

**立法會**  
**Legislative Council**

LC Paper No. CB(1)1007/18-19  
(These minutes have been seen  
by the Administration)

Ref : CB1/PS/1/18

**Panel on Housing**

**Subcommittee to Follow Up Issues Related to Inadequate Housing and  
Relevant Housing Policies**

**Minutes of fourth meeting held on  
Tuesday, 19 March 2019, at 2:30 pm  
in Conference Room 3 of the Legislative Council Complex**

**Members present** : Hon Vincent CHENG Wing-shun, MH (Chairman)  
Hon Andrew WAN Siu-kin (Deputy Chairman)  
Hon James TO Kun-sun  
Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung  
Hon Paul TSE Wai-chun, JP  
Hon WU Chi-wai, MH  
Hon Alice MAK Mei-kuen, BBS, JP  
Hon KWOK Wai-keung, JP  
Hon CHU Hoi-dick  
Hon SHIU Ka-fai  
Hon CHEUNG Kwok-kwan, JP  
Hon Jeremy TAM Man-ho  
Hon Tony TSE Wai-chuen, BBS  
Hon CHAN Hoi-yan

**Members absent** : Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, GBS, JP  
Hon Starry LEE Wai-king, SBS, JP  
Hon Mrs Regina IP LAU Suk-ye, GBS, JP  
Hon CHAN Han-pan, BBS, JP  
Dr Hon Fernando CHEUNG Chiu-hung  
Hon SHIU Ka-chun  
Hon Wilson OR Chong-shing, MH  
Hon KWONG Chun-yu

**Public Officers  
attending**

: Agenda item III

Transport and Housing Bureau

Dr Raymond SO, BBS, JP  
Under Secretary for Transport and Housing

Ms Jenny CHAN Yuen-han  
Assistant Director (Policy Support)

Mr CHAN Nap-ming  
Project Director 1, Task Force on Transitional  
Housing

Mr Stephen WONG Wing-hung  
Project Director 2, Task Force on Transitional  
Housing

**Attendance by  
invitation**

: Hong Kong Housing Society

Mr James CHAN Yum-min  
Deputy Chief Executive Officer

Mr Eric YEUNG Ka-hong  
Director (Development and Marketing)

Urban Renewal Authority

Mr Ian WONG Wai-kuen  
Director (Acquisition & Clearance)

Hong Kong Council of Social Service

Mr Anthony WONG Kin-wai  
Business Director

Light Be

Mr Ricky YU Wai-yip  
Founder & CEO

Ms Amen TSANG Ching-man  
Communication Manager

**Clerk in attendance** : Mr Daniel SIN  
Chief Council Secretary (1)6

**Staff in attendance** : Ms Mandy LI  
Senior Council Secretary (1)6

Mr Patrick CHOI  
Council Secretary (1)6

Miss Yolanda CHEUK  
Legislative Assistant (1)6

---

Action

**I. Confirmation of minutes**

(LC Paper No. CB(1)706/18-19 -- Minutes of meeting held on  
22 January 2019)

The minutes of the meeting held on 22 January 2019 were confirmed.

**II. Matters arising from previous meeting**

(LC Paper No. CB(1)719/18-19(01) -- List of follow-up actions

LC Paper No. CB(1)719/18-19(02) -- Administration's written  
response to the list of follow  
up actions and the six  
motions passed at the  
meeting on 19 February 2019)

**III. Presentations on measures to address the problem of inadequate housing**

(LC Paper No. CB(1)728/18-19(01) -- Information paper from the  
Hong Kong Council of Social  
Service (Chinese version  
only)

LC Paper No. CB(1)728/18-19(02) -- Information paper from  
Light Be (Chinese version  
only))

The Subcommittee deliberated (index of proceedings in the **Appendix**).

