

立法會
Legislative Council

LC Paper No. CB(2)919/18-19
(These minutes have been seen
by the Administration)

Ref : CB2/PS/3/16

Panel on Food Safety and Environmental Hygiene

Subcommittee on Issues Relating to Public Markets

Minutes of meeting

held on Monday, 17 December 2018, at 9:00 am
in Conference Room 1 of the Legislative Council Complex

- Members present** : Hon Wilson OR Chong-shing, MH (Chairman)
Hon HO Kai-ming (Deputy Chairman)
Hon Claudia MO
Hon Steven HO Chun-yin, BBS
Hon CHAN Han-pan, BBS, JP
Dr Hon KWOK Ka-ki
Hon KWOK Wai-keung, JP
Dr Hon Elizabeth QUAT, BBS, JP
Dr Hon CHIANG Lai-wan, SBS, JP
Hon Andrew WAN Siu-kin
Hon CHU Hoi-dick
Hon SHIU Ka-fai
Hon SHIU Ka-chun
Hon YUNG Hoi-yan
Hon LAU Kwok-fan, MH
Hon Jeremy TAM Man-ho
Hon AU Nok-hin
- Member attending** : Hon Michael TIEN Puk-sun, BBS, JP
- Member absent** : Hon Alice MAK Mei-kuen, BBS, JP

**Public Officers : Item I
attending**

Dr CHUI Tak-yi, JP
Under Secretary for Food & Health

Mr Gilford LAW Sun-on
Principal Assistant Secretary for Food and Health
(Food) 2

Ms Karyn CHAN Ching-yuen
Deputy Director (Administration & Development)
Food and Environmental Hygiene Department

Mr Damian CHAN Kwok-wai
Assistant Director (Market Special Duties)
Food and Environmental Hygiene Department

