

**立法會**  
***Legislative Council***

LC Paper No. PWSC176/19-20  
(These minutes have been seen  
by the Administration)

Ref : CB1/F/2/1(16)B

**Public Works Subcommittee of the Finance Committee  
of the Legislative Council**

**Minutes of the 15<sup>th</sup> meeting  
held in Conference Room 1 of the Legislative Council Complex  
on Monday, 11 May 2020, at 9:00 am**

**Members present:**

Ir Dr Hon LO Wai-kwok, SBS, MH, JP (Chairman)  
Hon Charles Peter MOK, JP (Deputy Chairman)  
Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, GBS, JP  
Hon Tommy CHEUNG Yu-yan, GBS, JP  
Hon CHAN Hak-kan, BBS, JP  
Dr Hon Priscilla LEUNG Mei-fun, SBS, JP  
Hon Claudia MO  
Hon Michael TIEN Puk-sun, BBS, JP  
Hon Frankie YICK Chi-ming, SBS, JP  
Hon WU Chi-wai, MH  
Hon MA Fung-kwok, SBS, JP  
Hon CHAN Chi-chuen  
Hon CHAN Han-pan, BBS, JP  
Hon LEUNG Che-cheung, SBS, MH, JP  
Hon Alice MAK Mei-kuen, BBS, JP  
Hon Christopher CHEUNG Wah-fung, SBS, JP  
Dr Hon Fernando CHEUNG Chiu-hung  
Dr Hon Helena WONG Pik-wan

Hon Alvin YEUNG  
Hon Andrew WAN Siu-kin  
Hon CHU Hoi-dick  
Dr Hon Junius HO Kwan-yiu, JP  
Hon HO Kai-ming  
Hon Holden CHOW Ho-ding  
Hon Wilson OR Chong-shing, MH  
Hon Tanya CHAN  
Hon HUI Chi-fung  
Hon LUK Chung-hung, JP  
Hon LAU Kwok-fan, MH  
Dr Hon CHENG Chung-tai  
Hon Jeremy TAM Man-ho  
Hon Vincent CHENG Wing-shun, MH, JP  
Hon Tony TSE Wai-chuen, BBS  
Hon CHAN Hoi-yan

**Members absent:**

Hon CHEUNG Kwok-kwan, JP  
Hon KWONG Chun-yu

**Public officers attending:**

Mr Howard LEE Man-sing	Deputy Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury (Treasury) <sup>3</sup>
Mr LAM Sai-hung, JP	Permanent Secretary for Development (Works)
Ms Bernadette LINN, JP	Permanent Secretary for Development (Planning and Lands)
Mr Elvis AU Wai-kwong, JP	Deputy Director of Environmental Protection (1)
Ms Margaret HSIA Mai-chi	Principal Assistant Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury (Treasury) (Works)

Mr Frank CHAN Fan, JP	Secretary for Transport and Housing
Mr Peter MAK Chi-kwong	Principal Assistant Secretary for Transport and Housing (Transport)7
Mr Jimmy CHAN Pai-ming, JP	Director of Highways
Mr LAM Yu-chau	Government Engineer (Railway Development)1 Highways Department
Mr LEUNG Sai-ho	Chief Engineer (Railway Development) 1-2 Highways Department
Mr David LAM Chi-man	Principal Assistant Secretary for Development (Planning and Lands)5
Mr Ricky LAU Chun-kit, JP	Director of Civil Engineering and Development
Mr Ambrose CHEONG Siu-yau, JP	Project Manager (West) West Development Office Civil Engineering and Development Department
Ms Joyce LAU Yiu-yan	Deputy Project Manager (West) West Development Office Civil Engineering and Development Department
Mr CHUNG Lok-chin	Chief Engineer (West)3 West Development Office Civil Engineering and Development Department
Mr CHAN Tze-ho	Coordinator (Special Duties) West Development Office Civil Engineering and Development Department
Ms Lily CHIU Lee-lee	Chief Estate Surveyor (New Development Area) Lands Department

Mr Jack CHAN Jick-chi, JP	Under Secretary for Home Affairs
Ms Iona SHAM Hiu-tung	Principal Assistant Secretary for Home Affairs (Culture) <sup>2</sup>
Ms Winnie HO Wing-yin, JP	Deputy Director of Architectural Services
Mr Henry LOK Wan-pak	Senior Project Manager 333 Architectural Services Department
Miss Eve TAM Mei-yee	Assistant Director of Leisure and Cultural Services (Heritage and Museums)
Ms Ronne YUEN Yuet-po	Head (Museum Projects and Development) Leisure and Cultural Services Department
Ms Paulina CHAN Shuk-man	Museum Director (Science Museum) Leisure and Cultural Services Department
Ms Belinda WONG Sau-lan	Museum Director (Museum of History) Leisure and Cultural Services Department
Mr Paul CHENG Ching-wan	Principal Assistant Secretary for Home Affairs (Recreation and Sport) <sup>1</sup>
Mr Stephen IP Shing-tak	Chief Technical Adviser (Subvented Projects) Architectural Services Department

**Attendance by invitation:**

Dr Jacob KAM	Chief Executive Officer MTR Corporation Limited
Mr Roger BAYLISS	Projects Director MTR Corporation Limited
Mr James CHOW	Divisional General Manager (Project Construction) MTR Corporation Limited

Mr Scott MACKENZIE	General Manager (Procurement & Contracts) MTR Corporation Limited
Mr Lam CHAN	Deputy General Manager (Projects & Property Communications) MTR Corporation Limited
Dr Trisha LEAHY, BBS	Chief Executive Hong Kong Sports Institute
Dr Tony CHOI	Deputy Chief Executive Hong Kong Sports Institute
Dr Raymond SO	Director Elite Training Science & Technology Hong Kong Sports Institute
Ms Monita HO	Associate Director (Estate Office) Hong Kong Sports Institute
Mr Alexander LUSH	Director DLN Architects Hong Kong Limited
Mr C K CHAN	Executive Director Arcadis Design & Engineering Limited
Ms Lysander LAM	Director Arcadis Hong Kong Limited
<b>Clerk in attendance:</b>	
Ms Doris LO	Chief Council Secretary (1)2
<b>Staff in attendance:</b>	
Mr Raymond CHOW	Senior Council Secretary (1)10
Mr Keith WONG	Council Secretary (1)2
Ms Christina SHIU	Legislative Assistant (1)2
Ms Christy YAU	Legislative Assistant (1)8
Ms Clara LO	Legislative Assistant (1)9

---

The Chairman advised that there were nine papers for discussion on the agenda for the meeting. All of them were funding proposals carried over from the previous meeting. The nine funding proposals involved a total funding allocation of \$48,633.3 million. Subject to the progress of scrutiny at today's meeting, items for which consideration was yet to be completed would be carried forward to the meeting on 13 May for continuous consideration together with four other new submissions from the Administration. The Chairman reminded members that in accordance with Rule 83A of the Rules of Procedure ("RoP") of the Legislative Council ("LegCo"), they should disclose the nature of any direct or indirect pecuniary interests relating to the funding proposals under discussion at the meeting before they spoke on the proposals. He also drew members' attention to Rule 84 of RoP on voting in case of direct pecuniary interest.

**Head 706 — Highways**

- PWSC(2019-20)27 61TR Shatin to Central Link — construction of railway works — remaining works**  
**62TR Shatin to Central Link — construction of non-railway works — remaining works**

2. The Chairman advised that the proposal (i.e. [PWSC\(2019-20\)27](#)) sought to increase the approved project estimates ("APEs") of 61TR and 62TR (collectively referred to as the "main works of the Shatin to Central Link ('SCL')") by \$8,696.8 million and \$1,367 million respectively (totalling about \$10,063.8 million), bringing the APEs from \$65,433.3 million to \$74,130.1 million and from \$5,983.1 million to \$7,350.1 million respectively in money-of-the-day ("MOD") prices. The Subcommittee had deliberated on this submission at the last three meetings and would now continue with the deliberation.