Motion

2. The Deputy Chairman proposed a motion under the agenda item. The Chairman ruled that the motion was related to the item under discussion. The Subcommittee agreed and the Chairman put the following motion to vote:

*The motion proposed by the Deputy Chairman:*

對於政府拒絕將過渡性房屋建屋量納入《長遠房屋策略》，本委員會表示遺憾，並要求政府重新考慮該建議，因應未來10年公營房屋供應量不足，以確保能夠提供穩定的過渡性房屋，紓緩居於惡劣住屋環境的住戶需要。

本委員會亦要求政府於立法會於今年7月休會前，交代路政署及香港鐵路有限公司就廣深港高鐵及沙中線項目交還有關臨時工地的用地興建過渡性房屋的檢討結果。

(Translation)

This Subcommittee regrets that the Government has refused to include a supply target for transitional housing in the Long Term Housing Strategy and requests it to reconsider the proposal in view of the insufficient supply of public housing in the next 10 years, so as to ensure a stable supply of transitional housing to ease the hardship of those living in poor conditions.

This Subcommittee also requests the Government to, before the Legislative Council goes into recess in July this year, give an account of the findings of the review regarding the provision of transitional housing by using the temporary works areas of the Guangzhou-Shenzhen-Hong Kong Express Rail Link project and the Shatin to Central Link project to be returned by the Highways Department and the MTR Corporation Limited.

3. As a majority of members present voted for the above motion, the Chairman declared that the motion was carried and requested the Administration to respond to the concerns raised by the Subcommittee.

*(Post-meeting note: The motion was issued to members in LC Paper No. CB(1)748/18-19(01) on 22 March 2019.)*

**IV. Any other business**

4. There being no other business, the meeting ended at 4:25 pm.

Council Business Division 1  
Legislative Council Secretariat  
14 May 2019

## Panel on Housing

## Subcommittee to Follow Up Issues Related to Inadequate Housing and Relevant Housing Policies

Proceedings of fourth meeting  
on Tuesday, 19 March 2019, at 2:30 pm  
in Conference Room 3 of the Legislative Council Complex

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
<b>Agenda item I — Confirmation of minutes</b>			
001014 – 001033	Chairman	Minutes of the meeting held on 22 January 2019	
<b>Agenda item II — Matters arising from previous meeting</b>			
001034 – 001135	Chairman	Matters arising from the previous meeting	
<b>Agenda item III — Presentations on measures to address the problem of inadequate housing</b>			
001136 – 001805	Chairman Administration	Briefing by the Administration	
001806 – 002229	Mr James CHAN Yum-min, Hong Kong Housing Society ("HKHS")	Presentation of views	
002230 – 002528	Mr Ian WONG Wai-kuen, Urban Renewal Authority ("URA")	Presentation of views	
002529 – 003233	Mr Anthony WONG Kin-wai, Hong Kong Council of Social Service ("HKCSS")	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(1)728/18-19(01)]	
003234 – 004140	Mr Ricky YU Wai-yip, Light Be	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(1)728/18-19(02)]	
004141 – 004929	Chairman Mr Jeremy TAM Man-ho Mr Ricky YU Wai-yip, Light Be Administration	Mr Jeremy TAM Man-ho asked if Light Be would make use of the exemption provisions in the Buildings Ordinance (Cap. 123) and develop transitional housing units fitted with artificial lighting and mechanical ventilation in place of natural lighting and ventilation.  Founder & CEO of Light Be replied that Light Be	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>would provide transitional housing units with windows in every room as far as possible.</p> <p>Mr Jeremy TAM Man-ho asked if the exemption provisions in Cap. 123 were meaningful if no organizations would adopt them.</p> <p>The Administration explained that some old tenement houses with deep footprint and narrow frontage might not have adequate natural lighting and ventilation. With suitable artificial lighting and mechanical ventilation, such premises could still be fit for abode if they were able to fulfil the relevant requirements and pose no health hazards to inhabitants.</p>	
004930 – 010020	<p>Chairman Mr LEUNG Yiu-chung Mr Ricky YU Wai-yip, Light Be Mr Anthony WONG Kin-wai, HKCSS</p>	<p>Mr LEUNG Yiu-chung commended non-government organizations' (NGOs) contribution in the provision of transitional housing, although the supply was far from meeting the shortfall. Mr LEUNG criticized the Administration for shifting responsibility to NGOs despite the fact that it had the financial and land resources to deal with the issue.</p> <p>Founder &amp; CEO of Light Be and Business Director of HKCSS commented that NGOs could only play a supplementary role in the provision of transitional housing, but they had the flexibility in experimenting different ideas to address the special needs of different target groups. They welcomed the Administration's initiative to step up support for NGOs in implementing transitional housing projects.</p>	
010021 – 010715	<p>Chairman Deputy Chairman Administration</p>	<p>The Deputy Chairman commended NGOs for their contribution in promoting transitional housing. He criticized the Administration for failing to take the lead in the provision of transitional housing. The Deputy Chairman suggested that the Administration should:</p> <p>(i) set a target for the provision of transitional housing as part of its overall housing policy in its Long Term Housing Strategy ("LTHS");</p> <p>(ii) announce detailed plans before July this year regarding its consideration on the use of the temporary works areas of public works projects, such as the Guangzhou-Shenzhen-Hong Kong</p>	

