

**立法會**  
**Legislative Council**

LC Paper No. CB(2)1934/18-19  
(These minutes have been  
seen by the Administration)

Ref : CB2/PL/WS

**Panel on Welfare Services**

**Minutes of special meeting**  
**held on Tuesday, 2 April 2019, at 9:30 am**  
**in Conference Rooms 1 and 2 of the Legislative Council Complex**

**Members present** : Hon KWONG Chun-yu (Chairman)  
Hon SHIU Ka-chun (Deputy Chairman)  
Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung  
Hon Michael TIEN Puk-sun, BBS, JP  
Hon CHAN Chi-chuen  
Hon LEUNG Che-cheung, SBS, MH, JP  
Dr Hon KWOK Ka-ki  
Hon KWOK Wai-keung, JP  
Dr Hon Fernando CHEUNG Chiu-hung  
Hon POON Siu-ping, BBS, MH  
Hon Alvin YEUNG  
Hon Andrew WAN Siu-kin  
Hon CHU Hoi-dick  
Hon Wilson OR Chong-shing, MH  
Hon YUNG Hoi-yan  
Dr Hon Pierre CHAN  
Hon LUK Chung-hung, JP

**Member absent** : Dr Hon CHENG Chung-tai

**Members attending** : Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, GBS, JP  
Dr Hon Junius HO Kwan-yiu, JP  
Hon SHIU Ka-fai

**Public Officers** : Session One  
**attending**

Dr LAW Chi-kwong, GBS, JP  
Secretary for Labour and Welfare  
Labour and Welfare Bureau

Ms Angelina KWAN Yuen-yee  
Head, Human Resources Planning and Poverty  
Co-ordination Unit  
Chief Secretary for Administration's Private Office

Ms Reddy NG Wai-lan, JP  
Principal Economist (5)  
Office of the Government Economist  
Financial Secretary's Office

Mr Leo YU Chun-keung  
Assistant Commissioner for Census and Statistics  
(Economic 1)  
Census and Statistics Department

Session Two

Dr LAW Chi-kwong, GBS, JP  
Secretary for Labour and Welfare  
Labour and Welfare Bureau

Mr Caspar TSUI Ying-wai, JP  
Under Secretary for Labour and Welfare  
Labour and Welfare Bureau

Ms Angelina KWAN Yuen-yee  
Head, Human Resources Planning and Poverty  
Co-ordination Unit  
Chief Secretary for Administration's Private Office

Ms Reddy NG Wai-lan, JP  
Principal Economist (5)  
Office of the Government Economist  
Financial Secretary's Office

Mr Leo YU Chun-keung  
Assistant Commissioner for Census and Statistics  
(Economic 1)  
Census and Statistics Department

Sessions Three to Four

Mr Caspar TSUI Ying-wai, JP  
Under Secretary for Labour and Welfare  
Labour and Welfare Bureau

Mr Nick AU YEUNG Lik  
Deputy Head, Human Resources Planning and  
Poverty Co-ordination Unit  
Chief Secretary for Administration's Private Office

Ms Reddy NG Wai-lan, JP  
Principal Economist (5)  
Office of the Government Economist  
Financial Secretary's Office

Mr Leo YU Chun-keung  
Assistant Commissioner for Census and Statistics  
(Economic 1)  
Census and Statistics Department

**Attendance  
by invitation**

: Session One

Agape Garden

Ms CHEUNG Tsz-wai  
Director

The Civic Party

Miss Leticia WONG  
地區發展主任

石硤尾邨居民協會

Mr KWOK Wai-shing  
Chief Executive

Labour Party

Mr KWOK Wing-kin  
Chairperson

Good Neighbour North District Church

Mr CHAN Hoi-hing  
Minister in charge of Church

Democratic Alliance for the Betterment and Progress of  
Hong Kong

Miss LAI Ka-man  
Deputy Spokesperson

落區

Mr CHIU Yat-fai  
Ministry Coordinator

Mr LAI Wai-tong

Waste Picker Platform

Mr TANG Wing-him  
Officer

School of Poverty Caring

Miss CHAN Yee-kwan  
Ministry Coordinator

Mrs WONG Yuet-han

流動露宿車車主聯盟

張木根先生  
Chairman

Mild Intellectual Disability Concern Group

Mr TAM Wai-yip  
Vice Chairman

The Federation of Hong Kong & Kowloon Labour  
Unions

曾威慎先生  
地區幹事

Session Two

The Democratic Party

Mr LAM Ting-wai  
Community Officer

Young Democrats

Miss LI Wing-yin  
Member

Hong Kong Unison

Ms Phyllis CHEUNG  
Executive Director

Ms Rabia ASLAM

Ms Kamal-preet KAUR

Ms Arlin-l RAI

Ms Henna BASHIR

Ms Kulsoom-akhtar OMME

Ms Yasmeen IQRAH

Mr Rohail MOHAMMAD

Society of Cultural Integration

Ms Payal BISWAS  
Project Officer

Ms Kainaat ASIF

Ms Nisa-uzma KHAN

Ms Narpreet KAUR

Mr Siddhartha DATTA

Ms Umme-habiba ASLAM

Hong Kong Social Workers' General Union

Ms CHEN Hung-sau

理事

Mrs WONG Hua

Ms Salma-umme ASLAM SAGHIR

觀塘兒童權利關注組

何汝瑛女士

組織幹事

觀塘關注兒童貧窮小組

李紅女士

成員

觀塘關心兒童貧窮小組

廖春花女士

成員

關注兒童政策組

孟凌雲女士

成員

兒童政策關注組

朱成愛女士  
成員

兒童權利關注小組

謝霜汶女士  
成員

Mrs CHAN Wa-chun

Session Three

Mrs LIN Chun-mei

Alliance for Children Development Rights

Mr CHEUNG Chin-kiu  
Committee Member

Kwun Tong Methodist Social Service

張健儀小姐  
社工

Alliance of Social Expenditure Concern Groups

Mr LEE Chi-yung  
Committee Member

賀卓軒先生

The Hong Kong Council of Social Service

Mr WONG Wo-ping  
Chief Officer (Social Security and Employment)

