

立法會
Legislative Council

LC Paper No. CB(4)398/19-20
(These minutes have been
cleared with the Chairman)

Ref : CB4/PL/AJLS

Panel on Administration of Justice and Legal Services

Minutes of meeting
held on Monday, 25 November 2019, at 4:30 pm
in Conference Room 1 of the Legislative Council Complex

Members present : Dr Hon Priscilla LEUNG Mei-fun, SBS, JP (Chairman)
Hon James TO Kun-sun
Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, GBS, JP
Hon Tommy CHEUNG Yu-yan, GBS, JP
Hon Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung, GBS, JP
Hon WONG Ting-kwong, GBS, JP
Hon CHAN Kin-por, GBS, JP
Hon Mrs Regina IP LAU Suk-yeet, GBS, JP
Hon Paul TSE Wai-chun, JP
Hon Claudia MO
Hon Steven HO Chun-yin, BBS
Hon WU Chi-wai, MH
Hon YIU Si-wing, BBS
Hon CHAN Chi-chuen
Hon CHAN Han-pan, BBS, JP
Hon LEUNG Che-cheung, SBS, MH, JP
Dr Hon KWOK Ka-ki
Hon KWOK Wai-keung, JP
Hon Christopher CHEUNG Wah-fung, SBS, JP
Dr Hon Helena WONG Pik-wan
Hon Elizabeth QUAT, BBS, JP
Hon Martin LIAO Cheung-kong, GBS, JP
Hon POON Siu-ping, BBS, MH
Dr Hon CHIANG Lai-wan, SBS, JP
Ir Dr Hon LO Wai-kwok, SBS, MH, JP
Hon Alvin YEUNG

Hon Jimmy NG Wing-ka, BBS, JP
Hon LAM Cheuk-ting
Hon Holden CHOW Ho-ding
Hon SHIU Ka-chun
Hon Wilson OR Chong-shing, MH
Hon CHAN Chun-ying, JP
Hon Tanya CHAN
Hon CHUNG Kwok-pan
Hon CHEUNG Kwok-kwan, JP
Hon LAU Kwok-fan, MH
Hon AU Nok-hin

Members absent : Hon Dennis KWOK Wing-hang (Deputy Chairman)
Prof Hon Joseph LEE Kok-long, SBS, JP
Hon WONG Kwok-kin, SBS, JP
Hon Charles Peter MOK, JP
Dr Hon Fernando CHEUNG Chiu-hung
Hon IP Kin-yuen
Hon CHU Hoi-dick
Hon Junius HO Kwan-yiu, JP
Hon YUNG Hoi-yan, JP
Hon HUI Chi-fung
Hon KWONG Chun-yu
Hon Jeremy TAM Man-ho
Hon Gary FAN Kwok-wai

Clerk in attendance : Mr Lemuel WOO
Chief Council Secretary (4)6

Staff in attendance : Mr Matthew LOO
Assistant Secretary General 4

Mr YICK Wing-kin
Senior Assistant Legal Adviser 2

Mr Ambrose LEUNG
Senior Council Secretary (4)6

Miss Katherine CHAN
Council Secretary (4)6

Miss Winnie CHENG
Senior Legislative Assistant (4)1

Ms Carmen HO
Senior Legislative Assistant (4)2

Miss Emma CHEUNG
Senior Legislative Assistant (4)3

Miss Ariel SHUM
Legislative Assistant (4)3

Ms Emily LIU
Legislative Assistant (4)6

Miss Vivian YUEN
Legislative Assistant (4)8

Action

I. Election of Chairman and Deputy Chairman

Mr James TO presided over the meeting. Mr TO explained to members that since Mr Dennis KWOK, the Deputy Chairman of the Panel on Administration of Justice and Legal Services ("the Panel") for the 2018-2019 session who presided over the election of Chairman of the Panel for the 2019-2020 session at the previous two meetings, was absent from the present meeting, he would preside over the election in accordance with paragraph 2(b) in Appendix IV to the House Rules as the member present having the highest precedence among the members not nominated for the office of the Chairman.