Motion to adjourn the discussion on PWSC(2019-20)27

3. The Chairman advised that at the last meeting, Mr Jeremy TAM moved, pursuant to paragraph 33 of the Public Works Subcommittee ("PWSC") Procedure, that the discussion on PWSC(2019-20)27 be adjourned (hereafter referred to as the "adjournment motion"). Eight members had spoken on the adjournment motion at the last meeting. The meeting would continue to deal with the adjournment motion proposed by Mr TAM. The Chairman directed that each member might speak once on the motion for not more than three minutes.

4. The Chairman pointed out that he had allowed a Member who was a non-subcommittee member to speak on the above adjournment motion at the last meeting on 29 April. Some members had enquired whether non-subcommittee members could speak on such a motion. Thanking members for their enquiries, the Chairman said that the PWSC Procedure did not stipulate explicitly whether non-subcommittee members could speak on an adjournment motion. Such a situation also rarely arose in the past. After referring to the practice adopted by other committees, the Chairman considered that it was more appropriate not to allow non-subcommittee members to speak on the adjournment motion. Moreover, the Chairman also reiterated that according to the PWSC Procedure, non-subcommittee members had no right to vote at the meetings of the Subcommittee.

5. Mr HUI Chi-fung, Ms Tanya CHAN, Mr CHAN Chi-chuen and Dr Helena WONG spoke in support of the motion proposed by Mr Jeremy TAM. These members expressed discontent with the serious cost overrun of the main works of SCL and the Administration's failure to account properly for the cost overrun. Moreover, they were also discontent with the Administration's failure to provide the cost details to address members' concerns about the improvement works to facilities of the Police Force.

6. In response, Secretary for Transport and Housing ("STH") said that he understood members' concern about the improvement works to facilities of the Police Force. The Government had endeavoured to respond to members' questions at the meetings of the Subcommittee and had provided the supplementary information required at members' request. He pointed out that although the actual rates in the returned tenders for individual works contracts (e.g. the contract that covered the reprovisioning works of the Police Officers' Club) were higher than the original estimate of MTR Corporation Limited ("MTRCL"), the sum of all contract prices for the main works of SCL was slightly lower than the pre-tender estimate, with a net saving of \$289 million in total. STH stressed that the works relating to improving the facilities of the Police Force were not related to the current proposal for increasing the APEs of the main works of SCL. He hoped that members would support the funding proposal to enable the continuous implementation of the main works of SCL.

7. Mr Jeremy TAM spoke in reply on his motion. The Chairman put the adjournment motion to vote. At the request of members, the Chairman ordered a division. The motion was [negatived](#).

Continuation of business for PWSC(2019-20)27

8. Mr Michael TIEN found it acceptable that the Administration and MTRCL had done what was in their power to compress the amount of the additional funding sought to around \$10 billion. He enquired whether the Tai Wai to Hung Hom Section of Tuen Ma Line ("TML") could be commissioned in or before the third quarter of 2021 for service to commence on the entire TML, thereby connecting New Territories West and East Kowloon.

9. STH replied that the Government expected that the entire Tai Wai to Hung Hom Section of TML could be commissioned by the end of 2021. Chief Executive Officer, MTRCL, said that after completion of the appropriate initiatives at Hung Hom Station, MTRCL was required to reprovision the tracks and electrical and mechanical equipment at Hung Hom Station and conduct the relevant tests and operational trials. As TML would bring about the full connection of two existing railway lines, the pre-operational testing was expected to take more time. MTRCL would complete this series of tasks expeditiously, so that service on the entire TML could commence safely as soon as possible.

Motions proposed under paragraph 32A of the Public Works Subcommittee Procedure

10. The Chairman said that he had received two motions proposed by two members under paragraph 32A of the PWSC Procedure ("32A motions"). He considered that the proposed motions were directly related to the agenda item.

11. At 9:35 am, the Subcommittee put to vote the question that the 32A motions proposed by members be proceeded forthwith. At the request of members, the Chairman ordered a division. The results were as follows—

Motion proposed by	Motion no.	Proceeded forthwith or not
Mr Alvin YEUNG	<u>1</u> (Chinese version only)	<u>No</u>
Mr CHAN Chi-chuen	<u>2</u> (Chinese version only)	<u>No</u>

Voting on PWSC(2019-20)27

12. The Chairman put [PWSC\(2019-20\)27](#) to vote. At the request of members, the Chairman ordered a division. 18 members voted for the



proposal, 12 members voted against it and no member abstained. The votes of individual members were as follows:

*For:*

Mr Tommy CHEUNG  
Dr Priscilla LEUNG  
Mr Frankie YICK  
Mr CHAN Han-pan  
Ms Alice MAK  
Mr HO Kai-ming  
Mr Wilson OR  
Mr LAU Kwok-fan  
Mr Tony TSE  
(18 members)

Mr CHAN Hak-kan  
Mr Michael TIEN  
Mr MA Fung-kwok  
Mr LEUNG Che-cheung  
Mr Christopher CHEUNG  
Mr Holden CHOW  
Mr LUK Chung-hung  
Mr Vincent CHENG  
Ms CHAN Hoi-yan

*Against:*

Mr Charles Peter MOK (Deputy Chairman)  
Mr CHAN Chi-chuen  
Dr Helena WONG  
Mr Andrew WAN  
Ms Tanya CHAN  
Dr CHENG Chung-tai  
(12 members)

Mr WU Chi-wai  
Dr Fernando CHEUNG  
Mr Alvin YEUNG  
Mr CHU Hoi-dick  
Mr HUI Chi-fung  
Mr Jeremy TAM

*Abstained:*

(0 member)

13. The Chairman declared that the item was endorsed by the Subcommittee. The Chairman consulted members on whether the item would require separate voting at the relevant meeting of the Finance Committee ("FC"). Ms Tanya CHAN requested separate voting on the item (i.e. [PWSC\(2019-20\)27](#)) at the relevant FC meeting.

**Head 707 — New Towns and Urban Area Development**

- PWSC(2019-20)24 787CL Hung Shui Kiu/Ha Tsuen New Development Area advance works — site formation and engineering infrastructure**
- 796CL Hung Shui Kiu/Ha Tsuen New Development Area stage 1 works — site formation and engineering infrastructure**
- 829CL Hung Shui Kiu/Ha Tsuen New Development Area stage 2 works — site formation and engineering infrastructure**

**Head 701 — Land Acquisition**

- 38CA Special Ex-gratia Cash Allowance for the First Phase development for the Hung Shui Kiu/Ha Tsuen New Development Area**

14. The Chairman advised that the proposal (i.e. [PWSC\(2019-20\)24](#)) sought to upgrade part of 787CL, 796CL and part of 829CL to Category A at the estimated costs of \$495.9 million, \$1,351.2 million and \$395.6 million in MOD prices respectively. The proposal also included the allocation of an estimated total cost of around \$2.4 million for Subhead 38CA under Head 701 — Land Acquisition to meet the payment of Special Ex-gratia Cash Allowance to eligible domestic households affected by the clearance for the First Phase development for the Hung Shui Kiu/Ha Tsuen New Development Area ("HSK/HT NDA"). The Government had consulted the Panel on Development on the above funding proposals on 16 December 2019. Panel members supported the submission of the funding proposals to the Subcommittee for consideration. A report on the gist of the Panel's discussion was tabled at the meeting.

