

立法會
Legislative Council

LC Paper No. CB(4)1230/18-19
*(These minutes have been seen
by the Administration)*

Ref : CB4/PL/TP/1

Panel on Transport

**Minutes of meeting held on
Friday, 17 May 2019, at 10:45 am
in Conference Room 1 of the Legislative Council Complex**

Members present : Hon CHAN Han-pan, BBS, JP (Chairman)
Hon Jeremy TAM Man-ho (Deputy Chairman)
Hon Tommy CHEUNG Yu-yan, GBS, JP
Hon CHAN Hak-kan, BBS, JP
Dr Hon Priscilla LEUNG Mei-fun, SBS, JP
Hon WONG Kwok-kin, SBS, JP
Hon Mrs Regina IP LAU Suk-yee, GBS, JP
Hon Paul TSE Wai-chun, JP
Hon Claudia MO
Hon Michael TIEN Puk-sun, BBS, JP
Hon Frankie YICK Chi-ming, SBS, JP
Hon YIU Si-wing, BBS
Hon Charles Peter MOK, JP
Hon CHAN Chi-chuen
Hon LEUNG Che-cheung, SBS, MH, JP
Dr Hon KWOK Ka-ki
Hon POON Siu-ping, BBS, MH
Dr Hon CHIANG Lai-wan, SBS, JP
Ir Dr Hon LO Wai-kwok, SBS, MH, JP
Hon CHUNG Kwok-pan
Hon Alvin YEUNG
Hon Andrew WAN Siu-kin
Hon CHU Hoi-dick
Dr Hon Junius HO Kwan-yiu, JP

Hon HO Kai-ming
Hon LAM Cheuk-ting
Hon SHIU Ka-fai
Hon Wilson OR Chong-shing, MH
Hon LUK Chung-hung, JP
Hon LAU Kwok-fan, MH
Hon Kenneth LAU Ip-keung, BBS, MH, JP
Dr Hon CHENG Chung-tai
Hon Gary FAN Kwok-wai
Hon AU Nok-hin
Hon Tony TSE Wai-chuen, BBS

Members attending : Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, GBS, JP
Hon Alice MAK Mei-kuen, BBS, JP

Members absent : Dr Hon Helena WONG Pik-wan
Hon Tanya CHAN

Public officers attending : **Agenda item IV**

Mr Kevin CHOI, JP
Deputy Secretary for Transport and Housing (Transport) 2
Transport and Housing Bureau

Miss Crystal YIP
Principal Assistant Secretary for Transport and Housing
(Transport)1
Transport and Housing Bureau

Mr Patrick WONG
Assistant Commissioner for Transport / Bus and Railway
Transport Department

Miss Amy TSE
Principal Transport Officer / Bus and Railway 1
Transport Department

Agenda item V

Mr Kevin CHOI, JP
Deputy Secretary for Transport and Housing (Transport) 2
Transport and Housing Bureau

Mr Philip HAR
Principal Assistant Secretary for Transport and Housing
(Transport)4
Transport and Housing Bureau

Mr Johnny CHAN
Chief Assistant Secretary (Works)3
Development Bureau

Mr Stephen KWOK
Assistant Secretary (Works Policies 2)1
Development Bureau

Mr Ricky WONG
Deputy Head of Civil Engineering Office (Port & Land)
Civil Engineering and Development Department

Mr Francis LEE
Project Team Leader
Civil Engineering and Development Department

Mr Christopher CHIU
Principal Transport Officer/ NT 1
Transport Department

Agenda item VI

Dr Raymond SO, BBS, JP
Under Secretary for Transport and Housing
Transport and Housing Bureau

Ms Shirley KWAN
Principal Assistant Secretary for Transport and Housing
(Transport) 2
Transport and Housing Bureau

Mr Samson LAM
Assistant Commissioner for Transport/ Planning
Transport Department

Mr Simon LAU
Chief Engineer / Strategic Studies
Transport Department

Mr Keith TANG
Principal Project Coordinator/Parking
Transport Department

Clerk in attendance : Ms Sophie LAU
Chief Council Secretary (4)2

Staff in attendance : Ms Angela CHU
Senior Council Secretary (4)2

Ms Jacqueline LAW
Council Secretary (4)2

Miss Mandy LAM
Legislative Assistant (4)2

Action

I. Information paper(s) issued since the last meeting

- | | |
|---------------------------------|--|
| LC Paper No. CB(4)818/18-19(01) | - Administration's response to the letter from Dr Hon Elizabeth QUAT requesting to improve the traffic light design on Tai Chung Kiu Road |
| LC Paper No. CB(4)752/18-19(01) | - Administration's response to a motion passed under the agenda item on "Fare increase application by New Lantao Bus Co. (1973) Limited" at the meeting on 15 March 2019 |

- | | |
|---|--|
| LC Paper No. CB(4)857/18-19(01) | - Administration's supplementary information under the agenda item on "Fare increase application by New Lantau Bus Co. (1973) Limited ("NLB")" at the meeting on 15 March 2019 |
| LC Paper No. CB(4)860/18-19(01)
(Chinese version only) | - Letter from Hon Jeremy TAM Man-ho requesting information on waiting time of driving test of non-commercial vehicles |
| LC Paper No. CB(4)861/18-19(01)
(Chinese version only) | - Road Traffic (Road Traffic (Construction and Maintenance of Vehicles) Regulations) (Amendment) Bill 2019 proposed by Hon Jeremy TAM Man-ho |

Members noted the above papers issued since the last meeting.

II. Items for discussion at the next meeting

- | | |
|---------------------------------|--|
| LC Paper No. CB(4)850/18-19(01) | - List of outstanding items for discussion |
| LC Paper No. CB(4)850/18-19(02) | - List of follow-up actions |

2. Members agreed to discuss the following items at the next regular meeting to be held on 21 June 2019:

- (a) Transport arrangements upon the commissioning of Liantang/Heung Yuen Wai Boundary Control Point;
- (b) 6850TH - New Wang Tong River Bridge; and
- (c) 6190TB - Retrofitting of escalators for footbridge across Castle Peak Road - Kwai Chung near MTR Tai Wo Hau Station Exit B.

