

立法會
Legislative Council

LC Paper No. FC15/20-21
(These minutes have been
seen by the Administration)

Ref : FC/1/1(41)

Finance Committee of the Legislative Council

Minutes of the 42nd meeting
held at Conference Room 1 of the Legislative Council Complex
on Monday, 13 July 2020, from 2:30 pm to 7:03 pm

Members present:

Hon CHAN Kin-por, GBS, JP (Chairman)
Hon CHAN Chun-ying, JP (Deputy Chairman)
Hon James TO Kun-sun
Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, GBS, JP
Hon Tommy CHEUNG Yu-yan, GBS, JP
Prof Hon Joseph LEE Kok-long, SBS, JP
Hon Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung, GBS, JP
Hon WONG Ting-kwong, GBS, JP
Hon Starry LEE Wai-king, SBS, JP
Hon CHAN Hak-kan, BBS, JP
Dr Hon Priscilla LEUNG Mei-fun, SBS, JP
Hon WONG Kwok-kin, SBS, JP
Hon Paul TSE Wai-chun, JP
Hon Claudia MO
Hon Michael TIEN Puk-sun, BBS, JP
Hon Steven HO Chun-yin, BBS
Hon Frankie YICK Chi-ming, SBS, JP
Hon WU Chi-wai, MH
Hon YIU Si-wing, BBS
Hon MA Fung-kwok, SBS, JP
Hon Charles Peter MOK, JP
Hon CHAN Chi-chuen
Hon CHAN Han-pan, BBS, JP
Hon LEUNG Che-cheung, SBS, MH, JP
Hon Kenneth LEUNG

Hon Alice MAK Mei-kuen, BBS, JP
Dr Hon KWOK Ka-ki
Hon KWOK Wai-keung, JP
Hon Dennis KWOK Wing-hang
Dr Hon Fernando CHEUNG Chiu-hung
Dr Hon Helena WONG Pik-wan
Hon IP Kin-yuen
Hon Elizabeth QUAT, BBS, JP
Hon Martin LIAO Cheung-kong, GBS, JP
Hon POON Siu-ping, BBS, MH
Ir Dr Hon LO Wai-kiwok, SBS, MH, JP
Hon CHUNG Kwok-pan
Hon Alvin YEUNG
Hon Andrew WAN Siu-kin
Hon CHU Hoi-dick
Hon Jimmy NG Wing-ka, BBS, JP
Dr Hon Junius HO Kwan-yiu, JP
Hon LAM Cheuk-ting
Hon Holden CHOW Ho-ding
Hon SHIU Ka-fai, JP
Hon SHIU Ka-chun
Hon Wilson OR Chong-shing, MH
Hon YUNG Hoi-yan, JP
Dr Hon Pierre CHAN
Hon Tanya CHAN
Hon CHEUNG Kwok-kwan, JP
Hon HUI Chi-fung
Hon LUK Chung-hung, JP
Hon LAU Kwok-fan, MH
Hon Kenneth LAU Ip-keung, BBS, MH, JP
Dr Hon CHENG Chung-tai
Hon KWONG Chun-yu
Hon Jeremy TAM Man-ho
Hon Vincent CHENG Wing-shun, MH, JP
Hon Tony TSE Wai-chuen, BBS
Hon CHAN Hoi-yan

Members absent:

Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung
Hon Mrs Regina IP LAU Suk-ye, GBS, JP
Hon Christopher CHEUNG Wah-fung, SBS, JP
Dr Hon CHIANG Lai-wan, SBS, JP

Public officers attending:

Mr Raistlin LAU Chun, JP	Deputy Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury (Treasury) 1
Mr Mike CHENG Wai-man	Principal Executive Officer (General), Financial Services and the Treasury Bureau (The Treasury Branch)
Mr Jacky WU Kwok-yuen	Principal Assistant Secretary for Development (Works) 5
Mr Kelvin LO Kwok-wah, JP	Director of Drainage Services
Mr CHAN Hak-keung	Acting Chief Engineer (Drainage Projects), Drainage Services Department
Mr Jimmy POON Sui-shun	Chief Engineer (Project Management), Drainage Services Department
Dr CHUI Tak-yi, JP	Under Secretary for Food and Health
Mr Gilford LAW Sun-on	Principal Assistant Secretary for Food and Health (Food)2
Miss Diane WONG Shuk-han	Deputy Director of Food and Environmental Hygiene (Environmental Hygiene)
Mr Eric TSAI Yu-sing	Assistant Director of Food and Environmental Hygiene (Grade Management and Development)
Mr Ricky WONG Chi-pan, JP	Deputy Head of Civil Engineering Office (Port and Land), Civil Engineering and Development Department
Mr CHOI Wing-hing	Chief Engineer (Land Works), Civil Engineering and Development Department
Mr Edward TSE Cheong-wo, JP	Project Director 3, Architectural Services Department
Mr CHOW Yun-tong	Senior Project Manager 321, Architectural Services Department
Mr Alex TSE Lok-man	Senior Project Manager 335, Architectural Services Department
Mr Jack CHAN Jick-chi, JP	Under Secretary for Home Affairs
Ms Iona SHAM Hiu-tung	Principal Assistant Secretary for Home Affairs (Culture) 2
Miss Eve TAM Mei-yee	Assistant Director of Leisure and Cultural Services (Heritage and Museums)

Ms Ronne YUEN Yuet-po	Head (Museum Projects and Development), Leisure and Cultural Services Department
Ms Paulina CHAN Shuk-man	Museum Director (Science Museum), Leisure and Cultural Services Department
Ms Belinda WONG Sau-lan	Museum Director (Museum of History), Leisure and Cultural Services Department
Ms Winnie HO Wing-yin, JP	Deputy Director of Architectural Services
Mr Henry LOK Wan-pak	Senior Project Manager 333, Architectural Services Department

Clerk in attendance:

Ms Anita SIT	Assistant Secretary General 1
--------------	-------------------------------

Staff in attendance:

Ms Angel SHEK	Chief Council Secretary (1)1
Miss Bowie LAM	Council Secretary (1)1
Miss Queenie LAM	Senior Legislative Assistant (1)2
Mr Frankie WOO	Senior Legislative Assistant (1)3
Miss Mandy POON	Legislative Assistant (1)1
Miss Yannes HO	Legislative Assistant (1)7
Ms Haley CHEUNG	Legislative Assistant (1)10

Action

The Chairman reminded members of the requirements under Rule 83A and Rule 84 of the Rules of Procedure.

2. The Chairman declared that he was an Executive Director and the Chief Executive Officer of Well Link Insurance Group Holdings Limited.

**Item 1 — FCR(2020-21)33
RECOMMENDATION OF THE PUBLIC WORKS
SUBCOMMITTEE MADE ON 25 MAY 2019**

PWSC(2019-20)6
HEAD 707 — **NEW TOWNS AND URBAN AREA DEVELOPMENT**
Civil Engineering — **Land development**
469CL — **Kai Tak development—infrastructure at north apron area of Kai Tak Airport**

3. The Chairman advised that this item sought the approval of the Finance Committee ("FC") for the recommendation made by the Public Works Subcommittee ("PWSC") at its meeting held on 25 May 2019 regarding PWSC(2019-20)6, i.e. upgrading part of 469CL as 832CL, entitled "Kai Tai development—stage 5B infrastructure works at the former north apron area", to Category A at an estimated cost of \$1,720.1 million in money-of-the-day ("MOD") prices; and retaining the remainder of 469CL in Category B.

4. The Chairman advised that no member had requested that the recommendation be voted on separately at the FC meeting.

5. Mr WU Chi-wai considered it undesirable that cyclists intending to enter the Kai Tak New Development Area ("Kai Tak NDA") had to either dismount and push their bicycles or use other means of transport as the cycle track network in the Kai Tak NDA was not connected to its adjacent areas. He requested that his aforesaid views be put on record. Mr WU was of the view that in the planning of other NDAs in future, the Administration should construct cycle track networks that were connected to the adjacent areas so as to provide uninterrupted access for cyclists to NDAs. The Chairman invited the Deputy Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury (Treasury)¹ to relay Mr WU's aforesaid views to relevant policy bureaux and departments.