<b>Time marker</b>	<b>Speaker</b>	<b>Subject(s)</b>	<b>Action required</b>
		<p>Express Rail Link project and the Shatin to Central Link project, for the provision of transitional housing; and</p> <p>(iii) explore the use of the site earmarked for phase two development of Hong Kong Disneyland for transitional housing.</p> <p>Given the demographic changes and the changing supply of transitional housing, the Administration advised that it would be impractical to set a rigid target for the supply of transitional housing.</p> <p>The Administration added that relevant departments were working together to examine whether certain works areas could be used for development of transitional housing.</p> <p>As regards the site reserved for Hong Kong Disneyland Resort's Phase 2 development ("Phase 2 site"), the Administration explained that while certain temporary uses were permitted under the relevant agreement made between the Government and Hongkong International Theme Parks Limited (i.e. the joint venture with the Government and The Walt Disney Company as shareholders), such short-term uses had to comply with the various permitted uses as listed in the Deed of Restrictive Covenant, including recreational, sports and cultural facilities, etc. but not residential use (e.g. development of transitional housing). The Government had to respect contractual spirit and had no intention to change the existing land use arrangements for the Phase 2 site.</p>	
010716 – 011745	<p>Chairman Mr James CHAN Yum-min, HKHS Mr Ian WONG Wai-kuen, URA</p>	<p>The Chairman asked about the progress of HKHS's transitional housing projects in the pipeline.</p> <p>Deputy Chief Executive Officer of HKHS said that an enhanced Letting Scheme For Subsidized Sale Developments With Premium Unpaid would be announced by mid-2019. HKHS was also examining two sites which had higher potential for transitional housing development. It was expected that further details could be announced later this year.</p> <p>The Chairman asked whether URA could make use of the accommodation units it had acquired as a result of urban renewal projects for the provision of</p>	

<b>Time marker</b>	<b>Speaker</b>	<b>Subject(s)</b>	<b>Action required</b>
		<p>transitional housing.</p> <p>Director (Acquisition &amp; Clearance) of URA said that except those units in URA's rehousing blocks, it might not be feasible to use properties acquired pending redevelopment for transitional housing purposes. He explained that many of those units in the latter were in dilapidated conditions, with many illegal structures and lacked fire-safety facilities. The structural safety of those premises might have been compromised by many alteration works and sub-divisions, so that those units might no longer be suitable for residential purposes without having undertaken large scale repair and conversion works.</p>	
011746 – 012453	Chairman Mr James TO Kun-sun Administration	<p>Mr James TO Kun-sun criticized the Administration for passing the responsibility of the provision of transitional housing to NGOs.</p> <p>Mr TO commented that the Administration should incorporate transitional housing into LTHS and formulate a detailed plan and concrete targets to tackle the housing issue in Hong Kong.</p> <p>The Administration said that, in projecting the long-term housing supply under LTHS, due consideration had been given to the needs of people living in inadequate housing.</p> <p>The Administration maintained that it was impractical to set a rigid target for the supply of transitional housing because, first, different NGOs provided various kinds of transitional housing projects to address the needs of different groups of people. Second, transitional housing was basically a temporary arrangement, thus there were uncertainties in each project.</p>	
012454 – 013552	Chairman Mr CHU Hoi-dick Mr Anthony WONG Kin-wai, HKCSS Mr Ricky YU Wai-yip, Light Be	<p>Mr CHU Hoi-dick asked representatives from HKCSS and Light Be whether "temporary housing area" ("THA") should be revived to become a type of transitional housing and provided by the Administration. Mr CHU also asked which type of transitional housing—those provided by NGOs or those similar to THAs developed by the Administration—would be preferred by people living in inadequate housing.</p> <p>Business Director, HKCSS said that HKCSS would</p>	

