

立法會
Legislative Council

LC Paper No. CB(2)1310/19-20

(These minutes have been seen
by the Administration)

Ref : CB2/PL/FE

Panel on Food Safety and Environmental Hygiene

Minutes of meeting
held on Tuesday, 12 May 2020, at 2:30 pm
in Conference Room 3 of the Legislative Council Complex

- Members present** : Hon Tommy CHEUNG Yu-yan, GBS, JP (Chairman)
Dr Hon Helena WONG Pik-wan (Deputy Chairman)
Prof Hon Joseph LEE Kok-long, SBS, JP
Dr Hon Priscilla LEUNG Mei-fun, SBS, JP
Hon Claudia MO
Hon Steven HO Chun-yin, BBS
Hon CHAN Chi-chuen
Dr Hon KWOK Ka-ki
Hon KWOK Wai-keung, JP
Hon Elizabeth QUAT, BBS, JP
Dr Hon CHIANG Lai-wan, SBS, JP
Ir Dr Hon LO Wai-kwok, SBS, MH, JP
Hon CHU Hoi-dick
Hon HO Kai-ming
Hon SHIU Ka-fai, JP
Hon SHIU Ka-chun
Hon Wilson OR Chong-shing, MH
Hon LAU Kwok-fan, MH
Hon Kenneth LAU Ip-keung, BBS, MH, JP
Hon Vincent CHENG Wing-shun, MH, JP
Hon CHAN Hoi-yan
- Members absent** : Hon Andrew WAN Siu-kin
Hon YUNG Hoi-yan, JP
Dr Hon Pierre CHAN
Hon HUI Chi-fung

Public Officers attending : Item III

Dr CHUI Tak-yi, JP
Under Secretary for Food and Health

Miss Erica NG Lai-man, JP
Deputy Secretary for Food and Health (Food) 2

Ms Teresa CHEUNG Shuk-kau
Senior Principal Executive Officer (Food)
Food and Health Bureau

Dr Samuel YEUNG Tze-kiu
Consultant (Community Medicine) (Risk Assessment and
Communication), Centre for Food Safety
Food and Environmental Hygiene Department

Item IV

Dr CHUI Tak-yi, JP
Under Secretary for Food and Health

Mr Gilford LAW Sun-on
Principal Assistant Secretary for Food and Health (Food) 2

Ms Karyn CHAN Ching-yuen
Deputy Director (Administration and Development)
Food and Environmental Hygiene Department

Miss Almaz LEUNG Tsz-ying
Assistant Director (Market Special Duties)
Food and Environmental Hygiene Department

Clerk in attendance : Miss Josephine SO
Chief Council Secretary (2) 2

Staff in attendance : Ms Wendy LO
Senior Council Secretary (2) 2

Mr Clement HAU
Council Secretary (2) 2

Miss Cally LAI
Legislative Assistant (2) 2

I. Information paper issued since the last meeting

Members noted that no information paper had been issued since the last meeting.

II. Date of next meeting and items for discussion

(LC Paper Nos. CB(2)922/19-20(01) and (02))

2. Members agreed to discuss the following items at the next regular meeting scheduled for Tuesday, 9 June 2020 at 2:30 pm:

- (a) Enhancement of the information technology systems and the Food Surveillance Programme of the Centre for Food Safety; and
- (b) Results of the study on pet food products in Hong Kong.

III. Implementation of measures to reduce salt and sugar in food

(LC Paper Nos. CB(2)922/19-20(03) and (04))

3. At the invitation of the Chairman, Under Secretary for Food and Health ("USFH") briefed members on the Administration's progress of implementing measures to reduce salt and sugar in food and the key areas of work in this aspect in 2021, as set out in the Administration's paper (LC Paper No. CB(2)922/19-20(03)). Members noted the background brief prepared by the Legislative Council ("LegCo") Secretariat on the subject (LC Paper No. CB(2)922/19-20(04)).