15. Mr CHAN Chi-chuen enquired whether the Subcommittee could vote separately on the four funding proposals under the agenda item, and whether members could propose a 32A motion on each of the four funding proposals.

16. The Chairman said that each member might propose only one 32A motion on each agenda item. As regards the voting arrangement, the Chairman would decide whether to accept members' request for separate voting on the funding proposals/a funding proposal under the agenda item subject to the views of the Administration. Previously, the Subcommittee had also voted separately on individual funding proposals under the same agenda item.

17. Ms Claudia MO enquired why the Administration had divided the works relating to the HSK/HT NDA project into advance works, stage 1 works

and stage 2 works rather than consolidating them into one project for consideration by the Subcommittee.

18. The Chairman said that it was a common practice of the Administration to divide major projects into multiple stages for implementation in phases. Permanent Secretary for Development (Planning and Lands) ("PS(P&L)/DEVB") explained that the HSK/HT NDA project would be taken forward in three phases. The proposed funding being sought was used for conducting the site formation and engineering infrastructure works for the First Phase development of the NDA, the detailed design and site investigation for the Second Phase development of the NDA and the related studies for the overall NDA development.

The Hung Shui Kiu/Ha Tsuen New Development Area project

19. Mr LAU Kwok-fan expressed support for the funding proposals and considered them contributive to increasing land and housing supply. He enquired about the completion time of the detailed planning of HSK/HT NDA. PS(P&L)/DEVB replied that the Planning Department had published the HSK and HT Outline Development Plan, which contained information on the land use zones in HSK/HT NDA.

20. Mr Andrew WAN urged the Administration to increase the ratio of public to private housing in HSK/HT NDA from the existing 51:49 to 70:30 to dovetail with the planning target in the 2019 Policy Address that 70% of the housing units on newly developed land would be used for public housing. Mr WAN also requested the Administration to expedite the development of public housing in HSK/HT NDA and tackle step by step the current issue of the relatively high public housing ratio in Tin Shui Wai ("TSW"). Ms Alice MAK also urged the Administration to increase the supply of public housing in HSK/HT NDA, such as providing more subsidized sale flats.

21. Mr WU Chi-wai questioned why, in spite of the already announced planning target in the 2019 Policy Address that 70% of the housing units on newly developed land would be used for public housing, the Administration still proposed that the feasibility of increasing the ratio of public to private housing in HSK/HT NDA be assessed first rather than going straight ahead to explore how the above planning target could be achieved for the NDA. Mr WU opined that the imbalanced public and private housing mix in TSW was the result of converting a large number of units intended to be used as subsidized sale flats for public rental housing.

22. Mr CHAN Chi-chuen requested the Administration to explain the background of setting the public and private housing mix in HSK/HT NDA at 51:49, and the factors to be considered before a decision could be made to increase the ratio of public to private housing in the NDA to 70:30.

23. PS(P&L)/DEVB explained that the HSK/HT NDA project was under planning for a very long period of time and the public engagement exercise conducted between 2010 and 2017 had been completed. The draft outline zoning plan concerned was also approved in 2018. In view of the public and private housing mix of about 80:20 in TSW, the Administration had set the ratio of public to private housing in HSK/HT NDA at 51:49 initially in order to achieve a more balanced mix of public and private housing in a larger regional context (i.e. an overall ratio at around 70:30 in both the NDA and TSW as a whole).

24. PS(P&L)/DEVB further said that in view of society's keen demand for public housing in recent years, the planning target that 70% of the housing units on newly developed land would be used for public housing was announced in the 2019 Policy Address. Against the above background, one of the tasks of the project was to assess the feasibility of increasing the public housing supply in the Second Phase and Remaining Phase development of HSK/HT NDA in order to increase the ratio of public to private housing in the NDA from the current 51:49 to 70:30. The above assessment would also examine the accommodating capacity of the planned infrastructure provisions in the NDA to support the revised housing split. In the course of assessment, public views would be sought on the relevant proposals. Furthermore, the project also included the detailed design for the infrastructure under the Second Phase development of HSK/HT NDA to prepare for the public housing development under the Second Phase development of the NDA. The housing units concerned were expected to be completed successively from 2030 onwards.

25. Mr LAU Kwok-fan supported the Administration's approach of ascertaining the feasibility of increasing the ratio of public to private housing in HSK/HT NDA to 70:30 based on a review of the actual situation of the NDA rather than pursuing rigidly the planning target of using 70% of the housing units on newly developed land for public housing. Mr LAU also enquired whether the Administration had formulated master development plans for different land use zones in Hong Kong in order to optimize the use of sites such as brownfield sites and deserted agricultural land.

26. PS(P&L)/DEVB said that the Administration would complete the Hong Kong 2030+: Towards a Planning Vision and Strategy Transcending 2030 ("Hong Kong 2030+") study within this year, under which Hong Kong's overall land use pattern to cope with long-term development needs was studied.

The issue of future development direction for agricultural land would be explored continuously under the New Agriculture Policy.

27. Mr WU Chi-wai enquired whether the Administration would use all the land formed under the First Phase development of HSK/HT NDA for construction of public facilities without allocating any of it for private development purpose.

28. PS(P&L)/DEVB replied that the 17 hectares ("ha") of land under the First Phase development of HSK/HT NDA would be mainly used for construction of infrastructure facilities, the Dedicated Rehousing Estate ("DRE") and village resite area for rehousing the affected residents, and the multi-storey buildings ("MSBs") to accommodate brownfield operations. Among these sites, except for one that would be handed to the CLP Power Company Limited for substation development and several sites that were earmarked for MSBs to accommodate brownfield operations, for which the decision as to whether and how they should be handed to private developers for development and operation would be made in the light of the findings of the market sounding exercise, none would be used for private development.

29. Mr LAU Kwok-fan noted that the Administration would spearhead the HSK/HT NDA project following the enhanced conventional new town approach adopted for the Kwu Tung North/Fanling North ("KTN/FLN") NDA. Under the said approach, private landowners in KTN/FLN NDA could develop their land planned for private development and with a site area of not less than 4 000 square metres ("m<sup>2</sup>") through in-situ land exchange applications. He enquired whether the criteria adopted for such land exchange applications would also apply to the HSK/HT NDA project.

30. PS(P&L)/DEVB responded that under the HSK/HT NDA project, private landowners could apply for in-situ land exchange for sites that were planned for private residential development with an area of not less than 4 000 m<sup>2</sup>. Regarding the land exchange applications for sites earmarked for commercial and mixed commercial/residential development, the Administration had previously proposed that the land area of in-situ land exchange application should not be less than the total area of individual sites for commercial and mixed commercial/residential development as shown in the HSK and HT Outline Development Plan. In the light of the feedback from stakeholders, the Administration was examining the size and site boundary of the sites concerned in order to promote the more diverse development of HSK/HT NDA.

31. Mr LAU Kwok-fan further enquired about the completion time of the said study and the latest area requirement proposed by the Administration in

respect of the in-situ land exchange applications for sites earmarked for commercial and mixed commercial/residential uses. On the other hand, Mr WU Chi-wai enquired about the details of in-situ land exchange applications in HSK/HT NDA, including whether the time period within which the in-situ land exchange application must be concluded would hinge on the schedule of the NDA's phased development.