(Post-meeting note: As large crowds of people had gathered outside the Legislative Council Complex and the entrance to the car park was

blocked and a number of Panel members were unable to enter the Complex before the meeting, the Chairman instructed in the morning on 21 June 2019 that the meeting be cancelled).

3. Referring to item (c) above, Mr LAM Cheuk-ting enquired whether it was a normal practice for the Panel to discuss the item as proposed, which in his view, was a district-based issue requiring not much discussion. The Chairman said that as the item involved a financial proposal, it was a normal practice for the Administration to seek the Panel's views before submitting it to the Public Works Subcommittee and Finance Committee for scrutiny and approval. As regards the proposed discussion items raised by members during the meeting on 26 April 2019 such as the traffic congestion problem in the Northern New Territories, the Chairman said that he had discussed with the Administration and was awaiting their response.

III. Matters arising from the meeting on 26 April 2019

- | | |
|--|---|
| LC Paper No. CB(4)800/18-19(01)
(<i>Chinese version only</i>) | - Wording of a motion to be moved by Hon LAM Cheuk-ting |
| LC Paper No. CB(4)821/18-19(01)
(<i>Chinese version only</i>) | - Wording of a motion to be moved by Hon Michael TIEN Puk-sun |
| LC Paper No. CB(4)821/18-19(02)
(<i>Chinese version only</i>) | - Wording of a motion to be moved by Hon CHAN Han-pan |
| LC Paper No. CB(4)821/18-19(03)
(<i>Chinese version only</i>) | - Wording of a motion to be moved by Hon Gary FAN Kwok-wai |
| LC Paper No. CB(4)821/18-19(04)
(<i>Chinese version only</i>) | - Wording of a motion to be moved by Hon LUK Chung-hung |
| LC Paper No. CB(4)821/18-19(05)
(<i>Chinese version only</i>) | - Wording of a motion to be moved by Hon CHU Hoi-dick |

Action

Motions

4. The Chairman said that there were six motions relating to "MTR fare adjustment for 2019" proposed by members at the meeting on 26 April 2019 but were not dealt with at that meeting due to insufficient time. The Chairman put these six motions to vote at the present meeting. At members' request, the Chairman ordered that the voting bell be rung for five minutes to notify members of the voting.

5. The Chairman referred members to the following motion moved by Mr LAM Chuek-ting:

現行港鐵罰款機制，只計算事故中延誤最長一班列車的延遲時間，以決定罰款金額，根本不足以反映事故影響的範圍和時間長短，例如於2017年8月觀塘綫故障，列車服務受影響逾十小時，輿論普遍認為應該重罰港鐵，但按「服務表現安排」機制只計算延誤最長一班列車，最後只罰款200萬元，而無考慮事故影響達十小時及影響十七個車站的嚴重情況。

本會要求制定新罰款計算方程式，分別以『延誤服務』及『暫停服務』作為兩級罰款基數，再以基數乘以『受影響時數』及『受影響站數』，以更準確反映事故的影響範圍及時間，按嚴重性釐訂罰款。

有關建議方程式如下：

A. 延誤服務

罰款基數 X 受影響時數 X 受影響站數 = 罰款總額

B. 停駛服務

較高罰款基數 X 受影響時數 X 受影響站數 = 罰款總額

本會同時要求將港鐵管理層的花紅獎金與事故頻密及嚴重程度掛鉤，讓高層承擔責任。

(Translation)

Under the existing penalty mechanism for the MTR Corporation Limited ("MTRCL"), only the longest train journey delay in an incident is taken into account when determining the level of penalty to be imposed and

this mechanism is simply not adequate to reflect the extent to which and the duration in which train service is affected in the incident. For example, during the signalling failure of the Kwun Tong Line in August 2017, train service was affected for more than 10 hours. While there were general public comments that MTRCL should be penalized heavily, it was ultimately fined a mere \$2 million under the "Service Performance Arrangement" which only took into account the longest train journey delay in the incident without considering the severity of the incident that it lasted for ten hours and affected 17 stations.

This Panel requests that a new penalty calculation formula be devised, under which the level of penalty is calculated on the basis of the two-tiered penalty base rate of "service delay" or "service suspension", and multiply the penalty base rate by "the number of hours of service delay or service suspension" and also by "the number of stations affected" so as to reflect more accurately the extent to which and the duration in which train service is affected in an incident and to determine the level of penalty according to the severity of the incident.

The proposed formulae are as follows:

A. For service delay:

Penalty base rate X Number of hours of service delay or service suspension X Number of stations affected = Level of penalty

B. For service suspension:

Higher penalty base rate X Number of hours of service delay or service suspension X Number of stations affected = Level of penalty

This Panel also requests that the bonuses and gratuities of the senior management of MTRCL be linked to the frequency and severity of train service disruption incidents so that the senior management will be held accountable.

6. The Chairman put to vote the above motion. Fifteen members voted in favour of the motion, two members voted against the motion, and four members abstained from voting. The Chairman declared that the motion was carried.

7. The Chairman referred members to the following motion moved by Mr Michael TIEN:

本委員會促請政府和港鐵公司擴大早晨折扣優惠的適用範圍，包括全線所有車站以及加碼由 75 折增至半價優惠，同時港鐵公司可發公開信呼籲本港企業推廣八點半彈性上班時間，令長途乘客得益，更加實際回饋市民，配合僱傭友善政策。

(Translation)

This Panel urges the Government and the MTR Corporation Limited ("MTRCL") to extend the coverage of the Early Bird Discount Promotion to all stations of all railway lines and to top up the discount rate from 25% to 50%. At the same time, MTRCL may issue an appeal letter calling upon all enterprises in Hong Kong to promote flexitime by adjusting the start time of work to 8:30 am, so as to benefit long-distance commuters and bring benefits to members of the public in a more practical way and dovetail with the friendly employment policy.

8. The Chairman put to vote the motion. Nineteen members voted in favour of the motion, no member voted against the motion, and four members abstained from voting. The Chairman declared that the motion was carried.