Voting on FCR(2020-21)33

6. At 2:32 pm, the Chairman put item FCR(2020-21)33 to vote. At the request of members, the Chairman ordered a division. The Chairman declared that 34 members voted in favour of and one member voted against the item, with no member abstaining from voting. The votes of individual members were as follows:

For:

Mr James TO Kun-sun
Mr WONG Ting-kwong
Mr WONG Kwok-kin
Mr Steven HO Chun-yin

Mr Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung
Mr CHAN Hak-kan
Mr Michael TIEN Puk-sun
Mr WU Chi-wai

Mr YIU Si-wing	Mr MA Fung-kwok
Mr Charles Peter MOK	Mr CHAN Chi-chuen
Mr LEUNG Che-cheung	Mr Kenneth LEUNG
Dr KWOK Ka-ki	Dr Fernando CHEUNG Chiu-hung
Dr Helena WONG Pik-wan	Mr IP Kin-yuen
Mr POON Siu-ping	Ir Dr LO Wai-kwok
Mr CHU Hoi-dick	Mr Jimmy NG Wing-ka
Mr LAM Cheuk-ting	Mr Holden CHOW Ho-ding
Mr SHIU Ka-fai	Mr SHIU Ka-chun
Ms YUNG Hoi-yan	Ms Tanya CHAN
Mr HUI Chi-fung	Mr LUK Chung-hung
Mr KWONG Chun-yu	Mr Jeremy TAM Man-ho
Mr Tony TSE Wai-chuen	Ms CHAN Hoi-yan

(34 members)

Against:

Dr CHENG Chung-tai
(1 member)

7. The Chairman declared that the item was approved.

Item 2 — FCR(2020-21)42

**RECOMMENDATION OF THE PUBLIC WORKS
SUBCOMMITTEE MADE ON 24 JUNE 2020**

PWSC(2020-21)9

HEAD 704 — DRAINAGE

Environmental Protection—Sewerage and sewage treatment

**331DS — Outlying Islands sewerage, stage 2—South Lantau
sewerage works**

**339DS — North District sewerage, stage 1 phase 2C and stage 2
phase 1**

346DS — Upgrading of Tuen Mun sewerage, phase 1

362DS — Sewerage for Ma Yau Tong Village, Tseung Kwan O

8. The Chairman advised that this item sought FC's approval for the following recommendations made by PWSC at its meeting held on 24 June 2020 regarding PWSC(2020-21)9:

- (a) upgrading part of 331DS as 433DS, entitled "Construction of San Shek Wan Sewage Treatment Works and Pui O village sewerage", to Category A at an estimated cost of

\$1,688.8 million in MOD prices; and retaining the remainder of 331DS in Category B;

- (b) upgrading part of 339DS as 434DS, entitled "Village sewerage in Fanling Wai, So Kwun Po and Leng Pei Tsuen, Fanling", to Category A at an estimated cost of \$179.7 million in MOD prices; and retaining the remainder of 339DS in Category B;
- (c) upgrading part of 346DS as 435DS, entitled "Village Sewerage in Northern Tuen Mun", to Category A at an estimated cost of \$431.2 million in MOD prices; and retaining the remainder of 346DS in Category B; and
- (d) upgrading 362DS, entitled "Sewerage for Ma Yau Tong Village, Tseung Kwan O", to Category A at an estimated cost of \$179.4 million in MOD prices.

9. The Chairman advised that no member had requested that the recommendation be voted on separately at the FC meeting.

Voting on FCR(2020-21)42

10. At 2:37 pm, the Chairman put item FCR(2020-21)42 to vote. At the request of members, the Chairman ordered a division. The Chairman declared that 34 members voted in favour of the item, and no member voted against the item or abstained from voting. The votes of individual members were as follows:

For:

Mr James TO Kun-sun	Mr Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung
Mr WONG Ting-kwong	Mr CHAN Hak-kan
Mr WONG Kwok-kin	Mr Michael TIEN Puk-sun
Mr Steven HO Chun-yin	Mr WU Chi-wai
Mr YIU Si-wing	Mr Charles Peter MOK
Mr CHAN Chi-chuen	Mr LEUNG Che-cheung
Mr Kenneth LEUNG	Dr KWOK Ka-ki
Dr Helena WONG Pik-wan	Mr POON Siu-ping
Ir Dr LO Wai-kwok	Mr Alvin YEUNG
Mr CHU Hoi-dick	Mr LAM Cheuk-ting
Mr Holden CHOW Ho-ding	Mr SHIU Ka-fai
Mr SHIU Ka-chun	Mr Wilson OR Chong-shing
Ms YUNG Hoi-yan	Dr Pierre CHAN
Ms Tanya CHAN	Mr HUI Chi-fung

Mr LUK Chung-hung	Dr CHENG Chung-tai
Mr KWONG Chun-yu	Mr Jeremy TAM Man-ho
Mr Tony TSE Wai-chuen	Ms CHAN Hoi-yan
(34 members)	

11. The Chairman declared that the item was approved.

**Item 3 — FCR(2020-21)44
RECOMMENDATION OF THE PUBLIC WORKS
SUBCOMMITTEE MADE ON 24 JUNE 2020**

**PWSC(2020-21)12
HEAD 703 — BUILDINGS
Law and Order—Judiciary
32LJ — Additional courtrooms and associated facilities at lower
ground fourth floor in the High Court Building**

12. The Chairman advised that this item sought FC's approval for the recommendation made by PWSC at its meeting held on 24 June 2020 regarding PWSC(2020-21)12, i.e. upgrading 32LJ, entitled "Additional courtrooms and associated facilities at lower ground fourth floor in the High Court Building", to Category A at an estimated cost of \$105.2 million in MOD prices.

13. The Chairman advised that no member had requested that the recommendation be voted on separately at the FC meeting.

Voting on FCR(2020-21)44

14. At 2:44 pm, the Chairman put item FCR(2020-21)44 to vote. At the request of members, the Chairman ordered a division. The Chairman declared that 36 members voted in favour of the item, and no member voted against the item or abstained from voting. The votes of individual members were as follows:

For:

Mr James TO Kun-sun	Mr WONG Ting-kwong
Mr CHAN Hak-kan	Mr WONG Kwok-kin
Mr Paul TSE Wai-chun	Mr Michael TIEN Puk-sun
Mr Steven HO Chun-yin	Mr WU Chi-wai
Mr YIU Si-wing	Mr Charles Peter MOK
Mr CHAN Chi-chuen	Mr CHAN Han-pan
Mr LEUNG Che-cheung	Mr Kenneth LEUNG

Dr KWOK Ka-ki	Dr Helena WONG Pik-wan
Mr POON Siu-ping	Ir Dr LO Wai-kwok
Mr CHUNG Kwok-pan	Mr Alvin YEUNG
Mr CHU Hoi-dick	Mr LAM Cheuk-ting
Mr Holden CHOW Ho-ding	Mr SHIU Ka-fai
Mr SHIU Ka-chun	Mr Wilson OR Chong-shing
Ms YUNG Hoi-yan	Dr Pierre CHAN
Ms Tanya CHAN	Mr HUI Chi-fung
Mr LUK Chung-hung	Dr CHENG Chung-tai
Mr KWONG Chun-yu	Mr Jeremy TAM Man-ho
Mr Tony TSE Wai-chuen	Ms CHAN Hoi-yan
(36 members)	

15. The Chairman declared that the item was approved.

Item 4 — FCR(2020-21)55

**RECOMMENDATION OF THE PUBLIC WORKS
SUBCOMMITTEE MADE ON 24 JUNE 2020**

PWSC(2020-21)10

**HEAD 707 — NEW TOWNS AND URBAN AREA
DEVELOPMENT**

Recreation, Culture and Amenities—Sport facilities

**265RS — Cycle tracks connecting North West New Territories
with North East New Territories—Sam Mun Tsai
extension**

16. The Chairman advised that this item sought FC's approval for the recommendation made by PWSC at its meeting held on 24 June 2020 regarding PWSC(2020-21)10, i.e. upgrading 265RS, entitled "Cycle tracks connecting North West New Territories with North East New Territories—Sam Mun Tsai extension", to Category A at an estimated cost of \$66.9 million in MOD prices.

