# THE STANDING COMMITTEE ON LEGAL EDUCATION AND TRAINING

# ANNUAL REPORT 2018

1 January 2018 to 31 December 2018

### **CONTENTS**

ANNUAL REPOR	$\Lambda$	1
ANNEXURE 1:	Section 74A of the Legal Practitioners Ordinance	5
ANNEXURE 2:	Composition of the Standing Committee on Legal Education and Training	7
ANNEXURE 3:	City University of Hong Kong  – Report on the LLB Programme	9
	City University of Hong Kong  – Report on the PCLL Programme	15
	City University of Hong Kong  – Report on the JD Programme	19
ANNEXURE 4:	The Chinese University of Hong Kong  – Report on the LLB Programme	25
	The Chinese University of Hong Kong  – Report on the PCLL Programme	29
	The Chinese University of Hong Kong  – Report on the JD Programme	32
ANNEXURE 5:	The University of Hong Kong  – Report on the LLB and JD Programmes	39
	The University of Hong Kong  – Report on the PCLL Programme	42
ANNEXURE 6:	Key Statistics of the 2018/19 LLB, JD and PCLL Programmes	45
ANNEXURE 7:	Composition of the Hong Kong Conversion Examination Board	46

# ANNUAL REPORT OF THE STANDING COMMITTEE ON LEGAL EDUCATION AND TRAINING

(1 January 2018 to 31 December 2018)

This is the thirteenth annual report of the Standing Committee on Legal Education and Training ("SCLET"). Section 74A of the Legal Practitioners Ordinance Cap. 159 ("Ordinance") providing for the establishment of SCLET and its functions is at <u>Annexure 1</u>.

#### **Meetings**

1. SCLET met on six occasions during the reporting period from 1 January 2018 to 31 December 2018 ("Reporting Period"). Its composition is at **Annexure 2**.

#### **Major Matters Dealt with by SCLET**

#### Comprehensive Study on Legal Education and Training

- 2. The Consultants published an Interim Report in October 2017 and invited written responses. The Consultants also visited Hong Kong in the last week of January 2018 to meet with stakeholders before finalising their Report.
- 3. In the Interim Report, the Consultants suggested "That consideration be given to the establishment for Hong Kong of a separate School or Institute of Professional Legal Studies, with a view to preparing candidates for entry to the legal professions and the practice of law." <sup>1</sup> In Chapter 6, it dealt at some length with the Law Society's proposal to establish the "common entrance examination and called for a moratorium" on current Common Entrance Examination ("CEE") development.<sup>2</sup>
- 4. The Law Society did not meet with the Consultants during their visit in January 2018 or respond to the Interim Report prior to the presentation of the Final Report to SCLET in April 2018. The Final Report was presented to SCLET on 26 April 2018. The suggestion that consideration be given to the establishment of a separate law school was not repeated in the Final Report.
- 5. After presentation of the Final Report to SCLET, the Law Society by a document titled "Submission to (the Consultants) regarding Unified Law School and the Common Entrance Examination" dated 8 May 2018 (the Law Society's Submission), stated "pending implementation of the unified law school and that sufficient PCLL places be made available in order to fairly and appropriately accommodate at least the current

Para.2.18, Recommendation 2.1

<sup>-</sup>

For details, see Recommendations 6.1, 6.2, 6.3 and 6.4 in the Interim Report

level of PCLL application, ... the Law Society would pending the above establish the Law Society Examination (LSE) which is currently estimated to take effect as early as the academic year 2019/2020." As proposed, the LSE would provide an alternative mode of qualification for solicitors to PCLL. This proposal which had not been made previously by the Law Society had been considered by the Consultants in their Interim and Final Reports<sup>3</sup>, under the name of AltCEE, (Alternative Common Entrance Examination).

- 6. The Final Report was published on 15 May 2018. The Consultants responded to the Law Society's Submission by their Observations published in the same month and repeated their concerns about AltCEE which they had expressed in their Interim and Final Reports. The Consultants went on to say at para.7.1 "Any move to the establishment of an LSE or AltCEE must be fully scrutinized by SCLET before it is put before the Chief Justice for approval."
- 7. Following views expressed at SCLET meetings, the Law Society announced on 28 December 2018 "The Law Society has been considering proposals on the examinations required, set or approved under Rule 7(a) of the Trainee Solicitors Rules. Advance notice will be given regarding relevant proposals which, in any event, will not be implemented in the academic year of 2019/2020".
- 8. With regard to their proposal, a Law Society representative said, in response to a question raised at a subsequent SCLET meeting, that the possibility of the LSE not being implemented by the Law Society would be low. By email dated 20 May 2019, in response to the request for comment on an earlier draft of this report, the Law Society stated "(T)he Law Society would like to emphasise that the Law Society has repeatedly stated that the Law Society Examination and the Common Entrance Examination (the Law Society never called it the AltCEE) were at a conceptual stage, it was in the process of developing detailed syllabus and logistics, and once the details and logistics had been formulated, these would be discussed with SCLET." This helpful statement shows that SCLET will indeed have a genuine opportunity to consider and comment on the Law Society's proposals, if any, and has alleviated the fear of unilateral action by the Law Society. We look forward to a constructive dialogue with the Law Society at their convenience.
- 9. SCLET considers it important that it and other stakeholders will have a genuine opportunity to consider and comment on the Law Society's proposal(s), and for those views to be taken into account by the Law Society, before a decision is taken on the

-

See, for example, para.6.8-6.9, Final Report

The concerns included the risk that it may be perceived as a "second class" pathway for those who cannot get into PCLL; risks as to standards and a race to the bottom of grade inflation and possible concern about variability of standards of the vocational courses, as well as concerns about resources, monitoring and oversight, especially if the suggestion paragraph 32 of (the Law Society's Submission) that part or all of the course work were undertaken overseas was implemented. See para.6.1, 6.2 and 6.3, Comprehensive Review of Legal Education and Training in Hong Kong, Observations by the SCLET Consultants' on the Hong Kong Law Society to their Interim Report (Oct 2017).

It appears the Law Society is of the view that it is empowered to prescribe the CEE under Rule 7(a)(ii) of the Trainee Solicitors Rules, and that they could do so 'without seeking permission from any other person or institution'. See Law Society, President's Message, "Common Entrance Examination", Hong Kong Lawyer, February 2016. Whether the Law Society's view is correct may require determination in the event of disagreement over the Law Society's proposal(s).

way forward regarding the LSE. Whilst SCLET acknowledges the importance of professional independence, it believes its advisory role should be respected. Moreover, SCLET believes that any change or reform on legal education should be based on a consideration of where the public interest lies. Whether the view of the Law Society on any issue should be supported should also be decided by consideration of public interest.

- 10. Meanwhile, given the uncertainty over the Law Society's plans, SCLET's consideration of the Consultant's recommendations in the Final Report has been progressing more slowly than expected.
- 11. The SCLET will continue its deliberation of the Consultants' recommendations as well as any proposal or decision of the Law Society over LSE or CEE (it is not clear whether the Law Society is still pursuing CEE or whether it will seek to implement LSE) and will report its recommendations as soon as possible.

#### Bachelor of Laws ("LLB"), Juris Doctor ("JD") and PCLL Programmes

- 12. SCLET continued to monitor the following legal education programmes:
  - (a) The LLB, JD and PCLL programmes of City University of Hong Kong. The reports are at **Annexure 3**;
  - (b) The LLB, JD and PCLL programmes of The Chinese University of Hong Kong. The reports are at **Annexure 4**; and
  - (c) The LLB, JD and PCLL programmes of The University of Hong Kong. The reports are at **Annexure 5**.
- 13. A table consolidating the key statistics of the LLB, JD and PCLL programmes of the 3 law schools is at **Annexure 6**.

#### **Conversion Examination**

- 14. The Conversion Examination Board met on three occasions during the Reporting Period to oversee the administration of the Conversion Examination. Matters considered by the Board in the meetings and by paper circulation included the following:
  - (a) Vetting of applications for exemption from sitting the Conversion Examination;
  - (b) Review of examination results, reports of the Examiners, irregularities in the examinations:
  - (c) Review of exemptions granted to the examination subjects of Criminal Procedure and Civil Procedure;

- (d) Appointment of examiners and reviewers;
- (e) Fees of the Examiners;
- (f) Scholarships granted to candidates and their eligibility;
- (g) Review of examination schedule;
- (h) Decisions of the Chief Examiner on the appeals against examination results;
- (i) Review of syllabi and book lists; and
- (j) Applications for special arrangements to sit the Conversion Examination.
- 15. The Conversion Examination was held twice during the Reporting Period in January and June 2018 respectively.
- 16. 742 and 663 candidates took part in the Conversion Examination in eight different prerequisite subjects in January and June 2018 as compared to 702 and 674 candidates respectively in the January and June 2017 Conversion Examinations.
- 17. The average pass rate of the subjects examined in January 2018 was 59.26% (as compared to 66.27% in the January 2017 results) and that in June 2018 was 60.32% (as compared to 55.32% in the June 2017 results).
- 18. The composition of the Conversion Examination Board is at **Annexure 7**.

#### Chairmanship

19. SCLET is chaired by Mr. Justice Robert Tang.

#### **Overall position**

20. Various stakeholders in the field of legal education and training contributed their views from different perspectives and the meetings of SCLET have provided a useful forum for the exchange of views on different issues.