9. The Chairman referred members to the following motion moved by Mr CHAN Han-pan:

鑑於港鐵近年盈利豐厚，而繁忙時段載客率幾近飽和，雖然港鐵公司已於 35 個市區站提供 75 折的非繁忙時段優惠，但吸引力有限，本委員會要求港鐵增加折扣優惠，以吸引更多企業及乘客，採用彈性上班時間，和非繁忙時間出行，以改善鐵路繁忙時段的擠逼情況。

(Translation)

Given that the MTR Corporation Limited ("MTRCL") has earned hefty profits in recent years and the passenger loading during peak hours has almost reached the maximum capacity, and that MTRCL has offered a 25% fare discount rate at 35 urban stations during non-peak hours but the attractiveness of such discount is limited, this Panel requests MTRCL to increase the discount rate to attract more enterprises to adopt flexitime and more passengers to travel during non-peak hours, so as to alleviate the crowdedness in trains during peak hours.

10. The Chairman put to vote the motion. Twenty-three members voted in favour of the motion, no member voted against the motion, and no member abstained from voting. The Chairman declared that the motion was carried.

11. The Chairman referred members to the following motion moved by Mr Gary FAN:

由於香港鐵路有限公司近年的服務表現差劣，本委員會要求香港鐵路有限公司，必須在票價調整機制方程式中加入服務表現因素，將票價調整的幅度與每年的服務表現掛勾，以促使港鐵加以改善其服務表現。

(Translation)

Given the poor service performance of the MTR Corporation Limited ("MTRCL") in recent years, this Panel requests that MTRCL must include a service performance factor in the Fare Adjustment Mechanism formula so that the rate of fare adjustment will be linked to the yearly service performance, thereby prompting MTRCL to improve its service performance.

12. The Chairman put to vote the motion. Fourteen members voted in favour of the motion, five members voted against the motion, and two members abstained from voting. The Chairman declared that the motion was carried.

13. The Chairman referred members to the following motion moved by Mr LUK Chung-hung:

有鑒於港鐵在錄得豐厚盈利下，仍按機制自動加價，加重市民交通費負擔，本會要求政府促請港鐵擱置或減低今次票價加幅，並重新訂立票價調整機制，加上「盈利扣減」因素，以及增加行政會議把關票價最終調整，以反映實際社會情況。

(Translation)

Given that the MTR Corporation Limited ("MTRCL") will still increase its fares automatically according to the mechanism despite recording hefty profits, posing a heavier transport fare burden on commuters, this Panel requests the Government to urge MTRCL to shelve the current fare increase or lower the magnitude of the increase, and establish afresh a fare adjustment mechanism which will incorporate a "profit-linked deduction" element and bring in the Executive Council as

the gatekeeper to determine the final fare adjustment in order to reflect the actual social conditions.

14. The Chairman put to vote the motion. Twenty members voted in favour of the motion, one member voted against the motion, and four members abstained from voting. The Chairman declared that the motion was carried.

15. The Chairman referred members to the following motion moved by Mr CHU Hoi-dick:

本委員會要求政府及港鐵照顧西鐵線和東涌線乘客較重的交通負擔，短期加設「東涌線日票」，並研究大幅減低西鐵線和東涌線的單程票價至接近東鐵線(紅磡至上水)的水平。

(Translation)

This Panel requests the Government and the MTR Corporation Limited to alleviate the heavier transport fare burden of commuters of the West Rail Line ("WRL") and the Tung Chung Line ("TCL") by introducing "TCL Day Pass" in the short run and studying a substantial reduction of the single journey fares of WRL and TCL to levels close to that of the East Rail Line (between Hung Hom and Sheung Shui).

16. The Chairman put to vote the motion. Seventeen members voted in favour of the motion, three members voted against the motion, and three members abstained from voting. The Chairman declared that the motion was carried.

(Post-meeting note: The wordings of the motions passed were issued to members vide LC Paper No. CB(4)893/18-19 on 20 May 2019)

IV. Allowing access to franchised buses for persons carrying compressed oxygen cylinders for self-medical use when travelling

LC Paper No. CB(4)850/18-19(03) - Administration's paper on allowing access to franchised buses for persons carrying compressed oxygen cylinders for self-medical use when travelling

Briefing by the Administration

17. At the invitation of the Chairman, Deputy Secretary for Transport and Housing (Transport) 2 ("DSTH(T)2") briefed members on the Administration's proposal to amend the Public Bus Services Regulations (Cap. 230A) ("PBSR") to allow persons carrying compressed oxygen cylinders for self-medical use access to franchised buses ("FB"). DSTH(T)2 explained that compressed oxygen was a dangerous goods regulated under the Dangerous Goods Ordinance (Cap. 295) ("DGO"). PBSR stipulated that substances or articles that the DGO applied, i.e. including compressed oxygen, should not be brought onto any bus regardless of the quantity involved. In order to promote the "Transport for All" policy objective, the Administration proposed to amend PBSR to allow access to FB for persons who required oxygen therapy and needed to bring along compressed oxygen cylinders for self-medical use. DSTH(T)2 said that subject to members' comments, the Administration aimed at submitting legislative amendments to PBSR to the Legislative Council for negative vetting within 2019.

Discussion

18. Mr LAM Cheuk-ting and Mr Frankie YICK welcomed the initiative, but expressed concern about the difficulties for bus captains to execute the relevant measures as listed in paragraph 5 of the Administration's paper. Both members opined that the responsibility of ascertaining that no more than two compressed oxygen cylinders not exceeding five litres each were allowed on a bus at any one time were vested on the bus captains. It would pose undue burden on bus captains in addition to their driving duties. Mr LAM opined that if the bus captain refused a passenger carrying compressed oxygen cylinder for self-medical use to board a bus on the ground that there were already two such cylinders on the bus, it might lead to disputes between the passenger and the bus captain, especially on routes where bus trips were less frequent.

19. Mr Frankie YICK expressed the view that the relevant restrictions under DGO with regard to the conveyance of compressed oxygen were not kept abreast of time as FB nowadays disallowed smoking, hence safety risk associated with explosion due to leakage of oxygen were minimal. Mr YICK called on the Administration to review the relevant provisions in DGO with regard to the carriage of oxygen cylinders for self-medical use by passengers when using public transport.