17. The Chairman advised that no member had requested that the recommendation be voted on separately at the FC meeting.

Voting on FCR(2020-21)55

18. At 2:50 pm, the Chairman put item FCR(2020-21)55 to vote. At the request of members, the Chairman ordered a division. The Chairman declared that 37 members voted in favour of the item, and no member

voted against the item or abstained from voting. The votes of individual members were as follows:

For:

Mr James TO Kun-sun	Mr Tommy CHEUNG Yu-yan
Mr WONG Ting-kwong	Mr CHAN Hak-kan
Mr WONG Kwok-kin	Mr Paul TSE Wai-chun
Mr Michael TIEN Puk-sun	Mr Steven HO Chun-yin
Mr WU Chi-wai	Mr YIU Si-wing
Mr Charles Peter MOK	Mr CHAN Chi-chuen
Mr CHAN Han-pan	Mr LEUNG Che-cheung
Mr Kenneth LEUNG	Dr KWOK Ka-ki
Dr Helena WONG Pik-wan	Mr POON Siu-ping
Ir Dr LO Wai-kwok	Mr CHUNG Kwok-pan
Mr Alvin YEUNG	Mr CHU Hoi-dick
Mr LAM Cheuk-ting	Mr Holden CHOW Ho-ding
Mr SHIU Ka-fai	Mr SHIU Ka-chun
Mr Wilson OR Chong-shing	Ms YUNG Hoi-yan
Dr Pierre CHAN	Ms Tanya CHAN
Mr HUI Chi-fung	Mr LUK Chung-hung
Dr CHENG Chung-tai	Mr KWONG Chun-yu
Mr Jeremy TAM Man-ho	Mr Tony TSE Wai-chuen
Ms CHAN Hoi-yan	

(37 members)

19. The Chairman declared that the item was approved.

Item 5 — FCR(2019-20)22

**RECOMMENDATION OF THE ESTABLISHMENT
SUBCOMMITTEE MADE ON 30 APRIL 2019**

EC(2018-19)31

HEAD 100 — MARINE DEPARTMENT

Subhead 000 Operational expenses

20. The Chairman advised that this item sought FC's approval for the recommendation made by the Establishment Subcommittee ("ESC") at its meeting held on 30 April 2019 regarding EC(2018-19)31, i.e. creating two permanent posts in the Marine Department, namely one Administrative Officer Staff Grade B (D3) and one Assistant Director of Marine (D2) to enhance marine safety and to lead a new division in the Marine Department

to strengthen the regulatory regime of local vessels upon the disbandment of the Task Force on Reform in the department.

21. The Chairman advised that no member had requested that the recommendation be voted on separately at the FC meeting.

Voting on FCR(2019-20)22

22. At 2:56 pm, the Chairman put item FCR(2019-20)22 to vote. At the request of members, the Chairman ordered a division. The Chairman declared that 31 members voted in favour of and three members voted against the item, with no member abstaining from voting. The votes of individual members were as follows:

For:

Mr James TO Kun-sun	Mr Tommy CHEUNG Yu-yan
Mr CHAN Hak-kan	Mr WONG Kwok-kin
Mr Paul TSE Wai-chun	Mr Michael TIEN Puk-sun
Mr Steven HO Chun-yin	Mr YIU Si-wing
Mr Charles Peter MOK	Mr CHAN Han-pan
Mr LEUNG Che-cheung	Mr Kenneth LEUNG
Dr KWOK Ka-ki	Dr Helena WONG Pik-wan
Mr POON Siu-ping	Ir Dr LO Wai-kwok
Mr CHUNG Kwok-pan	Mr Alvin YEUNG
Mr LAM Cheuk-ting	Mr Holden CHOW Ho-ding
Mr SHIU Ka-fai	Mr SHIU Ka-chun
Dr Pierre CHAN	Ms Tanya CHAN
Mr CHEUNG Kwok-kwan	Mr HUI Chi-fung
Mr LUK Chung-hung	Mr KWONG Chun-yu
Mr Jeremy TAM Man-ho	Mr Tony TSE Wai-chuen
Ms CHAN Hoi-yan	
(31 members)	

Against:

Mr CHAN Chi-chuen	Mr CHU Hoi-dick
Dr CHENG Chung-tai	
(3 members)	

23. The Chairman declared that the item was approved.

**Item 6 — FCR(2020-21)60
RECOMMENDATION OF THE ESTABLISHMENT
SUBCOMMITTEE MADE ON 20 MAY 2020**

**EC(2020-21)2
HEAD 62 —HOUSING DEPARTMENT
Subhead 000 Operational expenses**

24. The Chairman advised that this item sought FC's approval for the recommendation made by ESC at its meeting held on 20 May 2020 regarding EC(2020-21)2, i.e. creating one supernumerary post of Administrative Officer Staff Grade C (D2) in the Housing Department to oversee the operation of the Task Force on Transitional Housing, including the implementation of the funding scheme to support transitional housing projects by non-government organizations ("NGOs"), and other initiatives in facilitating transitional housing projects proposed and implemented by NGOs.

25. The Chairman advised that no member had requested that the recommendation be voted on separately at the FC meeting.

Voting on FCR(2020-21)60

26. At 3:02 pm, the Chairman put item FCR(2020-21)60 to vote. At the request of members, the Chairman ordered a division. The Chairman declared that 18 members voted in favour of and 18 members voted against the item, with no member abstaining from voting. The votes of individual members were as follows:

For:

Mr Tommy CHEUNG Yu-yan	Mr WONG Ting-kwong
Mr CHAN Hak-kan	Mr WONG Kwok-kin
Mr Paul TSE Wai-chun	Mr Steven HO Chun-yin
Mr YIU Si-wing	Mr LEUNG Che-cheung
Mr POON Siu-ping	Ir Dr LO Wai-kwok
Mr CHUNG Kwok-pan	Mr Holden CHOW Ho-ding
Mr SHIU Ka-fai	Dr Pierre CHAN
Mr CHEUNG Kwok-kwan	Mr LUK Chung-hung
Mr Tony TSE Wai-chuen	Ms CHAN Hoi-yan
(18 members)	

Against:

Mr James TO Kun-sun	Prof Joseph LEE Kok-long
Ms Claudia MO	Mr WU Chi-wai

Mr Charles Peter MOK
Mr Kenneth LEUNG
Mr IP Kin-yuen
Mr CHU Hoi-dick
Mr SHIU Ka-chun
Mr HUI Chi-fung
Mr KWONG Chun-yu
(18 members)

Mr CHAN Chi-chuen
Dr KWOK Ka-ki
Mr Alvin YEUNG
Mr LAM Cheuk-ting
Ms Tanya CHAN
Dr CHENG Chung-tai
Mr Jeremy TAM Man-ho

27. Given that the votes of members were equally divided, the Chairman, pursuant to paragraph 45 of the Finance Committee Procedure, exercised his casting vote by voting against the item. The Chairman declared that the item was negated.

Item 7 — FCR(2019-20)15

**RECOMMENDATION OF THE ESTABLISHMENT
SUBCOMMITTEE MADE ON 30 APRIL 2019**

EC(2018-19)33

**HEAD 158 — GOVERNMENT SECRETARIAT: TRANSPORT
AND HOUSING BUREAU (TRANSPORT
BRANCH)**

Subhead 000 Operational expenses

28. The Chairman advised that this item sought FC's approval for the recommendation made by ESC at its meeting held on 30 April 2019 regarding EC(2018-19)33, i.e. creating one permanent post of Administrative Officer Staff Grade C (D2) in the Transport Branch of the Transport and Housing Bureau to take forward various new initiatives for enhancing public transport services.