## **Annexure 1**

#### SECTION 74A OF THE LEGAL PRACTITIONERS ORDINANCE

#### 74A. Standing Committee on Legal Education and Training

- (1) There is established by this section a Standing Committee on Legal Education and Training.
- (2) The functions of the committee are-
  - (a) to keep under review, evaluate and assess-
    - (i) the system and provision of legal education and training in Hong Kong;
    - (ii) without prejudice to the generality of subparagraph (i), the academic requirements and standards for admission to the Postgraduate Certificate in Laws programme;
  - (b) to monitor the provision of vocational training of prospective legal practitioners in Hong Kong by organizations other than the Society or the Hong Kong Bar Association;
  - (c) to make recommendations on matters referred to in paragraphs (a) and (b); and
  - (d) to collect and disseminate information concerning the system of legal education and training in Hong Kong.
- (3) The committee shall consist of-
  - (a) 17 members appointed by the Chief Executive of whom- (Amended 10 of 2005, s.184)
    - (i) 2 shall be persons nominated by the Chief Justice;
    - (ii) 1 shall be a person nominated by the Secretary for Justice;
    - (iii) 1 shall be a person nominated by the Secretary for Education (Amended L.N. 130 of 2007);
    - (iv) 2 shall be persons nominated by the Society;
    - (v) 2 shall be persons nominated by the Hong Kong Bar Association;

#### Extract of Section 74A of the Legal Practitioners Ordinance

- (vi) 2 shall be persons nominated by the Vice-Chancellor of the University of Hong Kong;
- (vii) 2 shall be persons nominated by the President of the City University of Hong Kong;
- (viia) 2 shall be persons nominated by the Vice-Chancellor of The Chinese University of Hong Kong; (Added 10 of 2005 s.184)
- (viii) 2 shall be members of the public; and
- (ix) 1 shall be a person nominated by the Federation for Self-financing Tertiary Education, a non-profit-making educational organization, from among its members which provide continuing legal education courses in Hong Kong; and (Amended 18 of 2014 s. 159)
- (b) a chairman appointed by the Chief Executive after consultation with the persons and organizations making nominations pursuant to paragraph (a)(i) to (viia) and (ix). (Amended 10 of 2005 s.184)
- (4) A member of the committee who is unable to attend a meeting of the committee, except for a member appointed pursuant to subsection (3)(a)(viii), may, subject to the consent of the chairman, send a substitute to attend the meeting in his place and the substitute shall be deemed to be a member of the committee for the purpose of that meeting.
- (5) A member of the committee including the chairman shall hold office for a term not exceeding 2 years.
- (6) A member of the committee including the chairman may at any time resign from the committee by giving notice in writing of his resignation to the Chief Executive.
- (7) The Secretary for Justice may publish notice of the appointment or termination of membership of a member (including the chairman) appointed pursuant to this section in the Gazette.
- (8) The committee shall report annually to the Chief Executive and its annual report shall be tabled in the Legislative Council.
- (9) The committee may determine its own procedure.

## Annexure 2

# THE STANDING COMMITTEE ON LEGAL EDUCATION AND TRAINING

**Chairman:** The Honourable Mr. Justice Patrick CHAN Siu-oi, G.B.M.

(from August 2011 to August 2017)

The Honourable Mr. Justice Robert Tang Ching, G.B.M., S.B.S., J.P.

(from August 2017)

**Members:** The Honourable Mr. Thomas AU Hing-cheung

(on the nomination of the Chief Justice)

The Honourable Mr. Justice Godfrey LAM Wan-ho, J.P.

(on the nomination of the Chief Justice)

Mr. Peter WONG Hing-hong

(from September 2010 to March 2018)

Miss LEE Sau-kong (from March 2018)

Deputy Solicitor General (Policy Affairs), Department of Justice

(on the nomination of the Secretary for Justice)

Ms. Sharon KO Yee-wai

Principal Assistant Secretary (Higher Education), Education Bureau

(on the nomination of the Secretary for Education)

Mr. Simon LAI Sau-cheong

(on the nomination of The Law Society of Hong Kong)

Mr. Nicholas CHAN Hiu-fung, M.H.

(on the nomination of The Law Society of Hong Kong)

Mr. Edward CHAN King-sang, S.C., J.P.

(on the nomination of Hong Kong Bar Association)

Mr. Michael YIN Chi-ming

(on the nomination of Hong Kong Bar Association)

Professor Michael HOR Yew-meng

Dean of Law, The University of Hong Kong

(on the nomination of the Vice-Chancellor of The University of

Hong Kong)

Mr. Wilson CHOW Wai-shun

Head of the Department of Professional Legal Education,

Faculty of Law, The University of Hong Kong

(on the nomination of the Vice-Chancellor of The University of Hong Kong)

Professor Geraint G. HOWELLS

Dean & Chair Professor of Commercial Law, School of Law,

City University of Hong Kong

(on the nomination of the President of City University of Hong Kong)

Ms. Stella LEUNG Suk-yee

(from August 2016 to August 2018)

Ms Theresa LOW

(from August 2018)

Programme Leader of the Postgraduate Certificate in Laws,

School of Law, City University of Hong Kong

(on the nomination of the President of City University of Hong Kong)

Professor Christopher GANE

Dean, Faculty of Law, The Chinese University of Hong Kong (on the nomination of the Vice-Chancellor of The Chinese University of Hong Kong)

Mr. Christopher KNIGHT

Programme Director of Postgraduate Certificate in Laws Programme, The Chinese University of Hong Kong (on the nomination of the Vice-Chancellor of The Chinese University of Hong Kong)

Ms. TONG Choi-cheng

(Member appointed under S74A(3)(a)(viii) of the Legal Practitioners Ordinance Cap.159 ("Ordinance"))

Mr. Alvin WONG Tak-wai

(Member appointed under S74A(3)(a)(viii) of the Ordinance)

Dr. Tommy HO Koon-ki

(on the nomination of The Federation for Self-financing Tertiary Education)

**Secretary:** Ms Vivien LEE, Director of Standards & Development

The Law Society of Hong Kong

(from September 2010 to March 2018)

Ms Kitty Fung, Senior Government Counsel

Department of Justice (from March 2018)

### Annexure 3

#### School of Law City University of Hong Kong

# Bachelor of Laws (LLB) 2018 Annual Report for Standing Committee on Legal Education and Training

#### **April 2019**

This is a status report on the Bachelor of Laws (LLB) Programme offered by the School of Law ("the School"), City University of Hong Kong (CityU). The report covers the period from 1 January 2018 to 31 December 2018.

During the period of this report, the LLB Programme was offered only in full-time (UGC-funded) study mode.

#### **1. 2018/19 Admissions**

In the 2018/19 academic year, the School admitted 59 full-time LLB students in total, including:

- 39 JUPAS applicants (from HKDSE)
- 16 non-JUPAS applicants
- 4 Mainland students

#### 1.1 JUPAS Admissions

In 2018, the School received a total of 471 qualified applications for the 2018 JUPAS entry. All students admitted through JUPAS have good English proficiency, having attained "5" or above in English Language (HKDSE).

#### 1.2 Direct Applicants (local and international)

The School received a total of 233 non-JUPAS (including local and non-local) applications. The selection criteria include the assessment of applicants' academic performance, personal statements and achievements in other relevant activities. In addition, they must all have achieved an IELTS overall score of "7" or above, TOEFL score of over 100 (internet-based) or 600 (paper-based) or equivalent English proficiency qualifications. The quality of applicants was generally high, with some of them being degree holders.

Admission interviews and written tests were conducted with those applicants located in Hong Kong.

#### 1.3 Admission Scholarship

The School established the Admission Scholarship in 2008 to attract high quality students to enroll in the LLB Programme. The Scholarship is awarded to outstanding secondary school students who are admitted to the LLB Programme through the JUPAS and Direct Application admission channels. The maximum value of each scholarship was HK\$60,000 which was increased to HK\$75,000 starting for 2018 cohort.

In 2018, four (4) LLB Year One students received the scholarship. The students were outstanding in both public examination result and extra-curricular activities.

#### 2. Academic Standards

Several mechanisms have been put in place to maintain high academic standards in the LLB Programme. First, the examination papers moderated internally as well as by External Academic Advisors from leading universities. The Programme Director ensures that feedback from the external examiners is properly considered.

#### 3. Programme Structure

The LLB Programme requirement is 126 credits contributed by the core courses, Law for Professional Qualification Minor, Gateway Education courses and free electives. Students are required to take the core courses including: Legal Research and Writing, Hong Kong Legal System, Law of Contract, Law of Tort, Land Law, Constitutional Law, Administrative Law, Criminal Law, Public Law of the PRC, Private Law of the PRC, Mooting, Applied Legal Theory and Company Law.

In order to encourage students to take part in the exchange programme, the year-long courses "Equity and Trusts I/II" were changed to a single one-semester 3-credit course "Equity and Trusts" and it was offered in Year 3 Semester B. Meanwhile, "Applied Legal Theory" was moved from Year 3 Semester B to Year 2 Semester A.

In addition to the core courses, students must complete the Law for Professional Qualification Minor for entry to PCLL. The Minor includes the following courses: Law of Evidence, Equity and Trusts, Commercial Law, Civil Procedure and Criminal Procedure.

Students who do not wish to enter the legal profession have the option of taking other Minors such as Accountancy, Finance, Global Business, Marketing, Psychology, Languages, etc.

The School continues to bring in renowned scholars to give short one-credit electives. This again broadens the menu of electives available to LLB students.

#### 4. Teaching and Learning

The LLB courses were redesigned in accordance with Outcome Based Teaching and Learning (OBTL). The Course Intended Learning Outcomes (CILOs) have been aligned with the Major Intended Learning Outcomes (MILOs).

The MILOs of the LLB Programme specified that upon successful completion of the Programme, students should be able:

- (1) to analytically and critically describe the main substantive/procedural laws and the legal system of Hong Kong, and also describe the principles of international law or the laws of other jurisdictions;
- (2) to describe the law and legal system of the People's Republic of China and its relation with Hong Kong's constitutional set-up and commercial future;
- (3) to apply the law to solve legal problems;
- (4) to critically evaluate the law in action and the dynamic interplay between law and other social phenomena;
- (5) to use a range of legal or intellectual skills such as reading and interpreting cases and statutes, identifying and evaluating relevant facts, conducting independent legal research, developing and offering solutions to legal problems, using and citing relevant authorities appropriately, drafting documents, and communicating in a coherent, cogent and persuasive manner in performing various tasks;
- (6) to act with a strong sense of ethics and with due regard to social and professional responsibilities;
- (7) to develop an attitude of inquiry and a sense of curiosity to learning and knowledge; and
- (8) to have an opportunity to make an original discovery and/ or innovation concerning the operation of the law and procedure in Hong Kong.

Following the CityU's initiative, the Discovery-Enriched Curriculum (DEC) is well-integrated into the LLB curriculum. Under the DEC, students are given opportunity to make an original discovery and/ or innovation concerning the operation of the law and procedure in Hong Kong.

#### 5. Assessment

The LLB courses are assessed by a combination of class participation and presentation, coursework and examination. To pass a particular course, students must obtain an aggregate mark of 40% and a minimum of 30% in each of the coursework and the examination elements of the assessment.