Concerning CSSA & Low Income Alliance

Mr LEE Tai-shing  
Committee Member

爭取低收入家庭保障聯席

李風清小姐  
成員

Women's Right Association

Ms HUANG Xiaoqun  
Member

Society for Community Organization

Ms SZE Lai-shan  
Community Organizer

SEN Concern Group

Ms HUANG Wenjie  
Organizer

Concern Group for Elderly with Family Members

Ms FOR Mei-sung  
Member

Women's Employment Group

Ms LAU Yin-shan  
Organizer

Shau Kei Wan Residents Service Group

Mr LO Wai-sam  
實習社區幹事



Mr LEUNG Yat-long

Health In Action

Mr Anthony LAI Chun-kin  
Research and Advocacy Coordinator

The Zubin Foundation

Ms Shalini MAHTANI  
Founder and CEO

Concern Group on the Grassroot Youth

Mr NG Yi-chung  
Member

Catholic Diocese of HK Diocesan Pastoral Centre for  
Workers - Kowloon

Mr TSENG Ka-chun  
Program Officer

Equal Access Group

Mr Shoaib HUSSAIN  
Assistant Program Officer

Session Four

Kwai Chung Estate Elder's Rights Concern Group

Ms YAU Fong-fong  
Group Member

Hey! Group

Mr Numan GHARIB  
Member

Equal Access Core Group

Mr Malik-aftab HUSSAIN  
Member

EM Concern Group

Ms Magarni INDIRA  
Member

AIM Group

Mr Yuvraj LAMA  
Member

Kwai Chung Estate Elder Rights Concern Group

Mr TSANG Hoi-pang  
Member

Mr Tauqir AHMAD

Mr Minhas RASHID

Ms LO Lai-ping

Miss SO Sim-yan

Miss Kathy LEE

Mr LAI Chi-ho

Nepalese Cleaning Workers Concern Group

Miss Rabina LIMBU  
Organizer

**Clerk in attendance** : Ms Wendy JAN  
Chief Council Secretary (2) 4

**Staff in attendance** : Mr Roger CHUNG  
Council Secretary (2) 4

Miss Alison HUI  
Legislative Assistant (2) 4

---

Action

**I. Review of Hong Kong's poverty situation and setting of a target for poverty elimination**  
[LC Paper Nos. CB(2)1093/18-19(01) to (02)]

At the invitation of the Chairman, Secretary for Labour and Welfare ("SLW") briefed members on the major findings of the analysis of poverty situation in Hong Kong in 2017 based on the poverty line analytical framework formulated by the Commission on Poverty ("CoP").

2. The Chairman invited the deputations/individuals to present their views. A total of 73 deputations/individuals expressed their views which were summarized in the **Appendix**.

The Administration's response to the views of deputations/individuals

3. Responding to the views expressed by the deputations/individuals, SLW and Under Secretary for Labour and Welfare ("USLW") made the following points:

- (a) to facilitate multi-dimensional understanding and analysis of the local poverty situation, the Administration and CoP had conducted further studies to supplement the analytical framework of the poverty line. For example, the Administration had prepared a supplementary analysis on the expenditure patterns of poor households in 2015, which was based on the statistics acquired from the Household Expenditure Survey ("HES") conducted every five years. A new round of HES would be launched in the 2019-2020 financial year;
- (b) the Administration had spent around 60% of its recurrent expenditure on health, education and welfare services in the last two years. In the 2019-2020 financial year, the

expenditure on social welfare was estimated to reach \$84.3 billion, representing 19.1% of the Government's total recurrent expenditure estimate. Various poverty alleviation measures had been rolled out and their effectiveness would be fully reflected in future poverty situation analyses;

- (c) the Administration would conduct a review of the relevant pro-employment components of the Comprehensive Social Security Assistance ("CSSA") Scheme, including the Integrated Employment Assistance Programme for Self-reliance, in 2019;
- (d) a number of children had benefited from the Working Family Allowance ("WFA") and the student financial assistance schemes administered by the Student Finance Office ("SFO"). The Administration would review the relevant policies as appropriate;
- (e) the Administration would implement measures to strengthen community care and support services for children and elderly persons, with a view to supporting women to join the workforce. In addition, the Administration had encouraged employers to introduce various family-friendly employment practices, including flexitime arrangements;
- (f) the Administration had, since February 2019, expanded the target beneficiaries of the Community Care Fund ("CCF") Elderly Dental Assistance Programme to cover all elderly persons aged 65 or above who were receiving the Old Age Living Allowance ("OALA");
- (g) deputations' views regarding the implementation of the Chinese Language Curriculum Second Language Learning Framework ("Learning Framework") would be relayed to the Education Bureau ("EDB") for consideration;
- (h) the Social Welfare Department ("SWD") would commission non-governmental organizations ("NGOs") to set up three designated outreaching teams to proactively reach out to ethnic minorities ("EMs") in need and connect them to mainstream welfare services. The outreaching teams were expected to commence operation in the 2019-2020 financial year;

- (i) to further strengthen the employment support for EM job seekers, the Administration would launch a pilot programme in conjunction with NGOs to provide employment services for EM job seekers through a case management approach ("the Pilot Programme"). Briefing sessions had been organized for interested NGOs to better understand the details of the Pilot Programme;
- (j) the Administration had engaged NGOs to help EMs apply for WFA. As at end-February 2019, over 5 000 EMs, involving more than 1 200 households had benefited from WFA;
- (k) the Administration had recently conducted a comprehensive review of the entry requirements relating to Chinese language proficiency for all civil service grades. The review sought to ensure that the Chinese language proficiency requirements ("LPRs") of all the grades would be commensurate with their job requirements and no more than necessary for performance of the job, thereby removing any unreasonable barrier to EMs in applying for civil service jobs. After the review, the number of grades in the civil service that had lowered/would lower Chinese LPRs had increased by 22 to 53;
- (l) the Labour Department ("LD") had, since September 2014, implemented the Employment Services Ambassador ("ESA") Programme for EMs, under which trainees of the Youth Employment and Training Programme who could communicate in EM languages were employed as ESAs to undergo six-month on-the-job training (extended to 12 months for ESAs engaged since September 2018). LD had employed over 100 ESAs since the launch of the programme; and
- (m) a high-level Steering Committee on Ethnic Minority Affairs ("SCEMA") had been set up under the chairmanship of the Chief Secretary for Administration to enhance internal collaboration among government bureaux/departments on the support for EMs and to coordinate, review and monitor the work in this area. SCEMA would also oversee the effective utilization of the \$500 million as earmarked in the 2018-2019 Budget to strengthen support services for EMs.

