

立法會

Legislative Council

LC Paper No. CB(4)96/19-20

(These minutes have been seen
by the Administration)

Ref: CB4/PS/2/16

Panel on Transport

Subcommittee on Hillside Escalator Links and Elevator Systems

Minutes of the second meeting held on Wednesday, 15 May 2019, at 8:30 am in Conference Room 1 of the Legislative Council Complex

- Members present** : Hon CHAN Han-pan, BBS, JP (Chairman)
Hon AU Nok-hin (Deputy Chairman)
Hon Mrs Regina IP LAU Suk-ye, GBS, JP
Hon Paul TSE Wai-chun, JP
Hon Frankie YICK Chi-ming, SBS, JP
Hon HO Kai-ming
Hon LAM Cheuk-ting
Hon SHIU Ka-fai
Hon Wilson OR Chong-shing, MH
Hon Jeremy TAM Man-ho
- Member attend** : Hon YUNG Hoi-yan
- Member absent** : Hon Andrew WAN Siu-kin
- Public Officers attending** : **Agenda item I**
Dr Raymond SO, BBS, JP
Under Secretary for Transport and Housing
Transport and Housing Bureau

Mr Raymond SY
Principal Assistant Secretary for Transport and
Housing (Transport) 5
Transport and Housing Bureau

Mr Michael LAW
Assistant Commissioner/Urban
Transport Department

Mr Eddie LEUNG
Chief Traffic Engineer / Hong Kong
Transport Department

Mr Harry MA
Assistant Director/ Development
Highways Department

Mr CHU Shun Wah
Principal Project Coordinator/Pedestrian Hillside
Links
Highways Department

**Attendance by
invitation** :

Agenda Item I

New People's Party
Mr LIU Michael
社區發展主任

Mr CHAN Nok-hang
Sha Tin District Council Member

Mr Thomas PANG Cheung-wai
Sha Tin District Council Member(Vice Chairman),
SBS, JP

Mr CHING Cheung-ying

Mr Rayman CHOW Wai-hung

陳壇丹先生

Mr Ken CHAN

Sai Kung District Council

Mr Stanley TAM

區議員 (翠林)

Mr Jason CHAN Ka-yau

Mr CHEUNG Pak-yuen

穗禾苑業主立案法團

Miss LEUNG Po-ling

主席

公民黨新界東支部

Mr MAK Tsz-kin

秘書

Wong Tai Sin District Council

Mr TING Chi-wai

Wong Tai Sin District Council Member

Mr CHAN Lee-shing

中西區關注組

馮家亮先生

召集人

寶馬山區議員助理

阮建中先生

郭銳忠先生

The Incorporated Owners of Fortress Garden

Ms PANG Lai-ha

Committee Member

自由黨

梁志偉先生

新界區地區執行委員會主席

Mr LAW Kwong-keung

海天峰管理處
張紹民先生
代表

Mr Ronald HO

Mr Kent LAM Jing-kwok

Ms LI Chun-chau
Eastern District Council Member

Mr HUI Lam-hing
Eastern District Council Member

Kwai Tsing District Council Member Office of Pau
Ming Hong
Mr PAU Ming-hong
Kwai Tsing District Council Member

富澤花園「寶馬山行人通道系統」關注組
Ms LO Yuk-kuen
召集人

Mr TAM Pui-tak

何偉俊先生

Mr Frankie LAM Siu-chung

潘秉康先生

Ms YAM Pauline
Southern District Council Member

Ms KWOK Fu-yung
Kwai Tsing District Council Member

Clerk in attendance: Ms Sophie LAU
Chief Council Secretary (4)2

Staff in attendance : Ms Angela CHU
Senior Council Secretary (4)2

Ms Jacqueline LAW
Council Secretary (4)2

Miss Mandy LAM
Legislative Assistant (4)2

Action

- I. Meeting with deputations/individuals and the Administration**
[File Ref: LC Paper Nos: CB(4)836/18-19(01) – (10),
CB(4)869/18-19(01)]

Discussion

The Subcommittee deliberated (index of proceedings attached at **Annex**).

2. The Chairman said that a site visit would be scheduled in June to review the implementation progress of some of the Hillside Escalator Links and Elevator System proposals.

(Post-meeting note: the site visit originally scheduled for 18 June 2019 was cancelled due to safety and security reasons arising from large crowds of people gathered in the vicinity of the Legislative Council Complex since 12 June 2019).