20. DSTH(T)2 responded that the Fire Services Department ("FSD"), the Hospital Authority, the Hong Kong Occupational Therapy Association and franchised bus operators had been consulted to formulate the proposed

legislative amendments as highlighted in paragraph 5 of the Administration's paper for allowing the carriage of compressed oxygen cylinders by passengers for self-medical use, but without compromising bus safety. DSTH(T)2 added that TD would issue a set of guidelines so that bus captains would be fully aware of the new legislative requirements, and step up publicity efforts so that all passengers, particularly those who required oxygen therapy, were fully aware of the relevant arrangements.

21. As regards the relevant restriction of the carriage of compressed oxygen cylinders on FB, DSTH(T)2 explained that compressed oxygen was a dangerous goods regulated under DGO, which stipulated clearly that a licence would be required for the conveyance of compressed oxygen exceeding two cylinders of five litres each. When proposing legislative amendments to PBSR, the relevant statutory requirements under DGO had to be observed. Having said that, Transport and Housing Bureau ("THB") would convey members' suggestion to FSD and the Security Bureau ("SB") on reviewing the relevant provisions under DGO to see if there was any room for relaxing the requirement for the carriage of compressed oxygen cylinder for self-medical use by passengers using public transport.

22. Mr POON Siu-ping and Mr YIU Si-wing sought clarification in situation where passengers conveying more than two compressed oxygen cylinders for self-medical use boarding a bus at the same time but did not inform the bus captain accordingly, whether the liability of breaching the proposed legislative provisions would be borne by the bus captain or the passengers concerned. The members also cast doubt on whether bus captains could assess the compressed oxygen cylinders carried by passengers were for self-medical use or solely for conveyance purpose, and expressed concern that disputes might arise under the above situation.

23. DSTH(T)2 advised that under the proposed legislative amendments to PBSR, a passenger carrying compressed oxygen cylinders for self-medical use should advise the bus captain of the total number of cylinders he/she was carrying when boarding FB and before payment of bus fare, and passengers should be inhaling the oxygen through a nasal cannula or oxygen mask connected to the cylinder for easy identification by the bus captain. Passengers breaching the relevant requirement under PBSR would be liable to a fine of \$3,000 and imprisonment of six months. Regarding the occurrence of possible disputes that members were concerning about, DSTH(T)2 reiterated that TD would step up publicity and education to inform FB passengers of the new arrangements, and had liaised with patient groups regarding the amendments. These patient groups expressed support to the Administration's

proposal and were willing to cooperate with FB operators regarding the arrangement.

24. The Chairman enquired about the risk involved in carrying more than two compressed oxygen cylinders when boarding a bus. He also called upon the THB to liaise further with FSD and SB regarding the proposed cap on the number of compressed oxygen cylinders allowed in public transport. DSTH(T)2 explained that as discussed with FSD regarding the proposed legislative amendments to PBSR, the major possible risk involved was not the leakage of oxygen, but the uncontrollable movement of the compressed oxygen cylinder due to damage to the cylinder's valve. DSTH(T)2 reiterated that THB would convey members' suggestion when reviewing the relevant provisions under DGO for consideration by FSD and SB.

25. Mr POON Siu-ping and Mr LAM Cheuk-ting expressed concern that other public transport carriers such as MTR Corporation Limited, did not have similar strict control on passengers carrying oxygen cylinders under their respective statutory provisions, and queried how MTR Corporation Limited would handle situation where passengers carrying more than two compressed oxygen cylinders boarding a train.

26. DSTH(T)2 replied that although no specific provisions on the carriage of compressed oxygen was provided in the respective statutory provisions of other public transport carriers, passengers were still required to comply with the relevant provisions of DGO in respect of the storage or conveyance of compressed oxygen under which a licence was required if more than two cylinders of compressed oxygen of five litres each was carried. For MTR Corporation Limited, DSTH(T)2 replied that MTR staff would provide assistance to passengers carrying compressed oxygen for the MTR journey.

V. Reconstruction of Pak Kok Pier on Lamma Island

- | | |
|---------------------------------|---|
| LC Paper No. CB(4)850/18-19(04) | - Administration's paper on 051TF–Reconstruction of Pak Kok Pier on Lamma Island |
| LC Paper No. CB(4)850/18-19(05) | - Paper on enhancement of public pier facilities prepared by the Legislative Council Secretariat (Background brief) |

Briefing by the Administration

27. At the invitation of the Chairman, DSTH(T)2 briefed members on the Administration's funding application for upgrading 051TF "Reconstruction of Pak Kok Pier on Lamma Island" ("the Project") to Category A, details of which were set out in the Administration's paper (LC Paper No. CB(4)850/18-19(04)). Subject to the funding approval of the Finance Committee ("FC") of the Legislative Council, the Administration planned to commence the Project in the second half of 2019 for completion in the second half of 2021.

Discussion

28. Mr Frankie YICK, Mr LEUNG Che-cheung, Mrs Regina IP and the Deputy Chairman indicated their support for the Project.

Suggestions on project design and provision of ancillary facilities

29. Mr Frankie YICK suggested the Administration installing ticketing kiosks for use by kaito operators at the proposed Pak Kok Pier upon completion of the Project. Mr YIU Si-wing expressed similar views. Mr POON Siu-ping suggested that a drinking fountain and toilet facilities should be provided at the new pier. Mr Kenneth LAU and the Deputy Chairman suggested that to facilitate the villagers who commuted by bicycles to use the pier, parking area for bicycles should be provided as well.

30. DSTH(T)2 noted members' suggestions and undertook to consider and suitably incorporate their advice and suggestions in the design. He added that public toilets managed by the Food and Environmental Hygiene Department ("FEHD") were available in the vicinity of the existing Pak Kok Pier for meeting the needs of the passengers using the pier.

31. Referring to Enclosure 1 of the Administration's paper, Mr Kenneth LAU asked whether the Administration would consider providing a roof cover for the proposed catwalk.

32. Deputy Head of Civil Engineering Office (Port & Land) of Civil Engineering and Development Department ("DH(CEO)/CEDD") responded that the length of the proposed catwalk was about 20 meters. He considered that the roof cover to be constructed at the proposed Pak Kok Pier and the pavilion located at the existing Pak Kok Pier should be sufficient for sun-shading purpose. In response to member's suggestion, DH(CEO)/CEDD said Civil

Engineering and Development Department ("CEDD") would study with the consultant concerned on the possible visual impact of providing a roof cover above the proposed catwalk.