#### **6.** Exchange Programmes

The School has a good number of exchange programmes with foreign Universities. Exchange activities form an important element in the acquisition of both general transferable skills and legal knowledge. Students are encouraged to take part in the exchange programmes. The School has entered into agreements with overseas universities. They include: University of Amsterdam, University College Dublin in Ireland, Erasmus University Rotterdam, University

of Kent, KU LEUVEN, University of Mannheim in Germany, Montreal University, Nanjing University, National Chengchi University, National Taiwan University, Universidad Pontificia Comillas in Spain, Renmin University of China, Shanghai Jiaotong University, Singapore Management University, Soochow University, Sun Yat-sen University, University of Strathclyde in the U.K, William & Mary Law School, Zhongnan University of Economics and Law, etc.

In 2018, the School received 42 exchange students from overseas jurisdictions, including Australia, Canada, China, Denmark, France, Hungary, India, Israel, the Netherlands, Spain and the United Kingdom studied at the School as exchange students. The School sent out 3 LLB students to universities in Canada, Japan and the Netherlands.

#### 7. Global Engagement

In order to complement the conventional semester-long exchange progammes and to produce law graduates equipped with the breadth of knowledge and skills to navigate the challenges of the globalised working environment, the School in 2007 launched the G-LEAP initially for LLB students and subsequently for JD students. The G-LEAP is a one month intensive mode programme in which students study in prestigious overseas law schools. In the summer of 2018 (during May - June 2018), 14 LLB students spent a month at the Faculty of Law, Monash University (Australia), to study a credit-bearing law course *Australian Corporations Law*. Similarly, 19 LLB students spent a month at University College, Oxford (United Kingdom) during July - August 2018, to study a credit-bearing law course *European Competition Law and Policy*.

The School has received very positive feedback from students who took part in these overseas summer programmes. In particular, students appreciate the change in learning environment and the comparative focus of the courses.

#### 8. Legal Placements

The School has incorporated legal placements in the credit-bearing curriculum of the LLB Programme. The objective of this course is to provide students with a structured opportunity to obtain practical experience from working in law offices or in a law-related working environment. Currently, the course provides legal work experience in Hong Kong, Mainland China and overseas. In 2018, 16 students completed either a part-time or full-time legal placement across a range of diverse places (including barristers' chambers, local/international law firms, legal departments of international companies and financial institutions) in Hong Kong. Furthermore, 14 LLB students participated in the Mainland Legal Placement Programme during May - June 2018. Students received one-week training at Renmin University. Thereafter, they were attached to the local courts of major cities in China. 8 LLB students were given an opportunity to do internship and participate in the Model Universal Periodic Review (MUPR) Competition in Seoul during July – August 2018. Participation in the placement programme provides students with a structured opportunity to acquire practical experience through working in a legal working environment.

#### 9. Mooting Competitions

The School considers mooting to be an integral part of students' legal education as it provides students with an opportunity to broaden and sharpen their advocacy skills. To this end, the School provides them with extensive training in order to participate in both internal and international mooting competitions. During the reporting period, our LLB students achieved an outstanding level of success in the following international mooting competitions.

The LLB students participated in international mooting competitions and achieved commendable results, including the following:

Our students received extensive training from experts in their fields for better preparation in the specific mooting competitions. In the academic year 2017-2018, the LLB students participated in the following international mooting competitions. The moot teams achieved outstanding results:

The 2018 Philip C. Jessup International Law Moot Court Competition (Hong Kong Regional Round) (25 February 2018)

- First Runner-Up
- Second Best Overall Memorial
- One of the team members: Best Oralist

The 8th Asia-Pacific M&A Moot Competition (9 March 2018)

- Prize of the Best M&A Deal
- Prize of the Best M&A Letter of Intent
- One of the team members: Prize of the Best Oralist
- One of the team members: Prize of the Best Team Member

The Vis (East) Pre-Moot Hong Kong (9 – 10 March 2018)

The 15th Annual Willem C. Vis (East) International Commercial Arbitration Moot (11-18 March 2018)

- Eric Bergsten Award for prevailing team in Oral Arguments Sixteenth Finals
- Honorable Mention for David Hunter Award Best Claimant Memoranda
- Honorable Mention for Fali Nariman Award Best Respondent Memoranda
- One of the team members: Honorable Mention for Neil Kaplan Award Best Oralists

The XI Belgrade Open Pre-Moot for the 25th Annual Willem C. Vis International Commercial Arbitration Moot (17 – 18 March 2018)

The 8th Annual Budapest Pre-Moot for the 25th Annual Willem C. Vis International Commercial Arbitration Moot (19 – 22 March 2018)

The 25th Annual Willem C. Vis International Commercial Arbitration Moot (23 – 29 March 2018)

• Advanced to the top 64 out of 357 teams

- 3rd highest overall oralist score in elimination rounds
- Honorable Mention for Werner Melis Award Best Memorandum for Respondent
- Honorable Mention for Pieter Sanders Award Best Memorandum for Claimant
- Two of the team members: Honorable Mention (Martin Domke Award for Individual Oralists)

Manfred Lachs Space Law Moot Court Competition (11 – 13 April 2018)

- Second Best Memorial
- One of the team members: 2nd highest oralist award

Participation in these competitions provides students with an opportunity to develop their advocacy skills and interact with students from other jurisdictions.

#### 10. City University of Hong Kong Law Review

The idea behind this course is for students to work together to edit a law journal: City University of Hong Kong Law Review (CityU LR). First launched in October 2009, the CityU LR publishes two issues annually. Student editors work under the mentorship of faculty members. The work of the students has won great acclaim. Due to its immense success, editing the CityU LR is offered as an LLB law elective.

#### 11. Conclusion

We are pleased to report the smooth and successful operation of the LLB Programme in the last year. In the near future, we are exploring more collaboration opportunities with the prestigious overseas universities to add to our student exchange arrangements. Additionally, the LLB Programme team is taking active measures to increase the number of international students.

Professor Kelvin Low LLB Programme Director School of Law City University of Hong Kong April 2019



# City University of Hong Kong Postgraduate Certificate in Laws (PCLL) 2018 Annual Report for Standing Committee on Legal Education and Training

1. The School of Law ("the School") received **531** applications for its PCLL programme for the academic year 2018/2019. About **84%** of the applicants selected City University of Hong Kong (CityU) as their first choice. **235** offers were made by the School and eventually **212** students were admitted to the PCLL programme.

Among the successful applicants, **53** received UGC-funded places and **159** received non-UGC funded places. About **49%** of those UGC-funded places were given to graduates from universities in Hong Kong.

As at 31 October 2018, there were **211** students studying in the CityU PCLL programme.

The 2018/2019 PCLL programme is comprised of **49%** local graduates and **51%** graduates from overseas institutions.

The following matters are noted in relation to the admissions process:

- 1. The Admissions Committee began reviewing applications in March 2018 and regularly thereafter. This enabled a number of early conditional and unconditional offers to be made to academically strong applicants.
- 2. **14** applicants to whom conditional offers were made were unable to take up their place (most of them being unsuccessful in one or more of the Conversion Exam Board examinations). **9** applicants declined our offers due to personal reasons.
- 3. No student was enrolled with a Third Class Law Degree [or equivalent]. All students enrolled attained the minimum IELTS standard.

#### 2. Class Size

We continued to limit our small group size to around 10 students except for some of the elective courses where the number of students is over 10.

#### 3. Assessment Regime and Outcomes

#### 3.1 Assessment Regime

As previously reported, all written assessments are taken under controlled conditions and the assessment of oral presentations continues to be videoed as backup and for review of the first examiners' assessments. Certain courses continue to be assessed by mid-term written examinations as well as end-of-term examinations.

We have been working with the CityU e-learning team to implement online examinations for all courses with written examinations except Chinese for Legal Practice. This has been well received by course examiners and students alike.

#### 3.2 Assessment Outcomes

#### 2016/2017:

No. of students who failed to graduate from	0
the PCLL programme:	
No. of students who failed one or more	35
subjects at first attempt and were required to	
take supplementary examinations:	

#### 2017/2018:

No. of students who failed to graduate from	0			
the PCLL programme:				
No. of students who failed one or more	35			
subjects at first attempt and were required to				
take supplementary examinations:				

#### 4. Staffing

In 2017/2018, 13 full-time staff and 34 part-time staff (practitioners) taught in the PCLL programme.

In 2018/2019, 13 full-time staff and 35 part-time staff (practitioners) taught in the PCLL programme.

Many teaching staff members have taught PCLL for some time while continuing their legal practice. We are continuing our efforts to bring into our teaching team experienced practitioners in different areas of practice with a view to further strengthen the PCLL programme.

#### 5. Curriculum

There are eleven core courses: Interlocutory Advocacy and Interviewing; Trial Advocacy; Mediation and Negotiation; Litigation Writing and Drafting; Commercial Writing and Drafting; Conveyancing Practice; Wills and Probate Practice; Corporate

and Commercial Practice; Civil Litigation Practice; Criminal Litigation Practice; and Professional Conduct and Practice.

Students must also take three courses from the following seven electives: Bar Course; Foundations in Mainland Related Legal Transactions; International Arbitration Practice; Family Law Practice; Financial Regulatory Practice; Personal Injuries Practice; and Chinese for Legal Practice.

#### Changes in 2017/2018 and 2018/19 academic years

There are no major curriculum changes to be carried out in 2018/19. The elective course "Chinese for Legal Practice" continues to be offered in 2018/19. We aim to equip students of this course with the practical Chinese drafting and Cantonese oral advocacy skills that are often required in legal practice in Hong Kong.

#### 6. The Future

We plan to maintain our strengths and continue to assign dedicated small group rooms to our PCLL students. We also plan to recruit additional qualified practitioners to teach in the programme.

We will continue to work closely with the CityU e-learning team for the implementation of online examination and marking for all PCLL courses in the future.

#### 7. Involvement of the Profession

We are happy to report that the profession has been very involved with the training of the CityU PCLL students. Involvement has been in the form of guest lectures and presentations on different topics; assistance in assessments; mock trials conducted in the High Court and participation in the demonstrations in various advocacy courses and also participation in the mock interviews for will drafting in the Wills & Probate Practice course.