29. The Chairman advised that no member had requested that the recommendation be voted on separately at the FC meeting.

Voting on FCR(2019-20)15

30. At 3:08 pm, the Chairman put item FCR(2019-20)15 to vote. At the request of members, the Chairman ordered a division. The Chairman declared that 22 members voted in favour of and 20 members voted against the item, with one member abstaining from voting. The votes of individual members were as follows:

For:

Mr Tommy CHEUNG Yu-yan	Mr Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung
Mr WONG Ting-kwong	Mr CHAN Hak-kan
Mr WONG Kwok-kin	Mr Paul TSE Wai-chun
Mr Michael TIEN Puk-sun	Mr Steven HO Chun-yin
Mr YIU Si-wing	Mr CHAN Han-pan
Mr LEUNG Che-cheung	Mr POON Siu-ping
Mr Dr LO Wai-kwok	Mr CHUNG Kwok-pan
Mr Jimmy NG Wing-ka	Mr Holden CHOW Ho-ding
Mr SHIU Ka-fai	Ms YUNG Hoi-yan
Mr CHEUNG Kwok-kwan	Mr LUK Chung-hung
Mr Tony TSE Wai-chuen	Ms CHAN Hoi-yan

(22 members)

Against:

Mr James TO Kun-sun	Prof Joseph LEE Kok-long
Ms Claudia MO	Mr WU Chi-wai
Mr Charles Peter MOK	Mr CHAN Chi-chuen
Mr Kenneth LEUNG	Dr KWOK Ka-ki
Dr Fernando CHEUNG Chiu-hung	Dr Helena WONG Pik-wan
Mr IP Kin-yuen	Mr Alvin YEUNG
Mr CHU Hoi-dick	Mr LAM Cheuk-ting
Mr SHIU Ka-chun	Ms Tanya CHAN
Mr HUI Chi-fung	Dr CHENG Chung-tai
Mr KWONG Chun-yu	Mr Jeremy TAM Man-ho

(20 members)

Abstained:

Dr Pierre CHAN
(1 member)

31. The Chairman declared that the item was approved.

**Item 8 — FCR(2020-21)48
RECOMMENDATION OF THE PUBLIC WORKS
SUBCOMMITTEE MADE ON 1 JUNE 2019**

**PWSC(2019-20)8
Head 704 — DRAINAGE
Civil Engineering — Drainage and erosion protection
118CD — Drainage improvement in Northern New Territories -
package B (remaining works)**

- 144CD — Drainage improvement in Southern Hong Kong Island - package 2**
163CD — Drainage improvement works at Ngong Ping
166CD — Drainage improvement works at Yuen Long

32. The Chairman advised that the item sought FC's approval for the following recommendations made by PWSC at its meeting on 1 June 2019 regarding PWSC(2019-20)8:

- (a) upgrading 118CD "Drainage improvement in Northern New Territories - package B (remaining works)" to Category A at an estimated cost of \$65.5 million in MOD prices;
- (b) upgrading part of 144CD as 184CD, entitled "Drainage improvement in Southern Hong Kong Island - package 2A", to Category A at an estimated cost of \$134.7 million in MOD prices; and retaining the remainder of 144CD in Category B;
- (c) upgrading 163CD to Category A at an estimated cost of \$216.0 million in MOD prices; and
- (d) upgrading part of 166CD as 185CD, entitled "Drainage improvement works at Yuen Long, stage 1", to Category A at an estimated cost of \$256.2 million in MOD prices; and retaining the remainder of 166CD in Category B.

33. The Chairman advised that some members had requested that the recommendation be voted on separately at the FC meeting.

118CD—Drainage improvement in Northern New Territories—package B (remaining works)

34. Mr CHAN Chi-chuen noted that under "Drainage improvement in Northern New Territories - package B (remaining works)", the Drainage Services Department ("DSD") would construct 900 m-long stormwater drains of diameters ranging from 300 mm to 1 800 mm at Ho Sheung Heung Road. In this connection, Mr CHAN requested the Administration to provide a breakdown of the stormwater drains of different diameters (e.g. the respective numbers of stormwater drains of diameters of 300 mm and 1 800 mm). Mr CHAN also enquired whether the stormwater drains with a diameter of 300 mm which would be laid by DSD in the villages could adequately cope with the possible increase in rainfall resulting from climate changes. Director of Drainage Services

("DDS") said that the recommendations concerned complied with the standards set out in the latest Stormwater Drainage Manual published in 2018, which had taken into full account the effect of climate changes. DSD would review the existing standards from time to time and would make timely updates.

[*Post-meeting note:* The supplementary information provided by the Administration was issued to members vide LC Paper No. FC271/19-20(01) on 28 August 2020.]

144CD—Drainage improvement in Southern Hong Kong Island—package 2

35. Ms Tanya CHAN noted that DSD had consulted the Southern District Council and the Pok Fu Lam Village representatives on the "Drainage improvement in Southern Hong Kong Island—package 2" project as early as in 2015. Ms CHAN queried why there had been a delay in submitting the project to FC for funding approval until now. DDS explained that during the aforesaid consultation process, the Southern District Council and the Pok Fu Lam Village representatives had expressed concerns about the proposed vehicular ingress/egress, and the location of the shaft installed on the pavement of Chi Fu Road. In order to allay their concerns, DSD had enhanced the design of the works, and the modification had increased the difficulty of the project. Besides, the department also needed to conduct a Preliminary Environmental Review ("PER") for the project to assess the environmental and ecological impact that the project might have on the area around the horse trail. These additional procedures had lengthened the lead time required of the project.

36. Mr WU Chi-wai noted that the proposed works comprised the construction of the drainage improvement works at the peripheral areas of Pok Fu Lam Village to intercept the stormwater upstream and divert it to the existing drainage system. Mr WU was concerned whether the design would lead to the drying up of the natural streams and affect the existing ecological environment. DDS explained that the stormwater drains to be constructed along the horse trail would be installed with diversion weirs which would divert stormwater to natural stream courses only when the water level rose during heavy rain. Therefore, water would still flow through the natural streams during the dry season, leaving the existing ecological environment intact.

37. Mr HUI Chi-fung stated that some residents of Pok Fu Lam Village were of the view that the drainage improvement works completed by DSD in June 2009 were ineffective in resolving the flooding problem in the

village, as major flooding incidents were still reported in Pok Fu Lam Village in September 2010 and July 2015. Mr HUI asked whether the flooding problem of Pok Fu Lam Village would be resolved completely upon the completion of the proposed project. DDS stated that upon the completion of the drainage improvement works in June 2009, the problem of the low-lying areas within Pok Fu Lam Village being susceptible to flooding had been improved, but it remained a flooding black spot. The proposed improvement works could enhance the drainage capacity of the stormwater drains in the area around Pok Fu Lam Village. Upon completion of the works, the drainage system of the area would be upgraded to the most updated standards, and the flooding risk of Pok Fu Lam Village was expected to be further alleviated. DSD would observe the performance of the improved drainage system during heavy rain for two to three years after completion of the works before deciding whether Pok Fu Lam Village could be removed from the list of flooding black spots.

163CD—Drainage improvement works at Ngong Ping

38. Dr KWOK Ka-ki enquired the extent to which the proposed drainage improvement works at Ngong Ping could reduce the flooding risk in areas around Ngong Ping. DDS said that a heavy rainstorm in 2008 had caused serious flooding at Po Lin Monastery, Ngong Ping Bus Terminus, Ngong Ping Village and areas in the vicinity of Ngong Ping 360. Given the inadequate capacity of the existing watercourses at the north of Po Lin Monastery as well as the upstream and downstream of Ngong Ping 360, the area was susceptible to flooding during heavy rainstorms. While DSD had raised the river walls, the area around Ngong Ping was still not free from flooding risk. With the consideration of the climate change effect, the flooding risk in these areas would further increase. Thus, it was necessary to conduct improvement works including construction of stormwater drains, so as to enhance the capacity of the existing drainage system. Upon completion of the proposed drainage improvement works, the capacity of the stormwater drainage system of Ngong Ping would be enhanced with the drainage system concerned upgraded to the current standard and the flooding risk in Ngong Ping reduced.

166CD—Drainage improvement works at Yuen Long

39. Mr CHU Hoi-dick noted that the proposed "Drainage Improvement Works at Yuen Long" comprised the construction of drainage channel and stormwater drain in Shan Ha Tsuen. Moreover, among the other 19 drainage works projects which DSD was considering to implement, the project entitled "Drainage Improvement Works at Yuen Long (Remaining Works)" (Item No. 6 in LC Paper No. PWSC266/18-19(01); Public Works

Project Item No.: 4166CD-2) also mentioned the construction of drainage channels and stormwater drains at a number of locations including Shan Ha Tsuen. Mr CHU enquired about the reasons why the works concerning Shan Ha Tsuen needed to be split into two projects, and the progress of 4166CD-2.