**Attendance : Item I
by invitation**

Session One

Tsz Lok Estate Resident Association

Mr CHEUNG Mau-ching
Community Service Officer

監察公營街市發展聯盟

陳淑淇小姐

實政圓桌

黃頌娛小姐
社區幹事

Development Owners' Committee of the Tung Chung
Crescent

Mr KWOK Kam-cheung
Chairman

Residential Owners' Sub-committee of the Tung Chung Crescent

Mr Richard TSOI Yiu-cheong
Chairman

The Civic Party

Mr LEE Ka-ho
東涌地區發展主任

天晴社區服務處

郭文浩先生
組織幹事

天水圍社區發展網絡

莫曉兒小姐
組織幹事

Individual

黃遠康先生

Tin Shui Wai New Force

Mr TONG Kin-fung
Community Organiser

Individual

吳劍昇先生
葵青區議會議員

Individual

吳家驥先生

Democratic Party

Mr LAU Hong-chun
Spokesperson

Tsz Wan Shan Market Residents Concern Group

Miss LAM Hoi-kiu
Representative

Individual

Dr LEUNG Chi-yuen

Individual

Mr LAI Wai-tong

工聯會新界東辦事處

陳詠彤小姐
將軍澳社區幹事

東涌公眾街市關注組

Miss FUNG Siu-yin
成員

Democratic Alliance for the Betterment and Progress of
Hong Kong

Mr WU Cheuk-him
Deputy Spokesperson on Food Safety and
Environmental Hygiene

Session Two

Individual

Mr LAU Chin-pang

Individual

Mr WONG Chun-kit

Individual

Miss CHU Lam

Individual

Miss CHEN Yu-ting

Tin Shui Wai Community Development Alliance

Mr YEUNG Kin-bun
Community Officer

Individual

Mr LUI Man-kwong

東涌社區發展陣線

張延先生
成員

Individual

Mr LAU Wing-yin

改善東涌居民組

方龍飛先生
成員

Individual

Mr LEE Kin-chung

自由黨

李鎮強先生
副主席

Individual

Mr POON Cheuk-bun

Individual

Ms HO Loy

The Association of the Residents of Private Buildings
of Kwai Fong District

Ms LEUNG Man-yi
秘書

關注葵芳榮芳街街市重建小組

Miss CHAU Man-yuk
發言人

Tsz Wan Shan Constructive Power

Dr SHAM Yu-hin
社區主任

Individual

Miss Anita CHAN Wai-sum

Individual

Mr YIP Pui-kei

港九新界販商社團聯合會

Mr LAM Fook-chuen
常務副主席兼街市委員會主席

漁灣街市檯商協進會

Mr WONG Chiu-yen
主席

西灣河商戶聯會

Mr KONG Chack-ho
主席

香港仔街市商會

Mr CHAN Kin-wa
主席

大圍街市互助委員會

Mr HEUNG Chung-wan
主席

大成街街市臺商協會

Mr HUI Chi-kuen
主席

鰂魚涌街市臺商會

Mr NGAN Chi-fai
主席

Individual

Mr WONG Yat-yuk
Wong Tai Sin District Council Member

Clerk in attendance : Ms Alice LEUNG
Chief Council Secretary (2) 6

Staff in attendance : Mr Richard WONG
Senior Council Secretary (2) 8

Miss Meisy KWOK
Legislative Assistant (2) 6

Action

I. Issues relating to planning and provision of public markets
(LC Paper Nos. CB(2)186/18-19(01), (03) and CB(2)444/18-19(01))

The Subcommittee deliberated (index of proceedings attached at **Annex**).

2. The Subcommittee received oral representations from 45 deputations/individuals attending the meeting. Members also noted that six written submissions from deputations/individuals not attending the

Action

meeting had been received by the Subcommittee. The major views expressed by the deputations/individuals were summarized as follows:

- (a) in planning for new public markets in various districts, the Administration should consider providing cooked food centres and incorporating various community facilities (such as social and welfare services) in the same Government complex, so as to better meet the daily needs of the local community. Besides, the Administration should release more details of new public markets under planning, such as the implementation timetable and construction cost. If new public markets could not be provided in the near future, the Administration should identify suitable sites for providing temporary public markets;
- (b) the site selected for building the new public market in Tung Chung Area 6 was not suitable for developing a high-rise building, as it would give rise to various adverse impacts including traffic congestion and poor air quality. Therefore, the Administration should consider identifying another site for building the new public market in Tung Chung;
- (c) the site selected for building the new public market in Tin Shui Wai could not fully satisfy the needs of local residents, particularly those living in the northern part of Tin Shui Wai. Therefore, the Administration should provide a public market in the northern part of Tin Shui Wai, in addition to the market currently under planning;
- (d) the Administration should provide new public markets and/or revitalize existing markets in various districts, particularly those districts where fresh provision outlets in their vicinity were owned by the Link Real Estate Investment Trust or other private enterprises (e.g. Tsz Wan Shan, Tseung Kwan O and Ma On Shan) as well as those districts where wet markets managed by the Food and Environmental Hygiene Department ("FEHD") were old and outdated (e.g. Kwai Fong and Sham Tseng);
- (e) provision of air-conditioning ("A/C") systems was an important factor affecting the operating environment of public markets. In order to encourage more stall tenants to support retrofitting A/C systems in their respective public markets, the Administration should bear the A/C charges for common areas in public markets, as well as the maintenance costs of A/C systems; and

Action

- (f) in planning for new public market projects, the Administration should engage local residents and release as much details as possible. Besides, in taking forward the Market Modernization Programme and management reform of public markets, FEHD should engage the stakeholders, particular the affected stall tenants.

3. The Administration gave a consolidated response to the views expressed by the deputations/individuals as follows:

- (a) given that the provision of a new public market required the use of scarce land resources and entailed public financial commitment, in considering whether a public market should be built, the Administration had to duly assess the need for the market and cost effectiveness and to ensure proper use of public resources. The Administration would consider the provision of new public markets on a case-by-case basis, taking into account relevant factors including demographic mix, community needs, provision of both public and private market facilities nearby and number of fresh provision retail outlets in the vicinity. In the process, the actual situation of individual districts and the views of stakeholders would also be taken into account. Having said that, given the land scarcity in developed areas, the difficulty in identifying suitable sites for providing public markets in developed areas could not be underestimated;
- (b) as in the case of permanent markets, a considerable amount of resources would be required and relevant hygiene and safety requirements would need to be fulfilled for providing basic facilities in temporary markets, if they were to be built. Therefore, the difficulty in planning and providing temporary markets could not be underestimated and FEHD currently had no plans to provide temporary markets;
- (c) in respect of site selection for public markets in individual districts, the following parameters would be pertinent: (i) the site, and in turn each floor of the building erected upon, should be reasonably large in size to accommodate the wet market in one or two floors; (ii) the site itself should bestow heavy pedestrian traffic on the future market, which should best be achieved by a location next to a major transport hub where commuters frequent every day; (iii) where possible, the site