Promotion of less salt and sugar in food

4. The Deputy Chairman expressed concern whether the Administration had new directions or ideas for promoting salt and sugar reduction in food. She asked whether the Administration would consider her suggestion of adopting in Hong Kong the traffic-light food labelling system implemented by the Government of the United Kingdom (i.e. a voluntary scheme for front-of-pack labelling under which participating manufacturers/retailers used green, amber and red colour coding (commonly known as "traffic lights") to indicate whether levels of nutrients (e.g. fat, saturated fat, sugar and salt) were low, medium or high) which, in her view, was easy to understand and had proven to be useful in helping consumers identify healthier products.

Action

5. USFH responded that in October 2017, the Administration launched the voluntary "Salt/Sugar" Label Scheme for Prepackaged Food Products to help the public easily identify prepackaged food products which could meet the legal definition of "low salt", "no salt", "low sugar" and "no sugar" by label display. At present, the scheme covered more than 210 prepackaged food products. Deputy Secretary for Food and Health (Food) 2 ("DSFH(F)2") said that the Food and Health Bureau ("FHB"), the Centre for Food Safety ("CFS"), the Department of Health ("DH") and the Committee on Reduction of Salt and Sugar in Food ("CRSS") had been promoting salt and sugar reduction through five directions (i.e. starting from an early age, enhancing transparency of information, encouraging restaurants to reduce salt and sugar, reformulation of prepackaged food products, and strengthening publicity and education). She then gave an account of the activities conducted and measures implemented along the five directions in the past few years.

Admin

6. The Deputy Chairman noted that seven chained bakery shops and manufacturers had agreed to participate in the Salt Reduction Scheme, striving to reduce the sodium content in their prepackaged white bread and wholemeal bread through product reformulation. She requested the Administration to revert in writing on whether voluntary sodium reduction targets had been set for the reference of participating bread manufacturers; and if yes, what the targets were.

7. Mr KWOK Wai-keung expressed concern whether targets had been set for reducing salt and sugar intake of Hong Kong people so as to minimize the burden of non-communicable diseases on the public healthcare system. In his view, if general promotion and public education on salt and sugar reduction could not achieve the desired results, consideration should be given to (a) enacting legislation to regulate the salt and sugar contents in food to better safeguard public health and (b) imposing a "sugar tax" on food manufacturers/importers according to the volume of the sugar-sweetened food/drinks they produced or imported. Mr Steven HO shared a similar view. He opined that the Administration should consider imposing certain regulatory control on the sodium and sugar contents in food if the Administration's promotion work could not help change the local dietary culture to a relatively healthier one in five to ten years' time.

8. USFH responded that in May 2018, FHB and DH announced "Towards 2025: Strategy and Action Plan to Prevent and Control Non-communicable Diseases in Hong Kong". The targets included achieving a 30% relative reduction in the mean population daily intake of sodium, halting the rise in diabetes and obesity, and containing the prevalence of raised blood pressure by 2025. To safeguard public health and minimize the burden of non-communicable diseases on the society, relevant departments would continue to take multi-pronged measures to encourage members of the public

Action

to adopt a healthy lifestyle and cultivate a less-salt-and-sugar dietary culture in the community through promotion and publicity. USFH and DSFH(F)2 further said that the Administration noticed that there were diverse views on the international front on the introduction of "sugar tax". Some overseas countries had introduced "sugar tax" in recent years while others had decided not to follow. There were also diverse views in the community over the regulation of sodium and sugar contents in food. The Administration had no plan to impose a "sugar tax" or regulate salt and sugar contents in food by legislative means at the present stage.

9. Prof Joseph LEE enquired whether the Administration would consider requiring manufacturers to list out in details the sodium or sugar contents of prepackaged food products on nutrition labels. Mr KWOK Wai-keung suggested that the Administration should consider making public a list of prepackaged food products/drinks with high salt and sugar contents to alert the public of the risks of these products. USFH responded that the Administration would relay members' suggestion to CRSS.

10. The Chairman opined that the consumption of salty and sweet food was a matter of personal choice. Food manufacturers and restaurants would flexibly adjust the sodium and sugar levels of their food products and dishes having regard to customers'/diners' responses. While measures could be taken to promote a low-salt-low-sugar dietary culture, there was no need for the Administration to enact legislation to regulate the salt and sugar contents in food or require food manufacturers to list out in details the salt and sugar contents on the nutrition labels of prepackaged food products. The Chairman suggested that the Administration should consider organizing more cooking competitions to promote healthy dishes with less oil, salt and sugar.