II Any other business

3. There being no other business, the meeting ended at 10:44 am.

Council Business Division 4
Legislative Council Secretariat
5 November 2019

**Proceedings of the second meeting of
Subcommittee on Hillside Escalator Links and Elevator Systems ("HEL")
on Wednesday, 15 May 2019, at 8:30 am
in Conference Room 1 of the Legislative Council Complex**

Running Time	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
<i>Agenda Item I – Meeting with deputations/individuals and the Administration</i>			
000510 – 000735	Chairman	Opening remarks	
000736 – 001823	Chairman Administration	Briefing by the Administration with the aid of a powerpoint presentation (LC Paper No. 883/18-19(01)).	
001928 – 002128	Chairman New People Party	Presentation of views on the carrying capacity and maintenance of the lift and pedestrian walkway system between Saddle Ridge Garden and Sai Sha Road of the Sha Tin district.	
002129 – 002249	Chairman Mr CHAN Nok-hung	Presentation of views on including estates under the management of the Housing Department in the provision of HEL by the Administration.	
002250 – 002503	Chairman Mr PANG Cheung-wai	Presentation of views on expediting the conduct of technical feasibility study of the escalator system between Sha Tin Sui Wo Court and MTR Fo Tan Station and the consultation with local communities.	
002504 – 002811	Chairman Mr CHING Cheung-ying	Presentation of views on the assessment mechanism and local consultation, as well as the need for improvement to the existing staircase between Sha Tin Tau Road and the Greenview Garden.	
002812 – 003055	Chairman Mr Raymond CHOW	Presentation of views as set out in LC Paper No. CB(4)881/18-19(05).	
003056 – 003357	Chairman Mr 陳壇丹	Presentation of views on the design and construction of the escalator system running between Sha Tin Sui Wo Court and MTR Fo Tan Station.	
003358 – 003703	Chairman Mr Ken CHAN	Presentation of views on the need for an escalator link system for Hong Sing Garden in Tseung Kwan O.	
003704 – 003936	Chairman Sai Kung DC	Presentation of views on the need to build an escalator link system running between Hong Sing	

Running Time	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		Garden and Po Hong Road in Tseung Kwan O and to include Tsui Lam Estate and King Ming Court in the proposed system.	
003937 – 004250	Chairman Ms Pauline YAM	Presentation of views as set out in LC Paper No. CB(4)836/18-19(09).	
004251 – 004556	Chairman Mr Jason CHAN Ka-yau	Presentation of views on the Braemar Hill Pedestrian Link and the need for a more comprehensive local consultation before finalizing the proposal.	
004557 – 004745	Chairman Mr CHEUNG Pak-yuen	Presentation of views on the need for a pedestrian walkway system at Hin Tai Street in Tai Wai district.	
004746 – 005050	Chairman 穗禾苑業主立案法團	Presentation of views on the design and construction of the escalator system running between Sha Tin Sui Wo Court and MTR Fo Tan Station.	
005051 – 005359	Chairman Mr MAK Tsz-kin	Presentation of views as set out in LC Paper No. CB(4)929/18-19(01).	
005400 – 005701	Chairman Wong Tai Sin District Council	Presentation of views on the need to construct more barrier-free pedestrian link systems in Chuk Yuen North Estate where a lot of local users are elderly or persons with disability.	
005702 – 010015	Chairman Mr CHAN Lee-shing	Presentation of views as set out in LC Paper No. CB(4)881/18-19(01).	
010016 – 010330	Chairman 中西區關注組	Presentation of views on the renovation of the Central-Mid-level Escalator.	
010331 – 010618	Chairman 寶馬山區議員助理	Presentation of views on expediting the construction of the pedestrian link at Braemar Hill to alleviate traffic congestion in the district.	
010619 – 010814	Chairman 郭銳忠先生	Presentation of views in support of the pedestrian link at Braemar Hill to benefit residents living in North Point.	
010815 – 011120	Chairman Representative of The Incorporated	Presentation of views as set out in LC Paper No. CB(4)836/18-19(01).	

Running Time	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
	Owners of Fortress Garden		
011121 – 011358	Chairman Representative of Liberal Party	Presentation of views on the slow progress in implementing the 18 HEL proposals put forth since 2009 and the revised assessment mechanism for HEL proposals.	
011359 – 011718	Chairman Mr LAW Kwong-keung	Presentation of views as set out in LC Paper No. CB(4)881/18-19(04).	
011719 – 011812	Chairman 海天峰管理處	Presentation of views on the necessity of constructing the pedestrian link at Braemar Hill.	
011813 – 012122	Chairman Mr Ronald HO	Presentation of views on expediting the implementation of the escalator link system between Sha Tin Sui Wo Court and MTR Fo Tan Station and the revised assessment mechanism on HEL proposals.	
012123 – 012430	Chairman Mr Kent LAM Jing-kwok	Presentation of views as set out in LC Paper No. CB(4)836/18-19(02).	
012431 – 012756	Chairman Ms LI Chun-chau, Eastern District Council Member	Presentation of views as set out in LC Paper No. CB(4)836/18-19(10).	
012757 – 013036	Chairman Mr HUI Lam-hing	Presentation of views as set out in LC Paper No. CB(4)836/18-19(03).	
013037 – 013303	Chairman Kwai Tsing District Council Member, Office of Pau Ming Hong	Presentation of views as set out in LC Paper No. CB(4)836/18-19(04).	
013304 – 013626	Chairman 富澤花園「寶馬山行人通道系統」關注組	Presentation of views as set out in LC Paper No. CB(4)836/18-19(05).	
013627 – 013931	Chairman Mr TAM Pui-tak	Presentation of views as set out in LC Paper No. CB(4)836/18-19(06).	