Action

should best be part of, or adjacent to, a retail and catering cluster in a commercial setting, for synergy effect to boost business; and (iv) in line with Government policy, where the site was zoned for "Government, Institution or Community" purposes, the Administration would pursue the "single site, multiple use" model in multi-storey developments and welcome collaboration with other public agencies to accommodate compatible use;

- (d) the Administration had consulted the relevant district councils ("DCs") on the preliminary proposals of new public markets in Tin Shui Wai and Tung Chung, and would take forward these new market projects in accordance with established procedures. Given that many works including technical feasibility study, transport assessment and environmental impact assessment had to be carried out, the Administration would consult the relevant DCs and relevant committees of the Legislative Council ("LegCo") when details of the projects were finalized. Besides, the Administration was pursuing a number of new public market projects in areas such as Tseung Kwan O, Kwu Tung North New Development Area ("NDA"), Hung Shui Kiu NDA and Tung Chung New Town Extension. These projects were at different stages of planning, and the Administration would continue to study the need and feasibility of providing new public markets in other districts as appropriate;
- (e) the Administration took the view that (i) public markets should principally be operating on a commercial basis allowing market forces to play in full swing; (ii) individual stalls should be allowed to compete on a level playing field; and (iii) public markets as municipal infrastructure should ultimately serve the public interest benefitting the community at large. The dedicated team set up in FEHD to improve the operating environment of existing public markets was conducting a review and developing ideas for translation into concrete management measures for implementation in public markets; and
- (f) in taking forward the planning and implementation of public works projects and management reform of public markets, the Administration would follow established procedures, including conducting local consultation with the relevant DCs and seeking LegCo's funding approval.

II. Any other business

Date of next meeting and the meeting arrangements

4. The Chairman informed members that the next meeting would be held on 21 January 2019, and one of the discussion items would be "Rental adjustment mechanism for public market stalls". The Chairman also said that he would also arrange to discuss at the next meeting other items on issues which members had raised concerns at previous meetings but not yet discussed by the Subcommittee. Members raised no objection to the above meeting arrangements and noted that the Secretariat would advise them of the detailed arrangements in due course.

(Post-meeting note: Members were informed on 28 December 2018 vide LC Paper No. CB(2)519/18-19 that the following three items would be discussed at the next meeting: (a) "Rental adjustment mechanism for public market stalls"; (b) "Vacancy situation in public markets and related issues"; and (c) "Further discussion on the modus operandi of the Market Modernization Programme".)

5. There being no other business, the meeting ended at 1:00 pm.

Council Business Division 2
Legislative Council Secretariat
5 March 2019

**Proceedings of the meeting of the
Subcommittee on Issues Relating to Public Markets
on Monday, 17 December 2018, at 9:00 am
in Conference Room 1 of the Legislative Council Complex**