40. DDS explained that the drainage improvement works at Shan Ha Tsuen involved land resumption, thus rendering it necessary to implement the whole project by phases. The part which did not require land resumption would first be included in the proposed "Drainage Improvement Works at Yuen Long" for implementation, so as to reduce the flooding risk as soon as possible. At present, 4166CD-2 was still under planning and design.

Project costs

41. Noting that among the four proposed drainage improvement works projects, "Drainage improvement works at Yuen Long, stage 1" was the only one that required the engagement of consultants with a cost of \$2.1 million, Mr Jeremy TAM enquired about the justifications for the engagement of consultants. DDS stated that DSD would try to deploy in-house staff and expertise to implement the new works projects. As the aforesaid project involved geotechnical works for which DSD was unable to provide support in the relevant professional area, it was necessary to engage consultants to offer assistance.

42. Mr Jeremy TAM queried why the estimated cost of the environmental mitigation measures of "Drainage Improvement Works at Ngong Ping" stood at \$5.2 million, which accounted for 2.4% of the overall project cost and was higher than those of the other three projects. DDS explained that as the aforesaid project was a designated project under Schedule 2 to the Environmental Impact Assessment Ordinance (Cap. 499) ("EIAO"), and was required to undergo environmental impact assessment ("EIA") and to implement the environmental mitigation measures recommended in the approved EIA Report, its project cost was therefore higher than the other three drainage improvement works which were not designated projects under Cap. 499. However, DSD had also conducted PERs for the three projects to ensure that the works concerned would not cause any long-term adverse impact to the environment and the ecology.

Implementation progress of drainage improvement works

43. Noting that DSD had completed a Drainage Master Plan study for Northern New Territories as early as in 1999 and the "Review of Drainage Master Plans in Yuen Long and North District—Feasibility Study" in 2011, Mr CHAN Han-pan asked why the submission of the drainage improvement works projects concerning the aforesaid areas to FC for consideration had been delayed until now. He urged the Administration to take forward these projects as soon as possible to resolve the flooding problem in the rural areas of North West New Territories.

44. Dr KWOK Ka-ki asked about the number of drainage improvement works projects that were located in New Territories West among the 19 projects to be launched (LC Paper No. PWSC 266/18-19 (01)) and their implementation schedule. Mr CHU Hoi-dick asked about the priorities of these 19 works projects and urged the Administration to expeditiously implement the works project on construction of dry weather flow interception system at the Yuen Long Town Nullah (Public Works Project Item No. 4161CD).

45. DDS said that 30 drainage improvement works projects had been completed and there were a total of 23 outstanding projects involving a total cost of \$32 billion. Four of those projects were about to be launched as set out in the paper while 19 were still under planning. Among the 19 projects to be launched, four were located in Yuen Long and three in the Northern District. As the launching of public works projects would entail a series of established procedures (including the conduct of feasibility studies, ground investigations, preliminary design, technical assessments, EIAs, traffic impact assessments (TIAs), public consultations, etc.) and the processing time might be even longer if the projects involved such procedures as gazettal and acquisition of private land, the Administration would adopt the approach of "launching projects once they were ready" in taking forward the drainage improvement works. It also undertook to review the workflow of and staffing arrangements for the relevant projects in the hope of launching the projects expeditiously.

46. Ms Claudia MO asked how the Administration would deal with the flooding problem in Chatham Road South. DDS advised that DSD was planning to construct an underground stormwater storage tank in the Urban Council Centenary Garden in Tsim Sha Tsui for temporary storage of the stormwater collected during rainstorms to alleviate the load on downstream drainage systems, thereby reducing the flooding risk in Chatham Road South.

Provision of rainwater harvesting facilities

47. Ms Claudia MO urged the Administration to provide rainwater harvesting facilities under the drainage improvement works projects to promote the recycling of water resources. Echoing Ms MO's views, Mr CHAN Chi-chuen opined that the Administration should follow Singapore's example by increasing Hong Kong's overall water harvesting capacity.

48. DDS advised that DSD had been endeavouring to provide water harvesting facilities under appropriate drainage works projects to promote the recycling of water resources. Given that among the four proposed drainage improvement works projects, the "Drainage Improvement Works at Ngong Ping" was located within the water gathering grounds of Shek Pik Reservoir, the stormwater collected could be discharged into Shek Pik Reservoir directly through the existing catchwaters downstream to fill the reservoir. The major reason for not providing rainwater harvesting facilities under the remaining three proposed drainage improvement projects was out of water quality considerations, as the rainwater collected was susceptible to pollution en-route. In the case of the "Drainage improvement in Southern Hong Kong Island—package 2" project, there was a height difference of about 30 m between the location of the proposed works project and Pok Fu Lam Reservoir, although the two were in close proximity. Therefore, the conveyance of stormwater collected from the proposed stormwater drainage system to Pok Fu Lam Reservoir or using it for other non-potable purposes would necessitate the construction of storage facilities as well as pumping stations and associated facilities. Taking into consideration the construction costs, operational expenses and land requirements, the provision of rainwater harvesting facilities under the project in question would not yield satisfactory results.

Other views and concerns

49. Mr WU Chi-wai said that as relayed by some residents living in the villages of North West New Territories, the drainage works projects carried out by DSD had blocked the original flow directions of stormwater in the villages, thus giving rise to the dam effect and resulting in stormwater flooding into the villages. Mr WU was concerned about whether the above situation would arise upon the completion of the four proposed works projects. In addition, noting that the relevant works would increase the amount of rainwater discharged into nearby natural river channels, Mr WU asked whether DSD would reinforce the natural river channels so affected.

50. DDS said that DSD would, at the project design stage, include the improvement works for existing drainage channels in the project if the drainage improvement works would affect the existing channels in the villages. For example, the improvement works for about 100 m of the existing drainage pipes would be carried out under "Drainage improvement in Northern New Territories—package B (remaining works)". DDS further advised that DSD would take into account the capacity of natural river channels at the project design stage to ensure that the river channels concerned would not be affected.

51. Mr WU Chi-wai enquired about the mechanism that DSD had put in place to ensure that the flood conveyance capacity of the improved stormwater drainage system would not be affected by new developments in the villages concerned in the future. DDS advised that the Lands Department would consult DSD on new development projects in the villages if the projects concerned would affect regional drainage. DSD would require the conduct of drainage impact assessments for the projects in question, and the projects could only proceed if DSD was satisfied with the assessment results.

52. Dr KWOK Ka-ki asked whether DSD had taken law enforcement actions against the case in Yan Shau Wai, San Tin where a river channel had been illegally filled and constructed with drainage pipes. DDS advised that DSD had, pursuant to the Land Drainage Ordinance (Cap. 446) ("LDO"), ordered the lot owner concerned to remove the landfill material and the illegally constructed drainage pipes from the river channel, as well as to reinstate the river channel. DSD was discussing with the lot owner the rectification plans which the latter might put forward under LDO. DDS added that DSD would exercise the powers conferred by LDO to reinstate the river channel should the circumstances involved pose an immediate risk of flooding. However, according to DSD's assessment, the case in question did not pose an immediate risk of flooding.

53. Dr KWOK Ka-ki asked how DSD would deal with the flooding problem in Shek Wu Wai, San Tin, Yuen Long. DDS advised that DSD had completed the first stage of works for the drainage improvement in Shek Wu Wai in 2014 (which included the construction of a three-cell box culvert) to greatly enhance the flood conveyance capacity of stormwater drains. As the remaining works involved private land acquisition, DSD was, at the moment, discussing various mediation proposals with the lot owners concerned.