## Discussion

### *Enhancing poverty alleviation measures*

4. Mr CHAN Chi-chuen considered that given the substantial fiscal surplus, the Administration should strengthen its poverty alleviation measures. He raised concern that each eligible member of the public was only granted a one-off payment of up to \$4,000 under the Caring and Sharing Scheme and the arrangement for disbursing payments under the Scheme was inefficient. He also urged the Administration to relax the means test mechanism for OALA. SLW responded that as announced in the 2017 Policy Address, the Administration had relaxed the asset limits for OALA from \$225,000 to \$329,000 for elderly singletons and from \$341,000 to \$499,000 for elderly couples in order to benefit more elderly persons with financial needs.

5. Mr Wilson OR noted with concern that the Hong Kong Poverty Situation Report 2017 was only published in November 2018 and called on the Administration to consider making available to the public the poverty situation analysis before the report was published in the future. Mr OR also urged the Administration to implement dedicated measures to address the problems of high rental and transportation expenses in Hong Kong.

6. Mr POON Siu-ping and Mr LEUNG Yiu-chung were of the view that the current poverty alleviation measures were ineffective in improving the poverty situation. The Deputy Chairman expressed concern that there was a lack of dedicated measures to improve the income level of poor families. He suggested that the Administration should raise the rate of the Statutory Minimum Wage with a view to improving the distribution of wealth in society. He also called on the Administration to formulate measures to improve the employment terms and conditions of the government outsourced workers. Dr Fernando CHEUNG urged the Administration to provide additional support for specific groups, such as elderly persons, persons with disabilities, EMs, women, new arrivals, youth, etc.

7. SLW responded that the overall poverty rate after recurrent cash policy intervention remained at 14.7% in 2017. The Administration's recurrent cash measures in 2017 had lifted about 370 000 persons out of poverty, which was about 3% more than the figure in 2016. In the light of the time lag of the data collected, the poverty situation report published in the current year could only provide poverty statistics of the previous year. As such, the effectiveness of the enhancements to OALA in 2017 and the full impact of the Higher OALA in 2018 would only be reflected in

subsequent poverty situation analyses.

8. SLW further advised that the data collected for poverty analysis had to be further analysed, with a view to identifying groups in need of focused support. It would therefore take time to explore and formulate policy initiatives accordingly so as to provide the necessary support. For example, the poverty line analysis had revealed that low-income working families not receiving CSSA were at a higher risk of poverty and warranted priority attention. In this connection, the Administration launched the Low-income Working Family Allowance Scheme (renamed as the WFA Scheme on 1 April 2018 with the implementation of a series of enhancements) in 2016 to encourage members of these families to stay in active employment and ease the problem of inter-generational poverty. Furthermore, the poverty line analysis also shed light on the poverty situation of elderly persons and had helped the Administration identify elderly persons with financial needs. In this connection, the Higher OALA was introduced in 2018 to provide additional support to them.

9. The Deputy Chairman and Dr Fernando CHEUNG strongly urged the Administration to take effective measures and formulate an implementation plan to alleviate the poverty situation. USLW explained that the policy objective of alleviating poverty was to encourage and support able-bodied persons to stay in active employment, with a view to lifting them out of poverty. In this connection, the Administration had enhanced various welfare services and employment support services to encourage able-bodied persons to join the labour market.

10. Sharing the views of Health in Action, the Deputy Chairman and Dr Fernando CHEUNG enquired whether the Administration would conduct a study on the health situation of and usage of public healthcare services by poor households, and enhance the provision of primary healthcare services for them.

11. Assistant Commissioner for Census and Statistics (Economic 1) advised that the Administration would compile analyses on the poverty situation of persons with disabilities and chronic diseases to help better understand the poverty situation of these specific groups. In response to the Deputy Chairman's further enquiry about studying the health situation of the poor population, USLW advised that the Administration would consider how to consolidate the above-mentioned analyses and the data obtained from various Government departments in studying the matter.

12. Dr Fernando CHEUNG raised concern that child poverty rate had increased in recent years. It indicated that various measures, such as WFA

and the Child Development Fund, had failed to alleviate the poverty situation of children from grass-root families. In this connection, he urged the Administration to formulate new measures and set a target to reduce child poverty.

13. Mr LUK Chung-hung expressed concern about the problem of inter-generational poverty and the widened disparity between the rich and the poor in Hong Kong. In view of the stringent eligibility criteria for and low allowance rates of the student financial assistance schemes administered by SFO, he urged the Labour and Welfare Bureau to collaborate with EDB to support children from grass-root families in attending after-school interest classes and tutorial classes.

14. SLW responded that EDB was conducting a review of the School Textbook Assistance Scheme and would consider improvements where necessary. Besides, CCF would continue to launch various programmes to support students from underprivileged and low-income families.

15. The Chairman considered that the Child Allowance under the WFA Scheme was inadequate to address the needs of children from grass-root families. The Chairman and Dr Fernando CHEUNG further called on the Administration to provide free dental services for children from grass-root families and elderly persons. USLW advised that the Administration had expanded the target beneficiaries of CCF Elderly Dental Assistance Programme since February 2019. He further explained that the shortage of healthcare professionals and suitable premises were obstacles to the increase in the provision of public dental services. Members' views would be relayed to the Food and Health Bureau for consideration.