32. PS(P&L)/DEVB replied that the land under the First Phase development of HSK/HT NDA was not used for any private housing and commercial development. The in-situ land exchange arrangement applied only to the Second Phase and Remaining Phase development. To dovetail with the schedule of the Second Phase development of the NDA, the Administration would finalize later this year the area requirement and the time period within which the land exchange application must be concluded for sites earmarked for commercial and mixed commercial/residential uses, so that the Administration might start to receive the first batch of in-situ land exchange applications in HSK/HT NDA covering residential, commercial and mixed commercial/residential sites later this year. Mr WU Chi-wai requested the Administration to provide supplementary information indicating the rough distribution of the first batch of private land within HSK/HT NDA to which the in-situ land exchange arrangement applied.

*(Post-meeting note: The supplementary information provided by the Administration was circulated to members vide [LC Paper No. PWSC174/19-20\(01\)](#) (Chinese version only) on 16 June 2020.)*

33. Mr CHU Hoi-dick pointed out that the various development projects in Northwest New Territories ("NWNT") would result in substantial population growth in the region. As one of the solutions to address the employment needs of the residents of NWNT, the Administration would create about 150 000 employment opportunities through the HSK/HT NDA project, so as to bring jobs closer to the residents. In this connection, Mr CHU enquired about the details of the respective employment opportunities to be created at various sites for economic uses based on the land use categories of HSK/HT NDA.

34. PS(P&L)/DEVB responded that about 22 ha of land in HSK/HT NDA was zoned for commercial use (which translated to more than 2 million m<sup>2</sup> in terms of floor area), in addition to a total of about 83 ha of land (which translated to more than 4 million m<sup>2</sup> in terms of floor area) zoned for industrial, enterprise and technology park, logistic facility, port back-up, storage and workshop uses. The Administration expected that the HSK/HT NDA project could create diverse employment opportunities for local residents and thus reduce the pressure on inter-district transport. Of the 150 000 employment

opportunities to be created in the NDA, about 75 000 and 61 000 were expected to be generated from commercial services and industrial operations respectively, and the remaining 14 000 were expected to be generated from community services. At the request of Mr CHU, the Administration would provide supplementary information on the number of jobs currently provided in Tuen Mun District after the meeting.

*(Post-meeting note: The supplementary information provided by the Administration was circulated to members vide [LC Paper No. PWSC174/19-20\(01\)](#) (Chinese version only) on 16 June 2020.)*

35. Mr Abraham SHEK expressed support for the funding proposals. He was concerned whether the sites for social welfare facilities in HSK/HT NDA could meet the district's needs for elderly services.

36. PS(P&L)/DEVB said that out of the total area of 441 ha of HSK/HT NDA, about 86 ha of land was zoned for provision of public facilities. At the request of Mr SHEK, the Administration would provide supplementary information after the meeting on the area of land reserved for development of residential care homes for the elderly ("RCHEs") in zones for social welfare facilities in the NDA and the estimated number of places that could be provided in such RCHEs upon completion.

*(Post-meeting note: The supplementary information provided by the Administration was circulated to members vide [LC Paper No. PWSC174/19-20\(01\)](#) (Chinese version only) on 16 June 2020.)*

37. Mr Jeremy TAM noted that the proposed project included the construction of a one-lane two-way carriageway about 330 m in length connecting Tsing Yick Road to Ng Lau Road and a sewer about 340 m in length under the First Phase development of HSK/HT NDA. He enquired about the construction costs of the carriageway and the sewer.

38. Director of Civil Engineering and Development ("DCED") explained that the proposed project included infrastructure works for the First Phase development of HSK/HT NDA involving the construction of sewerage systems and a number of road construction and improvement works. The former, which included the construction of a total of about 360 metres ("m") of sewage rising mains and a total of about 1 700 m of gravity sewers, cost \$59.6 million. The latter, which included the construction of a dual two-to-three-lane carriageway about 500 m in length connecting to the existing interchange underneath Kong Sham Western Highway, cost \$87.6 million.

Industrial policy

39. Mr LUK Chung-hung expressed support for the funding proposals. He urged the Development Bureau ("DEVB") to formulate a concrete industrial policy for HSK/HT NDA in collaboration with other relevant bureaux, including the Commerce and Economic Development Bureau and the Innovation and Technology Bureau, so as to bring to fruition the Administration's idea of creating 150 000 employment opportunities in the NDA. Mr Abraham SHEK opined that the Administration should review if new thinking should be adopted in place of the customary mode of development while it took forward the HSK/HT NDA project expeditiously, drawing from the experience gained from previous development of other projects (e.g. Cyberport and the Hong Kong Science Park) and taking into account the impact of the Coronavirus Disease — 2019 ("COVID-19") pandemic on the global economy.

40. Mr CHU Hoi-dick questioned if the HSK/HT NDA project could cope with the current and future impacts brought about by the fast changing global economy and climate and achieve its expected target of job opportunity creation. In particular, he was concerned whether the about 22 ha of land in the NDA that was earmarked for commercial use under the Administration's planning some years ago could meet the needs of future economic activities. Mr WU Chi-wai also requested the Administration to make forward-looking planning for Hong Kong's industrial development in order to cope with changes in the global political and economic landscape and impact of the COVID-19 pandemic.

41. PS(P&L)/DEVB responded that the Civil Engineering and Development Department, the department responsible for the planning and engineering study for HSK/HT NDA, had been making coordinated efforts among bureaux and departments to ensure the completion of the NDA as planned. DEVB was also working with other relevant bureaux to take forward the development of land in the NDA reserved for enterprise and technology park uses and MSBs for accommodating brownfield operations. Moreover, as a long-term development project that would not see full completion until 2038, the HSK/HT NDA project should not falter in its planning vision of becoming a regional economic hub of NWNT under the influence of short-term economic fluctuations. To that end, the Administration would balance the supply of land in the NDA for different uses (including land for housing development and those reserved for commercial use in order to create employment opportunities).

42. The Chairman reminded members to focus their discussion on subjects related to the HSK/HT NDA project. On wider questions of economic



development and industrial policy, members might raise them at a relevant Panel.

Accommodating the affected business undertakings

43. The Deputy Chairman enquired whether the first batch of MSBs to be completed under the First Phase development of HSK/HT NDA would be mainly used for accommodating the brownfield operations affected by the NDA project. Moreover, he enquired whether the Administration would provide financial compensation for affected business undertakings reluctant to continue with the operation, and set a reasonable threshold for admission into MSBs, so as to achieve more efficient use of land resources and prevent abuse of such MSB units. The Deputy Chairman also requested the Administration to provide the details of the market sounding exercise to be conducted on MSBs and invite the trades to participate in the exercise to enable them to better understand how the Administration would promote the industrial and technological development in HSK/HT NDA.

44. Mr WU Chi-wai opined that the above market sounding exercise should include studies on the industrial development of Hong Kong to ensure that MSBs could provide the space required by business undertakings for their operation amidst the future ups and downs of different industries. However, it would be difficult for the exercise to cover the studies on industrial development if it was designed to be a survey with limited scope. In this connection, Mr WU enquired about the cost required for conducting the above exercise. On the other hand, Mr CHU Hoi-dick enquired whether the Administration's brownfield policy included preventing the continuous proliferation of brownfield sites.

45. Mr Holden CHOW supported the Administration's resumption of land and development of relevant facilities through the First Phase development of HSK/HT NDA to help accommodate and rehouse the business undertakings and residents affected by the clearance exercise for the NDA development. He enquired about the industry mix of the about 670 business undertakings affected by the NDA project and whether the proposed MSBs for brownfield operations could accommodate all these affected business undertakings; if not, how the Administration would assist those business undertakings that could not move into MSBs.