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s) / Discussion	Action required
<i>Agenda item I – Issues relating to planning and provision of public markets</i>			
<i>Session One</i>			
001038 – 001456	Chairman	The Chairman's opening remarks	
001457 – 001757	Mr CHEUNG Mau-ching, Tsz Lok Estate Resident Association	Presentation of views	
001758 – 002015	黃頌嫻小姐，實政圓桌	Presentation of views	
002016 – 002334	Mr KWOK Kam-cheung, Development Owners' Committee of the Tung Chung Crescent	Presentation of views (LC Paper No. CB(2)477/18-19(01))	
002335 – 002655	Mr Richard TSOI Yiu-cheong, Residential Owners' Sub-committee of the Tung Chung Crescent	Presentation of views (LC Paper No. CB(2)477/18-19(01))	
002656 – 002948	Mr LEE Ka-ho, The Civic Party	Presentation of views (LC Paper No. CB(2)477/18-19(09))	
002949 – 003305	郭文浩先生，天晴社區服務處	Presentation of views (LC Paper No. CB(2)477/18-19(08))	
003306 – 003617	莫曉兒小姐，天水圍社區發展網絡	Presentation of views (LC Paper No. CB(2)477/18-19(08))	
003618 – 003932	黃遠康先生	Presentation of views	
003933 – 004236	Mr TONG Kin-fung, Tin Shui Wai New Force	Presentation of views (LC Paper No. CB(2)477/18-19(08))	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s) / Discussion	Action required
004237 – 004452	Mr NG Ka-kei	Presentation of views	
004453 – 004815	Mr LAU Hong-chun, Democratic Party	Presentation of views (LC Paper Nos. CB(2)477/18-19(02) and (07))	
004816 – 005123	Dr LEUNG Chi-yuen	Presentation of views	
005124 – 005431	Miss LAM Hoi-kiu, Tsz Wan Shan Market Residents Concern Group	Presentation of views (LC Paper No. CB(2)477/18-19(07))	
005432 – 005731	Mr LAI Wai-tong	Presentation of views	
005732 – 010021	陳詠彤小姐，工聯 會新界東辦事處	Presentation of views (LC Paper No. CB(2)444/18-19(03))	
010022 – 010330	Miss FUNG Siu-yin, 東涌公眾街市關 注組	Presentation of views (LC Paper Nos. CB(2)477/18-19(03), (10) and CB(2)725/18-19(01))	
010331 – 010625	Mr WU Cheuk-him, Democratic Alliance for the Betterment and Progress of Hong Kong	Presentation of views (LC Paper No. CB(2)477/18-19(04))	
010626 – 010940	陳淑淇小姐，監察 公營街市發展 聯盟	Presentation of views (LC Paper No. CB(2)477/18-19(08))	
010941 – 011333	吳劍昇先生，葵青 區議會議員	Presentation of views	
011334 – 011908	Chairman Admin	The Administration gave a consolidated response to the views expressed by deputations/individuals, as set out in paragraph 3(a) to (f) of the minutes of the meeting.	
011909 – 012341	Chairman Dr CHIANG Lai-wan Admin	Dr CHIANG Lai-wan expressed grave concern about the implementation progress of the Market Modernization Programme ("MMP"). She urged the Administration to release as soon as possible the criteria for determining which public markets would be selected for fundamental overhaul or	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s) / Discussion	Action required
		<p>minor improvement works under MMP. Pointing out that some of the public markets in urban areas had operated for more than 50 years (e.g. Yau Ma Tei Market), she asked whether these markets would be given priority for fundamental overhaul under MMP.</p> <p>The Administration advised that the dedicated team set up in the Food Safety and Environmental Hygiene Department ("FEHD") had been reviewing the overall landscape of public markets in a critical and systematic manner. As regards MMP, public markets would be selected with regard to their geographical location and distribution, condition of facilities, business viability, community needs and tenants' readiness.</p>	
012342 – 012859	Chairman Ms YUNG Hoi-yan Admin	<p>Ms YUNG Hoi-yan considered it undesirable that the Administration did not exercise any monitoring over the operation of wet markets owned by the Link Real Estate Investment Trust ("Link") or other private enterprises. She urged the Administration to provide new public markets in those districts where only Link or privately-operated wet markets were available, e.g. Tseung Kwan O. She also suggested that in planning for new public markets, the Administration should incorporate public markets into government complexes so as to better serve the community needs, as in the case of Tai Po Market.</p> <p>The Administration advised that in line with the Government policy, where the site was zoned for "Government, Institution or Community" purposes, the Administration would pursue the "single site, multiple use" model in multi-storey developments and welcome collaboration with other public agencies to accommodate compatible use. Besides, FEHD would take forward management reform of public markets so as to, among others, provide a proper trade mix in public markets and ensure that sufficient choices for fresh provisions were provided in various districts.</p>	
012900 – 013348	Chairman Mr SHIU Ka-chun Admin	Mr SHIU Ka-chun considered that the inadequate provision of public markets were due to the divestment of commercial facilities in public rental housing estates in 2005 by the Hong Kong	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s) / Discussion	Action required
