointed that there was no consultation with the local community about the site selection of the proposed public markets. She held a strong view that the site near the Tin Shui Wai MTR Station selected for building the new public market could not fully satisfy the needs of residents in Tin Shui Wai, particularly those living in the northern part of Tin Shui Wai. Therefore, the Administration should consider providing one more public market in the northern part of Tin Shui Wai.</p> <p>As regards the proposed new public market in Tung Chung, Ms MAK urged the Administration to consider adding one floor or two in the proposed market, so as to provide CFC and/or other community facilities therein, which could help increase the patronage of the market.</p> <p>Regarding the proposed public market in Tin Shui Wai, the Administration responded that the present emphasis would be put on taking forward the relevant works of the proposed market at the site near the Tin Shui Wai MTR Station. The Administration noted members' suggestion of providing CFC in the</p>	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s) / Discussion	Action required
		<p>public market under planning in Tung Chung, and would explore options for providing cooked food therein.</p>	
002419 – 002824	<p>Chairman Ms YUNG Hoi-yan Admin</p>	<p>Ms YUNG Hoi-yan was of the view that the Administration should consider providing new public markets in old districts where wet markets were managed by private enterprises like Link (e.g. Sun Tin Wai Estate) so that the residents concerned would have an alternative source of fresh food provisions.</p> <p>In respect of the project of retrofitting air-conditioning facilities in Tai Wai Market, Ms YUNG enquired about the assistance and/or compensatory payments to be provided to those stall operators who were required to suspend/stop operation when the relevant works were carried out.</p> <p>The Administration responded that provision of public markets in various districts would be considered on a case-by-case basis. Regarding the relevant works project of Tai Wai Market, the Administration advised that the affected stall operators were being consulted on the concessionary arrangements which had made reference to similar cases in the past.</p>	
002825 – 003712	<p>Chairman Mr SHIU Ka-chun Mr CHU Hoi-dick Admin</p>	<p>Mr SHIU Ka-chun considered that wet markets managed by Link (such as Fu Tung Market) could not meet the shopping needs of residents for daily fresh provisions at cheap prices in their vicinity. Therefore, the public markets under planning should not adopt the "Single Operator Market" model. As regards the proposed public market in Tung Chung, he considered that the Administration should explore the feasibility of increasing the number of floors in the proposed market so that CFC could be provided therein.</p> <p>Mr CHU Hoi-dick referred to paragraph 5 of the Administration's paper and considered that the Administration should provide clear and objective criteria for determining the provision of public markets. Notably, it was unreasonable not to provide a public market</p>	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s) / Discussion	Action required
		<p>in the Lamma Island as there were public markets in other outlying islands (e.g. Cheung Chau and Peng Chau). Regarding the proposed market in Tung Chung, Mr CHU also considered that the Administration should provide CFC on an additional floor, and if not, should identify a site for a temporary CFC.</p> <p>The Administration responded that local consultation on the proposed market in Tung Chung was underway. Subject to its outcome and other relevant factors, the Administration would further study the types of facilities to be provided there. FEHD had noted that various members shared a similar view regarding the demand for CFC in Tung Chung.</p> <p>The Administration reiterated that in the planning of public markets, a holistic consideration of all relevant factors would be taken into account, as reflected in the current Hong Kong Planning Standards and Guidelines ("HKPSG"). If warranted in future, the relevant guidelines would be reviewed and updated as appropriate.</p>	