11. Mr Steven HO noted with concern that the Director of Audit's Report No. 71 (issued in October 2018) had pointed out that the number of signatories of the "Reduce Salt, Sugar, Oil. We Do" Charter (implemented by CFS) remained low. He enquired about the measures to be taken by the Administration and CRSS for promoting the less-salt-and-sugar culture and enlisting support from the food trade.

12. DSFH(F)2 responded that since the Administration launched the Less-salt-and-sugar Restaurants Scheme in early 2019, close to 950 restaurants had participated in the scheme and provided customers with either options of reduced salt and/or sugar or tailor-made less-salt-and-sugar dishes (tailor-made dishes), so that the public could have more healthy choices when eating out. Participating restaurants had displayed logos in their premises and on their menus. The Administration had also promoted the scheme to the public through an online restaurant search platform. To encourage more restaurants to join the scheme, the Administration would strengthen publicity of the scheme through online gourmet platforms and food magazines.

Action

In response to Mr Steven HO's enquiry on the response from participating restaurants, DSFH(F)2 said that according to a telephone survey conducted by FHB on restaurants providing tailor-made dishes from December 2019 to January 2020, 94% of the respondents said that their customers were satisfied with or welcomed these dishes.

13. Prof Joseph LEE asked whether the Administration had set targets for recruiting restaurants to join the Less-salt-and-sugar Restaurants Scheme in the coming year and whether incentives would be provided to restaurants or diners for supporting the scheme. DSFH(F)2 stressed that free publicity on the scheme would be arranged by the Administration to recruit more restaurants to join the scheme. The Administration would also promote participating restaurants to the public through different means (e.g. promoting the dishes offered by these restaurants on online gourmet platforms and encouraging the restaurants to offer discounts on reduced-sugar or low sugary drinks).

14. In response to Prof Joseph LEE's enquiry about DH's health education on salt and sugar reduction at schools, DSFH(F)2 said that DH had been promoting the concept of less-salt-and-sugar among children through various health education programmes such as "Healthy Drinks at School" Charter and "Salt Reduction Scheme for School Lunches". DH, in conjunction with CFS, FHB, and the Education Bureau, had also organized regular briefing sessions to provide teachers with health information and to encourage them to make the best use of the Salt and Sugar Reduction Kit to teach students about healthy eating.

15. Prof Joseph LEE suggested that the Administration should step up promotion on salt and sugar reduction among the elderly, in particular those living in elderly homes. The Deputy Chairman made a similar suggestion, adding that CFS should also discuss with the food trade to see whether there was room to reduce the sodium and sugar contents in "dim sum" served in the Chinese restaurants.

16. DSFH(F)2 responded that the Administration would carry out general promotion and public education through mass media (e.g. cookery programmes featuring less-salt-and-sugar dishes on television) and mass transport to disseminate less-salt-and-sugar information to members of the public, including the elderly. USFH said that the Administration would consider collaborating with elderly homes/centres to step up promotion of healthy eating among the elderly.

Labels on prepackaged food products

17. Mr CHAN Chi-chuen expressed concern that sweeteners might be used to substitute sugars in some prepackaged drinks and those drinks might be

Action

marketed as "sugar free" products. He asked whether CRSS had conducted any research or study on the use of sweeteners in prepackaged drinks and whether CFS had randomly checked the nutrition labels of prepackaged drinks to see whether they were in compliance with the definition of "low sugar" or "no sugar" under the law.

18. Consultant (Community Medicine) (Risk Assessment and Communication), CFS responded that while the use of sweeteners in food might reduce the consumption of sugar in the short term, there was no compelling scientific evidence suggesting that the use of sweeteners to replace sugar would result in significant health benefit in the long run. In Hong Kong, the use of sweeteners was regulated by the Sweeteners in Food Regulations (Cap. 132U). The Administration aimed to reduce the daily intake of free sugar (e.g. monosaccharides and disaccharides added to food by the manufacturers, cooks or consumers, plus sugar naturally present in honey, syrups and fruit juices) of Hong Kong people according to the recommendations of the World Health Organization. The terms "low sugar" and "no sugar" were clearly defined under the Food and Drugs (Composition and Labelling) Regulations (Cap. 132W) ("the Regulations"). CFS adopted a risk-based approach in checking the nutrition labels of prepackaged food products, including drinks.