46. Mr Abraham SHEK opined that it would be difficult for the consultant engaged to conduct the market sounding exercise to put forward recommendations that could address the economic needs of Hong Kong unless the Administration had a clear industrial policy in place and provided clear guidelines. As he saw it, market force alone was not sufficient to spearhead

industrial development, and the Administration should assume a guidance role for the market. Mr SHEK requested that the Administration should explain to members its industrial policy when submitting the funding proposals to FC, and report to the relevant LegCo Panel the preliminary findings of the market sounding exercise before completion of the report of the exercise by the consultant. Ms Alice MAK was concerned whether the mode of operation of MSBs could meet the operational needs of business undertakings, such as whether the rental could be kept at a low level. On the other hand, Mr LUK Chung-hung enquired whether the Administration would consider providing land in the NDA at affordable prices and rents to promote the industrial development of Hong Kong, such as providing government-developed MSBs and sites for logistics facilities.

47. PS(P&L)/DEVB responded that the Administration's brownfield site policy was to concentrate brownfield operations within areas compliant with the respective uses of the land use zones. In the light of the findings of the Study on Existing Profile and Operations of Brownfield Sites in the New Territories released earlier, the Planning Department had promulgated the revised planning guidelines known as the "Town Planning Board Guidelines for Application for Open Storage and Port Back-up Uses under Section 16 of the Town Planning Ordinance" to guide the brownfield operations to designated areas in order to prevent the proliferation of brownfield sites. Eligible brownfield operators displaced by the Government's land development projects would be provided with financial compensation. Moreover, for operators in search of private land suitable for relocating their operations, the Administration would provide assistance from the planning and lands perspective, and identify suitable government sites for temporary uses that would be put up for auction among the affected operators and leased to them by short-term tenancies.

48. PS(P&L)/DEVB further said that there were about 246 ha of brownfield sites (which translated to more than 2 million m<sup>2</sup> in terms of floor area) within HSK/HT NDA. Of the affected brownfield operations, logistics, construction, port back-up, general warehousing and vehicle repairing etc. occupied about 65, 42, 39, 28 and 19 ha of land respectively. About 61 ha of land (which translated to more than 3 million m<sup>2</sup> in terms of floor area) had been reserved in the NDA for uses such as logistics facilities, port back-up, storage and workshop, including MSBs for accommodating the brownfield operations. Hence, there was sufficient space in the NDA to make up for the lost floor area of the brownfield operations.

49. PS(P&L)/DEVB added that MSBs mentioned above would be developed in phases. The site formation works for constructing the first batch of MSBs, which consisted of three buildings and covered a land area of about

8 ha, would be completed during the First Phase development of HSK/HT NDA, so that MSBs would be ready to cater for needs arising from, among others, the brownfield operations affected by the Second Phase development of NDA. For two reasons, however, it was expected that not all brownfield operations affected by the NDA project could move into MSBs. Firstly, as the first batch of MSBs mentioned above would be completed in 2027 the soonest, the business undertakings affected by the NDA project before the completion date of the MSBs concerned would not be able to move into such buildings immediately upon demolition of their existing premises. Secondly, some affected business undertakings might not fit in with MSBs even after completion of such buildings owing to the nature of their operations (e.g. operations with heavy construction machineries in place).

50. PS(P&L)/DEVB then pointed out that since the first batch of MSB sites to be formed in HSK/HT NDA were expected to be ready in 2023, the Administration must finalize the development direction for those MSBs by 2022 the latest. To that end, the Administration was making preparations to launch a market sounding exercise shortly using its internal resources, so as to ascertain the market interest towards developing and running MSBs mainly for brownfield businesses. The consultancy fees concerned amounted to some \$1 million. The consultant engaged would conduct surveys and communicate with market investors and stakeholders on a number of issues, including the rental of MSBs, their spatial distribution for meeting the needs of different economic activities, and the possibility of renting part of the floor area of MSBs to brownfield operators affected by the NDA projects on a priority basis. Based on the survey findings and the latest economic conditions, the consultant would put forward recommendations that would address the needs of the business undertakings for the Administration's consideration. At the current stage, the Administration did not preclude the adoption of any models for taking forward the MSB development, and it would make timely report to the relevant LegCo Panel. As regards the industrial and technological development in HSK/HT NDA in a longer term (including the about 9 ha of land reserved for enterprise and technology park uses in the NDA and development of MSBs under the Second Phase development), DEVB would further consider the relevant arrangement and the schedule of implementation together with relevant bureaux, including the Innovation and Technology Bureau.

51. The Deputy Chairman considered the progress of the project too slow with limited effect on local industrial and technological development if the trades could set up operations in HSK/HT NDA only after completion of its Second Phase development, which would not come to fruition until many years later. As he saw it, the Administration should adopt a balanced approach between addressing the needs of affected brownfield operations and pursuing

the potential benefits of facilitating the trades' industrial and technological development when it considered the list of tenants to be admitted into the first batch of MSBs. Moreover, the Administration should assist the brownfield operations concerned in achieving industrial upgrading. Mr WU Chi-wai requested the Administration to provide written information on the survey scope of the aforesaid market sounding exercise.

*(Post-meeting note: The written response of the Administration was circulated to members vide [LC Paper No. PWSC174/19-20\(01\)](#) (Chinese version only) on 16 June 2020.)*

52. Mr WU Chi-wai was concerned about the accommodation arrangement for the 29 business undertakings that were affected by the First Phase development of HSK/HT NDA before the completion of MSBs. PS(P&L)/DEVB said that according to the Administration's preliminary assessment, five out of the 29 affected business undertakings were considered ineligible for ex-gratia allowances for reasons such as being situated in unlawfully occupied land. For the other eligible business undertakings that occupied about 10 ha of land, the amount of ex-gratia allowances granted could be determined only after completion of the vetting process.

53. Given that many container vehicles were currently parked on brownfield sites, Ms Claudia MO enquired whether such container vehicles (especially the 45-foot-long ones) could be parked in MSBs for accommodating brownfield operations after the brownfield sites were resumed for other development purposes, and where they could be parked legally before the completion of MSBs.

54. PS(P&L)/DEVB responded that container vehicles could be parked on land compliant with town planning requirements and the land uses specified in the land lease. At present, there were some 500 ha of land in the New Territories located in land use zones in which open storage and port back-up uses were permitted. A site could also be converted for other land uses on application to the Town Planning Board under the statutory mechanism. Moreover, using a site for storage of objects did not by itself constitute a breach of lease conditions for an old scheduled agriculture lot if no structures were erected. However, since open-air operations were not an efficient way to use land resources, the Administration would seek to accommodate these open-air operations in MSBs when planning the NDA development. It was technically possible to provide parking spaces for container vehicles within purpose-built MSBs, and such MSBs could currently be found near the Kwai Tsing Container Terminals.

Rehousing the affected residents and other facilities

55. Mr Andrew WAN was concerned whether the completion schedule of DRE under the First Phase development of HSK/HT NDA could tie in with the rehousing arrangements for affected residents.

56. PS(P&L)/DEVB replied that the above DRE was mainly used for rehousing residents affected by the HSK/HT NDA project. It would be developed in two phases and would provide about 2 100 units in total. About 1 300 units would be delivered under the First Phase, which was expected to be completed progressively between 2024 and 2025. The units provided would be sufficient to provide rehousing for the around 1 000 households affected by the Second Phase development of HSK/HT NDA from 2024 onwards.

57. Dr CHENG Chung-tai noted that DRE, which would be developed and managed by the Hong Kong Housing Society ("HKHS"), would provide both public rental housing ("PRH") units and subsidized sale flats ("SSFs"). He enquired about the respective numbers of PRH units and SSFs that would be reserved by HKHS in DRE for the local rehousing of residents affected by the HSK/HT NDA project.