#### 8. Conclusion

We are committed to educating and training competent lawyers to work in the Hong Kong legal market. Our focus is on the holistic development of our students. Apart from training practical skills, we instill in them the value of collaboration, the importance of ethics and the joy of community service. We are proud of our graduates, and with every graduating student, we hope that we are adding an asset to the legal community of Hong Kong.

We are also keen to develop lawyers with a global perspective given the importance of Hong Kong as a financial center and crossroads community. Thus, our courses train our students to approach problem solving from different angles and to work competently with lawyers from other jurisdictions.

We welcome input from the profession and look forward to working with all constituents to move our programme to the next level of excellence.

Ms Theresa Low PCLL Programme Director School of Law, City University of Hong Kong April 2019

# School of Law City University of Hong Kong Juris Doctor (JD) 2018 Annual Report for Standing Committee on Legal Education and Training

#### **April 2019**

#### 1. Background

The JD (Juris Doctor) Programme is a graduate entry law programme for applicants who have a non-law bachelor degree or an undergraduate law degree from a non-common law jurisdiction. JD graduates may enter the legal profession in Hong Kong after completing the Postgraduate Certificate in Laws (PCLL) or use the gained legal knowledge and skills in other professions.

This status report on the JD Programme at the School of Law (School) of City University of Hong Kong (CityU) covers the period from 1 January to 31 December 2018. Since the part-time JD Programme was discontinued in 2010, we only offer the full-time programme to new entrants.

#### 2. 2018/2019 Admission

The minimum entry requirements for admission to JD is (i) a bachelor's degree in a non-law discipline, or (ii) a bachelor's degree in law from a non-common law jurisdiction obtained after at least eight semesters of full-time study. Moreover, applicants must also be proficient in English. For applicant whose entrance qualification is obtained from an institution where the medium of instruction is not English, the minimum English language proficiency requirement is:

- ➤ a TOEFL score of 600 (paper-based test) or 100 (internet-based); or
- > an overall band score of 7 in IELTS with no individual score below 6.5; or
- ➤ a total of 520 in the mainland China's College English Test (Band 6).

Entry to the JD Programme has been quite competitive. The number and quality of applications has remained strong. The School received 346 applications for admission to JD in 2018-19. The School admitted 89 students in the JD Programme in 2018-19, 22.5% of whom had a postgraduate degree. The intake quality of students admitted to the JD Programme in 2018-19 has been stable. For example, around 60% of admitted students had either Upper Second Class Honours (or above) or a GPA of 3 (or above) or achieved 85 out of 100.

Several outreach initiatives (e.g., placing advertisements and advertorials in local newspapers and education supplements, holding an Information Talk and school's participation in the Hong Kong Law Fair every year) were taken to attract applicants from all over the world. Our applicants come from a diverse range of academic backgrounds such as accounting and finance, economics, business administration, property management, physics, chemical and biological engineering, molecular biomedical science, materials engineering, civil engineering, biotechnology, nutrition, food science, civil law, language, translation, European

studies, architectural studies, psychology, sociology, criminology, social policy and administration, political science and journalism. This diversity of the JD student body enhances greatly the quality of class interactions and discussions.

In 2018, the JD Admissions Scholarship was continued to be awarded to students with outstanding academic performances. The maximum number of the award is up to 7 each year.

Subsequent to students' admission to the programme, apart from formal events and orientations, a tea gathering for newly admitted students was organized. This event provided students an opportunity to know each other better and learn about various academic opportunities offered by the School.

#### 3. Programme Structure

The JD Programme comprises a total of 72 credit units. Students have to complete the following three required courses (each worth 3 credits): Legal Systems of Hong Kong and Mainland China; Legal Methods, Research and Writing; and Jurisprudence. The remaining credits can be made up by enrolling in elective courses. The JD Programme structure allows students to take six non-PCLL required electives (worth 18 credits) assuming that they are also going to take 45 credits worth of PCLL-required courses (15 courses) as far as PCLL entry is concerned.

The JD Programme provides the necessary course requirements for admission to the PCLL Programme. Apart from the requirement concerning the required courses, students are required to complete the following courses if they wish to pursue the PCLL Programme: Law of Contract, Law of Tort, Constitutional Law, Administrative Law, Criminal Law I and II, Land Law I and II, Law of Evidence, Equity and Trusts, Company Law I and II, Commercial Law, Civil Procedure, and Criminal Procedure.

Students who do not wish to join the legal profession can still benefit from the JD Programme by choosing a range of elective courses offered by the JD, LLM and LLMArbDR Programmes. The School offers a wide variety of elective courses such as Contemporary Issues of Human Rights Law, Introduction to Information Law, Legal and Operational Aspects of Corporate Governance, International Investment Law, Chinese Maritime Law, Banking Law, Cyber Law, Current Issues in WTO Law, Maritime Insurance Law and Charterparties Law. In 2018-19, the School also offered 1-credit intensive elective courses like CIF and FOB Contracts, Global Class Actions and Collective Redress, Governing International Contracts: Comparative Conflict of Laws and Uniform Law, Dispute Resolution in a Global World, Comparative Contract Law, Introduction to Comparative Corporate Governance, Climate Change in International Law, Harmonization of Private Law: Legal and Cultural Challenges – The European Example To Be Avoided? and Online Platforms taught by faculties from other universities.

JD students have an option to specialise in any one of the following areas by taking any four elective courses (12 credits) from the respective specialisation list below:

1) **International Commercial Law**: LW6161E Competition Law; LW5631 Banking Law; LW5664 European Competition Law of Policy; LW5641 Intellectual Property: Theory, Copyright and Design; LW6543 Cyber Law, LW6144E International Trade Law:

LW6140E Chinese and Comparative Commercial Law; LW6180E International Commercial Contracts and Uniform Sales Law; LW6167E Current Issues in WTO Law

- 2) Alternative Dispute Resolution: LW6401 Dispute Resolution in Theory and Practice; LW6405 Arbitration Law; LW6406 Mediation Practice; LW6407 Arbitration Practice and Award Writing; LW6408 International Arbitration; LW6142E International Investment Law; and LW5649 International Mooting and Advocacy (3 credits) OR LW5649B International Mooting and Advocacy (6 credits).
- 3) Chinese and Comparative Law: LW5626 Comparative Law; LW6127E Chinese and Comparative Intellectual Property Law; LW6134E Chinese and Comparative Company Law; LW6140E Chinese and Comparative Commercial Law; LW6141E Chinese Foreign Trade and Investment Law
- 4) Air and Maritime Law: LW6175E Maritime Insurance Law; LW6176E International Air Law; LW6179E Maritime Arbitration Law; LW6189E Bills of Lading Law; LW6190E Charterparties Law; LW6191E Admiralty Law; LW6192E Maritime Law; LW6194E The Law of the Sea; LW5649 International Mooting and Advocacy (3 credits) OR LW5649B International Mooting and Advocacy (6 credits).

Depending upon the interest of students and the course offering in the future, these specialised streams may be modified. The offering of the above courses may be reviewed and amended from time to time subject to the availability of teaching staff. We shall keep students informed regarding the offering of elective courses.

Students who choose or do not choose to specialise in any of the above areas will receive the award title as Juris Doctor (法律博士). In pursuance of City University's new policy on streamlining award titles, it has been decided that from 2015-16 onwards the award titles will not include areas of specialisation. The specialised area, if elected by a student, will appear on the transcript.

#### 4. Teaching and Learning

The School promotes active and interactive learning. The teaching/learning activities and the assessment tasks are aligned with the Course Intended Learning Outcomes (CILOs). CILOs are then aligned with the Programme Intended Learning Outcomes (PILOs). The PILOs of the JD programme stipulate that after completing the programme, students should be able to:

- 1) explain and assess specified areas of the law and the legal system of Hong Kong, with particular emphasis on the law in action and the dynamic interplay between law and other social phenomena;
- 2) assess the common law system and its values, and its interaction with the law and the legal system of mainland China, the East Asian region and the wider world;
- 3) explain, interpret and apply main principles of ethics, civil duty, and social and professional responsibility;

- 4) critically assess the strengths and weaknesses of law as a means of regulating society in the context of competing and conflicting interests; and
- 5) demonstrate and apply skills of legal analysis and reasoning, of legal research, problem solving, and of oral and written communication to a level appropriate to a graduate-entry degree in law.

To be in line with City University's initiative of Discovery-enriched Curriculum (DEC), various DEC elements have been incorporated into JD courses. Students are encouraged to think critically, explore new socio-legal issues and produce papers of high quality.

All course syllabuses were reformulated in a format called "SYL" with the incorporation of DEC elements.

Students get three direct contact hours for each course every week. Classes are generally conducted as a combination of lectures and small group tutorials, though certain courses are taught in a seminar style. JD students normally do not share classes with undergraduate LLB students for most courses except a small number of elective courses.

#### 5. Assessment

The assessment pattern for most courses is in the form of an assignment, in-class participation and final examination. Since all JD courses are offered at a postgraduate level and students are expected to achieve a suitable standard of competency, students are required to achieve a minimum of 40 per cent marks in each of the assessment components. Students are provided written feedback on their assignment before the final examination.

#### 6. Academic Quality

The School maintains the academic quality of the JD Programme by having in place a rigorous system of external academic advisors. All examination papers are subjected to internal and an external moderation whereby the examination papers are reviewed by the School's cluster groups and the external examiners. The mechanism serves to ensure that the examination papers are in conformity with international standards. The JD Programme Director ensures that the feedback provided by external examiners is taken on board by respective course leaders.

#### 7. Exchange Opportunities

The School recognises the importance of providing students overseas exchange opportunities. Overseas exchanges provide a platform for students to exchange ideas and experiences about different legal issues and legal systems. The School has entered into collaborative agreements with several leading universities such as Amsterdam Law School, Bergen University, KU Leuven, Liège University, Emory University, Maine University, University of San Francisco, William & Mary Law School, Case Western Reserve University, Montreal University, Mannheim University, Fribourg University, National Chengchi University, National Taiwan University, Fudan University, East China University of Political Science and Law, Jilin University, Shanghai Jiaotong University Koguan Law School, Shanghai

University of Finance and Economics, Renmin University, Zhongnan University of Economics & Law and Singapore Management University. We received one incoming postgraduate exchange student in Semester B 2017-18 and three incoming postgraduate exchange students in Semester A 2018-19 from universities in Norway and mainland China. The School sent out two JD students to the universities in the Netherlands and mainland China.