2. Mr James TO recapitulated that when the last Panel meeting held on 28 October 2019 was adjourned, a total number of 11 nominations for the chairmanship of the Panel had been validly made. Since then, Mr CHU Hoi-dick was elected Deputy Chairman of the Panel on Manpower at its meeting on 29 October 2019 and, according to Rule 77(7) of the Rules of Procedure, Mr CHU shall not be chairman of the Panel at the same time. Mr TO further said that as himself had informed the Clerk of his decision to withdraw his nomination for the chairmanship on 22 November 2019 (LC Paper No CB(4)140/19-20(01) issued on 22 November 2019), the number of valid nominations had reduced to nine as follows:

Action

Dr Priscilla LEUNG
Mr CHAN Chi-chuen
Mr HUI Chi-fung
Mr Jeremy TAM
Ms Tanya CHAN
Mr Gary FAN
Dr Fernando CHEUNG
Prof Joseph LEE
Dr KWOK Ka-ki

3. Mr James TO then called for further nominations. There being no further nomination made by members, Mr TO announced that the nomination procedure closed and the above nine members validly nominated for the chairmanship of the Panel.

4. Ms Tanya CHAN requested that an election forum should be held for candidates to present their election platforms, answer questions from members and make their final responses. Dr KWOK Ka-ki agreed with Ms CHAN that the election forum should comprise three stages. Given the smaller number of candidates nominated for the chairmanship of the Panel as compared to other committees such as the House Committee, he suggested that each candidate should be allotted 10, 20 and 5 minutes for the three stages respectively.

5. Both Mr CHAN Chi-chuen and Mr WU Chi-wai considered that the Panel should take a stringent approach in the election of its Chairman and suggested that reference should be made to the proposed arrangements of election forum considered by the House Committee.

6. Mr James TO ordered that the meeting be suspended for about 20 minutes to facilitate his consideration on the mode of the election forum in consultation with the Clerk.

(The meeting was suspended at 4:52 pm and resumed at 5:24 pm.)

7. Upon resumption of the meeting, Mr James TO invited members to consider two proposed procedural options for the holding of the election forum ("the two options") in the **Appendix** which were distributed for members' consideration at the meeting. Mr TO said that in drawing up the two options, he had taken into account members' views and the relevant options for the holding of election forums considered by various committees including the Finance Committee and the Panel on Security.

Action

8. Mr LAM Cheuk-ting said that the time for candidates to respond to questions from other members was inadequate under either of the two options drawn up by Mr James TO. He suggested that each candidate should be given at least 20 minutes for responding to members' questions and, for those candidates who had fielded questions from a large number of members, 30 to 45 minutes.

9. Mr CHAN Chi-chuen considered that there should be no limit on the number of members to raise questions with the candidates. He also suggested that each candidate could separately be given 10 minutes of "home turf time" to question other candidates and to further elaborate their platforms.

10. Both Mr CHAN Chi-chuen and Mr AU Nok-hin pointed out that, if all members were to ask questions and each was directed at all the nine candidates, the time for each candidate to respond would be 10 minutes so that the total time for response would be 90 minutes. Mr James TO agreed that, in the extreme scenario, the maximum time of the election forum under Option B could be up to 206 minutes.

11. Mr James TO said that in the light of the time constraint, it was not feasible for members to come to a conclusion on the procedure of conducting the election forum during the remainder of the meeting. He directed that the Clerk should brief the Deputy Chairman or the member presiding at the next Panel meeting on the two options and members' views on them, with a view to coming up with an agreement on the procedure for conducting the election forum.

12. The meeting ended at 5:45 pm.

**Election of the Chairman of the Panel on Administration of Justice
and Legal Services for the 2019-2020 session**

**Proposals on Election Forum
(Number of candidates: nine)**

	Proposal A	Proposal B
Presentation of platforms by candidates	Two minutes for each candidate	Two minutes for each candidate
Questions by members	Each member may have one minute to raise questions to an individual candidate (each candidate may receive question from no more than eight members)	One minute for each member (up to 50 members may raise questions)
Response by candidates	A candidate may have five minutes to make a consolidated response after all the members have raised questions	If questioned by 15 or more members: 10 minutes If questioned by less than 15 members: five minutes
Concluding remark by candidate	Two minutes for each candidate	Two minutes for each candidate
Estimated duration of forum	153 minutes	146 minutes Note: Assuming that three candidates questioned by 15 or more members