		<p>Housing Authority, as well as the review of the Hong Kong Planning Standards and Guidelines ("HKPSG") in 2009 regarding the provision of public markets. He sought more details about the public markets under planning in Tung Chung and Tin Shui Wai, including the implementation timetable and construction cost. He considered that prior to the commencement of these new public markets, the Administration should provide temporary markets in those districts.</p> <p>The Administration advised that the relevant district councils ("DCs") had been consulted on the preliminary proposals of the two public markets respectively, and FEHD would take forward these projects according to established procedures. Once detailed designs of the two public markets were ready, the Administration would revert to the relevant DCs and the relevant committees of the Legislative Council ("LegCo"). As regards temporary markets, as in the case of permanent markets, the Administration had to take into consideration the hygiene and safety requirements and put in a considerable amount of resources to provide basic facilities such as water supply and sewerage systems. The difficulty in planning and providing temporary markets could not be underestimated. FEHD currently had no plans to provide temporary markets.</p>	
013349 – 013832	<p>Chairman Mr CHU Hoi-dick Mr Richard TSOI Yiu-cheong, Residential Owners' Sub-committee of the Tung Chung Crescent Admin</p>	<p>In response to Mr CHU Hoi-dick's enquiry, Mr Richard TSOI reiterated his objection to the Administration's proposal of providing a public market in a high-rise commercial building in Tung Chung Area 6.</p> <p>Mr CHU Hoi-dick enquired whether the Administration would take into consideration the views of residents in Tung Chung, and whether an additional public market would be provided in Tin Shui Wai so as to accommodate residents in the northern part of Tin Shui Wai.</p> <p>The Administration advised that when taking forward the two public market projects in Tung Chung and Tin Shui Wai, FEHD would carefully consider the views of relevant DCs and local residents, taking into account actual situation in the districts.</p>	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s) / Discussion	Action required
013833 – 014242	Chairman Deputy Chairman Admin	<p>The Deputy Chairman expressed concern about the inadequate number of fresh provision outlets which met the needs of local residents in old urban districts, such as Tsz Wan Shan, where wet markets were owned by private enterprises such as Link. He suggested that FEHD should explore options to increase the number of fresh provision outlets in these districts, e.g. by providing temporary markets and giving permission for trucks/vans to sell fruits and vegetables.</p> <p>The Administration reiterated its position stated earlier in relation to the provision of temporary markets. Having said that, the Administration would explore various options to increase the number of shopping outlets where appropriate and feasible, e.g. bazaars.</p>	
014243 – 014702	Chairman Mr SHIU Ka-fai Mr Richard TSOI Yiu-cheong, Residential Owners' Sub-committee of the Tung Chung Crescent Admin	<p>In response to Mr SHIU Ka-fai's enquiry, Mr Richard TSOI reiterated his view that it was undesirable to build a high-rise commercial building in Tung Chung Area 6.</p> <p>In response to Mr SHIU Ka-fai's enquiry, the Administration advised that since 2016, the zoning of the site had been converted from "Government, Institution or Community" to "Commercial" as approved by the Town Planning Board.</p>	
014703 – 015143	Chairman Mr Andrew WAN Admin	<p>Mr Andrew WAN expressed concern about the inadequate number of public markets in various districts. He also expressed dissatisfaction that the Administration had not provided much details of the public market projects in Tin Shui Wai and Tung Chung. He suggested that prior to the commencement of these new markets, the Administration should provide temporary markets in those districts.</p> <p>The Administration reiterated that the relevant DCs had been consulted on the preliminary proposals of the two public markets, and the Administration would take forward these projects according to established procedures. Once more detailed designs of the two public markets were ready, the Administration would revert to the relevant DCs.</p>	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s) / Discussion	Action required
015144 – 015708	Chairman Admin	<p>The Chairman expressed strong dissatisfaction that the Administration had not directly addressed the concerns raised by deputations. He urged FEHD to better engage stakeholders, particularly local residents and stall tenants, when taking forward measures to improve the hardware and software of public markets. He also reminded the Administration that the Subcommittee had requested it to provide updated information on the implementation of MMP and advise on whether it would plan to conduct a Strengths-Weaknesses-Opportunities-Threats analysis of existing public markets.</p> <p>The Administration advised that FEHD had maintained communication with relevant stakeholders including the relevant DCs, stall tenant associations, and Market Management Consultative Committees. Further information on the implementation of MMP would be provided to the Subcommittee in due course.</p>	