We enter into an agreement with East China University of Political Science and Law that provide opportunity for their students to study in our JD Programme. We also entered into an agreement with Fribourg University, Switzerland. Our JD students are provided with opportunity to study the LLM programme at Fribourg University.

#### 8. Co-curricular and/or Overseas Academic Activities

The learning environment of JD students is immensely enriched by their participation in some of the following activities:

#### **International Mooting Competitions**

As participation in mooting competitions greatly enhances students' mooting and advocacy skills, the School continues to facilitate students' participation in various regional and international mooting competitions by providing extensive training and financial support for them. Our mooting teams have earned world-class reputation winning approximately 12 world championships in 9 years.

#### Legal Placement

The credit-bearing Legal Placement course provides JD students with opportunities to do internships not only in Hong Kong but also in mainland China and other parts of the world. The placement enhances students' hands-on experiences apart from theoretical learning. In Hong Kong, students were placed in various legal departments, financial institutions, chambers and law firms. To enhance students' global exposure, some of them were placed in different courts of major cities in China for four weeks after attending Chinese law courses at the Renmin University of China for two weeks. In Summer 2018, 46 JD students participated in Legal Placement in Hong Kong and 9 JD students joined Legal Placement in mainland China. 3 JD students participated in the Legal Placement (Seoul) – Model Universal Periodic Review (MUPR) Competition in Seoul during July and August 2018.

#### Global Engagement

Global Legal Education Awareness Project (G-LEAP) aims to promote excellence in legal education with a view to providing opportunities for our law students to obtain a global perspective in the study of law. In the summer of 2018, 16 JD students took "Australian Corporations Law" at Monash University, 11 studied "European Competition Law and Policy" at University College Oxford. Students enrolled in these credit-bearing elective courses were taught on an intensive basis by the faculty members of these leading law schools.

#### City University of Hong Kong Law Review (CityULR)

The School of Law launched the student-edited law journal in 2009. Every year, about twenty students are selected and trained by the Faculty Editor to edit the journal. From 2010-11 onwards, an elective law course has been introduced to harness the writing and editing skills of the Board members. The *CityU LR* is available through HeinOnline and Westlaw. It ranks 14th among Asian Law Journals on the W & L law journal ranking scheme, which is highly competitive with other top rated faculty edited law journals and superior to many quality journals in the UK, China, Japan, Korea, Australia, US, the Netherlands and Singapore.

#### 9. Library and Other Facilities

The library provides an extensive selection of print and online legal materials, including law books, law reports, statutes, law reviews databases etc. Most of the electronic resources can be accessed both on campus and remotely. Legal reference services are also offered by the library. Law library workshops are held throughout the year to equip students with legal research skills: finding cases and legislation, finding PRC law, locating ADR legal materials, locating maritime law resources, effective use of secondary materials, and citing legal authorities. Library staff also handle all kinds of enquiries and compile different kinds of research guides. This is to ensure that students can get assistance at the point of need. The library continues to provide customized library collections and services to JD students. The essential readings for their courses are acquired and put on course reserve.

#### 10. Looking Ahead

The JD Programme at CityU, the first of its kind in Hong Kong, is doing well and our JD graduates are highly sought after by local as well as international law firms. We aim to continue to offer an excellent global learning environment to our students. In the coming years, the School aims to offer more elective courses and explore more overseas learning opportunities.

Dr Mark Kielsgard JD Programme Director School of Law City University of Hong Kong

### **Annexure 4**

#### The Chinese University of Hong Kong Faculty of Law

#### Report on the LLB Programme

(January to December 2018)

#### 1. Admissions

The LLB programme has an annual admission quota of 79 with effect from 2016. For 2018 intake, the University also gave an additional 5 Strategic Admission quota to the LLB Programme. The actual number of students admitted was 81 students (including 43 JUPAS students, 34 non-JUPAS students, 3 mainland students and 1 transfer student from another programme of CUHK) for the 2018 intake. Among the 34 non-JUPAS students, six were non-local students from Canada, the Mainland & Taiwan.

The Faculty continues to conduct short interviews as a part of the admissions process to give all students who meet our minimum requirements the opportunity to discuss with a member of the teaching staff their goals and interest in studying at CUHK Law.

#### 2. Course Offering

In addition to the core courses, the LLB programme continues to offer a wide range of electives. Several new elective courses were approved, including *i*) *The Laws and Legal System of the United States*; *ii*) *Origins, Divergence & Duality*; and *iii*) *Issues in Civil Procedure.* 

#### 3. Use of Chinese Language

The Chinese University of Hong Kong implements bilingual education and Chinese language courses form a compulsory part of the curriculum for all students admitted under both JUPAS and non-JUPAS schemes. The LLB programme places great emphasis on improving the bilingual skills of our students.

All LLB students are required to take University Chinese I and II in their first and second years of study. These courses are designed to strengthen the students' ability to use Chinese. Students admitted under the non-JUPAS scheme may be granted exemption on a case-by-case basis after assessment of the individual's Chinese language ability. Where exemption is granted, it is compulsory for the relevant student to take other Chinese language courses suitable for their level of linguistic ability.

In addition, the LLB programme continues to offer two electives (*Chinese Law (Summer Course*) and *Chinese Law Internship*) conducted in Putonghua and delivered on the Mainland for students to acquire a deeper understanding of Chinese law and the Chinese legal system, and to sharpen their Chinese language skills. Students who have taken these courses report that they have substantially improved their Chinese language reading, writing and communication skills.

#### 4. Experiential Learning

The LLB programme continues to emphasize experiential learning as part of the law students' university experience to broaden their learning horizons. In addition to a wide range of activities organized at the University and College levels, the Faculty offers exchange programmes, internships and credit-bearing Summer Study Abroad Programmes (SSAPs) in Beijing, Sydney, and Toronto. The Faculty continues to identify further exchange partners and encourage our students to participate in exchange schemes. In response to student demand for increased faculty-level exchanges in common law jurisdictions, the Faculty has confirmed a new exchange agreement with Osgoode Hall Law School. We also organize lectures by distinguished guests and visits to legal institutions. There are also social activities under the Distinguished Professional Mentorship Scheme. We are most grateful for the strong support from the legal profession that has made these out-of-class learning activities a great success.

#### 5. Mooting Participation

The LLB students continue to participate in international mooting competitions, where they have built upon the success of previous years. In the 2017-18 academic year, CUHK sent teams to participate in the Jessup, Vis, Red Cross, and ICC Moots.

The moot teams continued to excel in 2018. For instance, the team qualified for the competitive final rounds of the Vis (Vienna) International Commercial Arbitration Law Moot and advanced to the final 16 teams out of some 350 participating teams and two team members awarded Honourable Mention (top 10%) for oral advocacy. The team was awarded Third Place Award for Respondent's Memorandum out of some 130 participating teams and honourable mention (top 10%) for oral advocacy at the Vis (East) International Commercial Arbitration Law Moot. Besides, the team won the prize for Best Memorial (Prosecution) at the 13<sup>th</sup> Red Cross International Humanitarian Law Moot Competition. For the International Criminal Court Moot, the team advanced to the quarter-final rounds and won "Best Prosecution Team", "Best Prosecution Memorial" and Second Runner-Up Best Prosecutor Oral Advocacy awards. Also, the team won the 2<sup>nd</sup> and 3<sup>rd</sup> best oral advocates awards in the regional rounds of Philip C. Jessup International Law Moot Court Competition.

The Faculty will continue to encourage mooting amongst our students and support these eminent competitions.

#### 6. Quality Assurance of Teaching and Learning

Quality assurance mechanisms are in place to ensure that we deliver quality legal education to best serve the community.

Internally to ensure the quality of our courses the Faculty administers teaching evaluation surveys to students to collect their feedback in a systematic approach. The Assistant Dean/LLB Programme Director and the Deputy LLB Programme Director meet LLB year representatives in each academic term to collect students' views and concerns in relation to teaching and learning. The Faculty responds to all student questions and concerns in written answers distributed to all students. A "staff-student consultative committee" has been established since last year to allow students to engage in conversations with one another as well as with teaching staff regarding their concerns about all aspects of their studies and university life. The Faculty will continue to work closely with our students to aid independent learning and ensure the best learning environment.

There is rigorous internal moderation of course outlines and exams. All new courses require a detailed outline and plan and must be approved by both the Committee on Undergraduate and Graduate Studies and the Faculty Board. Each semester, exam panels are convened to review proposed exam questions for quality and consistency. The Assistant Dean/LLB Programme Director and the Deputy LLB Programme Director then review all the exams a second time. This double-layer of review has proved effective in catching errors before the exams are printed and distributed to students. Exam marking also is moderated, with two or three exam papers from each grading band and all failure grades being marked again by a second member of staff to ensure fairness and consistency.

#### 7. Learning Resources

As law reports, ordinances and scholarly writings are central to the study of law, the Faculty places great emphasis on its library resources. The Lee Quo Wei Law Library contains over 126,730 volumes and has 82 current print journal titles and access to 3,718 electronic law journals. There are 109 electronic legal databases available to students and staff. The Law Library continues to invest in updating its collection to support existing courses and new courses with new titles and new editions of old titles. In line with the preferred format of our students the Library purchases resources in electronic format where possible, so that access to required texts, cases and articles is available to all students whenever required, regardless of where they are located.

#### 8. Career Preparation

The Academic Advisory System and the Distinguished Professional Mentorship Scheme provide pastoral care and support for our students. The Academic Advisory System ensures close faculty-student relations. The Distinguished Professional Mentors provide close links for our students to the local practitioner community which is invaluable in their appreciation of the working life of a practitioner and in providing them with guidance in their future career choices. The students also have access to alumni mentoring through the Faculty's e-mentoring programme.

Mr. Paul Mitchard, Q.C., is Director of Career Planning and Professionalism. Together with the support the Faculty continues to receive from local professionals, Mr. Mitchard provides our students with valuable guidance on career planning, job applications, interview techniques, professionalism and other matters relating to careers including through a series of seminars matched to the stages of the annual recruitment round and through counselling sessions offered to students who require personalised assistance on career issues.