16. The Deputy Chairman raised concern about the low university admission rates for children from grass-root families. Given that the child poverty rate was on the rise, he urged the Administration to implement measures to narrow the gap between children from grass-root families and children from rich families. USLW responded that some poor children were from large working households with heavy family burden. These children usually lived with elderly persons and with only one working family member. In this connection, the Administration launched and enhanced the WFA Scheme to help alleviate inter-generational poverty and promote upward social mobility in the long run. As at February 2019, there were about 160 000 persons benefiting from the WFA Scheme, including over 60 000 children/youth.

17. Dr KWOK Ka-ki expressed concern that the expenditure weight of individual categories of goods and services covered by the Social Security



Assistance Index of Prices ("SSAIP") was only updated once every five years with reference to the findings of HES on CSSA Households. In this connection, he enquired how the Administration would assist CSSA households between the updates of the weighting system of SSAIP. SLW advised that the standard payment rates under the CSSA Scheme were adjusted annually taking into account movements of SSAIP to maintain the purchasing power of CSSA payments. Besides, the Administration would review the pro-employment components of the CSSA Scheme, which include the supplements and special grants thereunder in 2019.

*Setting a target for poverty alleviation*

18. The Deputy Chairman, Dr KWOK Ka-ki, Mr POON Siu-ping and Dr Fernando CHEUNG enquired whether the Administration would set a target for poverty alleviation. The Deputy Chairman had reservation about the Administration's view that the setting of a quantified poverty alleviation target might direct its resources to focus on those below the poverty line, rendering those slightly above the poverty line ineligible for welfare assistance.

19. SLW advised that setting a target for poverty alleviation would focus the Administration's resources on lowering the poverty line. However, based on the concept of "relative poverty", the poverty line thresholds would continue to rise with increasing wage levels. Given the difficulties in predicting the increase in wages, it was not technically feasible to set a target for poverty alleviation.

20. SLW and USLW further explained that the Administration's poverty alleviation initiatives needed to achieve the dual functions of poverty prevention and alleviation, and should not just benefit those under the poverty line. As such, various cash-based support measures implemented by the Administration were targeted not only at those below but also those above the poverty line. Other than cash measures, the Administration had allocated substantial resources to provide households in need with various in-kind benefits.

21. In view of the limitations of the analytical framework of the poverty line, the Deputy Chairman suggested that the Administration should set a subsistence living protection line to delineate the minimum standard of basic subsistence recognized by the community. USLW advised that the poverty line provided a simple quantitative basis for the Administration to understand the trends of the poverty situation in Hong Kong. The Administration would continue to make use of the poverty line analysis to monitor the poverty situation, evaluate the effectiveness of various

initiatives on poverty alleviation, as well as review and improve policy initiatives in light of relevant data analyses.

22. In response to Dr Fernando CHEUNG's suggestion that representatives from CoP should be invited to attend the Panel meeting, USLW advised that the Administration would convey to CoP the views expressed by members during the Panel meeting.

*Employment support services for elderly persons*

23. The Chairman and Dr KWOK Ka-ki raised concern that CSSA recipients aged between 60 and 64 were forced to take up employment after the implementation of the policy of raising the eligible age for elderly CSSA from 60 to 65. Dr Fernando CHEUNG held the view that elderly persons were often engaged in low-skilled manual jobs and more prone to injuries at work. However, the retirement protection for elderly persons was weak and the poverty rate of elderly persons after policy intervention was over 30%.

24. In the light of the difficulties encountered by elderly persons in seeking employment, the Chairman, Dr KWOK Ka-ki, Dr Fernando CHEUNG and Mr POON Siu-ping urged the Administration to enhance the employment support services for elderly persons. SLW advised that the Administration was committed to providing appropriate employment services for mature persons. To encourage employers to hire mature persons and provide them with on-the-job training, LD had further enhanced the Employment Programme for the Elderly and Middle-aged in September 2018. Meanwhile, the Employees Retraining Board ("ERB") had been providing suitable courses for mature persons. Of all trainees attending the training courses provided by ERB in recent years, around 55% were aged 50 or above and one-fourth were aged 60 or above.

*Strengthening the provision of child care services*

25. Mr LEUNG Yiu-chung considered that the initiatives proposed in the 2018 Policy Address had failed to improve the service quality of the Neighbourhood Support Child Care Project ("NSCCP") and Mutual Help Child Care Centres ("MHCCCs"). In the light of the low utilization rate of the services of NSCCP and MHCCCs, additional resources should be provided to improve such services to better meet the needs of poor families. He also suggested that the Administration should strengthen the provision of child care services in the existing public rental housing estates.

26. SLW advised that to further enhance child care services, SWD had planned to increase the provision of long full-day child care places for children aged below three at aided standalone child care centres ("CCCs") by about 300 from the 2019-2020 financial year. In addition, the Administration would take into account the current provision of CCC places in each district when purchasing properties for the provision of welfare facilities. Besides, the Administration would raise the level of incentive payment for home-based child carers under NSCCP within the 2019-2020 financial year. The Administration would also re-engineer in phases the existing MHCCCs from the 2019-2020 financial year onwards and consider converting MHCCC services to after-school care services for pre-school children so as to further meet the child care needs in the community.

*Support measures for ethnic minorities*

27. In view of the high poverty rate of EMs, Dr Fernando CHEUNG called on the Administration to introduce new and dedicated measures to strengthen the support for EMs. Dr CHEUNG also opined that the Administration should conduct a study on the poverty situation of EM students with special needs and EM women, and formulate dedicated measures to address their needs.

28. USLW advised that the Administration would continue to enhance the support services for various groups in need by conducting a focused analysis of their situation. In addition, the Administration had set up various committees to monitor and consider how to strengthen relevant support services for specific groups.