33. Mr LUK Chung-hung suggested that to achieve better shading effect, glass-materials of lower transparency should be adopted for the construction of roof cover. DH(CEO)/CEDD replied that Mr LUK's suggestion would be suitably considered in the detailed design.

34. Mr YIU Si-wing welcomed the provision of barrier-free facilities at the proposed Pak Kok Pier, but was concerned that whether the same had been provided at the Aberdeen Promenade. DH(CEO)/CEDD replied that a ramp was currently available on the pontoon at the Aberdeen Promenade to facilitate passengers with disabilities to use the pier for boarding and alighting.

35. Mr LEUNG Che-cheung noted that the barrier-free facilities for passengers with disabilities were planned to be constructed at the western side of the proposed Pak Kok Pier. He enquired the reasons for not constructing the barrier-free facilities at both the eastern and western sides of the pier.

36. DH(CEO)/CEDD explained that the eastern side of the Proposed Pak Kok Pier would be more prone to rough sea conditions since the major prevailing wind of Hong Kong mainly came from the east and north-east directions, particularly during winter. After considering a host of factors including the safety of passengers (especially passengers with disabilities and the elderly) when boarding and alighting, the costs of constructing such facilities at both sides of the pier and the usage rate, CEDD proposed to construct ramps only at the western side of the pier.

37. Mr LUK Chung-hung opined that the views of the local community on the design of the proposed Pak Kok Pier should be gauged, such that the design of the pier would be drawn up having regard to the local characteristics. DH(CEO)/CEDD advised that the Administration had consulted the relevant District Council, local villagers, ferry operators and major construction professional bodies including the Hong Kong Institute of Landscape Architects ("the Institute"). Having taken into consideration the Institute's advice and suggestions, CEDD had enhanced the design of the pier to bring out the local characteristics of Lamma Island.

Pier Improvement Programme

38. Noting that Pak Kok Pier on Lamma Island was one of the piers included in the first phase of the Pier Improvement Programme ("PIP"), Mr Frankie

YICK asked about the implementation progress of the other nine public piers under PIP. He urged the Administration to expedite the implementation of PIP and consider putting more remote public piers into PIP to facilitate public access to these areas.

39. Chief Assistant Secretary (Works)³ of the Development Bureau advised that the technical studies of most pier projects proposed under the first phase of PIP were almost substantially completed. Relevant District Councils and stakeholders were being consulted on the preliminary designs of the pier projects progressively. The Administration would proceed to carry out the detailed designs of the pier projects and go through the relevant statutory process as appropriate. He added that PIP was featured in the 2017 Policy Address as a new policy initiative. The Administration targeted to commence the first pier project (i.e. Pak Kok Pier) in 2019. At present, the Administration's prime objective was to complete the first phase of PIP. Taking into account the effectiveness of and the experience gained from the first phase of PIP, the Development Bureau would consider the feasibility of taking forward more pier projects under the next phase of PIP.

40. On Mr POON Siu-ping's request, DH(CEO)/CEDD undertook to provide the information on the locations and implementation progress of the piers projects proposed under PIP after the meeting.

(Post-meeting note: the Chinese and English versions of the supplementary information were circulated to members vide LC Paper No. CB(4)960/18-19(01) on 30 May and 5 June 2019 respectively.)

41. Mr Kenneth LAU called on the Administration to consider constructing more public piers or reconstructing substandard public piers to meet the basic needs of remote villagers who had to rely on piers to commute to urban areas.

Other views and concerns

42. Mr YIU Si-wing was concerned about the management of Pak Kok Pier on Lamma Island upon completion of the Project. DSTH(T)² advised that the Administration would undertake the management and maintenance works of Pak Kok Pier upon completion of the reconstruction works according to the usual practice. Principal Transport Officer/NT1 of Transport Department ("PTO(NT1)/TD") further advised that with the coordination of TD, the daily management duties of the public piers would be undertaken by respective government departments with respect to their purview. For suggestions relating to the management of public piers, TD would liaise with relevant government departments as and when necessary for follow up and response.

43. Mrs Regina IP enquired about the handling of street sleepers at public piers including Pak Kok Pier. PTO(NT1)/TD advised that as the issue might involve more than one government departments, TD would coordinate with the government departments concerned, including FEHD, District Offices and Hong Kong Police Force, to carry out necessary follow-up actions. DSTH(T)2 undertook to provide supplementary information in this regard after the meeting.

(Post-meeting note: the Chinese and English versions of the supplementary information were circulated to members vide LC Paper No. CB(4)960/18-19(01) on 30 May and 5 June 2019 respectively.)

44. In response to the Deputy Chairman's enquiry, DSTH(T)2 advised that same as the other public piers, private vessels would be allowed to use Pak Kok Pier for berthing. As regards the usage rate of Pak Kok Pier, currently there was only one licensed ferry service (the "Aberdeen – Pak Kok Tsuen – Yung Shue Wan" route) using the pier for boarding and alighting. There were around 21 vessels using the pier daily. The usage rate by other private vessels was not high.

Conclusion

45. After discussion, the Chairman concluded that the Panel supported the Administration's submission of the funding proposal to the Public Works Subcommittee of FC for consideration.

VI. Latest Situation on Increasing the Provision of Car Parking Spaces

- | | |
|---------------------------------|--|
| LC Paper No. CB(4)850/18-19(06) | - Administration's paper on latest situation on increasing the provision of car parking spaces |
| LC Paper No. CB(4)850/18-19(07) | - Paper on increasing the provision of car parking spaces prepared by the Legislative Council Secretariat (Updated background brief) |

Briefing by the Administration

46. At the invitation of the Chairman, Under Secretary for Transport and Housing ("USTH") briefed members on the latest position of the measures adopted by the Administration to increase the provision of car parking spaces, details of which were contained in the Administration's paper. USTH said that the Administration's policy in the provision of parking spaces was to accord priority to considering the parking demand of commercial vehicles ("CVs"), and to provide an appropriate number of private car parking spaces if the overall development permitted, while not attracting passengers to opt for private cars in lieu of public transport so as to avoid aggravating the burden on road traffic. Objectively speaking, it was virtually impossible to increase parking spaces continuously to catch up with the growth rate of motor vehicles. As land resources were scarce in Hong Kong, the Administration was mindful of the need to cater for competing land use demand to match community and economic development, and would encourage the use of public transport as far as possible.