The Office of Career Planning and Professionalism has also continued to keep the Faculty's Virtual Careers Resource Centre up-to-date and has made a number of further improvements to it. It has also introduced a weekly newsletter on developments in legal business and arranged a series of career seminars, and career talks and workshops, delivered by international and local law firms as well as members of the Hong Kong Bar and the Department of Justice. These events have been very well attended and well received by students.

The Office has again organised a seminar on the New York Bar for students who are considering that as a possible career option, and has fostered relationships with a number of organisations, such as the Hong Kong Corporate Counsel Association, with a view to identifying and enhancing career opportunities for students.

#### 9. Graduates

As in previous years, the majority of our LLB graduates continue their PCLL studies at CUHK on completion of the LLB programme. Around 88% of our LLB graduates who applied for the PCLL programme at CUHK were admitted in 2018. Those not joining the PCLL programme pursued other postgraduate programmes in Hong Kong or abroad or had other career plans.

Stuart Hargreaves
Assistant Dean (Undergraduate Studies) and LLB Programme Director
Faculty of Law
The Chinese University of Hong Kong
April 2019

#### The Chinese University of Hong Kong Faculty of Law

#### Report on the PCLL Programme

(January to December 2018)

#### 1. Admission and Completion Rates (2017-18)

In the 2017 intake, we admitted 162 students to the PCLL. Including one student who was approved to defer studies from 2016-17 to the 2017-18 academic year due to illness, there were 163 students. Of the 163 students, one withdrew from studies due to change in career preference. The remaining 162 students successfully completed the PCLL. A number of students failed courses but were permitted by the Assessment Panel to sit reassessments: a total of 10 reassessments were sat during the year. The excellent pass rate is a reflection of the quality of the students admitted to the programme.

#### 2. Programme Delivery

The 2017/2018 programme was delivered at our Graduate Law Centre in the Bank of America Tower. The Graduate Law Centre offers students a high quality learning environment. In addition to a Moot Court we have a number of interactive lecture theatres and classrooms. These are all equipped with state-of-the-art facilities. There are also a number of breakout rooms available for student study and discussion. We retained the teaching model of a combination of Large Group Sessions and Small Group Sessions (LGSs and SGSs) as this has proved so effective in the previous years.

The same 5 core courses as in previous years were offered in Term 1, namely Professional Practice, Commercial Practice, Property and Probate Practice, Civil Litigation Practice and Criminal Litigation Practice. 11 elective courses were offered in Term 2/Summer term, of which the students had to select and complete 5 courses; these were Writing and Drafting Litigation Documents\*, Conference Skills and Opinion Writing\*, Lending and Finance, Corporate Finance, Writing and Drafting Litigation Documents (in Chinese), China Practice, Writing and Drafting Commercial Documents (in Chinese), Alternative Dispute Resolution, Trial Advocacy\*, Writing and Drafting Commercial Documents and Personal Injuries Practice\*.

Students intending to enter pupillage as a barrister have to study Trial Advocacy and 2 out of the other 3 electives, marked with asterisks. These 4 electives were not confined to intending barristers and it is noteworthy that many intending solicitors also chose to study one or more of these courses.

With the exception of the Chinese language parts of the 2 Chinese drafting electives, nearly all teachers on the PCLL programme are or have been practising lawyers. Throughout all of the courses, the emphasis was on the teaching of skills, and on the students "learning by doing". To that end on all courses the students were taught and then practised skills they would need in practice and were assessed on their skills.

The PCLL is a rigorous course. There is continuous assessment throughout each term with the students facing 2 or 3 assessments in each course. Thus the students have to balance their time between courses and in doing so successfully learn the time management skills which will be so vital to them in practice.

#### 3. Student Diversity

The PCLL 2017/18 had a diverse student body. Of the 162 students admitted, 142 held local law qualifications while 20 held non-local law qualifications. Their academic background is as follows:

Law Qualifications	No. with overseas qualifications	No. with local qualifications	Total no. of students
Bachelor of Laws (LLB)	17	60	77
BA in Law	3	0	3
Juris Doctor (JD)	0	82	82

While most of our students were local, we also had a number of students from the Mainland, who had qualified for admission by way of our Juris Doctor programme, along with students who had studied for their law degrees in the UK and Australia.

#### 4. Oversight by the Professions

With the exception of Trial Advocacy, each PCLL course has assigned to it one or two external course assessors (ECAs), from the Law Society and the Bar Association. The Law Society ECAs see and approve all course papers, and both ECAs see the assessment papers before they are sat and are sent for their review all borderline and failed scripts, along with some top scripts. The Law Society ECAs also attend sessions of their choice and provide feedback to the Law Society. All that feedback has to date been for the most part very positive.

The students also give feedback on the courses and their teachers: that too has been generally positive and encouraging.

#### 5. Contribution by the Judiciary and the Professions

We are also very fortunate to be able to call upon many volunteers from the judiciary and the professions. By way of example, in our Trial Advocacy course in May 2018 we had 18 sessions in which barristers and solicitors came in the evening to give individual feedback to the students on their videoed advocacy performances from earlier each day. The students' final assessment was a mini-trial in courtrooms in the High Court: with 53 students on the course and 4 students participating as advocates in each trial. We required 13 persons to act as judges, whom we invited from the judiciary and the professions.

In addition as part of the Trial Advocacy course we staged a demonstration of trial before a magistrate in Cantonese. This involved a senior Magistrate and members of the Bar acting as the advocates.

We have also had throughout the years numerous guest speakers from the judiciary and the professions. We are very fortunate indeed to have such support. The teaching staff and the students greatly appreciate it.

#### 6. Placement of the 2018 Graduates

Notwithstanding our short history, our graduates in all ten years have been consistently placed in all areas of the legal profession following graduation. Our placement survey results comprise 138 student responses out of 162 graduates of the 2017/2018 cohort. The results show that over 90% have been employed by leading law firms, leading sets of barrister's chambers and the Department of Justice or have chosen to pursue further studies.

#### 2018/2019 PCLL Programme

#### 1. Admissions for 2018-2019

The Faculty received 283 applications to read for the PCLL in the academic year 2018/19. The Faculty made 167 offers. Of the 167 candidates to whom the Faculty made offers, 158 accepted and 9 declined. Of those accepting the offers, 155 were able to satisfy all of the conditions and register on the PCLL. A student was then approved to defer studies till 2019-20. The 2018/2019 PCLL intake accordingly comprises 154 candidates.

We have this year a very high calibre of students. They appear to be very enthusiastic about and committed to their studies.

#### **Conclusion**

We are very proud of our PCLL and confidently believe that the emphasis we place on the acquisition of skills throughout the programme continues to produce graduates who will be useful and professional from the very first day of their traineeship or pupillage. The feedback we have had from the professions on the quality of our PCLL graduates whom they have taken on as trainees or pupils very much bears this out.

We now have ten successful PCLLs to build upon and aim to make the 2018/2019 PCLL better still.

Christopher Knight
PCLL Programme Director
Faculty of Law
The Chinese University of Hong Kong
April 2019

#### The Chinese University of Hong Kong Faculty of Law

#### **Report on the Juris Doctor Programme**

(January to December 2018)

#### 1. Background

The Juris Doctor (JD) is a graduate entry programme. The Chinese University of Hong Kong's Faculty of Law designed and offered it as a response to the recommendation of the *Redmond-Roper Report* "that there should be opportunity for mature age students, and graduates in other disciplines, to study law - both for equity and access reasons and for the richness and diversity this brings to the law schools and the legal profession" (*Report*, 11.4 at p. 271).

#### 2. Teaching philosophy and structure

The CUHK Faculty of Law teaches the JD exclusively at graduate level. JD students thus enjoy a dedicated programme. They share some courses with other students (i.e. those reading for the Master of Laws (LLM) and a small number of exchange and associate students).

The Faculty of Law examines the JD as a graduate programme. Students thus must perform to graduate standards.

#### 3. Admission requirements

The Faculty of Law required applicants for admission to the 2018-19 JD to have:

- (i) graduated from a recognised university and obtained a bachelor's degree in a non-law subject or a law degree from a non-common law jurisdiction, normally with honours not lower than Second Class; or
- (ii) graduated from an honours programme of a recognised university with a bachelor's degree in a non-law subject or a law degree from a non-common law jurisdiction, normally achieving an average grade of not lower than "B" in undergraduate courses; or
- (iii) completed a course of study in a tertiary educational institution and obtained professional or similar qualifications equivalent to an honours degree.

Applicants must also have satisfied the JD's English Language Proficiency Requirement by:

 possessing a bachelor's degree obtained by completing a programme of study in Hong Kong or an English-speaking country, or which was taught primarily in the English language; or

- achieving a result of Band 7.5 or better in the International English Language Testing System (IELTS), which result was obtained not more than two years prior to the date of applying to join the JD; or
- achieving a result of 600 (Paper Based Test), or 100 (Internet Based Test) or better in the Test of English as a Foreign Language (TOEFL), which result was obtained not more than two years prior to the date of applying to join the JD; or
- producing alternative evidence of English proficiency equivalent to one of the preceding measures.

#### 4. Programme philosophy and structure

The JD is an intellectually enriching general education in law. It offers various Faculty core courses (details of which are below). It offers all subjects that the Hong Kong legal professions stipulate as pre-requisites for admission to the Postgraduate Certificate in Laws (PCLL). It also allows candidates to read a wide range of challenging elective courses in the common law, Chinese law, comparative law, international law and the law of trade, business and finance.

The JD consists of 72 credit units (a standard semester-length course being 3 credit units). Students have an average of 3 contact hours per week with teachers in each course. Students entering the JD complete it in full-time mode or part-time mode.

Full-time mode students can finish the JD in 24 months by completing courses in each summer term. Full-time students may take up to 48 months to complete the JD.

Part-time mode students can complete their studies in 42 months (although students may, in exceptional circumstances, apply to accelerate their studies and complete the JD in 36 months on the Faculty of Law's recommendation and with the Graduate Council's permission). The Faculty of Law lets part-time students take up to 84 months to complete the JD. The JD is currently the only qualifying law degree offered in part-time mode by a Hong Kong university.