29. In response to the enquiries of the Chairman and Dr Fernando CHEUNG as to how the Administration would strengthen the employment support for EM job seekers, USLW advised that LD and ERB had been actively providing employment support services and job-related training for EMs with a view to enhancing their employability and skills. The Administration would also encourage employers to provide EMs with a more diversified range of job opportunities and review the Chinese LPRs of various jobs.

30. Dr Fernando CHEUNG expressed concern that the Administration had only lowered the Chinese LPRs of a limited number of grades in the civil service. The Chairman and Dr CHEUNG further requested the Administration to provide information on the current number of EMs working in various Government departments.

31. SLW responded that the number of grades in the civil service that had lowered/would lower Chinese LPRs had increased to 53. In view of the concern about possible race discrimination and that the race of job applicants was not a relevant consideration in the civil service recruitment process, the prevailing practice was not to collect information on the ethnic origins of civil service job applicants or serving civil servants.

32. The Chairman asked whether the Administration would provide support services for EM students to enhance their learning of the Chinese language. SLW advised that from the 2014-2015 school year onwards, EDB had introduced a series of measures to step up the support, including the implementation of the Learning Framework in primary and secondary schools. The Learning Framework aimed to help non-Chinese speaking students (notably EM students) overcome the difficulties in learning Chinese as a second language with a view to facilitating their bridging over to mainstream Chinese language classes in the long run. The Administration would also provide subsidies for special child care centres and early education and training centres to strengthen the support for pre-school EM children with disabilities or special needs from the 2019-2020 financial year onwards.

## **II. Any other business**

33. There being no other business, the meeting ended at 5:12 pm.

## Panel on Welfare Services

Special meeting on Tuesday, 2 April 2019, at 9:30 am

Review of Hong Kong's poverty situation  
and setting of a target for poverty elimination

## Summary of views and concerns expressed by deputations/individuals

No.	Name of deputation / individual	Views
<u>Session One</u>		
1.	Agape Garden	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>● The problem of elderly poverty and the disparity between the rich and the poor had become more serious in Hong Kong.</li> <li>● Despite having a huge fiscal surplus, the Administration had not allocated adequate resources to improve the housing, health and welfare services.</li> <li>● The Administration should not raise the eligible age for elderly Comprehensive Social Security Allowance ("CSSA") from 60 to 65. CSSA payment rates could not cover the recipients' living expenses.</li> </ul>
2.	The Civic Party	[LC Paper No. CB(2)1093/18-19(05)]
3.	石硤尾邨居民協會	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>● The size of the poor population had continued to go up in recent years.</li> <li>● The disparity between the rich and the poor was the result of uneven distribution of public resources.</li> <li>● The Administration should levy higher taxes on the rich and allocate more resources to improve the welfare services for the poor.</li> </ul>
4.	Labour Party	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>● The Administration should raise the rate of the Statutory Minimum Wage ("SMW") and legislate to affirm workers' right to collective bargaining, with a view to improving the distribution of wealth in the society.</li> <li>● The Administration should step up its efforts in alleviating poverty, and improve the social security system and raise the level of assistance.</li> <li>● The eligibility criteria for the Working Family Allowance ("WFA") Scheme were stringent and</li> </ul>

No.	Name of deputation / individual	Views
		the amount of allowances under the Scheme was inadequate.
5.	Good Neighbour North District Church	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>● The Administration should implement measures to help poor households and poor elderly persons, e.g. formulating a scavenger-friendly policy.</li> <li>● The Administration should educate the public not to stigmatize CSSA recipients.</li> <li>● The Administration should not raise the eligible age for elderly CSSA from 60 to 65, but should conduct a comprehensive review of the CSSA Scheme.</li> </ul>
6.	Democratic Alliance for the Betterment and Progress of Hong Kong	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>● The Commission on Poverty should set a poverty alleviation target in order to narrow the disparity between the rich and the poor.</li> <li>● Given the limitation that the poverty line took household income as the sole indicator for measuring poverty, "asset-rich, income-poor" persons were wrongly defined as poor.</li> <li>● The Administration should set a subsistence living protection line to delineate the minimum standard of basic subsistence recognized by the community.</li> </ul>
7.	落區	[LC Paper No. CB(2)1165/18-19(05)]
8.	Mr LAI Wai-tong	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>● Existing poverty alleviation measures were ineffective in improving the poverty situation.</li> <li>● Some elderly persons were unwilling to apply for CSSA and Old Age Living Allowance since these allowances were means-tested.</li> <li>● The Administration should set a poverty alleviation target and step up its efforts in alleviating problems of elderly poverty and youth poverty.</li> </ul>
9.	Waste Picker Platform	[LC Paper No. CB(2)1135/18-19(02)]
10.	School of Poverty Caring	[LC Paper No. CB(2)1135/18-19(03)]
11.	Mrs WONG Yuet-han	[LC Paper No. CB(2)1135/18-19(01)]

No.	Name of deputation / individual	Views
12.	流動露宿車車主聯盟	[LC Paper No. CB(2)1165/18-19(06)]
13.	Mild Intellectual Disability Concern Group	[LC Paper No. CB(2)1165/18-19(04)]
14.	The Federation of Hong Kong & Kowloon Labour Unions	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>● The Administration should review the effectiveness and adequacy of its poverty alleviation measures and set a poverty alleviation target.</li> <li>● The Administration should set a subsistence living protection line to delineate the minimum standard of basic subsistence recognized by the community.</li> <li>● The Administration should enact legislation to further protect employees' rights, e.g. stipulating standard working hours.</li> </ul>
<b><u>Session Two</u></b>		
15.	The Democratic Party	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>● The Hong Kong Poverty Situation Report 2017 could not accurately reflect the situation of youth poverty in Hong Kong.</li> <li>● Undergraduate students were usually heavily burdened by loan debts resulting from high tuition fees.</li> <li>● The disparity between the rich and the poor had become more serious and there were fewer opportunities for young persons to move up the social ladder.</li> </ul>
16.	Young Democrats	[LC Paper No. CB(2)1165/18-19(09)]
17.	Hong Kong Unison	[LC Paper No. CB(2)1165/18-19(03)]
18.	Ms Rabia ASLAM	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>● Many ethnic minority ("EM") students had encountered language barrier in post-secondary institutions.</li> <li>● Some post-secondary courses were not suitable for non-Chinese speaking ("NCS") students as Chinese was used as the medium of instruction.</li> <li>● The Administration should provide more post-secondary courses for NCS students and review the progression ladder for EM students to pursue post-secondary education.</li> </ul>