Admin

19. DSFH(F)2 supplemented that in the past three years, CFS collected about 165 000 samples of prepackaged food products to check whether there was any violation of the provisions of the Regulations, including claims relating to sugar and salt contents. At Mr CHAN Chi-chuen's request, the Administration undertook to provide details of enforcement actions taken over the past few years against cases involving false claims of "low salt", "no salt", "low sugar" and "no sugar" on food product labels (including those making such claims on the packages and those using the specific display labels under the voluntary "Salt/Sugar" Label Scheme for Prepackaged Food Products), including the numbers of prosecutions instituted and successful prosecutions made.

(Post-meeting note: The Administration's response in respect of the issues mentioned in paragraphs 6 and 19 was circulated vide LC Paper No. CB(2)1111/19-20 on 1 June 2020.)

IV. Implementation of the Market Modernization Programme and development of new public markets

(LC Paper Nos. CB(2)1000/18-19, CB(2)884/19-20(01) and CB(2)922/19-20(05)-(07))

20. At the invitation of the Chairman, USFH briefed members on the progress of developing new public markets and implementing the 10-year

Action

Market Modernization Programme ("MMP"), as detailed in the Administration's paper (LC Paper No. CB(2)922/19-20(05)). Members noted the information note prepared by the LegCo Secretariat on the subject (LC Paper No. CB(2)922/19-20(06)).

21. Members also noted the letter dated 27 April 2020 from Mr Andrew WAN on issues relating to MMP and the development of new public markets (LC Paper No. CB(2)884/19-20(01)) and the Administration's response to Mr WAN's letter (LC Paper No. CB(2)922/19-20(07)).

Development of new public markets

22. Mr Steven HO and Ir Dr LO Wai-kwok indicated support for the provision of new public markets in various districts as set out in the Administration's paper. Ir Dr LO said that the Food and Environmental Hygiene Department ("FEHD") should consider providing new public markets in each of the new development areas in the territory.

23. Ms Elizabeth QUAT expressed support for the new public market project in Tseung Kwan O. In response to Ms QUAT's enquiry about the progress of the project, Deputy Director (Administration and Development), FEHD ("DD(AD)/FEHD") advised that the Administration planned to provide a new public market on the lower floors of the proposed Joint-user Complex in Area 67 at Tseung Kwan O town centre (at the junction of Po Yap Road and Tong Yin Street). The Joint-user Complex would also accommodate other community facilities including medical, welfare and education facilities. In early May 2020, relevant bureaux and departments consulted the Sai Kung District Council ("DC") on the site selected and the preliminary plan for the Joint-user Complex (including the new public market). Upon completion of the preliminary work for the Joint-user Complex project, including technical assessments and detailed design, the Administration would seek funding approval from the Finance Committee of LegCo in a timely manner.

24. Mr CHU Hoi-dick noted that the Administration planned to provide a temporary market at the open space adjacent to Tin Sau Road Park in Tin Shui Wai by adopting the Modular Integrated Construction method to shorten the on-site construction time, so that the public could have an additional choice for purchasing fresh provisions before the establishment of a new public market in the southern part of Tin Shui Wai. Mr CHU asked whether the Administration would consider adopting similar arrangements as in the case of Tin Shui Wai and providing a temporary market respectively in (a) the vicinity of Kam Sheung Road Station in Yuen Long and (b) the town centres of Tung Chung and Tseung Kwan O, while planning for the construction of new public markets in these two districts.

Action

25. DD(AD)/FEHD advised that providing a new public market or a temporary market required the use of scarce land resources and entailed financial commitment, both capital and recurrent. In considering whether a public market (whether such market was permanent or temporary) should be built, the Administration had to duly assess the need for the market and cost-effectiveness in order to ensure proper use of public resources. The Administration would provide a written response to Mr CHU Hoi-dick's enquiry after the meeting.