Discussion

Rapid increase in the number of private cars

47. The Chairman, Mr POON Siu-ping, Mr Tony TSE and Mr Wilson OR criticized the Administration's parking policy for failing to meet the parking needs of the public. Pointing out that the number of private cars and vans had increased by 45% over the past decade, while the number of spaces available for use by private cars and vans had increased by only 9%, these members enquired why the Administration did not formulate measures to slow down the growth of private vehicles. Sharing similar views, Mr CHU Hoi-dick requested the Administration to step up measures to control the future growth of private vehicles to be on a par with that of population growth.

48. USTH responded that noting that private cars had been increasing at a much faster pace as compared to the increase in parking spaces over the past decade, the Administration had been progressively implementing various short term and medium to long term measures as recommended by the Transport Advisory Committee in its Report on Study of Road Traffic Congestion in Hong Kong. Such measures included the implementation of Smart Mobility Initiatives so as to better manage traffic conditions in Hong Kong.

Review of parking standards under the Hong Kong Planning Standards and Guidelines ("HKPSG")

49. The Deputy Chairman opined that the shortage of parking spaces was attributable to the lowering of the parking standards under HKPSG by TD seven times between 2002 and 2018, such that ancillary parking facilities of both private and government development projects were not sufficiently provided for. The Deputy Chairman said that instead of requesting private and government projects to follow the higher end of the existing parking standards under HKPSG, a more direct solution to the problem was to consider revising the relevant guidelines under HKPSG to the effect that more parking spaces should be provided.

50. Ms Alice MAK, Mr HO Kai-ming and Mr Wilson OR also called on the Administration to review the parking standards under HKPSG, especially the provision of parking spaces for private cars. Referring to paragraph 18 of the Administration's paper, Mr HO and Mr OR opined that the Hong Kong Housing Authority ("HA") could have provided more parking facilities in its housing development projects. They enquired whether HA would consider providing more parking spaces beyond the parking standards stipulated under HKPSG, including the possibility of building underground car parks in new public housing estates to better utilize land resources.

51. In reply, USTH said that TD had commenced a review on the parking standards for private cars under HKPSG in August 2018 for completion in 2020, and would subsequently update the relevant parking requirements for private cars in housing development projects. He added that subject to the principles of no flat losses, no delays in completion of housing units and no substantial costs involved, HA would provide more parking spaces in its new public housing developments as far as possible having regard to site and design constraints.

Measures to increase the provision of parking spaces

52. Mr POON Siu-ping enquired about the progress of utilizing spaces underneath flyovers for designation as parking spaces as outlined in paragraph 8 of the Administration's paper, and the ratio of parking spaces designated for CVs. He also sought information regarding the eight projects to provide public parking spaces in Government, Institution or Community ("G/IC") facilities and public open space ("POS") as set out in paragraph 17 of the paper.

53. Assistant Commissioner for Transport/Planning ("AC/P") replied that the initiative to utilize spaces underneath flyovers as parking spaces was mainly designated for use by private cars and motorcycles. TD had kept in view

suitable locations for such designation and had identified a few sites. It was estimated that about 200 additional parking spaces would be provided in 2019-2020. As regards the eight projects mentioned by Mr POON, AC/P advised that TD would consider taking forward the projects progressively.

54. Ms Alice MAK suggested the Administration opening up parking spaces at government buildings and public facilities during non-office hours for use by nearby residents in the districts. She also suggested to better utilize works sites under the management of Highways Department as parking spaces to the extent possible. USTH took note of Ms MAK's suggestions.

Parking spaces for CVs

55. Mr Frankie YICK referred to the recent incident of mini-bus drivers who went on strike after their vehicles were issued penalty tickets for illegal parking at certain on-street locations in Tsing Yi. In view of the serious shortage of parking spaces for CVs including mini-bus, Mr YICK urged TD to designate more on-street locations for parking by CVs and suggested closer communication between TD and the Police so that the latter would be aware of TD's initiative.

56. Referring to paragraph 6 of the Administration's paper regarding the progress of TD's scheme in turning suitable kerbside spaces into night-time parking spaces for use by CVs, Mr CHENG Chung-tai expressed concern that of the 515 proposed locations for such designation, only 191 were in service as of April 2019. He enquired about measures to speed up the progress.

57. In response, AC/P said that minibuses were allowed to park at the minibus stops during night-time provided that the parking would not affect road safety or cause obstruction to road users. Regarding the scheme to designate on-street private car parking spaces for night-time parking of goods vehicles or coaches, USTH said that TD would continue to discuss and liaise with different stakeholders and local communities to speed up the progress with a view to increasing more on-street parking spaces for CVs.

Opening up school parking spaces to student service vehicles

58. Mr LUK Chung-hung, Mr POON Siu-ping and Mr Frankie YICK welcomed TD's initiative to collaborate with the Education Bureau ("EDB") in encouraging schools to open up parking spaces within school premises for the parking of student service vehicles during non-school hours, and opined that such measure could effectively alleviate the problem of shortage of parking spaces for student service vehicles. These members asked about TD's plan to further

expand the scheme and ways to sort out the issue of insurance coverage of student service vehicles within school premises.

59. USTH replied that a total of eight schools had participated in the trial scheme in the 2018-2019 school year providing a total of about 30 parking spaces for student service vehicles. Given the positive feedback of participating schools, EDB in collaboration with TD issued in February 2019 a circular memorandum inviting all public sector schools and direct-subsidy schools to join in the 2019-2020 school year. TD and EDB would continue to monitor the implementation of the scheme.

Development of automated parking system ("APS")

60. In respect of the use of APS, the Chairman and Mr LUK Chung-hung enquired whether the Administration would roll out the initiative to districts that had been severely short of parking spaces by encouraging private investors to participate in the provision of APS at short-term tenancy ("STT") sites. Both members opined that in order to attract private investment in developing APS, the Administration could consider providing subsidies and allowing a longer tenancy period of STT sites for private investors.