No.	Name of deputation / individual	Views
19.	Ms Kamal-preet KAUR	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>● Large household size should not be one of the root causes of poverty.</li> <li>● The Administration's education, employment and welfare policies had failed to address the needs of poor EM households.</li> </ul>
20.	Ms Arlin-I RAI	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>● The Administration should train secondary school teachers to be culturally sensitive and better understand the needs of EM students.</li> </ul>
21.	Ms Henna BASHIR	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>● Given that NCS students were only taught an adapted and simpler Chinese language curriculum not normally applicable to the majority of students in local schools, their employability and social mobility were adversely affected.</li> <li>● The Chinese Language Curriculum Second Language Learning Framework ("Learning Framework") was not effective in improving the quality of Chinese language learning for NCS students.</li> <li>● The Administration should set learning targets for NCS students in learning Chinese language.</li> </ul>
22.	Ms Kulsoom-akhtar OMME	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>● The Administration should strengthen the capability of teachers in implementing the Learning Framework and teaching Chinese as a second language, e.g. provision of a standardized curriculum. It should also formulate a long-term education policy for NCS students.</li> <li>● The Administration should train teachers to be culturally sensitive and better understand the needs of EM students.</li> </ul>
23.	Ms Yasmeen IQRAH	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>● Given that NCS students were only taught an adapted and simpler Chinese language curriculum not normally applicable to the majority of students in local schools, their employability and social mobility were adversely affected.</li> </ul>
24.	Mr Rohail MOHAMMAD	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>● EM children did not have the opportunity to study in an immersed Chinese language environment since their applications for admission were usually rejected by kindergartens where the majority of students were Chinese.</li> <li>● Children from EM families had difficulties in admission to some kindergartens since the</li> </ul>



No.	Name of deputation / individual	Views
		<p>admission interviews were conducted in Chinese and the information provided by the kindergartens was also in Chinese only.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>● The Administration should monitor kindergartens to ensure their compliance with the relevant admission guidelines, with a view to providing adequate support to EM families and setting up a fair admission mechanism.</li> </ul>
25.	Society of Cultural Integration	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>● The Administration should step up the monitoring of kindergartens so as to ensure equal opportunities in school admission for all eligible children (including EM children).</li> <li>● The Administration should develop another set of performance indicators for kindergartens to evaluate the language ability of EM students.</li> <li>● The Administration should review the application form for primary one admission system to ensure that NCS students had equal opportunity to gain admission to primary schools.</li> </ul>
26.	Ms Kainaat ASIF	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>● EM families were not aware of the welfare services provided by the Administration. The Administration should step up its promotion efforts in this regard.</li> <li>● Frontline staff of the Social Welfare Department should arrange interpretation services for EMs to facilitate their access to welfare services.</li> </ul>
27.	Ms Nisa-uzma KHAN	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>● EM families had difficulties in admission to kindergartens with an immersed Chinese language environment since they were not familiar with the admission procedures.</li> <li>● Kindergarten teachers were not culturally sensitive and could not understand the needs of EM students.</li> <li>● Given that EM students had great difficulties in admission to mainstream schools, their employability and social mobility were adversely affected.</li> </ul>
28.	Ms Narpreet KAUR	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>● Given that NCS students were only taught an adapted and simpler Chinese language curriculum not normally applicable to the majority of students in local schools, their employability and social mobility were adversely affected.</li> </ul>

No.	Name of deputation / individual	Views
29.	Mr Siddhartha DATTA	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>● EM students had great difficulties in admission to mainstream schools with an immersed Chinese language environment.</li> <li>● Given that NCS students were only taught an adapted and simpler Chinese language curriculum not normally applicable to the majority of students in local schools, their employability and social mobility were adversely affected.</li> </ul>
30.	Ms Umme-habiba ASLAM	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>● Given that NCS students were only taught an adapted and simpler Chinese language curriculum not normally applicable to the majority of students in local schools, their employability and social mobility were adversely affected.</li> <li>● The Administration should conduct a comprehensive review of the Learning Framework with a view to providing adequate support to EM students in learning Chinese.</li> <li>● The Administration should not include Chinese History as an independent compulsory subject for the junior secondary level as most EM students would encounter difficulties in learning the subject.</li> </ul>
31.	Hong Kong Social Workers' General Union	[LC Paper No. CB(2)1165/18-19(08)]
32.	Mrs WONG Hua	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>● Low-income families could not afford to pay for their children's after-school tutorial fees or interest class fees.</li> <li>● The Administration should subsidize children from low-income families to attend interest classes.</li> </ul>
33.	Ms Salma-umme ASLAM SAGHIR	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>● The Chinese language proficiency requirements ("LPRs") of civil service posts were barriers for EMs to apply for civil service openings.</li> <li>● Since the majority of grades in the civil service with lowered Chinese LPRs were from disciplinary forces, the Steering Committee on Ethnic Minorities Affairs should further review such requirements so as to increase the number of grades with lowered LPRs.</li> <li>● The Administration should provide information on the current number of EMs working in various</li> </ul>