003713 – 004207	Chairman Mr AU Nok-hin Admin	<p>Mr AU Nok-hin was of the view that given the strong local demand in various districts for CFCs, the Administration should consider refurbishing certain outdated/inactive public markets for use as CFCs. In his view, the existing HKPSG did not provide clear guidelines regarding the provision of public markets, and a revision was therefore necessary.</p> <p>Mr AU also considered that local residents should be engaged in the site selection for the proposed market in Tin Shui Wai. Besides, the Administration should provide more municipal facilities in that public market to increase its patronage.</p> <p>The Administration advised that the site selected for the proposed public market in Tin Shui Wai had taken into consideration a host of relevant factors as well as the need to balance demands of various communities in Tin Shui Wai.</p>	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s) / Discussion	Action required
004208 – 004543	Chairman Admin	<p>The Chairman expressed the view that the Administration should review HKPSG so as to devise a set of clear criteria for provision of public markets, as in the case of HKPSG prior to the revision in 2009 that one public market stall should be provided for about 55-65 households. He also hoped that the Administration would consider providing a new public market in the Wong Tai Sin district, in response to Link's commercialized mode of operation of Tsz Wan Shan Market.</p> <p>The Administration responded that the relevant revision was made to HKPSG in 2009 with a view that planning of new public markets could be considered on a case-by-case basis, taking into account not only the population, but also a host of other relevant factors. The Administration would study whether further revision was warranted. The Administration also advised that FEHD had noted the community demands for public markets in various districts, including Tsz Wan Shan.</p>	
004544 – 004854	Chairman Ms Alice MAK Admin	<p>Ms Alice MAK held the view that given the strong community needs for a new public market in the northern part of Tin Shui Wai, if the Administration currently had no plan to provide a new public market there, a site for a temporary public market should be identified.</p> <p>The Administration reiterated that it understood that various parts in Tin Shui Wai might have different needs. In the planning process, the traffic and transport arrangements could be contemplated to facilitate access for residents in various parts of Tin Shui Wai.</p>	
004855 – 005019	Chairman Mr AU Nok-hin Admin	<p>The Administration took note of Mr AU Nok-hin's suggestion that FEHD, in its daily management of public markets and CFCs, should take into account conflicts among stall operators, e.g. in the allocation of tables in communal area.</p>	
005020 – 005400	Chairman Ms YUNG Hoi-yan Admin	<p>Ms YUNG Hoi-yan urged the Administration to incorporate various community facilities (including public markets) in a single</p>	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s) / Discussion	Action required
		<p>Government municipal complex, so as to adopt the "single site, multiple use" model. She also considered it necessary to provide public parking spaces in such complexes.</p> <p>The Administration responded that the design and site parameters as stated in paragraphs 8 and 9 of the Administration's paper had reflected a host of relevant factors, and FHB/FEHD would pursue "single site, multiple use" model in multi-storey developments and welcome collaboration with other public agencies to accommodate compatible use.</p>	
005401 – 005737	Chairman Mr CHU Hoi-dick Admin	<p>Noting that there were two design options for the proposed public market in Tin Shui Wai, Mr CHU Hoi-dick enquired whether a transport study had been carried out and whether there were any undisclosed information in relation to the feasibility of the two options being considered.</p> <p>The Administration explained that the two options had their own merits and disadvantages. While the option of decking over a section of Tin Fuk Road for floor space for accommodating the proposed public market might incur a higher construction cost, the other option for building a new public market next to the Light Rail and MTR stations might impact on road traffic in the vicinity and require mitigation measures. The paper provided to the relevant District Council already contained all the information which could be made public. If any of the two options was adopted, relevant departments would conduct further studies including feasibility study.</p>	
<i>Agenda item III – Reform of public market management</i>			
005738 – 010015	Chairman Admin	Briefing by the Administration on the latest thinking on reforming the management of public markets as a critical part of the on-going fundamental review (LC Paper No. CB(2)186/18-19(03)).	