58. PS(P&L)/DEVB responded that DRE would adopt a flexible design to enable HKHS to use the units for either rental or sale purpose according to the preference of the households concerned. However, since the eligibility vetting process for affected households and gauging of their rehousing preference would only be carried out when the Administration implemented each phase of the DRE development, only a rough estimate could be provided by HKHS at this stage of the split between PRH units and SSFs, i.e. 30%-40% of the units would be used for PRH units and 60%-70% would be used for SSFs.

59. Mr Andrew WAN enquired about the size and the rental/selling price of PRH units and SSFs provided by DRE. PS(P&L)/DEVB replied that since the affected household could opt for non-means tested rehousing in PRH units of DRE, they were required to pay rents chargeable at HKHS's prevailing Group B standard. However, in view of the suggestion made by LegCo Members earlier that HKHS should allow affected households which had passed the means test to be rehoused to DRE at lower rents chargeable at HKHS's prevailing Group A standard, the Administration was in discussion with HKHS on the relevant arrangement and was met with positive feedback from HKHS. As regards SSFs, the selling price generally mirrored that of the Home Ownership Scheme flats.

60. Mr LAU Kwok-fan enquired whether the residents affected by the HSK/HT NDA project were offered the option of applying for units in public housing estates in the district apart from being offered rehousing in DRE, as in the case of residents affected by the KTN/FLN NDA project. On the other hand, Ms Alice MAK enquired whether the residents affected by the First Phase development of HSK/HT NDA could be rehoused to DRE seamlessly. Mr WU Chi-wai was also concerned about the rehousing arrangement for residents affected by the First Phase development of HSK/HT NDA.

61. PS(P&L)/DEVB explained that while it was the Administration's policy that allocation of units in public housing estates should be subject to a means test, eligible affected residents were offered a non-means tested rehousing option in DRE. Eligible affected residents would also be provided with non-means tested transitional housing arrangement in public housing estates in the district pending the completion of DRE. Before completion of DRE under the HSK/HT NDA project in 2024, about six households affected by the First Phase development of NDA would have to move out between 2020 and 2021. If eligible, these households could be admitted to public housing estates in the district as a transitional arrangement. The households concerned might consider moving into DRE after its completion.

62. Mr WU Chi-wai enquired whether the Administration had undertaken freezing surveys for the whole area covered by the HSK/HT NDA project and whether the scope of NDA would need to be adjusted in the future. He was also concerned whether the issues related to the compensation for landowners affected by the First Phase development of HSK/HT NDA had been resolved.

63. Mr LEUNG Che-cheung urged the Administration to reach consensus on land resumption with stakeholders affected by the First Phase development of HSK/HT NDA as early as possible. He was particularly concerned about the reprovisioning arrangement for the cement works affected. He also enquired whether the Administration would compensate the affected landowners reasonably by offering other subsidies to them in addition to the compensation based on the rate of ex-gratia allowance for Zone A agricultural land upon resumption of the land for development of HSK/HT NDA.

64. PS(P&L)/DEVB responded that the Administration had not yet commenced work related to compensation and rehousing for the HSK/HT NDA project because the current funding proposals were still subject to FC's approval. That said, the Administration already undertook a freezing survey for the whole area covered by the NDA in 2017 and had also begun to reach out to the affected persons and verify their eligibility. As the detailed design work for the Second Phase development of HSK/HT NDA (which was part of the proposed project) was yet to commence, the Administration might

need to adjust the boundary of NDA and conduct supplementary freezing surveys in the light of the future outcome of the detailed design. Moreover, landowners generally welcomed the Administration's approach of calculating the land resumption compensation under the simpler ex-gratia compensation mechanism. Nevertheless, affected landowners might make a claim for statutory compensation if they did not accept the ex-gratia compensation offer made by the Administration.

65. Mr Andrew WAN was concerned about the granting arrangement of the cost of rehousing the 12 graves and 82 urns affected by the clearance exercise for the First Phase development of HSK/HT NDA and the related "Tun Fu" ceremonial fees. Chief Estate Surveyor (New Development Area), Lands Department, said that the Administration would issue to the affected parties the ex-gratia allowances for relocation of graves and urns and for the "Tun Fu" ceremonial fees in accordance with the established mechanism.

#### Transport support

66. Mr Micahel TIEN enquired whether the Administration would implement the proposed project of artificial islands around Kau Yi Chau ("KYC") to enable the development of a new cross-harbour railway connecting NWNT, the KYC artificial islands and Hong Kong Island, so as to relieve the increasingly severe crowdedness of the West Rail Line following the implementation of multiple development projects in NWNT (including HSK/HT NDA); if so, about the progress of the project (e.g. the timetable of submitting the funding application for the studies related to artificial islands); if not, whether the cross-harbour railway would still be developed and whether the studies related to the cross-harbour railway could be established as a separate proposal for seeking funding approval from FC. Mr Andrew WAN expressed similar concerns and enquired about the progress of the feasibility study on Route 11 (between North Lantau and Yuen Long) ("Route 11"), the planned external trunk road for NWNT.

67. PS(P&L)/DEVB replied that the Administration had conducted the traffic impact assessment for HSK/HT NDA during the planning of NDA. The assessment findings revealed that the existing and planned transport infrastructure had the capacity to cope with the traffic load arising from the NDA. In order to tie in with the inflow of more residents to HSK/HT NDA from 2030 onwards, the signalling system of the West Rail Line would be improved in advance. Moreover, in view of the various proposed development projects in NWNT (e.g. Lung Kwu Tan reclamation and the re-planning of Tuen Mun West area, and public housing development at some brownfield sites), the Administration would re-assess the external railway connection of NWNT. The Transport and Housing Bureau would also

explore the long-range development directions for Hong Kong's road and railway networks under the Hong Kong 2030+ study.

68. PS(P&L)/DEVB further said that the funding proposal for the studies related to the artificial islands in the Central Waters, which included an engineering study to ascertain the feasibility of rail links connecting the coastal areas of Tuen Mun, Lantau, the KYC artificial islands and Hong Kong Island, was examined and endorsed by PWSC earlier, and it would be included in the meeting agenda of FC upon thorough consideration of the overall priorities attached to all funding proposals. The Administration had no plan to establish the engineering feasibility study for the above railway project as a separate proposal. However, it remained the Administration's target to submit the funding application for the studies related to the artificial islands in the Central Waters to FC for consideration within the current legislative session.

69. Regarding the feasibility study on Route 11, Principal Assistant Secretary for Transport and Housing (Transport)<sup>7</sup> said that the study was underway and the study team was refining the project design in order to establish its engineering feasibility. As regards the transport feasibility, it was expected that Route 11, after its commissioning, could cope with the additional vehicular flow arising from the various development projects in NWNT (including HSK/HT NDA).

70. The Chairman advised that the funding proposal for the studies related to the artificial islands in the Central Waters was endorsed by the Subcommittee on 25 May 2019 and was now awaiting consideration by FC. He also suggested that members might follow up on matters related to the new cross-harbour railway at the meetings of the Panel on Transport.

71. In view of the importance of Tin Ying Road as a trunk road in Tin Shui Wai ("TSW"), Mr Andrew WAN urged the Administration to retain the road when developing the Environmentally Friendly Transport Services in HSK/HT NDA. Ms Alice MAK made similar comments. Mr LUK Chung-hung was concerned about the progress of the review of the possibility of re-provisioning Tin Ying Road around its current location.

72. PS(P&L)/DEVB and DCED replied that Tin Ying Road, which was built next to the TSW River Channel on elevated embankments, would undermine the connectivity between the communities of HSK/HT NDA and TSW in the future. In view of this, the Administration had originally planned to replace Tin Ying Road through improving other roads. However, in the light of the comments received from the public and LegCo Members, the possibility of re-provisioning Tin Ying Road around its current location would be examined under the detailed design for works of the Second Phase



development and the related studies, while consideration would be given to how the connectivity between the communities of HSK/HT NDA and TSW could be improved and how the urban design along the TSW River Channel could be enhanced.