To graduate, students must complete five Faculty-required courses. These are LAWS6001 Legal System, LAWS6004 Legal Research, Analysis and Writing, LAWS6006 Comparative Legal Studies, LAWS6007 Ethics and Jurisprudence, and either LAWS6901 Independent Research or LAWS6902 Independent Research Dissertation. These required components give JD students the essential foundational knowledge and skills for a well-rounded general legal education and a first-hand appreciation of the relationship between the legal system and the broader community that it serves and regulates.

Students aspiring to become Hong Kong-qualified barristers or solicitors must pursue particular courses mandated by the Hong Kong legal professions. Passing these courses entitles students to apply for admission to the PCLL programme. These courses are also open to students who do not plan to apply for the PCLL.

In addition to the five required courses, the Faculty of Law offers JD elective courses from a wide range of intellectually stimulating and professionally enhancing offerings. This arrangement enables students to complete their degrees and professional requirements while enhancing their range of courses and thus their academic and professional opportunities.

#### JD Courses

The Faculty of Law structures the JD to accommodate the interests both of those who intend to enter the legal profession and those who are reading the JD for other reasons. The JD comprises a mixture of required and elective courses:

#### (i) Required courses

- Legal System
- Legal Research, Analysis and Writing
- Comparative Legal Studies
- Ethics and Jurisprudence
- Independent Research\* OR Independent Research Dissertation\*

#### (ii) Elective Courses

#### (a) Elective Courses Required for admission to the PCLL Programme

Principles of Administrative Law

- Principles of Civil Procedure

- Principles of Commercial Law

- Principles of Company Law

- Principles of Constitutional Law

- Principles of Contract

- Principles of Conveyancing

Principles of Criminal Law

- Principles of Criminal Procedure

- Principles of Equity and Trusts

- Principles of Evidence

- Principles of Land Law

Principles of Tort

#### (b) Other Elective Courses

The Faculty offers an extensive list of electives in the JD (which ones are offered depends on teacher availability and sufficient student interest). The Faculty recently approved several new elective courses. These include (i) *Chinese Law on Corporate Finance*, (ii) *Mediation Practice* and (iii) *The Laws and Legal System of the United States*. Other elective courses include:

- Business and the Law in Hong Kong
- Chinese Civil Law
- Chinese Company Law
- Chinese Contract Law
- Chinese Environmental Law
- Chinese Financial Law
- Chinese Intellectual Property Law
- Chinese Investment Law
- Chinese Securities Regulation
- Chinese Tax Law
- Clean Energy and Climate Law
- Common Law: Origins and Development
- Comparative Constitutional Law
- Comparative Contract Law
- Conflict of Laws
- Copyright, Digital Subject Matter and Information Technology

<sup>\*</sup> Students must complete either *Independent Research* (3 credits) or *Independent Research Dissertation* (6 credits).

- Disaster Law
- Dispute Resolution in the Energy and Natural Resources Sector
- European Union Law
- Financial Markets: Law and Operation
- International and Comparative Energy Law
- International and Comparative Environmental Law
- International Commercial Dispute Resolution
- International Financial and Banking Law
- International Investment Law Policy and Development
- International Legal Advocacy
- International Taxation
- Investor-State Dispute Settlement
- Issues in Contract
- Issues in Human Rights
- Issues in Tort
- Law and Literature
- Law and Practice of Investment Arbitration
- Law of International Business Transactions I
- Law of International Business Transactions II
- Legal System and Methods in China
- Merger Control
- Oil and Gas Law
- Principles of Art, Antiquities, Cultural Heritage and the Law
- Principles of Aviation Law
- Principles of Competition Law
- Principles of Employment Law
- Principles of Environmental Law
- Principles of Family Law
- Principles of Information and Privacy Law
- Principles of Intellectual Property
- Principles of Mediation
- Principles of Remedies
- Principles of Revenue Law
- Principles of Securities Regulation
- Project Finance and Infrastructure Law
- Shipping Law
- The Clinic for Public Interest Advocacy
- Trans-national Legal Problems
- World Trade Law

#### 5. Student intake

The JD has proved to be a highly competitive programme. In the 2018-19 academic year, the programme received 781 applications meeting minimum admission requirements (532 applications for full-time mode and 249 applications for part-time mode). The admission requirements in section 3, above, are minimum requirements. In the 2018-2019 intake, the Faculty of Law did not offer places to a large proportion of applicants who satisfied these. The JD attracts students of the highest quality, and the student body is a rich and diverse mixture of well-educated fresh graduates and seasoned professionals who have already achieved considerable success in their fields. In 2018 the Faculty of Law admitted 218 students, these being the top segment of applicants.

No. of applications received for academic year	600			
2018-2019 (full-time mode)				
No. of students admitted for academic year 2018-2019	143			
(full-time mode)				
No. of applications received for academic year	341			
2018-2019 (part-time mode)				
No. of students admitted for academic year 2018-2019				
(part-time mode)				

All JD students the Faculty of Law admitted in 2018-2019 hold at least an Upper 2<sup>nd</sup> bachelor's degree or a credit master's degree (or equivalent):

Band 1	39.9% (87)
Band 2	16.5% (36)
Band 3	43.6% (95)
Total	100% (218)

<u>Band 1:</u> 1<sup>st</sup> class bachelor's degree; or Cumulative GPA 3.5 (4-point scale) where no class of honours awarded; or PhD; or equivalent.

<u>Band 2:</u> Borderline 1<sup>st</sup> class bachelor's degree; or Cumulative GPA 3.4 (4-point scale) where no class of honours awarded; or master (Distinction); or equivalent.

<u>Band 3:</u> Upper 2<sup>nd</sup> class bachelor's degree; or Cumulative GPA 3.2-3.3 (4-point scale) where no class of honours awarded; or master (Credit); or equivalent.

As noted above, many JD students take the Programme to help them in their existing careers or to enhance their skills; they have no intention of entering the legal profession. Most part-time students are professionals with qualifications. These include qualifications such as the American Institute of Certified Public Accountants (AICPA), Associate Anti Money Laundering Professional (AAMLP), Association of Chartered Certified Accountants (ACCA), Certified Professional Forecaster (CPF), Certified Public Accountant (CPA), Chartered Engineers (CEng), Chartered Financial Analyst (CFA), Chartered Institute of Linguists (CIL), Chartered Institute of Personnel and Development (CIPD), Financial Risk Manager (FRM), Hong Kong Institute of Certified Public Accountants (HKICPA), Hong Kong Institute of Surveyors (HKIS), Institute of Electrical and Electronics Engineers (IEEE) and Registered Occupational Therapist (ROT).

Some students are members of professional bodies. These include memberships as Fellow of Governance Institute of Australia (FGIA), Fellow of Chartered Professional Accountants (FCPA), Fellow of the Hong Kong Academy of Medicine (Psychiatry) FHKAM (Psychiatry), Fellow of Hong Kong College of Psychiatrists (FHKCPsych), Fellow of the Royal College of Radiologists (FRCR); or registered professionals in various disciplines, for instance in

medical and engineering. Some of our students are already in prominent management positions, such as VP, Director, Managing Director or Associate Director at companies such as AP Infosense, China Huarong International Holdings Limited, China Everbright Limited, Samsung Electronics Hong Kong Company, Société Générale, Koon Wing Motors Limited, Kroll Associate (Asia) Limited, Royal Bank of Canada Hong Kong Branch and Standard Chartered Bank (Hong Kong) Limited.

In 2017 the Faculty of Law and the CUHK Business School jointly introduced the BBA-JD Double Degree Programme. In 2018-19, the BBA-JD Programme admitted 18 students. Students in the BBA-JD Programme must achieve a second upper class honours in their BBA to be eligible to enrol in the JD. The first intake (2017-18) will enrol in the JD in 2021. The Faculty will report the final number of BBA-JD students enrolled in the JD in 2021.

#### 6. Library

Given the centrality of law reports, ordinances and scholarly writings to the study of law, the Faculty places great emphasis on its library resources. The Lee Quo Wei Law Library contains over 129,200 volumes and has 52 print journal titles and access to 3,718 electronic law journals. There are 108 electronic legal databases available to students and staff. Wherever possible electronic format is the preferred option for books, law journals and serials. The Faculty is investing heavily in library materials to support future years of its law programmes.

The Lee Quo Wei Law Library houses the main law collection. The Legal Resources Centre (LRC) at the Graduate Law Centre (GLC), where JD teaching takes place, contains a short loan collection and a small collection of law reports and reference materials. The Faculty of Law retains a daily courier service that provides research materials students need at the GLC.

The Law Library has developed an extensive array of resource guides and indices that are accessible via the Library website. Both locations provide reference services. The Faculty of Law also includes Information Literacy in the JD curriculum.

#### 7. Physical accommodation

The Faculty of Law teaches the JD at the GLC in Central. The GLC, covering 35,000 sq. feet, includes three lecture theatres, a state-of-the-art-moot court, small breakout rooms, multi-purpose classrooms, dedicated computer facilities and its Legal Resources Centre. The GLC's location in Central has proven ideal for organising events with practitioners in the legal profession. Throughout the year, the JD students benefit from a wide offering of talks, information sessions and other events with prominent law firms, barristers' chambers, as well as members of the judiciary, government departments and other members of the legal industry.

#### 8. Concluding Remarks

The CUHK JD is now a well-established feature of the Hong Kong legal education landscape. JD students routinely receive job placement offers from top international and local law firms. Many undertake pupilage and develop careers at the Hong Kong bar. Some move on to further studies, often competing strongly in the world's most venerated universities (among them Oxbridge and the Ivy League). Others embark on or continue careers in other walks of

Hong Kong or overseas. These fields include banking, commerce, academia and government. JD students are, as a whole, highly qualified and highly motivated. Classes are interactive, with students bringing expertise and experience to enrich the learning environment, both within and outside the classroom. Student satisfaction with the JD, which the University's Centre for Learning Enhancement and Research independently monitors, is very high. Students on the JD have taken the initiative to set up the Graduate Law Students Association and organised activities, which the Faculty supports, to benefit the student body. Mooting teams including JD students represent the Faculty at both regional and international competitions and have achieved outstanding results.

Some JD students will not choose a career in law. They continue to contribute to their respective professions – among them banking and finance, government, journalism and academia – and are all the better armed with all they have learned during their JD education.