No.	Name of deputation / individual	Views
		Government departments.
34.	觀塘兒童權利關注組	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>● Given the limited number of children covered and small amount of funds accumulated under the Child Development Fund, the Administration should instead set up a universal savings scheme for parents to pay for education and healthcare expenses of their children.</li> <li>● The Administration should provide a child allowance for recipients of the School Textbook Assistance Scheme.</li> <li>● The Administration should set a target for child poverty alleviation and establish a subcommittee under the Commission on Children to tackle child poverty.</li> </ul>
35.	觀塘關注兒童貧窮小組	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>● Low-income families could not afford the high transportation, education and healthcare expenses of their children.</li> <li>● The Administration should provide vouchers to subsidize children to use private healthcare service and provide financial assistance for kindergarten students.</li> <li>● The Administration should set a target for child poverty alleviation and establish a subcommittee under the Commission on Children to tackle child poverty.</li> </ul>
36.	觀塘關心兒童貧窮小組	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>● The Administration should encourage bus companies to provide fare concessions of 50% discount to secondary school students.</li> <li>● The Administration should extend the Free Lunch at Schools programme to cover secondary school students.</li> <li>● The Administration should provide a child allowance and establish a subcommittee under the Commission on Children to tackle child poverty.</li> </ul>
37.	關注兒童政策組	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>● Low-income families could not afford the high education and healthcare expenses of children.</li> </ul>
38.	兒童政策關注組	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>● The Administration should provide healthcare vouchers of \$2,000 a year to subsidize children aged below 12 to use private healthcare service.</li> <li>● The Administration should extend the School Dental Care Service to cover Secondary Three students.</li> </ul>

No.	Name of deputation / individual	Views
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>● The Administration should subsidize Primary One to Secondary Three students to attend interest classes.</li> </ul>
39.	兒童權利關注小組	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>● Students living under the poverty line should be eligible for full grant under the financial assistance schemes administered by the Student Finance Office ("SFO").</li> <li>● In addition to the full grant and half grant rates under the financial assistance schemes administered by SFO, the Administration should add a 75% grant rate under the schemes.</li> <li>● The Administration should set a target for child poverty alleviation and establish a subcommittee under the Commission on Children to tackle child poverty.</li> </ul>
40.	Mrs CHAN Wa-chun	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>● Grass-root families could not afford to pay for their children's after-school interest class fees.</li> <li>● The Administration should implement measures to support the development of children.</li> <li>● The District Support Scheme for Children and Youth Development could only provide a limited number of quota and short-term support to children.</li> </ul>
<b><u>Session Three</u></b>		
41.	Mrs LIN Chun-mei	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>● Grass-root families could not afford the high education expenses of children.</li> <li>● The District Support Scheme for Children and Youth Development only provided limited assistance for children and youth.</li> <li>● The Administration should review the student financial assistance schemes administered by SFO and subsidize the cost of school uniform and interest classes to help children from grass-root families.</li> </ul>
42.	Alliance for Children Development Rights	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>● The Administration had underestimated the poverty situation of children since the poverty line was set at 50% of the median monthly household income ("MMHI").</li> <li>● Given that the existing poverty alleviation measures were ineffective, the Administration should implement new measures to subsidize the living expenses of grass-root children.</li> <li>● The Administration should set a target for child</li> </ul>

No.	Name of deputation / individual	Views
		poverty alleviation.
43.	Kwun Tong Methodist Social Service	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>● The Department of Health should provide public dental services for children.</li> <li>● The Administration should provide through the Community Care Fund a service voucher for dental examination service for children aged below six.</li> <li>● The Administration should extend the School Dental Care Service to children aged below six.</li> </ul>
44.	Alliance of Social Expenditure Concern Groups	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>● The poverty line was delineated at 50% of MMHI, which was far below the international level (i.e. 60% of MMHI). This poverty line could not accurately reflect the poverty situation of Hong Kong.</li> <li>● There was a lack of concrete measures in the Budget to support grass-root families.</li> <li>● The Administration should set a subsistence living protection line to delineate the minimum standard of basic subsistence recognized by the community.</li> </ul>
45.	賀卓軒先生	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>● The Administration should raise the SMW rate to \$55 per hour and increase the rate of allowance under various cash-based support measures.</li> <li>● The Administration should introduce capital taxes, with a view to redistributing wealth.</li> <li>● The Administration should review the poverty line and set a target for poverty alleviation.</li> </ul>
46.	The Hong Kong Council of Social Service	[LC Paper No. CB(2)1165/18-19(07)]
47.	Concerning CSSA & Low Income Alliance	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>● The Administration had underestimated the poverty situation since the poverty line took household income as the sole indicator for measuring poverty.</li> <li>● The Administration did not take into account the high living expenses of grass-root families when assessing poverty.</li> <li>● The Administration should set a target for poverty alleviation.</li> </ul>
48.	爭取低收入家庭保障聯席	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>● The Administration had underestimated the poverty situation since the poverty line was only delineated at 50% of MMHI.</li> </ul>

No.	Name of deputation / individual	Views
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>● The Administration should set a subsistence living protection line and a target for poverty alleviation.</li> <li>● The WFA Scheme had only benefited a limited number of low-income working families.</li> </ul>
49.	Women's Right Association	[LC Paper No. CB(2)1165/18-19(01)]
50.	Society for Community Organization	[LC Paper No. CB(2)1165/18-19(01)]
51.	SEN Concern Group	[LC Paper No. CB(2)1165/18-19(01)]
52.	Concern Group for Elderly with Family Members	[LC Paper No. CB(2)1165/18-19(01)]
53.	Women's Employment Group	[LC Paper No. CB(2)1165/18-19(01)]
54.	Shau Kei Wan Residents Service Group	[LC Paper No. CB(2)1093/18-19(06)]
55.	Mr LEUNG Yat-long	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>● Given that the SMW rate was only reviewed every two years and the increase in the SMW rate was only marginal, most of the workers receiving wages at the SMW rate had become "working poor".</li> <li>● The Administration should review the effectiveness of its poverty alleviation measures in assisting grass-root families.</li> <li>● Given that the Administration did not have the authority to vet and approve One Way Permit applications, it might have difficulties in formulating effective poverty alleviation policies.</li> </ul>
56.	Health In Action	[LC Paper No. CB(2)1165/18-19(02)]
57.	The Zubin Foundation	[LC Paper No. CB(2)1093/18-19(07)]
58.	Concern Group on the Grassroot	[LC Paper No. CB(2)1165/18-19(01)]