61. AC/P responded that TD was planning a total of six APS pilot projects with a view to gaining experience in building, operating and managing different types of APSs and the associated financial arrangements for allowing wider application of APSs in private and government car parks in future. AC/P added that TD would maintain an open mind for the private sector to deploy APSs having regard to technical consideration and relevant land lease conditions.

62. Ms Alice MAK welcomed private investments in the operation of APS, but expressed worry that car park rental would be on the high side as a result. She suggested the Administration taking the lead in the provision of APSs and providing subsidies to private developments so as to keep the car park rental at a reasonable level.

Implementation of smart parking measures

63. Referring to paragraph 27 of the Administration's paper, Mr YIU Si-wing expressed concern that TD had to appeal to other government departments for disseminating parking vacancy information of public car parks under their management to the mobile application "HKeMobility". Mr YIU opined that the government departments should set an example for private car park operators to follow, and enquired whether TD would require these departments to disclose parking information on mandatory basis.

64. AC/P replied that TD had been communicating with other government departments on the launch of "HKeMobility" and the inclusion of parking vacancy information under their management through this one-stop platform. On Mr YIU's enquiry of the number of parking spaces that would be available for public searching on "HKeMobility" by end 2019 and the ratio of CV parking spaces amongst the numbers, AC/P said that the number of public car parks participating in the dissemination of parking information on the e-portal as at April 2019 was 280, and the number was expected to increase to about 330 by end 2019. On CV parking spaces, AC/P said that TD was taking forward the consultancy study on the parking needs of CVs to project the demand and supply of parking spaces for CVs in various districts.

65. Mr Michael TIEN welcomed the installation of 12 000 new generation of parking meters with the added feature of allowing motorists to pay their meter fees through mobile applications. Mr TIEN however cautioned that such new feature might reduce the circulation of parking spaces for use by other motorists as motorists who had already parked their cars could easily renew another parking time slot through the mobile applications. USTH took note of Mr TIEN's suggestion.

66. Mr TIEN enquired about the progress of installing closed-circuit television system to enhance enforcement efficiency against traffic offences such as illegal parking. USTH replied that the Police had conducted in 2018 a territory-wide trial scheme on the use of hand-held cameras to facilitate enforcement actions against traffic offences stipulated in the Fixed Penalty (Criminal Proceedings) Ordinance (Cap. 240). Following a review on its effectiveness, the Police had decided to formalize the arrangement lately for regular enforcement operations.

Inadequacies of the Park and Ride facilities

67. The Chairman, Mr Michael TIEN, Mr HO Kai-ming and Mr CHU Hoi-dick expressed concern about the limited number and locations of the Park and Ride ("PnR") facilities. Mr TIEN said that a majority of PnR facilities were located in urban areas rather than major transport hub at the fringe of busy districts, thereby could not achieve the Administration's objective to reducing traffic flow coming into urban districts during peak hours. Mr TIEN urged the Administration to offer more PnR facilities at suitable interchanges for residents living in the New Territories West so that motorists could park their cars at these junctures and change for public transport to travel to work during peak hours.

68. The Chairman and Mr CHU Hoi-dick expressed concern about the limited number of PnR facilities offered at the Kam Sheung Road MTR station and opined that the mere number of 600 parking spaces could not sufficiently cater for the parking needs of the region in view of its future development plan. Mr HO Kai-ming also commented that most of the PnR parking spaces were already fully occupied before 8:00 am and urged the Administration to provide more PnR facilities to cater for the demand.

69. In response to the above views, USTH said that the Administration would continue to explore suitable locations such as car parks near existing and new railway stations, urban renewal projects or in new development projects with a view to providing PnR concessions to motorists.

Insufficient parking spaces for motorcycles

70. Referring to Annex 1 of the Administration's paper, the Deputy Chairman raised concern about insufficient parking spaces for motorcycles and that the ratio of the number of parking spaces to the number of motorcycles was dropping continuously from 0.67 in 2008 to 0.63 in 2018. The Deputy Chairman was also concerned about the problem of abandoned motorcycles, resulting in prolonged occupation of parking spaces as highlighted in the Director of Audit's Report No. 72. He urged TD, the Police and the Food and Environmental Hygiene Department to step up their efforts to tackle the problem and sought information on the number of abandoned motorcycles being removed each year for the past three years. AC/P undertook to check and provide relevant information requested.

(*Post-meeting note: the Chinese and English versions of the supplementary information were circulated to members vide LC Paper No. CB(4)1197/18-19(01) on 30 August and 10 September 2019 respectively.*)

Motions

71. The Chairman said that there were five motions put forth by members, and he decided that they were all directly related to the agenda item under discussion. Members agreed to deal with them at the meeting. On the request of the Deputy Chairman, the voting bell was rung for five minutes.

72. The Chairman referred members to the following motion moved by Mr Michael TIEN:

本委員會促請政府，研究在新界西大型轉車站設立泊車轉乘設施，以便利居住偏遠地區的市民，駕駛車輛泊車並轉乘公共交通工具連接市區，紓緩市區交通擠塞問題，以符合政府「泊車轉乘」的政策原意。

(Translation)

This Panel urges the Government to study the provision of park-and-ride facilities at major interchanges in the New Territories West to facilitate members of the public residing in remote areas to drive and park at those interchanges and then switch to public transport for travelling to the urban areas, so as to alleviate the traffic congestion problem in the urban areas, which is in line with the "park-and-ride" policy intent of the Government.

73. The Chairman put the motion to vote. Thirteen members voted in favour of the motion. The Chairman declared that the motion was carried.