Admin

26. In response to Dr KWOK Ka-ki's enquiry about the progress of the new public market project in Tung Chung Town Centre, DD(AD)/FEHD advised that the new public market would be built on the lower floors of a commercial building in Area 6 adjacent to Tung Chung Mass Transit Railway Station. The commercial building would be built by a developer and the design of the market would be prepared by the developer according to the requirements and conditions specified by FEHD. The technical feasibility study for the entire development project (including the public market portion) was still underway.

Admin

27. At Dr KWOK Ka-ki's request, the Administration would revert in writing on :

- (a) details of the progress of the new public market project in Tung Chung Town Centre and the modes of operation and management to be adopted for the new market; and
- (b) whether the Administration had any plan to convert the temporary market in Tin Shui Wai into a permanent one in the future to serve the residents living in the northern part of Tin Shui Wai.

28. Mr Steven HO said that local chicken farmers had to rely on live poultry retail outlets for sale of their live chickens. The number of live poultry retail licences, however, had dropped to around 130 after the launch of the Voluntary Surrender Scheme and the Buyout Scheme for the live poultry trade years ago. As there were restrictions on the transfer of live poultry retail licences and some licensees did not have stalls to continue their operation following the closure of private markets, the live poultry retail trade was shrinking. He urged the Administration to review its policy on live poultry retail licencing, maintain the number of live poultry retail outlets at a certain level and reserve stalls in new public markets for relocation of on-street live poultry stalls or those operated in private markets and affected by various reasons.

29. The Chairman echoed Mr HO's view, adding that FEHD should allow relocation of live poultry stalls to other public markets if the retailers were

Action

forced to leave by the landlords (e.g. Link Real Estate Investment Trust) due to redevelopment plans or other commercial reasons.

30. DD(AD)/FEHD assured members that stalls would be reserved in overhauled public markets under MMP for continuation of live poultry retail business if the tenants concerned had all along been doing business in the markets concerned. The Administration would consider members' suggestion when determining the trade mix of each new public market.

Implementation of the Market Modernization Programme

Criteria for selecting public markets for overhaul or minor refurbishment/improvement works

31. The Deputy Chairman, Dr Priscilla LEUNG, Mr HO Kai-ming and Mr Vincent CHENG expressed support for the implementation of MMP to carry out various types of hardware improvement works for public markets. The Deputy Chairman, Mr CHENG and Ms CHAN Hoi-yan enquired about the criteria adopted by the Administration for selecting public markets for overhaul or minor refurbishment/improvement works, and the timetable for taking forward various projects as set out in the Administration's paper.

32. DD(AD)/FEHD made the following responses:

- (a) the Administration had considered a host of factors, including the physical condition of the markets, their geographical location and distribution, the condition of facilities thereof, business viability, community needs and tenants' readiness, in identifying public markets for carrying out overhaul or minor refurbishment/improvement works. Having regard to the above factors, the Administration proposed to overhaul Yeung Uk Road Market, Ngau Tau Kok Market and Kowloon City Market, in addition to Aberdeen Market as the pioneering project. The Administration also proposed to carry out minor refurbishment/improvement works in 11 markets (i.e. Nam Long Shan Road Cooked Food Market, Mong Kok Cooked Food Market, Luen Wo Hui Market, Ngau Tau Kok Market, Yeung Uk Road Market, Shek Tong Tsui Market, Fa Yuen Street Market, Ngau Chi Wan Market, Quarry Bay Market, Tsuen Wan Market and Shui Wo Street Market) with a view to upgrading the facilities thereof as soon as possible;
- (b) in the coming few months, FEHD would consult the respective Market Management Consultative Committees ("MMCCs") and tenants concerned on the scope of works and implementation timetable for individual markets. At the same time, FEHD and

Action

the Architectural Services Department ("ArchSD") would work out the approach for the hardware improvement works, conduct technical feasibility studies, etc.; and

- (c) the Administration hoped that the proposed scope of works and implementation timetable for individual markets could be worked out later in 2020. The Administration planned to consult relevant DCs on the preliminary plans for the three overhaul projects in late 2020 or early 2021.