010016 – 010450	Chairman Deputy Chairman Admin	The Deputy Chairman considered it unreasonable for FEHD, starting from June 2018, to have suspended the open auction of	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s) / Discussion	Action required
		<p>public market stalls. He also opined that if such arrangement was made to facilitate the implementation of the Market Modernization Programme ("MMP"), FEHD should expeditiously provide a timetable for taking forward MMP.</p> <p>The Administration explained that MMP involved hardware improvement projects of various scale, and it was necessary to make available a certain number of vacant stalls for re-siting the affected stall operators. For example, Aberdeen Market would undergo a fundamental overhaul, and over 300 stalls would be affected.</p>	
010451 – 010950	Chairman Ms Alice MAK Admin	<p>Ms Alice MAK held a strong view that in the event that it was necessary to suspend open auction of public market stalls, the Administration should communicate with stall operators and patrons at an earlier stage. If the length of suspension of open auction of public market stalls would depend on the progress of MMP, FEHD should provide a timetable for the implementation of MMP.</p> <p>The Administration responded that priority should be given to relocating sitting tenants who would be affected by projects under MMP. For that purpose, there was a need to maintain a certain number of vacant stalls in public markets for accommodating such tenants who would like to be temporarily or permanently relocated. The Administration reiterated that the overhaul of Aberdeen Market was the pioneering project under MMP and it was intended to serve as a prototype for other markets.</p> <p>In response to Ms MAK's concern about the new operation mode as stated in the Administration's paper, the Administration advised that the new operation mode was premised on the positioning of public markets as "one of the major sources of shopping fresh food provisions for the general public, which should be kept reasonably decent, clean, neat and tidy without being unduly upmarket". In this context, FEHD considered that stall tenants should remain to be individuals in the</p>	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s) / Discussion	Action required
		<p>capacity of small traders, and therefore, FEHD would enter into tenancy with an individual, but not a limited company nor a partnership.</p>	
<p>010951 – 011505</p>	<p>Chairman Mr AU Nok-hin Admin</p>	<p>As regards one of the reform principles that "public markets should principally be operating on a commercial basis allowing market forces to play in full swing", Mr AU Nok-hin considered it desirable for the Government to intervene into the market so as to ensure that public market stalls would be leased to small operators at affordable rent level, and then these operators could sell fresh food at affordable price level.</p> <p>The Administration responded that to ensure that the rent level of market stalls would be affordable to small operators, the allocation would be conducted through open market auction. Nevertheless, low rents of stalls did not necessarily translate into low retail price of products, as the Administration could not impose price control.</p> <p>In response to Mr AU's view that FEHD should give priority to regulation of market stalls over rental management, the Administration advised that FEHD was keen to address issues identified in the two reports released by The Ombudsman covering rental management and regulation of market stalls respectively. The less than satisfactory operation of some existing FEHD markets could be attributed to the outdated design, notably small stalls and narrow passageways, which entrenched and aggravated daily management problems. The Administration considered that hardware improvement would only be effective if taken together with management improvement measures and new operation modes. For example, a root cause of insufficient business hours, change of use and subletting of stalls might be attributed to the current low rental level of a great number of market stalls which did not fully reflect their full economic value. This called for management reform over stall bidding, rental adjustment, tenancy renewal, tenancy succession, multiple tenancy holding, enforcement of tenancy terms, etc.</p>	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s) / Discussion	Action required
011506 – 011904	Chairman Mr SHIU Ka-chun Admin	<p>Mr SHIU Ka-chun enquired about the enforcement actions taken by FEHD against tenants' malpractices in public markets (such as unauthorized change of use of stall and inactive operation), the number of such malpractices committed by tenants who entered into tenancy agreements through one-time transfer or succession of tenancy, and the approach to be taken by FEHD to deal with succession or transfer of tenancies based on families ties or otherwise.</p> <p>The Administration responded that FEHD had stepped up its enforcement actions against stall operators' malpractices in accordance with the "warning letter system", and FEHD would terminate the tenancy agreements for repeated offenders. Such enforcement actions would be taken in a fair manner, without regard to whether tenants entered into tenancy agreements through one-time transfer or succession of tenancy.</p> <p>The Administration further advised that tenancy agreements signed after August 2010 no longer allowed for one-time transfer or succession of tenancy agreement. Besides, a new management mode would be implemented in new public markets to be commissioned in the future.</p>	