015709 – 020709	Chairman	Five-minute break for the meeting	
<i>Session Two</i>			
020710 – 021111	Chairman	The Chairman's opening remarks for Session Two	
021112 – 021417	Mr LAU Chin-pang	Presentation of views	
021418 – 021720	Mr WONG Chun-kit	Presentation of views (LC Paper No. CB(2)477/18-19(11))	
021721 – 021904	Miss CHU Lam	Presentation of views	
021905 – 022039	Miss CHEN Yu-ting	Presentation of views	
022040 – 022348	Mr YEUNG Kin-bun, Tin Shui Wai Community Development Alliance	Presentation of views	
022349 – 022649	Mr LUI Man-kwong	Presentation of views	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s) / Discussion	Action required
022650 – 022949	張延先生，東涌社區發展陣線	Presentation of views	
022950 – 022311	Mr LAU Wing-yin	Presentation of views	
022312 – 023548	方龍飛先生，改善東涌居民組	Presentation of views (LC Paper No. CB(2)477/18-19(08))	
023549 – 023852	Mr LEE Kin-chung	Presentation of views	
023853 – 024202	李鎮強先生，自由黨	Presentation of views	
024203 – 024457	Mr POON Cheuk-bun	Presentation of views	
024458 – 024832	Ms HO Loy	Presentation of views (LC Paper No. CB(2)477/18-19(06))	
024833 – 025138	Ms LEUNG Man-yi, The Association of the Residents of Private Buildings of Kwai Fong District	Presentation of views (LC Paper No. CB(2)444/18-19(05))	
025139 – 025430	Miss CHAU Man-yuk, 關注葵芳榮芳街 街市重建小組	Presentation of views	
025431 – 025736	Dr SHAM Yu-hin, Tsz Wan Shan Constructive Power	Presentation of views	
025737 – 030040	Miss Anita CHAN Wai-sum	Presentation of views	
030041 – 030341	Mr YIP Pui-kei	Presentation of views (LC Paper No. CB(2)444/18-19(06))	
030342 – 030616	Mr LAM Fook-chuen, 港九新界販商社 團聯合會	Presentation of views	
030617 – 030927	Mr WONG Chiu-yen, 漁灣街市檯商協 進會	Presentation of views	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s) / Discussion	Action required
030928 – 031153	Mr KONG Chack-ho, 西灣河商戶聯會	Presentation of views	
031154 – 031515	Mr CHAN Kin-wa, 香港仔街市商會	Presentation of views	
031516 – 031828	Mr HEUNG Chung-wan, 大圍街市互助委員會	Presentation of views	
031829 – 032128	Mr HUI Chi-kuen, 大成街街市檯商協會	Presentation of views	
032129 – 032432	Mr NGAN Chi-fai, 鰂魚涌街市檯商會	Presentation of views	
032433 – 032745	Mr WONG Yat-yuk, Wong Tai Sin District Council Member	Presentation of views (LC Paper No. CB(2)477/18-19(07))	
032746 – 033143	Chairman Admin	The Administration gave a consolidated response to the views expressed by deputations/individuals, as set out in paragraph 3(a) to (f) the minutes of the meeting. <i>(Extension of meeting for 15 minutes beyond the appointed ending time)</i>	
033144 – 033549	Chairman Mr SHIU Ka-fai 李鎮強先生, 自由黨 Admin	Mr SHIU Ka-fai declared that he was currently a honorary President of "港九新界販商社團聯合會". He expressed reservation about the direction of management reform of public markets put forward by the Administration, and urged the Administration to (a) engage the stakeholders, particular stall tenants, in taking forward MMP as well as management reform of public markets; and (b) further lower the existing 80% threshold for taking forward retrofitting of air-conditioning facilities in public markets. In particular, Mr SHIU took the view that the Administration should be very careful in taking forward reform related to rental adjustment and tenancy agreements, as the livelihoods of stall tenants were at stake.	
033550 – 034033	Chairman Dr Elizabeth QUAT Admin	Dr Elizabeth QUAT expressed concern about the inadequate supply of public markets in Ma On Shan and Tseung Kwan O. Besides, she urged	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s) / Discussion	Action required
		<p>the Administration to be more accommodating to tenants' requests when taking forward the retrofitting of air-conditioning facilities in Tai Wai Market, so as to protect the livelihoods of the affected stall tenants.</p> <p>The Administration advised that FEHD had maintained communication with tenants of Tai Wai Market, and sought to work out an agreeable concessionary arrangement with the affected stall tenants before commissioning the retrofitting works. The latest concessionary arrangement was that (a) for the first 10-month period where a few tenants would be directly affected, a 50% rental waiver would be granted to all market tenants; (b) no rental payable for the seven-month period of full market closure; and (c) three-month full rental plus air-conditioning charge waiver would be granted to all tenants after re-opening of the market.</p>	
034034 – 034449	Chairman Mr SHIU Ka-chun Admin	<p>Mr SHIU Ka-chun reiterated his views that (a) provision of air-conditioning facilities was one of the basic requirements of public markets; (b) the Administration should provide temporary markets in various districts; and (c) a cooked food centre should be provided in the proposed public market in Tung Chung.</p> <p>The Administration reiterated its position on temporary markets as stated earlier at the meeting, and added that FEHD noted the views of members and residents in Tung Chung, and would make a final decision concerning cooked food stalls when the detailed design was worked out.</p>	