Voting on FCR(2020-21)48

54. At 4:31 pm, the Chairman put item FCR(2020-21)48 to vote. At the request of members, the Chairman ordered a division. The Chairman declared that 43 members voted in favour of the item, and no member voted against it or abstained from voting. The votes of individual members were as follows:

For:

Mr James TO Kun-sun	Mr Abraham SHEK Lai-him
Mr Tommy CHEUNG Yu-yan	Prof Joseph LEE Kok-long
Mr Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung	Mr WONG Ting-kwong
Mr CHAN Hak-kan	Dr Priscilla LEUNG Mei-fun
Mr WONG Kwok-kin	Mr Paul TSE Wai-chun
Mr Steven HO Chun-yin	Mr Frankie YICK Chi-ming
Mr WU Chi-wai	Mr YIU Si-wing
Mr Charles Peter MOK	Mr CHAN Chi-chuen
Mr CHAN Han-pan	Mr Kenneth LEUNG
Ms Alice MAK Mei-kuen	Dr KWOK Ka-ki
Dr Helena WONG Pik-wan	Mr IP Kin-yuen
Ms Elizabeth QUAT	Mr Martin LIAO Cheung-kong
Mr POON Siu-ping	Ir Dr LO Wai-kwok
Mr Alvin YEUNG	Mr CHU Hoi-dick
Mr Jimmy NG Wing-ka	Dr Junius HO Kwan-yiu
Mr LAM Cheuk-ting	Mr SHIU Ka-fai
Dr Pierre CHAN	Mr CHAN Chun-ying
Ms Tanya CHAN	Mr HUI Chi-fung
Mr LUK Chung-hung	Mr LAU Kwok-fan
Dr CHENG Chung-tai	Mr KWONG Chun-yu
Mr Jeremy TAM Man-ho	Mr Vincent CHENG Wing-shun
Mr Tony TSE Wai-chuen	
(43 members)	

55. The Chairman declared that the item was approved.

56. The meeting was suspended at 4:37 pm and resumed at 4:47 pm.

Item 9 — FCR(2020-21)49

**RECOMMENDATION OF THE PUBLIC WORKS
SUBCOMMITTEE MADE ON 13 NOVEMBER 2019**

PWSC(2019-20)14

HEAD 703 — BUILDINGS

- Environmental** — **Burial grounds, columbaria and crematoria**
Hygiene
24NB — **Provision of columbarium, Garden of Remembrance and related works at On Hing Lane, Shek Mun, Sha Tin**
- 28NB** — **Provision of columbarium and Garden of Remembrance at Sandy Ridge Cemetery (Phase 1 development)**
- HEAD 705** — **CIVIL**
Transport — **Footbridges and pedestrian tunnels**
193TB — **Construction of subway in support of the provision of columbarium at On Hing Lane, Shek Mun, Sha Tin**

57. The Chairman advised that this item sought FC's approval for the following recommendations made by PWSC at its meeting on 13 November 2019 regarding PWSC(2019-20)14:

- (a) the upgrading of 24NB, entitled "Provision of columbarium, Garden of Remembrance and related works at On Hing Lane, Shek Mun, Sha Tin", to Category A at an estimated cost of \$859.5 million in MOD prices;
- (b) the upgrading of 28NB, entitled "Provision of columbarium and Garden of Remembrance at Sandy Ridge Cemetery (Phase 1 development)", to Category A at an estimated cost of \$1,240.5 million in MOD prices; and
- (c) the upgrading of 193TB, entitled "Construction of subway in support of the provision of columbarium at On Hing Lane, Shek Mun, Sha Tin", to Category A at an estimated cost of \$227.4 million in MOD prices.

58. The Chairman advised that some members had requested that the recommendation be voted on separately at the FC meeting.

Memorial facilities for abortuses

59. Mr KWONG Chun-yu enquired about the progress of providing memorial facilities for abortuses in public cemeteries. Deputy Director of Food and Environmental Hygiene (Environmental Hygiene) ("DD(EH)/FEHD") advised that the proposed columbaria at Shek Mun and

Sandy Ridge Cemetery ("SRC") would provide facilities for keeping of abortuses and/or scattering of their ashes, with respective areas of about 200 m² and 300 m². They would each provide 300 keeping spaces for abortuses. In addition, the Government would provide 400 keeping spaces at Cape Collinson Columbarium in Chai Wan. Public and private cemeteries currently provided a total of about 1 200 keeping places for abortuses. It was expected that the number of such places would continue to increase in future.

Shortening the waiting time for public niches

60. Pointing out that the current waiting time for public niches exceeded four years, Mr KWONG Chun-yu urged the Administration to strengthen communication with relevant District Councils and members of the local communities in relation to the development of new columbaria in all districts, and appropriately address the concerns of District Councils and local residents, with a view to implementing the relevant projects as soon as possible to shorten the waiting time for public niches. Under Secretary for Food and Health ("USFH") advised that after deciding to introduce the district-based columbarium development scheme, the Government had consulted nine District Councils which had either showed support for or raised no objection to the provision of public columbaria in their districts, involving about 590 000 niches. The Government would continue to discuss the development of new columbaria with different District Councils. DD(EH)/FEHD clarified that the waiting time of more than four years, as mentioned by Mr KWONG Chun-yu, referred to the time needed to wait for the allocation of used niches, for which the Food and Environmental Hygiene Department ("FEHD") had ceased to accept applications since 26 April 2019. New public niches would be allocated by balloting. With 21 235 and 44 950 niches being provided last year (2019) and this year (2020) respectively, they could meet the public's demand for public niches.

Provision of columbarium and Garden of Remembrance at Sandy Ridge Cemetery (Phase 1 development) (Public Works Project Item No. 28NB)

Opposition from the local community

61. Mr CHAN Hak-kan referred to a submission (LC Paper No. FC243/19-20(01)) tabled at the meeting, in which the Ta Kwu Ling District Rural Committee ("TKLDRC") expressed its objection against the SRC extension plan. The submission pointed out that the North District Council ("NDC"), at its meeting on 7 January 2020, passed a motion requesting the Administration to significantly scale down the extension of

the columbarium at SRC and immediately cancel the plan to build one-stop integrated facilities consisting of funeral parlours and human cremators next to SRC ("the motion concerned"). Mr CHAN asked why the Administration had indicated in its paper that NDC supported the plan. Mr CHAN further criticized the Administration for conducting phased consultations only, instead of consulting NDC and TKLDRC on the overall planning of the project, rendering it impossible for local residents to grasp the details of the whole project.

62. Mr James TO and Mr LAM Cheuk-ting queried why the Administration had not included NDC's latest views in the relevant paper. Mr TO and Mr LAM held that after the passage of the motion concerned, the Administration should take the initiative to contact NDC and TKLDRC to lobby for their support for the SRC development. Mr CHAN Chi-chuen concurred with the views of Mr TO and Mr LAM. Mr CHAN indicated in-principle support for the Government's implementation of the district-based columbarium development scheme. Nevertheless, he criticized the authorities for failing to properly respond to the views raised by North District residents.

63. USFH advised that the SRC development would comprise the construction of a columbarium with about 200 000 niches, a crematorium and related facilities. Given the scale of the whole development, the Government planned to carry out the project in two phases, providing 54 000 and 146 000 niches in Phase 1 and Phase 2 respectively. The Administration embarked on a district-level consultation exercise on the development plan as early as in 2012, and briefed NDC on the overall planning of the project and the facilities to be provided in various phases in the papers submitted to NDC in 2012 and 2014 respectively. The Government subsequently further consulted NDC on the design of Phase 1 development in 2018. NDC supported the columbarium development at SRC and the design of Phase 1 development. As NDC's and TKLDRC's current concerns were primarily related to the proposed facilities under Phase 2 development, the Government would further consult NDC and TKLDRC on the relevant details once Phase 2 development entered the planning stage.

64. DD(EH)/FEHD added that noting NDC's and TKLDRC's concerns about the SRC development, the Administration had taken the initiative to communicate with them. Following a meeting on 18 June 2020 between USFH and the representatives of TKLDRC, FEHD sought to arrange a meeting with TKLDRC before today's FC meeting but, due to busy schedules, both parties were still coordinating to propose a meeting date. As for the motion passed by NDC, FEHD had also consulted District

Officer (North) on the arrangements for the Government to respond to the motion. District Officer (North) said that the specific arrangements had yet to be discussed by the current-term NDC.

Traffic and environmental impacts

65. Mr CHAN Hak-kan asked how the Administration would cope with the additional traffic and pedestrian volume arising from the commissioning of the SRC columbarium and crematorium facilities, so as to prevent traffic paralysis in the area during the Ching Ming and Chung Yeung festive periods. Mr CHAN queried whether the Administration had taken into account recent and future developments in the North District area when it conducted TIA for the project in 2014. As the Administration had failed to address the doubts of North District residents over the project, Mr CHAN suggested that the project should be withdrawn. Dr Junius HO suggested that the Administration should re-examine the SRC development in its entirety and explore the feasibility of expanding Tsang Tsui Columbarium in Tuen Mun as a backup plan.