011905 – 012541	Chairman Mr CHU Hoi-dick Admin	<p>Mr CHU Hoi-dick considered it more appropriate for the Government to intervene into the market so as to adjust the market forces and restore the right balance. Regarding the directions of market reform as stated in paragraphs 6(d) and (f) of the Administration's paper, he considered it more appropriate if the Administration would have regard to the livelihood of small operators such that tenancy would be renewed as long as stall operators did not commit any serious malpractices.</p> <p>The Administration responded that the rental level of newly rented stalls was based on the open auction among small traders. Besides, it was appropriate to have a rental adjustment mechanism that would ensure that rental level for renewal would make reference to</p>	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s) / Discussion	Action required
		<p>comparable auction results. As vibrancy of public markets depended on active operation of stall tenants, tenancy renewal should be underpinned by a fair mechanism to promote healthy turnover of tenants and admissions of new small traders, taking into account past performance of sitting tenants.</p>	
012542 – 013109	Chairman Dr CHIANG Lai-wan Admin	<p>Dr CHIANG Lai-wan expressed disappointment at the unsatisfactory progress of MMP. In her view, it was imperative for the Administration to provide a timetable and a list of candidate public markets that were initially identified for minor improvement works or fundamental overhaul.</p> <p>The Administration responded that as the proposed overhaul of Aberdeen Market had been identified as the pioneering MMP project, engagement with its sitting tenants had been underway. At the same time, FEHD was making preparations for identifying other existing FEHD markets as MMP candidate markets and engaging their sitting tenants along the same reform directions, with a view to progressively working out a mix of projects of different scale over time.</p> <p>The Chairman requested the Administration to follow up on Dr CHIANG's request for information on the timetable and candidate public markets for minor improvement works or fundamental overhaul.</p>	Admin (Para. 7 of the minutes)
013110 – 013814	Chairman Mr CHAN Han-pan Admin	<p>Mr CHAN Han-pan made a declaration of interest that his family members were currently involved in the operation of public market stalls.</p> <p>In Mr CHAN's view, FEHD should expeditiously step up its efforts in daily management and hardware maintenance of public markets. He also considered it unreasonable that FEHD took much longer time than Link to complete renovation/overhaul projects of wet markets. In considering issues relating to rental adjustment, tenancy renewal and tenancy succession, it was necessary to take into</p>	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s) / Discussion	Action required
		<p>account the historical backgrounds of adopting such arrangements, notably provision of public markets to re-site hawkers. Otherwise, the livelihood of small traders would be affected.</p> <p>The Administration responded that the issues in public markets as pointed out by The Ombudsman had all along been major concerns to the Administration, and FEHD planned to take forward management reform premised on the market positioning and reform principles as stated in paragraphs 4 and 5 of the Administration's paper.</p> <p>The Administration also advised that even when wet markets were managed by the former Municipal Councils, concessionary rental arrangements were made to hawkers for the first tenancy usually over a period of three years, and then the rent would be adjusted by making reference to the open market rent after the first tenancy. The Administration pointed out that to ensure the vibrancy of public markets, tenancy renewal should not be taken for granted, and instead, should take into account past performance of sitting tenants.</p>	
013815 – 014145	Chairman Admin	<p>The Chairman considered that FEHD should expeditiously step up its efforts in the daily management and hardware maintenance of public markets. In his view, the Administration should enhance the functions of the Market Management Consultative Committees ("MMCCs") of various public markets, such that a certain amount of funding would be allocated to MMCCs to take forward hardware maintenance of public markets. The Chairman also stressed that in taking forward management reform, the Administration should give regard to the livelihoods of small traders and the grassroots.</p> <p>The Administration responded that FEHD had been tasked to take forward management reform with a view to improving the vibrancy and operating environment of public markets, and would examine ways to enhance the</p>	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s) / Discussion	Action required
		functions of MMCC as a consultative mechanism.	