034450 – 034857	Chairman Deputy Chairman Admin	<p>The Deputy Chairman considered that public markets played an important function in maintaining social stability. He did not concur with the Administration's view that public markets were operating on a commercial basis, and suggested that the Administration should not adopt the "user-pays" principle in setting the air-conditioning charges in public markets.</p> <p>The Administration advised that the high capital costs of retrofitting air-conditioning facilities were borne entirely by the Government, and the Government would not recover the capital costs. As tenants in public markets were commercial operators and had not undergone any means test,</p>	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s) / Discussion	Action required
		<p>the Administration considered it appropriate that air-conditioning charges in public markets should follow the "user-pays" principle.</p>	
034858 – 035313	Chairman Mr KWOK Wai-keung Admin	<p>Mr KWOK Wai-keung considered it inappropriate for the Administration to emphasize that "public markets should principally be operating on a commercial basis" without giving due consideration to the historical background of public markets and the livelihoods of stall tenants. In his view, FEHD should take into account the views and concerns of stall tenants when taking forward management reform, particularly those measures related to rental adjustment and tenancy arrangement. He also expressed concern about the fire in Yue Kwong Road Market, which occurred in early December 2018, and requested FEHD to provide necessary assistance to the affected stall tenants.</p> <p>The Administration reiterated that FEHD had all along endeavored to communicate with stall tenants when taking forward any hardware and software improvement measures. Having regard to the historical background of public markets, FEHD had adopted a flexible approach in its management of public markets.</p>	
035314 – 035811	Chairman Mr Michael TIEN Admin	<p>Mr Michael TIEN expressed support for the Administration to take forward management reforms of public markets as set out in its paper. He, however, suggested that the Administration should avoid leasing public market stalls to the highest bidders through open auction, but instead, the rental level should be set at a certain discount rate (e.g. 80% or 90% of the market rental value). Besides, tenancy terms should be designed in such a way that (a) each tenancy would be on a relatively short term (say, two years); (b) each stall tenant would be given an incentive to increase its turnover; and (c) tenancy renewal would not be granted to tenants whose performance in terms of turnover was unsatisfactory as compared to other tenants and/or compliance record with tenancy terms was poor.</p> <p>The Administration noted various views raised by members on the direction of management reform of public markets, adding that FEHD had already stepped up its enforcement actions against</p>	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s) / Discussion	Action required
		non-compliance with tenancy terms in public markets.	
035812 – 040221	Chairman Admin	<p>The Chairman suggested that the Administration should (a) conduct a review of HKPSG in respect of provision of public markets; and (b) carry out feasibility study of providing public markets in various urban districts where wet markets were owned by private enterprises. He also urged the Administration to provide the implementation timetable for various new market projects under planning. Besides, he considered that in implementing management reform of public markets, the Administration should avoid modelling the operation of public markets after Link.</p> <p>The Administration advised that under the existing HKPSG, the planning of public markets was based on a more holistic consideration of all relevant factors including population in the district, and the provision of new public markets would be considered on a case-by-case basis in a flexible manner. In the process, relevant factors set out in HKPSG, the actual situation of individual districts and the views of stakeholders would be taken into account. As regards the new market projects under planning (i.e. Tung Chung and Tin Shui Wai), many works including technical feasibility study, transport assessment and environmental impact assessment had to be carried out. Therefore, there was no concrete timetable for the projects at the present stage. The Administration would consult the relevant DCs and the relevant committees of LegCo when details of projects were finalized.</p>	
<i>Agenda item II – Any other business</i>			
040222 – 040343	Chairman	Date of next meeting and the meeting arrangements.	