<b>Time marker</b>	<b>Speaker</b>	<b>Subject(s)</b>	<b>Action required</b>
		<p>support any form of transitional housing where a better living environment was provided and where the rents were affordable. He added that all transitional housing should be social housing in the sense that they should offer not only accommodation but also an opportunity for community-based empowerment for the residents.</p> <p>Founder &amp; CEO of Light Be considered that transitional housing were likely to continue to exist for a long time. He envisaged that there would be many types of transitional housing, each involving a different degree of Government participation. The choice of living in one type of transitional housing or another would depend on an individual's circumstances and how such transitional housing would meet his or her needs.</p>	
013553 – 014225	Chairman Mr KWOK Wai-keung Mr Anthony WONG Kin-wai, HKCSS	<p>Mr KWOK Wai-keung commented that the Administration should focus its efforts on addressing the housing needs of the eligible applicants of public rental housing who had been waiting for housing allocation for more than three years. He also commented that the Administration lacked commitment in the provision of transitional housing.</p> <p>Mr KWOK asked how much support NGOs had received from the Administration in providing transitional housing.</p> <p>Business Director, HKCSS said that the Administration had been helpful in liaising with the property owners and encouraging them to make available accommodation units for the provision of transitional housing.</p>	
014226 – 015020	Chairman Mr Anthony WONG Kin-wai, HKCSS Mr Ricky YU Wai-yip, Light Be Administration	<p>The Chairman asked what technical difficulties NGOs faced during the development of transitional housing sites and what support the Administration had provided in the process.</p> <p>Business Director, HKCSS said that NGOs lacked the technical and operational expertise in developing and managing the transitional housing projects. In the development of modular housing for example, Business Director, HKCSS said that as there was no established technical standard or regulatory framework, project proponents had to tackle each problem as it happened, and</p>	

<b>Time marker</b>	<b>Speaker</b>	<b>Subject(s)</b>	<b>Action required</b>
		<p>accumulate experience during the process. The Administration, through the Task Force on Transitional Housing ("Task Force"), had provided advice and assistance in solving certain technical, regulatory and administrative difficulties.</p> <p>Founder &amp; CEO of Light Be said that the implementation of previous transitional housing projects had been a learning process. They had attempted to solve the problems on their own as far as possible or sought help from the private sector as necessary.</p> <p>The Administration added that the Task Force had worked with NGOs in the initial stages of the projects and had provided technical advice, one-stop support and administrative assistance, so as to enable NGOs to exercise creativity in developing transitional housing to meet the needs of people living in inadequate housing conditions.</p>	
015021 – 015611	Chairman Ms CHAN Hoi-yan Administration	<p>Ms CHAN Hoi-yan commented that NGOs should have made use of their experience and expertise to provide social services for people living in inadequate housing conditions rather than to spend time learning how to tackle technical and operational issues arising from the development of transitional housing. She said that the Administration should have undertaken the relevant technical and construction works so as to make transitional housing units available to the inadequately housed households at the earliest opportunity.</p> <p>The Administration reiterated that it played a facilitating role in promoting and mobilizing community efforts in the provision of transitional housing. The Task Force had provided one-stop support to project proponents and had facilitated the successful implementation of a number of projects.</p> <p>The Administration added that as each of the transitional housing projects was unique, and each might involve renovating or modifying an existing premise with different objectives and visions, it would be more suitable for NGOs, instead of the Administration, to undertake these projects.</p>	

<b>Time marker</b>	<b>Speaker</b>	<b>Subject(s)</b>	<b>Action required</b>
015612 – 015738	Chairman Deputy Chairman	Voting on the motion proposed by the Deputy Chairman	
<b>Agenda item IV — Any other business</b>			
015739 – 015912	Chairman	Concluding remarks	

Council Business Division 1  
Legislative Council Secretariat  
14 May 2019