Running Time	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
013932 – 014239	Chairman 何偉俊先生	Presentation of views as set out in LC Paper No. CB(4)836/18-19(07).	
014240 – 014521	Chairman Mr Frankie LAM	Presentation of views on the need for a pedestrian link between Hong Sing Garden and Po Hong Road in Tseung Kwan O.	
014522 – 014827	Chairman 潘秉康先生	Presentation of views as set out in LC Paper No. CB(4)836/18-19(08)	
014828 – 015149	Chairman Ms KWOK Fu-yung, Kwai Tsing District Council	Presentation of views on the need for HEL facilities (1) between Wah Sing Street and Kwai Hing MTR station, (2) near Hong Kong Taoist Association (HKTA) The Yuen Yuen Institute No.1 Secondary School and (3) near Kam Heng Building, as well as setting up a dedicated fund to implement HEL proposals.	
015150 – 015656	Chairman Administration	Administration's response to the views expressed by deputations.	
015657 – 020007	Chairman Mr HO Kai-ming Administration	<p>Mr HO expressed deep concern about the slow implementation progress of the 18 HEL proposals put forward since 2009. He also opined that HEL, as an automated pedestrian walkway system, could substitute short-haul transport mode such as minibus to connect mass railway transport stations with nearby residential areas.</p> <p>The Administration responded that it normally took 6 to 9 years for completing a HEL project. The Administration would progressively take forward the 18 HEL projects in different districts and review the assessment mechanism for future HEL proposals to foster a pedestrian-friendly environment.</p>	
020008 – 020315	Chairman Mr SHIU Ka-fai	Mr SHIU commented that there was a genuine need for constructing the pedestrian link at Braemar Hill having regard to the population size and serious congestion problem in the district. He also addressed some of the concerns raised by deputations on the project.	
020316 – 020623	Chairman Mr AU Nok-hin Administration	Mr AU enquired about the possibility of merging the Universal Accessibility ("UA") Programme with the provision of HEL and urged the Administration to consolidate experience gained in undertaking different types of projects to improve	

Running Time	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>efficiency.</p> <p>The Administration replied that as the scope and objective of UA Programme and HEL projects were different, it was not feasible to merge the two programmes. The Administration would consolidate experience and maintain flexibility when undertaking future HEL projects.</p>	
020624 – 020931	Chairman Mr Paul TSE	Mr TSE enquired whether the Administration would consider other HEL proposals apart from the 114 proposals received in the past years and how the Administration could quantify the social benefits of a proposal under the revised assessment mechanism. He also opined that the HEL proposals should be selected based on the topographical nature rather than evenly distributed among 18 district councils.	
020932 – 021330	Chairman Ms YUNG Hoi-yan Administration	<p>Ms YUNG expressed concern about the slow implementation progress of the 18 HEL proposals and commented that the revised assessment mechanism had complicated the procedures in assessing HEL proposals and might exclude projects which had immense local needs.</p> <p>The Administration replied that the revised assessment mechanism would take into account both social benefits and cost-effectiveness of HEL proposals so that these two aspects could be evaluated holistically. The Administration proposed to shortlist not less than 20 proposals for consultation with relevant district councils in 2020, and would evaluate the remainder of the 114 proposals together with new proposals received for shortlisting the second batch of proposals for implementation.</p>	
021331 – 021729	Chairman Administration	<p>The Chairman enquired whether the Administration would consider setting up a dedicated fund for implementing HEL projects to speed up the progress. He also sought the implementation status of the pedestrian walkway system between Lai King Hill Road and Lai Cho Road in Kwai Tsing area.</p> <p>The Administration replied that the vetting procedure for a public works project was adopted</p>	

Running Time	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		having regard to the scale and the cost of HEL proposals involved and the Administration would carefully consider members' suggestion. As regards the proposal mentioned, the Highways Department would engage consultant to carry out investigation and preliminary design for the proposal in the second half of 2019.	
<i>Agenda Item III – Any other business</i>			
021730 - 021758	Chairman	Closing remarks	

Council Business Division 4
Legislative Council Secretariat
5 November 2019