73. Dr CHENG Chung-tai relayed the concern of Yuen Long District Council about the traffic impact on the district arising from HSK/HT NDA and the development at Kam Tin South, Yuen Long. As DRE of HSK/HT NDA would be built using the modular integrated construction method, Dr CHENG was concerned whether the transportation of the prefabricated modules to the construction site of DRE would increase the traffic load in the district.

74. PS(P&L)/DEVB and DCED responded that HKHS had taken into account the transportation arrangement of the prefabricated modules and had coordinated with the relevant government departments when it decided to build DRE using the modular integrated construction method. Furthermore, there were other projects in Hong Kong that were also built using the modular integrated construction method, such as the Disciplined Services Quarters for the Fire Services Department at Pak Shing Kok, Tseung Kwan O. The Administration therefore believed that HKHS and the trades could handle the transportation of the prefabricated modules during the construction of DRE without profoundly affecting the traffic in the district.

Voting on PWSC(2019-20)24

75. At 12:09 pm, members raised no further questions on the item. Due to a lack of quorum, the Chairman directed that members be summoned. At 12:10 pm, a quorum was present for the Subcommittee to proceed to making a decision on the funding proposal. The Chairman then put [PWSC\(2019-20\)24](#) to vote. At the request of members, the Chairman ordered a division. Twelve members voted for the proposal, eleven members voted against it and no member abstained. The votes of individual members were as follows:

*For:*

Mr Abraham SHEK	Mr CHAN Hak-kan
Mr Michael TIEN	Mr Frankie YICK
Mr MA Fung-kiwok	Mr CHAN Han-pan
Mr LEUNG Che-cheung	Ms Alice MAK
Mr HO Kai-ming	Mr LUK Chung-hung
Mr LAU Kwok-fan	Mr Tony TSE
(12 members)	

*Against:*

Mr Charles Peter MOK (Deputy Chairman)	Ms Claudia MO
--	---------------

Mr WU Chi-wai  
Dr Helena WONG  
Mr Andrew WAN  
Ms Tanya CHAN  
Mr Jeremy TAM  
(11 members)

Mr CHAN Chi-chuen  
Mr Alvin YEUNG  
Mr CHU Hoi-dick  
Dr CHENG Chung-tai

*Abstained:*  
(0 member)

76. The Chairman declared that the item was endorsed by the Subcommittee. The Chairman consulted members on whether the item would require separate voting at the relevant FC meeting. Mr WU Chi-wai requested separate voting on the item (i.e. [PWSC\(2019-20\)24](#)) at the relevant FC meeting.

**Head 703 — Buildings**

**PWSC(2019-20)25 75RE Expansion of Hong Kong Science Museum and Hong Kong Museum of History**

**Head 708 — Capital Subventions and Major Systems and Equipment**

**54QJ New facilities building of the Hong Kong Sports Institute**

77. The Chairman advised that the proposal (i.e. [PWSC\(2019-20\)25](#)) sought to upgrade part of 75RE (i.e. pre-construction activities for the expansion of Hong Kong Science Museum ("HKScM") and Hong Kong Museum of History ("HKMH")) and part of 54QJ (i.e. pre-construction activities for the new facilities building of the Hong Kong Sports Institute ("HKSI")) to Category A at the estimated costs of \$72.8 million and \$54.7 million in MOD prices respectively. The Government had consulted the Panel on Home Affairs on the above two projects on 9 December 2019. Panel members raised no objection to the Government submitting the funding proposals to the Subcommittee for consideration. A report on the gist of the Panel's discussion was tabled at the meeting.

78. The Deputy Chairman opined that it was an undesirable arrangement for the Administration to combine the funding proposals for the pre-construction activities for both the expansion of HKScM and HKMH and the new facilities building of HKSI into one agenda item as it had diminished the time available to members to speak and raise questions on each of the two funding proposals.

Expansion of Hong Kong Science Museum and Hong Kong Museum of History

79. Ms Claudia MO enquired whether the Administration would seek to achieve the maximum development parameters (e.g. the building height restriction) when expanding HKMH, so as to provide it with sufficient space and headroom for display of sizable exhibits and obviate the need of further expansion in the future.

80. Under Secretary for Home Affairs ("USHA") said that the Administration would use a reserved site of around 1 900 m<sup>2</sup> (Site 1) and an open space of around 7 600 m<sup>2</sup> (Site 2) located outside HKScM and HKMH for the expansion of the two museums. Maximum development parameters had been achieved at the two sites to provide sufficient space and headroom in HKMH for display of sizable exhibits after the expansion. Moreover, the Administration would use the proposed expansion as an opportunity to enhance the accessibility of the museum complex and provide open space allowing 24- hour public access within the museum precinct. The open space concerned took up about 40% of the site area of the whole complex.

81. Mr Jeremy TAM enquired about the respective site areas used for the expansion of HKScM and HKMH at Site 1 and Site 2, and whether HKScM would enjoy a larger increase in floor area than HKMH under the Administration's plan. Mr TAM opined that the Administration should first ascertain the additional floor areas required respectively by HKScM and HKMH and the uses of the additional floor areas before implementing the proposed expansion. He also requested the Administration to provide an artist's impression of the expanded HKScM and HKMH.

82. Deputy Director of Architectural Services ("DDArchS") responded that the Architectural Services Department ("ArchSD") would plan the uses of Site 1 and Site 2 based on the requirements of the Leisure and Cultural Services Department ("LCSD") for facilities at HKScM and HKMH. Under the current plan, Site 2, which was larger in area, might be used for the expansion of HKScM and Site 1, which was smaller, might be used for the expansion of HKMH. Both sites would have facilities for shared-use between them. ArchSD would be able to ascertain the floor areas that could be added to the two museums only after completing the detailed design of the expansion. For the sake of avoiding work duplication, ArchSD would first conduct the preliminary studies relating to the pre-construction activities for the expansion of HKScM and HKMH through internal manpower deployment. Other tasks (e.g. undergoing detailed design and preparing an artist's impression) would be carried out after consultants were engaged. For that reason, the Administration was unable to provide an artist's impression at this stage.

83. USHA supplemented that the proposed expansion was expected to bring about an increase in gross floor area by about 28 000 m<sup>2</sup>, among which 15 000 m<sup>2</sup> was usable floor area (including 7 800 m<sup>2</sup> for staging exhibitions and 2 700 m<sup>2</sup> for education facilities). In view of the different spatial requirements for development of the two museums (e.g. the need of HKScM to provide additional education facilities), it was expected that the floor area added to HKScM through the proposed expansion would be more than that added to HKMH.

84. Dr Helena WONG said that for the sake of enhancing the accessibility of HKScM and HKMH, she had suggested earlier that the Administration should extend the footbridge network of Tsim Sha Tsui East connecting to Hung Hom Railway Station to the two museums through implementing the proposed expansion. Dr WONG requested the Administration to respond to her suggestion. Dr WONG also enquired whether the Administration would provide more public parking spaces for private cars and tourist coaches for use by individual and group visitors within the precinct of the two museums through implementing the proposed expansion.