014146 – 014556	Chairman Mr AU Nok-hin Admin	<p>Mr AU Nok-hin hoped that the management reform could achieve the effect that small traders could continue to operate their stalls at a relatively low rental level, and at the same time, public markets would provide the general public with reasonably-priced fresh food. He considered that FEHD should take enforcement actions against irregularities such as subletting of idling stalls, but he had reservations as to whether such problems had to be tackled by reforming rental adjustment and tenancy renewal mechanisms. In his view, there should be a designated officer responsible for the operation of each public market, and stall operators could participate in the decision making process through the relevant MMCC.</p> <p>The Administration reiterated that FEHD planned to take forward management reform premised on the market positioning and reform principles as stated in paragraphs 4 and 5 of the Administration's paper, with a view that there would be reasonable returns from public market operations, be it social, economic or financial, commensurate to the land, capital and recurrent resources being invested.</p>	
014557 – 014919	Chairman Dr CHIANG Lai-wan Admin	Dr CHIANG Lai-wan reiterated her concern about the outdated hardware and poor environmental hygiene in various districts, particularly public markets in the Yau Tsim Mong District, Sham Shui Po and Kowloon City. She stressed again that it was imperative for the Administration to put forward a timetable and a list of candidate public markets that were initially identified for minor improvement works or fundamental overhaul under MMP. She urged the Administration to provide such information.	
014920 – 015235	Chairman Mr CHU Hoi-dick Admin	Mr CHU Hoi-dick enquired about whether the Administration would give priority to taking forward hardware improvement projects over reforming rental adjustment and tenancy renewal mechanisms, or vice versa.	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s) / Discussion	Action required
		<p>The Administration responded that hardware and software improvement would be taken forward in parallel, based on the principles as stated in the Administration's paper that individual stalls should be allowed to compete on a level playing field, and that public markets as municipal infrastructure should ultimately serve the public interest benefitting the community at large.</p>	
015236 – 015527	Chairman Ms Claudia MO Admin	<p>The Administration undertook to provide a written response to Ms MO's enquiries about the redevelopment plan of Mong Kok Market, including the timing for taking forward the relevant plan and whether health services facilities would be provided therein upon completion of the redevelopment after meeting.</p> <p>The Chairman reminded the Administration to expeditiously provide written responses to the following four letters issued respectively by four members: (a) letter dated 29 June 2018 from Ms Claudia MO (LC Paper No. CB(2)1754/17-18(01)); (b) letter dated 3 July 2018 from Mr Andrew WAN (LC Paper No. CB(2)1754/17-18(02)); (c) letter dated 6 July 2018 from Mr LEUNG Yiu-chung (LC Paper No. CB(2)1780/17-18(01)); and (d) letter dated 31 October 2018 from the Deputy Chairman (LC Paper No. CB(2)179/18-19(01)).</p>	<p>Admin (Para. 9 of the minutes)</p> <p>Admin (Para. 9 of the minutes)</p>
015528 – 020240	Chairman Dr CHIANG Lai-wan Admin	<p>Dr CHIANG Lai-wan reiterated her grave concerns about the lack of details in the implementation of MMP, and urged the Administration to provide more details about the type of revitalization projects to be implemented in public markets in various districts in Kowloon as well as the details of how the \$2 billion would be allocated among various public markets. Dr CHIANG Lai-wan considered that the Administration should conduct a thorough review of the merits and problems of each FEHD market so as to devise a detailed improvement plan.</p> <p>The Administration responded that the paper issued to the Subcommittee in June 2018 (LC Paper No.(2)1544/17-18(01)) had provided factual information on the overall landscape of public markets and besetting problems and</p>	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s) / Discussion	Action required
		<p>anomalies. Under MMP, public markets in various districts would be identified as candidates for projects of different scales. Besides, the Administration would not rule out seeking further funding support for the \$2-billion MMP if warranted.</p> <p>On Dr CHIANG Lai-wan's above view, the Chairman advised that at the previous meeting, he had requested the Administration to provide information on whether the Administration had conducted/would plan to conduct any strategic analysis (e.g. a Strengths-Weaknesses-Opportunities-Threats analysis) of existing public markets in contemplating which type of improvement projects (i.e. fundamental overhaul, retrofitting air-conditioning systems and other improvements or refurbishment and minor upgrading works) would best suit individual public markets. He reminded the Administration to provide its response as soon as possible.</p>	<p>Admin (Para. 8 of the minutes)</p>
<i>Agenda item IV – Any other business</i>			
020241 – 020358	Chairman	The Chairman's consultation with members on meeting arrangements for the next meeting.	