Some JD students will choose to continue their studies in the PCLL Programme. In 2018-19, 120 JD graduates applied for admission to the CUHK PCLL Programme and 73% of them were successful. Those who progress to the PCLL have a great deal to offer the legal profession. They will continue to help answer the call in the Redmond Roper Report for increased diversity of practitioners in Hong Kong.

Matthew P Cheung
JD Programme Director
April 2019

## **Annexure 5**



# **Department of Law The University of Hong Kong**

## Report on the LLB and JD Programmes to the Standing Committee on Legal Education and Training

#### March 2019

The Department is now back to the normal track, with the double cohort of the LLB degree programme ending in 2016 and the double cohort of our three double-degree programmes ending in 2017. The Department has continued to make efforts to provide high-quality teaching for our students, and is glad to report satisfactory progress.

#### **Admissions 2018-2019**

The LLB and double-degree undergraduate programmes remain signature programmes that cement the reputation of the HKU, as seen by the robust admissions figures. The LLB is one of the top ten programmes at HKU and among the most competitive programmes across all tertiary institutions in Hong Kong.

A total of 103 students including 4 UCL-HKU double degree students) were admitted into the undergraduate programmes: 68 (including 1 UCL-HKU double degree student) through the JUPAS scheme: 28 (including 3 UCL-HKU double degree students) through the non-JUPAS admissions process; and 7 through Mainland recruitment.

In addition, 159 students were admitted to the three mixed-degree programmes: BBA(Law) & LLB – 87; BSocSc (Govt & Laws) & LLB – 58; and BA (Literary Studies) & LLB – 14.

All these programmes continue to achieve outstanding admission quality.

JD admissions figures continue to be strong. We admitted 43 students from over 248 applications. Student profiles are diverse, with 33 fresh graduates and 10 with work experience.

#### **Exchange**

We have been able to accommodate the demand of students for exchange opportunities in the past few years. Current figures for out-going law students comprise 109 students, undertaking studies in 14 countries, mostly in the UK (53), Canada (20), and USA (7).

#### **Dual LLB degree and Pathways Programmes**

Following the dual LLB programme with University College London, we are in discussions with Peking University Law School to introduce a dual LLB programme.

To further attract top students, we have established pathways programmes with King's College of London, University of New South Wales and National University Singapore, which will give students a wider range of options – such flexibility being increasingly important in light of rapid social, cultural, technological, economic legal and political changes.

We hope that the above initiatives will enhance the attractiveness of the LLB Programme.

#### Curriculum

The "3+3+4" curriculum has been fully implemented. The Department has also de-cross-listed electives in both the undergraduate and postgraduate programmes, to allow teachers to better take into account the skills and competencies of students in their courses.

The Department promotes experiential learning for students to develop practical skills and to learn law in action. The Clinical Legal Education course and other experiential courses including Social Justice Internship (in both Hong Kong and Mainland China), Human Rights in Practice, have been in high demand. The Faculty has advertised for recruiting more full-time teaching-track colleagues for Experiential Learning, which will further strengthen our student experiential learning programme.

The Department continued to send LLB students to Shanghai (Fudan University and East China University of Political Science and Law) to take a compulsory course, Introduction to Chinese Law, in an intensive manner. We are exploring the opportunities to collaborate with mainland universities in other cities for possible intensive teaching of the same course.

The Department has continued to take steps to implement the proposals in the Report of the Review Panel for our JD programme in the last review. The JD programme is actively preparing for the upcoming internal review this year.

#### **Career Advice**

The Department has successfully recruited a new Student Career Advisor, who works on a fractional basis. The Department will try its best to increase individual career advice consultation sessions for our students.

#### **Staffing**

Our staff has been able to offer a wide range of electives in the undergraduate programmes. The Faculty has been conducting an active search for professional staff at different levels. It is expected that the current round of recruitment will end in two months' time and that the new staff will be able to join the Department before the start of the new academic year.

#### Conclusion

The Department is aware of the challenges facing the legal education, such as greater curriculum needs and concerns about job opportunities. We will continue to consider special measures to ensure that the rigour and diversity of teaching will not be compromised.

Professor ZHAO Yun Head, Department of Law

### Report on the HKU PCLL January – December 2018

#### **Overview**

1. The two double cohorts of secondary school graduates (A-level and DSE) admitted to read the 4-year LLB or the 5-year mixed degree LLB passed through the HKU PCLL during the last two calendar years smoothly with least disruption. As one of the ways to address the perceived issue of the PCLL being the 'bottleneck' to the legal profession, we have not cut back to the pre-double cohort number of target intake. While we have prepared for a maximum of 300 full-time and 100 part-time students to the HKU PCLL if quality of applicants so warranted, the number of applications for admission indeed dropped.

#### Assessments and examination results 2017/18

2. The overall first-attempt pass rate across the three programmes (i.e. the 1-year full-time PCLL; Year 1 and Year 2 of the part-time PCLL) fell to about 78%. The pass rate after the supplementary exams in August increased to about 99%. The Board of Examiners awarded overall distinction to the top 10% of the cohort among over 400 full-time and part-time Year 2 students in total. Eight out of the top ten students are HKU law graduates.

#### **Admissions 2018/19**

- 3. There were 900 applications from 605 individual applicants, of which 546 applicants designated HKU as first preference. Applicants, as in the past, had to make separate applications to the full-time and part-time programmes and many of them applied for both.
- 4. The number of PCLL students admitted in September 2018 was 279 to the full-time course and 86 to the part-time course. We have a maximum number of 15 discretionary part-time places based on a balance of candidates' legal knowledge and full-time working experience and filled up 11 of those after interviewing 25 candidates.
- 5. We continued to allocate the 117 government-funded full-time places, all on academic merit. HKU law graduates (including JD) took up about 75% of such places. Other categories of applicants, with UK LLB graduates having the largest share and most of them were Hong Kong permanent residents, shared the remaining government-funded places.

6. About 73% of the full-time intake held a HKU law degree. The proportion in the part-time programme was much lower, just about 1/3. Graduates of the Common Professional Examination operated by MMU/SPACE or other UK providers including the University of London International LLB filled up most of the remaining part-time places.

#### **Curriculum and teaching**

- 7. Mr. Justice Anderson Chow, the Chief External Examiner, gave his third comprehensive report on the programme. He raised no concerns that require attention. Indeed, he commended that the HKU PCLL 'is a mature one' and our graduates 'are well equipped to enter the legal profession in HK'. We considered his remark a recognition of all the efforts colleagues in my Department have put into over the last decade or so in our curriculum and related reform.
- 8. HKU has been looking proactively for opportunities and ways to improve further our PCLL. For example, the 13-week Listed Companies elective (LCE) combines both online (via short downloadable video clips recorded on some topics replacing some of the conventional type of lectures supported by assessed quizzes) and face-to-face (through weekly small group practical sessions) learning, with positive feedback from students. Towards the end of the LCE, students participate in a few 'flipped learning' classes during which they work on some problem-type questions in smaller groups, with a view to facilitating their preparation for the final examination.
- 9. Another example is our pilot 3-day intensive Chinese advocacy training for a small group of selected students who have completed our Trial Advocacy elective (TAE) and were joining the Hong Kong Bar. Other students not selected but maintained a keen interest could still attend as observers. During the training, students worked on a case file from the TAE which was translated into Chinese, with glossaries of terms provided to them, focusing more on advocacy and language skills since they were already familiar with the case. Teachers ran an informative large group session with advice, examples and tips of useful resources. It also covered how best to prepare to effectively and persuasively present cases in Cantonese. Students then participate in small group training with tutors who in return gave feedback on students' performance and progress. The students, as well as the trainers, were eager, keen and enthusiastic. The overall feedback from students and trainers was that it was a genuinely excellent learning opportunity that was also thoroughly enjoyable and insightful.
- 10. In 2018/19, Matrimonial Practice and Procedure, Commercial Dispute Resolution and LCE are the three most popular electives. About 90 students, full-time and part-time, opted for TAE.

#### Looking ahead

11. We are committed to use our best endeavour to contribute to the improvement the system as reasonably recommended by SCLET in its final review report and agreed among the stakeholders after deliberation, in all aspects of the PCLL from admissions

to assessments which aim to better serve the public interest and avoid any double (or even multiple) jeopardy to students. Meanwhile, we continue to seek the continuing co-operation with the profession via the professional bodies, firms and chambers, as well as individual members of the profession for the better development of the HKU PCLL, and with our counterparts for the PCLLs in Hong Kong.

Wilson Chow Head, Department of Professional Legal Education Faculty of Law, The University of Hong Kong March 2019

## Annexure 6

### Key Statistics of the 2018/19 LLB, JD and PCLL Programmes of City University of Hong Kong The Chinese University of Hong Kong The University of Hong Kong

	City University of Hong Kong	The Chinese University of Hong Kong	The University of Hong Kong
No. of Admissions to the LLB Programme	59 (39 JUPAS students, 16 Non-JUPAS students and 4 Mainland students)	81 (43 JUPAS students, 34 Non-JUPAS students, 3 Mainland students and 1 transfer student)	103 (68 JUPAS students, 28 Non-JUPAS students and 7 Mainland students)
No. of Admissions to the JD Programme	89	143 (full-time) 75 (part-time)	43
No. of Admissions to the PCLL Programme	212	154	279 (full-time) 86 (part-time)
No. of Admissions to the Double Law Degree Programmes	N/A	N/A	87 (BBA (Law) & LLB) 58 (BSocSc (Govt & Laws) & LLB) 14 (BA (Literary Studies) & LLB)

## Annexure 7

#### THE HONG KONG CONVERSION EXAMINATION BOARD

**Chairperson:** The Hon Madam Justice POON

**Members**: Mr. Edward CHAN King-sang, S.C., J.P.

Hong Kong Bar Association

Mr. Mark D. DALY

(from March 2016 to August 2018)

Ms. Serina CHAN (from August 2018)

The Law Society of Hong Kong

Dr. Richard WU Wai-sang The University of Hong Kong

Ms. Stella LEUNG Suk-yee

(from August 2016 to October 2018)

Ms. Theresa LOW (from October 2018)

City University of Hong Kong

Mr. Christopher KNIGHT

The Chinese University of Hong Kong

**Secretary**: Dr. John CRIBBIN

HKU School of Professional and Continuing Education