85. USHA and DDArchS responded that the Administration attached great importance to how the accessibility of HKScM and HKMH could be enhanced. To that end, space would be reserved within the precinct of the two museums for connection to the footbridge network connecting to Hung Hom Railway Station, and the two museums would be designed in a way that supported this purpose. Related matters would also be explored with other relevant government departments at the detailed design stage of the proposed expansion. As for parking spaces, the Administration had no current or future plans to provide public parking spaces for private cars within the precinct of the two museums in view of the ample supply of private car parking spaces in many car parks in the vicinity. On the other hand, in view of the large number of group visitors who would visit the two museums in the future, the Administration planned to increase the number of parking spaces for tourist coaches from the current three to the future 10 through implementing the proposed expansion and retain the six lay-bys for tourist coaches.

86. Dr Helena WONG was dissatisfied that the Administration had not taken her suggestion seriously and had only reserved space for the future works to connect to the footbridge. She urged the Administration to give a clear account of how the footbridge connection works would be taken forward when it submitted the related funding proposal to FC. USHA undertook that the Administration would look into Dr WONG' suggestion.

87. Mr WU Chi-wai enquired about the operational arrangements of HKScM and HKMH during implementation of the proposed expansion. Assistant Director of Leisure and Cultural Services (Heritage and Museums) ("AD(HM)/LCSD") said that owing to the large scale of the construction works, the proposed expansion would be implemented in phases to allow the continuous operation of HKScM and HKMH with partial opening/partial closure arrangements in place. LCSD would finalize the details of the arrangements concerned after completion of the detailed design of the proposed expansion.

88. Ms Claudia MO and Mr WU Chi-wai were concerned whether the upper piazza outside HKScM and HKMH would be retained, modified or demolished after the expansion of the two museums. DDArchS and AD(HM)/LCSD replied that expansion works would be carried out at the present location of the tourist coach lay-bys within the museum precinct. The upper piazza would be retained and continue to be used as public open space. However, it was hoped that the proposed expansion could enhance its accessibility as it was rather underutilized.

#### Exhibitions and activities staged at Hong Kong Science Museum and Hong Kong Museum of History

89. Ms Tanya CHAN was concerned that many existing exhibits at HKScM were outdated, and HKMH did not cater for the presentation of large-scale exhibitions with sizable exhibits as its existing exhibition gallery was only 980 m<sup>2</sup> in size with headroom of only 3.3 m. In this connection, she enquired about exhibitions that had been prevented from being staged at HKMH previously owing to the space and headroom limits; what exhibitions that were impossible to stage previously were planned to be staged after the expansion of the two museums so as to attract visitors; and the theme and cost of such exhibitions.

90. USHA and Museum Director (Museum of History), LCSD ("MD(MH)/LCSD"), explained that in view of the many constraints of HKScM and HKMH in terms of space and setting, expansion was required for their services to be enhanced. A case in point was HKMH's past exhibitions of artefacts from the Palace Museum of Beijing and the Russian court, during which the sizable exhibits had to be displayed at the main lobby due to the headroom limit of the exhibition gallery, thereby dampening the impact. It would become possible for HKMH to display sizable exhibits in its exhibition gallery after completion of the proposed expansion. USHA added that the Administration attached great importance to members' comments regarding the exhibits of HKScM that had been raised on other occasions of LegCo and had regularly updated such exhibits. HKScM also planned to stage a series of

exhibitions that were attractive to visitors. These included an exhibition by the Science Museum in London to be held in December this year on the 500-year evolution of robots, a science exhibition on Pixar's animation to be held from June to October next year in collaboration with the Museum of Science, Boston, and an exhibition on the wonders of the human body to be held in December next year in collaboration with the American Museum of Natural History.

91. The Deputy Chairman enquired whether the Administration would draw insights from science museums overseas and stage diverse and participant-engaging activities for science popularization at HKScM after the expansion in place of the current approach of one-way display of exhibits. The Deputy Chairman also enquired about the impact on the design, manpower arrangement and estimated expenditure of HKScM should the above interactive elements be introduced.

92. USHA replied that the Administration strived to introduce new educational and interactive elements to HKScM. To that end, HKScM would be provided with facilities such as innovative experiential centres, learning centres and outdoor interactive exhibition areas in addition to its exhibition space after the expansion to provide visitors with better interactive experience. AD(HM)/LCSD supplemented that since the exhibition space of HKScM would be doubled after the expansion, its manpower should also be increased correspondingly. LCSD would provide information on the increase in manpower of HKScM when submitting the funding proposal to FC for the main expansion works in the future.

93. Mr CHAN Han-pan welcomed the Administration's plan to expand HKScM. He enquired whether HKScM would collaborate with enterprises in the Hong Kong Science Park and local universities by providing space for them to display or sell their products, so as to enable members of the public to have first-hand experience of them and support local technological development.

94. USHA responded that HKScM would stage more Science, Technology, Engineering and Mathematics ("STEM")-related education programmes after the expansion to enhance students' understanding of the subject. In addition, LCSD set up a Science Promotion Unit last year to promote knowledge of science through the use of LCSD's facilities. AD(HM)/LCSD supplemented that at present, HKScM mainly focused on popularizing the basics of science among children and families. After expansion, the additional space could be used for showcasing more of the country's and local scientific achievements and providing platforms for different parties to publicize their scientific findings and exchange with one another.

95. Mr HO Kai-ming was concerned how HKMH would work more closely with schools (e.g. whether visits to HKMH could be organized for primary school students once a year) to enable students to understand the history of Hong Kong correctly. Mr HO also enquired whether the Administration would develop online-merge-offline museum services through implementing the proposed expansion, such as beefing up the content of the website of HKMH and introducing augmented reality technology and interactive games to its exhibitions. Mr WU Chi-wai also enquired whether HKScM and HKMH would introduce virtual reality ("VR") technology to its exhibitions to provide visitors with improved interactive experience.

96. USHA said that HKScM and HKMH currently received some 1.1 million and 900,000 visitors a year respectively, among which many were group visitors from schools. The Administration intended to attract more visitors by implementing the expansion and making visits to the museums more interesting. Moreover, LCSD's museums had introduced new technologies such as VR and interactive features to its exhibitions in recent years, such as Eternal Life—Exploring Ancient Egypt, Animated Version of the Riverside Scene at Qingming Festival and Digital Dunhuang—Tales of Heaven and Earth. MD(MH)/LCSD supplemented that HKMH had been collaborating with schools, including organizing student visits to HKMH under the School Culture Day Scheme. Through the proposed expansion, HKMH would also be provided with additional education facilities, such as learning centres and activities rooms where students could attend briefings and participate in educational activities while visiting *The Hong Kong Story* permanent exhibition, so as to enrich their learning experience.

### The Chinese and English names of Hong Kong Science Museum

97. Ms Claudia MO noticed that the Chinese and English names of HKScM, which was known as "香港科學館" in Chinese and "Hong Kong Science Museum" in English, did not tally. She enquired whether the Administration would consider unifying the names of HKScM in the two languages by adopting the pairing of "香港科學博物館/Hong Kong Science Museum" or "香港科學館/Hong Kong Science Centre".

98. Museum Director (Science Museum), LCSD, explained the background to the matter and pointed out that when HKScM was conceptualized by the former Urban Council more than three decades ago, it was intended to be a museum focused on display of exhibits on sciences. After referring to the experience of science museums overseas, the positioning of HKScM had shifted to focus more on hands-on exhibits which emphasized

multi-sensory experience for visitors through hands-on interactions. Meanwhile, the characters "博物", which carried a museological tone, were dropped from the Chinese name to become "香港科學館", a more generic term for a facility with a science theme that indeed conveyed a slightly different meaning from the English name. Looking forward, HKScM planned to present exhibits on both natural history and local technological development in a more comprehensive manner with the additional space available after the expansion.

99. The Chairman said that the Subcommittee would continue to discuss this item at the next meeting. The meeting ended at 1:00 pm.

Council Business Division 1  
Legislative Council Secretariat  
19 June 2020