33. Dr Priscilla LEUNG and Dr CHIANG Lai-wan considered that the Administration should give due consideration to the social functions of public markets. Dr LEUNG suggested the Administration make reference to overseas experience and blend in local characteristics in the designs of public markets, so that new/revamped public markets could become gathering places or even tourist attractions in the city. Dr CHIANG hoped that new design concepts could be adopted in building new public markets or renovating existing markets. The Administration should also explore whether other community facilities (e.g. sport venues) could be provided in new market buildings.

34. DD(AD)/FEHD responded that while FEHD-managed public markets were positioned to be one of the major sources for the public to purchase fresh food, the Administration hoped that public markets could serve a greater social function by providing a resting and gathering place for the public. In designing new public markets or taking forward overhaul projects, FEHD would adopt "place-making" elements as far as practicable to provide public space for enjoyment of the public. The scope of overhaul projects might include air-conditioning ("A/C") retrofitting works, upgrading works for facilities, re-zoning of stalls, re-configuring the layout of the market and provision of barrier free access.

Overhaul of Aberdeen Market

35. Mr Wilson OR noted with concern that the overhaul works in Aberdeen Market would not commence until 2021. He asked whether measures would be taken by FEHD to expedite the works progress. Noting that the market would be closed for 14 months for carrying out overhaul works, Mr KWOK Wai-keung expressed concern whether effort could be made to compress the works schedule and shortening the full market closure. He said that existing tenants were worried whether they would be given priority in renting stalls in the overhauled market and whether the rental would increase for the stalls.

36. DD(AD)/FEHD responded that in order to complete the overhaul works for Aberdeen Market in 14 months, it was necessary for relevant

Action

departments to apply for extension of daily works hours and carry out works during night time and holidays. ArchSD would complete the process of engaging a consultant in May 2020 to commence the detailed design of building plan and preparation of tender documents. The Administration would explore with ArchSD to see whether there was room to further compress the works schedule. DD(AD)/FEHD further said that existing tenants wishing to return to the overhauled Aberdeen Market could take part in a restricted auction to bid for stalls before open auctions were held. In determining the rental level for the stalls, the Administration would take into account relevant factors, including the market rental as assessed by the Rating and Valuation Department as reference.

37. Mr Wilson OR expressed concern on how the Administration would ride on the experience of the Aberdeen Market project in taking forward the other three overhaul projects. DD(AD)/FEHD said that with the experience of Aberdeen Market as blueprint, the Administration would kick-start the preparatory and consultation work shortly, ascertain the scope of and approach for the overhaul works, conduct technical feasibility studies, etc. The Administration would maintain close liaison with stakeholders during the process and report to the relevant DCs on the progress of work in a timely manner.

38. Mr SHIU Ka-fai declared that he was an honorary president of the Federation of Hong Kong Kowloon New Territories Hawkers Associations ("the Federation"). He and Mr KWOK Wai-keung asked whether the Administration would consider setting up an advisory committee comprising relevant stakeholders (including the Federation) to engage views on the overhaul projects (including the Aberdeen Market project) and to enhance communication with the tenants concerned during project implementation.

39. DD(AD)/FEHD advised that FEHD and ArchSD briefed the relevant committee of the Southern DC on the details and progress of the Aberdeen Market project in February 2020. Upon the Southern DC's request and with the assistance of District Office (Southern), FEHD conducted local consultation at the district level in May 2020 to invite views on the project. FEHD would continue to maintain close liaison with tenants and relevant stakeholders (including the Federation) on the progress of all MMP projects. At members' request, the Administration undertook to provide a written response to the enquiries of Mr KWOK Wai-keung and Mr SHIU Ka-fai after the meeting.

Admin

Other overhaul projects

40. Mr SHIU Ka-fai, Mr Vincent CHENG and Ms CHAN Hoi-yan expressed concern about the appropriateness of selecting Kowloon City Market for overhaul. They were worried that as Kowloon City Market was

Action

the main shopping venue for fresh food in the district, the full closure of the market for overhaul works as in the case of Aberdeen Market would greatly affect the business of existing tenants and the livelihood of local residents. Ms CHAN said that to her understanding, tenants of Kowloon City Market had not made any requests for overhaul. She queried whether FEHD had consulted tenants before selecting Kowloon City Market for overhaul works.