No.	Name of deputation / individual	Views
	Youth	
59.	Catholic Diocese of HK Diocesan Pastoral Centre for Workers - Kowloon	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>● Given that EMs often engaged in low-skilled jobs, most of them became "working poor".</li> <li>● EMs had difficulties in seeking professional and high-skilled jobs since employers lacked the experience in hiring EM staff. The Administration should encourage employers to hire EMs.</li> <li>● The Administration should subsidize private companies to offer interpretation service to EM job seekers.</li> </ul>
60.	Equal Access Group	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>● The Administration should ensure equal access to public services for EMs. Government departments should set performance indicators and pledge to monitor the provision of services to EMs.</li> <li>● The Administration should offer interpretation service and other support services to EMs so as to assist them in applying for public services.</li> <li>● EM staff should be employed to assist EMs in applying for public services.</li> </ul>
<b><u>Session Four</u></b>		
61.	Kwai Chung Estate Elder's Rights Concern Group	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>● The Administration should provide out-patient dental services and mobile dental services for elderly persons in the 18 districts.</li> <li>● The Administration should provide an accountable dental service allowance for elderly persons.</li> <li>● The Administration should increase the annual voucher amount and the accumulation limit of Elderly Health Care Vouchers.</li> </ul>
62.	Hey! Group	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>● The Administration should discuss with EMs regarding the pilot programme to provide employment services for EM job seekers through a case management approach ("the Pilot Programme").</li> <li>● The Administration should take into account the capability and service quality of NGOs in selecting service providers of the Pilot Programme.</li> <li>● The Pilot Programme should promote social integration of EM staff at workplace and encourage employers to hire EMs.</li> </ul>

No.	Name of deputation / individual	Views
63.	Equal Access Core Group	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>● Given that EMs had difficulties in seeking jobs and were often engaged in low-paid and insecure employment, most of them had become "working poor".</li> <li>● The Administration should introduce more measures to help EMs find jobs.</li> <li>● The Labour Department should follow up with EM job seekers until they found employment, and encourage employers to hire EMs.</li> </ul>
64.	EM Concern Group	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>● The Administration should provide support service and escort service for EM elderly persons.</li> <li>● The Administration should strengthen the support services for EM elderly persons at District Elderly Community Centres, Neighbourhood Elderly Centres, Social Centres for the Elderly, etc. For example, EM staff should be employed at these centres to provide language support services.</li> <li>● The Administration should plan for the provision of support services for EM elderly persons in order to address their needs.</li> </ul>
65.	AIM Group	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>● The Administration should provide incentives for employers to train NCS staff at work.</li> <li>● The Administration should launch a programme to encourage NCS workers to learn Chinese.</li> </ul>
66.	Kwai Chung Estate Elder Rights Concern Group	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>● The Administration should implement universal retirement protection scheme in order to address the needs of poor elderly persons.</li> <li>● The Administration should regulate the dental services provided for elderly persons.</li> </ul>
67.	Mr Tauqir AHMAD	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>● The Administration should allocate more resources to provide bilingual education for both Chinese and EM students.</li> <li>● The Administration should provide allowance for EM students to receive education.</li> <li>● The Administration should ensure equal access to employment for all workers, including EM workers.</li> </ul>
68.	Mr Minhas RASHID	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>● CSSA payment rates could not cover the rent paid by CSSA households living in rented private residential units. The Administration should implement tenancy control to deal with high rents</li> </ul>



No.	Name of deputation / individual	Views
		<p>of private residential units.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>● The eligibility criteria for WFA were too stringent.</li> <li>● The Administration should provide information on the current number of EMs working in various Government departments.</li> </ul>
69.	Ms LO Lai-ping	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>● The Administration should strengthen the manpower of community care services for elderly persons, with a view to facilitating ageing-in-place.</li> </ul>
70.	Miss SO Sim-yan	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>● The Administration should regularize the Elderly Dental Assistance Programme under the Community Care Fund, and provide free dental services under the Programme on a need basis.</li> <li>● Fixed prosthesis instead of removable dentures should be provided for elderly persons under the Programme.</li> <li>● The Administration should remove the accumulation limit of Elderly Health Care Vouchers.</li> </ul>
71.	Miss Kathy LEE	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>● EMs had difficulties in seeking jobs due to language barrier and stringent Chinese LPRs of some jobs. The Administration should sign the Racial Diversity &amp; Inclusion Charter for Employers, with a view to promoting a racially inclusive culture and working environment.</li> <li>● The Administration should take into account the unemployment rate of EMs when setting the poverty alleviation line.</li> <li>● The Administration should provide the details and updated progress of the Pilot Programme to the public.</li> </ul>
72.	Mr LAI Chi-ho	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>● There was a lack of opportunities for EMs to upgrade their social status and they were often engaged in insecure employment.</li> <li>● The contract for the provision of employment support service for EMs was often awarded to the non-governmental organizations ("NGO") which had submitted the lowest bid, and such NGOs usually had high staff turnover rate which in return would affect their service quality.</li> <li>● The Administration should provide the details of the Pilot Programme, e.g. the target for reducing unemployment rate of EMs, to the public.</li> </ul>

<b>No.</b>	<b>Name of deputation / individual</b>	<b>Views</b>
73.	Nepalese Cleaning Workers Concern Group	<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>● Since cleansing service contracts were simply awarded on the basis of tender price, cleansing workers were often paid a low salary. In addition, there was a lack of changing facilities and shower facilities for cleansing workers.</li><li>● The Administration should take into consideration rental expenses when setting the poverty line and provide a rental allowance for needy households.</li><li>● The Administration should review the existing labour legislation and implement measures to address the needs of working women.</li></ul>

Council Business Division 2  
Legislative Council Secretariat  
25 September 2019