74. The Chairman referred members to the following motion moved by Mr Jeremy TAM:

本港私家車泊車位不敷應用，但政府自2002年起卻多次調低《香港規劃標準與準則》就發展項目配置車位的指標，當中包括引入「需求調整比率」以減少私人屋苑細面積單位（納米樓）需配置的車位數量、調低公共房屋需配置的車位數量、以及調低鄰近鐵路站住宅需配置的車位數量。因此，本委員會要求政府重新檢視《香港規劃標準與準則》，並直接提高該準則就發展項目配置車位的標準，為本港私家車提供更多泊車位。

(Translation)

In Hong Kong, private car parking spaces are insufficient to meet the demand. However, since 2002, the Government has for several times lowered the standards in the Hong Kong Planning Standards and Guidelines ("HKPSG") in respect of the provision of parking spaces in development projects by, among other things, introducing the Demand Adjustment Ratio in lowering the parking requirements for small flats ("nano flats") in private housing development projects, public housing development projects and residential development projects near railway stations. Therefore, this Panel urges the Government to review HKPSG

and directly raise the standards in HKPSG in respect of the provision of parking spaces in development projects, with a view to providing more parking spaces for private cars in Hong Kong.

75. The Chairman put the motion to vote. Twelve members voted in favour of the motion. The Chairman declared that the motion was carried.

76. The Chairman referred members to the following motion moved by Mr Jeremy TAM:

審計署報告《公眾泊車位的規劃、提供和管理》指出，本港近半(47%)路旁電單車泊車處被發現長期停泊不適宜在道路行走的電單車（俗稱「死車」），當中涉及618輛電單車。鑑於大量死車停泊在泊車處會阻礙有需要的車主使用車位，本委員會要求有關當局加強執法，採取更有效措施移除死車。

(Translation)

The Director of Audit's Report on "Planning, provision and management of public parking spaces" has pointed out that almost half (47%) of the on-street motorcycles considered not roadworthy (commonly known as "dead vehicles") have been found parking there for a long period of time, involving a total of 618 motorcycles. As the parking of a large number of "dead vehicles" in parking places will hinder car owners with parking needs from using the parking spaces provided, this Panel calls upon the relevant authorities to step up law enforcement efforts and take more effective measures to remove these "dead vehicles".

77. The Chairman put the motion to vote. Ten members voted in favour of the motion and two members abstained from voting. The Chairman declared that the motion was carried.

78. The Chairman referred members to the following motion moved by Mr LUK Chung-hung:

有鑒於本港泊車位不足，間接加劇路面交通擠塞、違泊及空氣污染等問題，本會促請政府要求透過以下措施適度增加泊車位，當中包括：據"香港規劃標準與準則"檢討泊車位比例、鼓勵私人承辦商在短期租約的土地上，設立多層智能泊車裝置、在"一地多用"的原則

下，透過政策鼓勵私人發展商和政府部門善用地下空間，設立停車場、並在新發展及重建項目增加智能停車場的試點。

(Translation)

Given that the inadequate supply of parking spaces in Hong Kong has indirectly aggravated the problems of road traffic congestion, illegal parking and air pollution, this Panel urges the Government to suitably increase parking spaces by means of the following measures: reviewing the parking space ratio in accordance with the Hong Kong Planning Standards and Guidelines, encouraging private developers to provide multi-storey automated parking facilities on short-term tenancy sites, encouraging private developers and government departments to make good use of underground spaces for the provision of car parks under the policy guideline of "single site, multiple uses", and identifying more pilot sites for the provision of automated car parks in new development and redevelopment projects.

79. The Chairman put the motion to vote. Thirteen members voted in favour of the motion. The Chairman declared that the motion was carried.

80. The Chairman referred members to the following motion moved by himself:

本會促請政府認真檢視審計署最近發表的《公眾泊車位的規劃、提供和管理》報告，並就解決泊車位不足問題，積極考慮以下建議：

- 一、改革交通諮詢委員會的運作模式，使委員會更有效反映交通運輸問題及提出建設性建議，以發揮諮詢機構應有的職能；
- 二、制定未來五年車位供應藍圖，涵蓋商用車輛和私家車；
- 三、檢討《香港規劃標準與準則》，豁免地面泊車位的地積比率，以鼓勵發展商積極增建停車場泊車位；
- 四、增建更多泊車轉乘停車場，方便駕駛者轉乘公共交通工具，以減少車輛進入市區；
- 五、落實一地多用，加快興建智能停車場，將興建計劃擴展至全港十八區；

- 六、改善運輸署手機應用程式，開放更多泊車數據，提高使用率；
- 七、加快推出智慧咪表，落實智慧出行；
- 八、在新建的公共屋邨增加泊車供應，於現有屋邨、領展及其分析物業附近覓地，興建公眾停車場；
- 九、完善現有停車場的管理安排，於假日開放政府物業泊車位。

(Translation)

This Panel urges the Government to seriously review the report on "Planning, provision and management of public parking spaces" published by the Audit Commission recently and proactively consider the following proposals for solving the problem of inadequate parking spaces:

1. revamping the modus operandi of the Transport Advisory Committee so that the Committee can more effectively reflect the traffic and transport problems and put forward constructive recommendations, thereby performing the functions that it should perform as an advisory body;
2. formulating the blueprint for the provision of parking spaces in the next five years covering both commercial vehicles and private cars;
3. reviewing the Hong Kong Planning Standards and Guidelines, and exempting the plot ratio of at-grade parking spaces to encourage developers to actively provide additional car parks and parking spaces;
4. providing more park-and-ride car parks to facilitate drivers to shift to public transport, so as to reduce the volume of traffic entering urban areas;
5. implementing the "single site, multiple uses" initiative, expediting the construction of automated parking system and extending such construction plans to all 18 districts in Hong Kong;
6. improving the mobile applications of the Transport Department, opening up more parking data and enhancing their utilization rates;

7. expediting the introduction of smart parking meters for the implementation of the "smart mobility" initiative;
 8. increasing the provision of parking spaces in new public housing estates, and identifying sites near existing housing estates and properties owned or divested by the Link Real Estate Investment Trust for constructing public car parks; and
 9. enhancing the current management arrangements for car parks and making available parking spaces in government properties during holidays.
81. The Chairman put the motion to vote. Fourteen members voted in favour of the motion. The Chairman declared that the motion was carried.

(Post-meeting note: The wordings of the motions passed and the Administration's response to the motions were issued to members vide LC Paper Nos. CB(4)902/18-19 and CB4(4)1104/18-19 on 20 May and 12 July 2019 respectively.)

VII. Any other business

82. There being no other business, the meeting ended at 1:08 pm.

Council Business Division 4
Legislative Council Secretariat
19 September 2019