41. Mr HO Kai-ming said that both Kowloon City Market and Yeung Uk Road Market were major fresh markets in respective districts with a high patronage. He queried the need to overhaul these two bustling markets in times of a worsening economic situation. Mr HO and Ms CHAN Hoi-yan were of the view that while minor enhancement works could be carried out to improve the facilities of Kowloon City Market and Yeung Uk Road Market, FEHD should focus on revitalizing those public markets with a low patronage and less competitive operating environment.

42. DD(AD)/FEHD explained that as the overhaul of a public market involved the investment of substantial public resources, the Administration had to ensure that the overhaul works could achieve cost-effectiveness by unleashing the development potential of the market concerned. As Kowloon City Market and Yeung Uk Road Market were large-sized public markets serving lots of local residents and the markets were built years ago with facilities already outdated, the Administration hoped to improve the overall layout and facilities of the markets through overhaul works, thereby benefitting the tenants and the general public.

43. Mr SHIU Ka-fai and Ms CHAN Hoi-yan said that to their understanding, tenants of Kowloon City Market were worrying about whether they would be compensated if the market was to be re-built. They enquired about FEHD's consultation work with affected tenants on the overhaul plan and the compensation arrangements. DD(AD)/FEHD stressed that the actual scope of overhaul works for Kowloon City Market would only be confirmed after consultation with MMCC, tenants and stakeholders concerned. While tenants would not be entitled to compensation under tenancy agreements for termination of tenancy due to overhaul works with adequate notice, the Administration would consider the need of providing assistance to affected tenants during the closure of the markets for overhaul works depending on the actual circumstances.

44. Dr CHIANG Lai-wan said that tenants of Kowloon City Market had complained that the A/C system, lighting, ventilation, public access facilities, etc., were outdated and needed improvement. She hoped that FEHD could renovate the above facilities, re-configure the layout of the upper floors of the market building to make better use of the vacant stalls and accord priority to existing tenants in renting stalls after completion of the overhaul works.

Action

Minor refurbishment/improvement works

45. Mr Wilson OR said that he received complaints from tenants that the preliminary plan for the minor refurbishment/improvement works to be carried out in Ngau Tau Kok Market did not include upgrading works for electricity supply. He called on the Administration to consult tenants before finalizing the enhancement plan for Ngau Tau Kok Market. Mr OR also expressed concern that FEHD had yet to take forward the A/C retrofitting works in Shui Wo Street Market Cooked Food Centre where tenants' support for the works had been obtained a couple of years ago.

Admin

46. The Administration was requested to revert in writing on the scope of works and implementation timetable in respect of the minor refurbishment/improvement works to be carried out in Ngau Tau Kok Market and Shui Wo Street Market.

47. Ir Dr LO Wai-kwok urged the Administration to take into account the impact on the business of existing tenants in determining how overhaul or minor refurbishment/improvement works in public markets should be carried out. He expressed concern that stall tenants of the cooked food market in Tai Po Hui Market had ceased business due to the closure of the cooked food market for renovation works which commenced after the Chinese Lunar New Year. He requested the Administration to provide a written response on whether assistance and ex-gratia payments had been/would be provided to stall tenants affected by the renovation works, and if yes, the details.

Admin

48. Dr Priscilla LEUNG and Mr Vincent CHENG asked whether the Administration would consider carrying out minor refurbishment/improvement works in more public markets (e.g. To Kwa Wan Market and Hung Hom Market). Expressing concern about the dilapidated facilities in Sai Kung Market, Ms Elizabeth QUAT asked whether consideration would be given to carrying out minor refurbishment/improvement works in that market.

49. DD(AD)/FEHD responded that the Administration would continue to identify suitable public markets for overhaul or minor refurbishment/improvement works under the 10-year MMP in order to improve the operating environment of existing public markets. The Administration would seek additional funding support for MMP when such a need arose. Apart from the various types of hardware improvement works for public markets under MMP, FEHD would carry out other improvement works each year to upgrade existing facilities (e.g. lifts and escalators as mentioned by Ms Elizabeth QUAT) in public markets.