66. Dr Helena WONG indicated in-principle support for the two projects for the provision of columbaria as set out in the relevant paper. However, regarding the Sandy Ridge Columbarium development, she considered that the authorities should respond in specific terms to the concerns raised by members of the local community over the impact of the project on the traffic and environment of the district.

67. DD(EH)/FEHD advised that the proposed 54 000 public niches in Phase 1 development would be gradually introduced within three years, with an average of 18 000 per year. The Government completed the TIA Study in 2014 and briefed NDC on the findings in the same year. Subsequently, the Government also conducted a review based on the study. Traffic data projected up to 2052 (the year when all niches would have been allocated) and 2055 had been taken into account in the TIA. The study findings showed that the additional traffic and pedestrian volume arising from the columbarium during the Ching Ming and Chung Yeung festive periods should be manageable with the implementation of appropriate traffic mitigation and crowd control measures, including the provision of direct special bus services between the Sandy Ridge Columbarium and designated public transport interchanges during the Ching Ming and Chung Yeung festive periods. The interchanges would include Fanling Station Road, Sheung Shui Bus Terminus, Kwu Tung MTR Station (expected to be completed in 2028) and Fanling South (at Pak Wo Road near Wah Ming Road). The Sandy Ridge Columbarium would be provided with a pick-up/drop-off area for 43 buses and coaches to cope

with the pedestrian flow. FEHD would work closely with the Hong Kong Police Force and relevant departments to ensure that effective traffic and crowd control measures would be implemented during the grave sweeping seasons. The Government had indicated to NDC that it would conduct a review of the traffic situation five years after the completion and commissioning of the SRC columbarium and crematorium facilities.

68. Regarding environmental impacts, DD(EH)/FEHD said that the building project under Phase 1 development was not a designated project under EIAO. Nevertheless, the Government had completed a PER for the project and the findings were agreed by the Environmental Protection Department ("EPD") in January 2019. During the PER, the Government assessed the impact of the project on the nearby environment in terms of air quality, water quality, ecology, fisheries, landscape and so on. With the implementation of the recommended mitigation measures including water scrubber, electrostatic precipitator, etc., the project would not cause long-term adverse environmental impacts. The environment-friendly joss paper furnaces to be built under the project would be equipped with the aforesaid devices (including sprinklers, electrostatic precipitators and smoke extraction fans) and their design would comply with EPD's guidelines on the best available technology. In this connection, Dr Helena WONG asked the Administration to provide the relevant TIA and the PER report for the building project under Phase 1 development.

[Post-meeting note: The supplementary information provided by the Administration was issued to members vide LC Paper No. FC301/19-20(01) on 7 October 2020.]

69. Mr James TO held that the Administration should update the TIA completed in 2014 for the SRC development and submit more detailed study materials to NDC for consideration so as to address NDC's concerns about possible traffic issues arising from the project. Mr LAM Cheuk-ting criticized the Administration for failing to garner the support of NDC because it had not prepared any long-term plan for providing ancillary transport support for the development in order to cope with the pedestrian volume arising from hundreds of thousands of ancestor worshippers during the Ching Ming and Chung Yeung festive periods in the wake of the completion of all 200 000 niches. Mr LAM urged the Administration to prepare a comprehensive plan for ancillary transport facilities and consult NDC again. Mr TO and Mr LAM suggested that the Administration should consider withdrawing the funding proposal for the development and re-submitting it to FC for consideration after obtaining NDC's support for the project.

70. The meeting was suspended at 5:43 pm and resumed at 5:54 pm.

71. At 5:54 pm, the Chairman invited the Administration to respond to members' request for the withdrawal of the proposal for "Provision of columbarium and Garden of Remembrance at Sandy Ridge Cemetery (Phase 1 development)". On behalf of the Financial Secretary, Deputy Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury (Treasury)¹ withdrew item FCR(2020-21)49 at the meeting. He said that the Government would delete the aforesaid project from the paper and submit a revised paper for members' consideration at the FC meeting on 17 July 2020. In this connection, the Government asked the Chairman to consider waiving the notice period for submission of the relevant paper to FC.

Item 10 — FCR(2020-21)50

**RECOMMENDATION OF THE PUBLIC WORKS
SUBCOMMITTEE MADE ON 27 MAY 2020**

PWSC(2019-20)25

HEAD 703 — BUILDING

Recreation, Culture and Amenities — Cultural facilities

**75RE — Expansion of Hong Kong Science Museum and Hong
Kong Museum of History**

**HEAD 708 — CAPITAL SUBVENTIONS AND MAJOR SYSTEMS
AND EQUIPMENT**

**54QJ — New facilities building of the Hong Kong Sports
Institute**

72. The Chairman advised that this item sought FC's approval for the recommendation made by PWSC at its meeting held on 27 May 2020 regarding PWSC(2019-20)25, i.e. upgrading part of 75RE as 76RE, entitled "Pre-construction activities for expansion of Hong Kong Science Museum and Hong Kong Museum of History", to Category A at an estimated cost of \$72.8 million in MOD prices; and retaining the remainder of 75RE in Category B.

73. The Chairman advised that some members had requested that the recommendation be voted on separately at the FC meeting.

Overall objectives of expansion works

74. Mr KWONG Chun-yu enquired about the overall objectives of the expansion works for the Hong Kong Science Museum ("HKScM") and the

Hong Kong Museum of History ("HKMH"). Under Secretary for Home Affairs ("USHA") advised that the main objective of the proposed expansion works was to provide HKScM and HKMH with additional space for exhibition and education purpose. After expansion, the net operating floor area ("NOFA") of the two museums would increase by around 15 000 m² (roughly 90%). The works concerned would also enhance the accessibility of the museum buildings. As HKScM and HKMH, which were completed and opened in 1991 and 1998 respectively, were walled buildings with an old construction design layout, both museums were not easily accessible. Under the proposed expansion works, studies would be conducted on making the building design more open and enhancing the standard of public facilities and the quality of auxiliary facilities in the two museums.

75. Ms Claudia MO expressed reservations about the funding proposal for HKMH's expansion. She queried that the Administration, by choosing to bundle together the expansion works for HKMH and those for HKScM and submit them as a package for FC's scrutiny after the implementation of the Law of the People's Republic of China on Safeguarding National Security in the Hong Kong Special Administrative Region ("NSL"), aimed to compel Members into supporting the funding proposal for HKMH. Mr CHAN Chi-chuen enquired whether the funding proposal for the expansion of the two museums could be split into two independent items for scrutiny and voting.

76. USHA explained that the site in Tsim Sha Tsui East that accommodated both HKScM and HKMH had been developed in planned phases for the construction of a museum complex, and planning for the expansion works concerned had been drawn up for quite some time. The development was proposed to be implemented in three phases: the construction of HKScM in phase one (completed in 1991); the construction of HKMH in phase two (completed in 1998); and the expansion of HKScM and HKMH in phase three, namely the works item set out in the paper. It was expected that HKMH would only occupy around 2 500 m² out of the additional 15 000 m² of NOFA to be generated by the item, whereas the remaining additional NOFA would be designated mainly for HKScM. USHA further said that the main objective of the proposed expansion works was to improve the accessibility of the museum buildings, so as to enhance the overall quality of the area and improve the public facilities of the two museums. Therefore, the expansion works for the two museums must be taken forward together under a single works project, and the funding proposal concerned could not be split.

77. Mr CHAN Chi-chuen enquired whether the area of the permanent exhibition gallery showcasing "The Hong Kong Story" in HKMH would be increased upon the completion of the proposed expansion works to enable Hong Kong people and inbound visitors to know more about Hong Kong's history. USHA advised that HKMH's NOFA would be increased by around 2 500 m² upon the completion of expansion works, which included additional exhibition and education space, as well as the needs to enhance its permanent exhibition galleries, special exhibition galleries and education centre.