Admin

50. The Administration was requested to revert in writing on whether consideration would be given to carrying out minor refurbishment/

Action

improvement works in more public markets, in particular, Sai Kung Market and if so, the details of the Administration's plan.

(Post-meeting note: A letter dated 18 May 2020 from Mr SHIU Ka-chun addressed to USFH and copied to the Panel Chairman requesting the Administration to provide further information relating to the implementation of MMP and development of new public markets was issued to members vide LC Paper No. CB(2)1055/19-20 on 21 May 2020. The Administration's responses to Mr SHIU's letter and issues raised by members at the meeting (LC Paper Nos. CB(2)1069/19-20(01) and CB(2)1314/19-20(01)) were issued on 25 May and 6 July 2020 respectively.)

(To allow sufficient time for discussion and handling the motions proposed by members during the original appointed meeting time, the Chairman directed that the meeting be extended for 15 minutes.)

Motions proposed by members

51. Mr CHU Hoi-dick indicated an intention to move a motion under this item. Mr Steven HO and Mr KWOK Wai-keung also indicated their intention to jointly move a motion under this discussion item. The Chairman ruled that the two motions proposed were directly related to the agenda item and members present agreed that the motions should be dealt with.

Motion 1

52. The Chairman put the following motion moved by Mr CHU Hoi-dick, and amended by Ms Elizabeth QUAT, Mr Wilson OR and Mr Vincent CHENG to vote:

(議案中文措辭)

本事務委員會促請政府當局仿效在天水圍的安排，於規劃及興建各區新公眾街市及進行舊街市翻新工程期間，盡快於市中心一帶或原址附近設置臨時街市，或分階段提供適度服務。

(English translation of the motion)

This Panel requests the Government, in the course of planning for and constructing new public markets as well as undertaking refurbishment works for old markets in various districts, to adopt similar arrangements as in the case of Tin Shui Wai to ensure the early provision of a temporary market in the town centre or at a location in

Action

the vicinity of the existing market, or provide reasonable services by phases.

53. The Chairman invited members to vote for or against the motion by a show of hands. Twelve members voted for the motion, and no member voted against it or abstained from voting. The Chairman declared that the motion was carried.

Motion 2

54. The Chairman put the following motion jointly moved by Mr Steven HO and Mr KWOK Wai-keung to vote:

(議案中文措辭)

鑒於政府對活家禽零售牌照(或新鮮糧食店牌照)規管過嚴，包括不許轉讓牌照、令活雞檔難以搬遷，加上非公營街市關閉結業後，令活雞檔牌主有牌無檔，可能被迫放棄牌照，而本地活雞農友，只能依靠活家禽零售點銷售活雞，如果現時131個牌照因社會及政策環境而逐漸減少，會令市場扭曲，直接摧毀活雞行業。

故本事務委員會促請政府當局重新檢討活家禽零售牌照的政策，確保活雞零售點的數量，並於新建成的公眾街市預留位置供活雞檔搬遷。

(English translation of the motion)

The excessive restrictions imposed by the Government on live poultry retail licences (or fresh provision shop licences), which include prohibition against the transfer of licences, have made the relocation of live poultry stalls very difficult. This, together with the fact that holders of live poultry retail licences would be left with no place to operate following the closure of non-public markets, might have forced the licence holders to surrender their licences. However, local chicken farmers must rely on live poultry retail outlets for sale of their live chickens. If the number of the existing 131 licences is gradually reduced due to social and policy environment, the market will be distorted and the live poultry trade will be directly wiped out.

Therefore, this Panel requests the Administration to review its policy on live poultry retail licences, maintain the number of live poultry retail outlets at a certain level and reserve spaces in new public markets for relocation of live poultry stalls.

Action

55. Eleven members voted for the motion, and no member voted against it or abstained from voting. The Chairman declared that the motion was carried.

(Post-meeting note: The Administration's response to the motions was circulated vide LC Paper No. CB(2)1100/19-20 on 1 June 2020.)

V. Any other business

56. There being no other business, the meeting ended at 4:32 pm.

Council Business Division 2
Legislative Council Secretariat
8 July 2020