Project design

78. Mr Tony TSE expressed support for the expansion works for HKScM and HKMH. As the two museums were situated at a prime site in Tsim Sha Tsui, Mr TSE considered that a landmark design should be adopted for the expansion project. Mr WU Chi-wai noted the paper's reference to a disconnection between the existing design of the two museums and the surrounding streetscape and its striking contrast with the hustle and bustle in the vicinity. In this connection, Mr WU enquired about the design concept for the proposed works project. Mr TSE and Mr WU both suggested that the Administration should consider organizing a design competition for local architects to participate in the design work of the project. Mr WU considered that the authorities should earmark part of the funding for the proposed pre-construction activities for the drawing up of project design parameters to facilitate the organization of the relevant design competition.

79. USHA advised that the Government had endeavoured to develop the museum buildings into landmarks through the expansion works. Deputy Director of Architectural Services ("DDAS") added that it was the Government's hope that the design of the project could cater for the features, compatibility and concordance of the museum cluster comprising buildings belonging to different eras, while exuding a sense of modernity found in buildings of a new epoch and retaining the historical legacy and style of the buildings at the original site. Regarding the observation that there was a disconnection between the existing design of the two museums and the surrounding streetscape, DDAS advised that it stemmed from the existing museum design under which the buildings were walled, giving an impression that the museums were secluded and inaccessible. In the future design, consideration would be given to the removal of such external walls to enhance the accessibility of the museum buildings, their exposure and connectivity with the neighbourhood. As the two museums had to remain open for public visits in the course of expansion, the expansion works must be taken forward in phases, and this would increase the

complexity of the project. This explained why functional design was given a heavier weighting under the project. Despite all this, she undertook that the Architectural Services Department would join hands with the Leisure and Cultural Services Department ("LCSD") to examine the ways in which local architects might participate in the design work of part of the project through competition on the premise that such design could dovetail with the unique works conditions of the project.

80. Mr WU Chi-wai noted that the proportion of open space in the museum buildings would be maintained at the existing 40% under the design of the proposed expansion works project. Mr WU enquired whether such open space would be located outdoors or indoors. Ms Tanya CHAN asked about the design of the open space concerned, and whether the two museums would be equipped with catering facilities upon expansion. USHA said that the Government planned to provide catering and vending facilities outside the museums, so that the facilities could cater for visitors not intending to enter the museums, and would be accessible in the evening. DDAS advised that the open space concerned would be open-air public space located on different levels of the two museums. Assistant Director of Leisure and Cultural Services (Heritage and Museums) ("ADLCS(H&M)") added that the open space would provide an outdoor area for organizing large-scale activities involving public interaction.

81. Mr SHIU Ka-chun was concerned that the security staff members working in the museums were generally at an advanced age, but they were required to remain standing for prolonged periods owing to job nature. Mr SHIU urged LCSD to consider providing common rooms for use by staff (especially security staff) in individual exhibition galleries in future. Noting Mr SHIU's concern, ADLCS(H&M) said that she would explore the provision of appropriate rest places for security staff and draw up relevant plans.

Exhibition contents in the Hong Kong Museum of History

82. Mr KWONG Chun-yu enquired whether any exhibitions on the "4 June Incident" would be held in the expanded HKMH. Mr CHU Hoi-dick was concerned that the implementation of NSL would deter HKMH from exhibiting historical facts about Hong Kong people's support for student protesters in the "4 June Incident" in Beijing and their commemoration of the deceased in the incident, and it would even be forced to disregard such information. Mr CHU enquired whether the "4 June Incident" would be included as part of HKMH's permanent exhibition on "The Hong Kong Story". Expressing concern about NSL's

implications on HKMH, Dr Fernando CHEUNG enquired how LCSD could ensure that HKMH was able to uphold a professional, unbiased and objective attitude in its account of the history of Hong Kong after its return to China. Mr CHAN Chi-chuen enquired whether LCSD had the mechanism to review the collections and exhibitions of museums under its purview in light of the implementation of new legislations. Mr Vincent CHENG expressed the hope that HKMH could present historical facts with an impartial attitude, free from political pressure.

83. USHA said that LCSD always adopted a professional, unbiased and objective attitude in acquiring collections and planning exhibitions for museums under its purview, and museum staff had received professional training. In the case of HKMH, LCSD would heed the views of the relevant experts, advisers and academics, as well as the History Sub-committee of the Museum Advisory Committee, on individual exhibition topics. Since the implementation of the new legislation, LCSD had not found any collections or exhibitions of museums that contravened the legislation of Hong Kong. In case of needs or doubts, LCSD would seek legal advice. USHA also advised that the permanent exhibition on "The Hong Kong Story" had had a history of 19 years since its introduction in 2001. LCSD was preparing for a comprehensive update of the exhibition, with the preliminary plan of adopting a chronological or topic-based approach in presenting the relevant contents. The details of the updated permanent exhibition on "The Hong Kong Story" were still being reviewed and finalized.

84. Dr Fernando CHEUNG enquired about LCSD's criteria for selecting advisers for HKMH and the appointment terms of such advisers. Mr Vincent CHENG was concerned whether the relevant advisers could provide HKMH with fair and unbiased opinions under political pressure. ADLCS(H&M) said that the Museum Expert Advisers and the Museum Advisory Committee under LCSD would offer professional advice to LCSD on museum collections and exhibition contents. Speaking of the history domain, the relevant advisers comprised history experts and academics with substantial experience and professional knowledge who commanded a high degree of recognition in their respective professional fields. These advisers had been providing service for LCSD for many years.

85. Mr LAU Kwok-fan suggested that the Administration should consider injecting technological elements into HKMH's exhibitions as a means to enhance people's knowledge about technology and spice up history exhibitions, so as to attract more visitors. ADLCS(H&M) advised that the current piazzas were very much under-utilized and had little

connections with the two museums. The expanded outdoor public space would be used more often in the future to organize activities, so as to strengthen the connection and integration of science with history and in turn create a synergy effect.

86. Ms Tanya CHAN enquired about the details of guided tour services in the two museums, and whether visits would be arranged during non-opening hours at the request of persons from individual sectors. ADLCS(H&M) said that the museums would, subject to the needs of so doing, consider arranging visits during non-opening hours. Guided tour services for group visits and public guided tours were available at various museums, and audio guide devices were also provided for visitors in certain exhibitions. Individual visitors might also use their smartphones to download exhibition materials through QR codes.

87. At 6:58 pm, the Chairman advised that FC would continue with the scrutiny of the item at the meeting to be held on the morning of the next day (i.e. 14 July). He also informed members that the cut-off time for making requests for raising questions would be set at 9:30 am tomorrow.

Strengthening connectivity with neighbourhood

88. Mr LAU Kwok-fan expressed in-principle support for the proposed works project. Mr LAU enquired how the Administration would improve the accessibility of the museum buildings through this project. Mr Vincent CHENG opined that the Administration should strengthen the connectivity of the two museums with the central area of Tsim Sha Tsui and the harbourfront in Tsim Sha Tsui East, or even with the West Kowloon Cultural District, in the hope that the item could turn the two museums into a new landmark and invigorate the Tsim Sha Tsui district. USHA said that at present, the public entrances of the two museums all lay on the southern side of the site and connected only to a fraction of the public circulation system around the area, rendering the accessibility of the museums unsatisfactory. The existing walled design of museum buildings had also added to the feeling of seclusion. The future design would seek to enhance the museums' accessibility, exposure and connectivity with the neighbourhood and provide people with public space open on a 24-hour basis. The Government was planning the re-provisioning of the existing ramp connecting footbridge across Granville Road, and it would explore different proposals on the construction of a modernized footbridge on Science Museum Road, including its possibility of routing via Concordia Plaza or the nearby Harbour Crystal Centre for connection to the existing footbridge system that linked up Tsim Sha Tsui East, The Hong Kong

Polytechnic University and the toll plaza of the Cross Harbour Tunnel, so as to enhance the accessibility of the two museums.

Other views and concerns

89. Mr Vincent CHENG expressed support for the proposed works project. Mr CHENG was concerned that the exhibits in HKScM were out of date, and he hoped that the Administration could take the opportunity presented by the expansion works concerned to inject new elements into HKScM, so as to enable HKScM to keep abreast of the times.

90. The meeting ended at 7:03 pm.

Legislative Council Secretariat
28 October 2020