

立法會
Legislative Council

LC Paper No. CB(2)92/20-21

(These minutes have been
seen by the Administration)

Ref : CB2/PS/5/16

Panel on Health Services

**Subcommittee on Issues Relating to the
Development of Chinese Medicine**

**Minutes of the fifth meeting
held on Friday, 3 July 2020, at 10:45 am
in Conference Room 2 of the Legislative Council Complex**

Members present : Hon CHAN Han-pan, BBS, JP (Chairman)
Hon CHAN Hoi-yan (Deputy Chairman)
Prof Hon Joseph LEE Kok-long, SBS, JP
Hon Alice MAK Mei-kuen, BBS, JP
Dr Hon KWOK Ka-ki
Dr Hon Helena WONG Pik-wan
Hon SHIU Ka-fai, JP
Hon SHIU Ka-chun
Dr Hon Pierre CHAN

Members absent : Hon Mrs Regina IP LAU Suk yee, GBS, JP
Hon Elizabeth QUAT, BBS, JP

Public Officers attending : Items I and II

Dr CHUI Tak-yi, JP
Under Secretary for Food and Health

Dr CHEUNG Wai-lun, JP
Project Director (Chinese Medicine Hospital Project Office)
Food and Health Bureau

Ms Ellen CHAN Sheung-man
Principal Assistant Secretary for Food and Health (Health) 7/
Head (Chinese Medicine Unit)

Food and Health Bureau

Dr NG Chi-sun
Consultant Chinese Medicine Practitioner
Food and Health Bureau

Dr Christine WONG Wang
Assistant Director of Health (Chinese Medicine)
Department of Health

Mr Robert LAW Kwok-wai
Chief Pharmacist (Chinese Medicine)
Department of Health

Ms Rowena WONG
Chief (Chinese Medicine Department)
Hospital Authority

Clerk in attendance : Ms Maisie LAM
Chief Council Secretary (2) 5

Staff in attendance : Miss Kay CHU
Senior Council Secretary (2) 5

Miss Maggie CHIU
Legislative Assistant (2) 5

Action

I. Regulatory regime for and professional development of Chinese medicine practitioners

[LC Paper Nos. CB(2)1266/19-20(01) and (02)]

The Subcommittee deliberated (index of proceedings attached at **Annex**).

Follow-up actions required of the Administration

Admin/HA

2. The Subcommittee requested the Administration/Hospital Authority ("HA") to advise:

(a) in details the Chinese medicine specialist outpatient services provided by Tung Wah Group of Hospitals at certain public

Action

hospitals, such as Kwong Wah Hospital, TWGHs Wong Tai Sin Hospital and Tung Wah Eastern Hospital; and

- (b) the qualification requirements for the Chinese medicine practitioners providing these services.

II. Latest progress of Chinese Medicine Development Fund

[LC Paper Nos. CB(2)1266/19-20(03) and (04)]

3. The Subcommittee deliberated (index of proceedings attached at **Annex**).

Admin

4. The Subcommittee requested the Administration to update the Panel on Health Services ("the Panel") the implementation progress of the Chinese Medicine Development Fund on a regular basis.

III. Any other business

Way forward of the Subcommittee

5. Members noted that this would be the last meeting of the Subcommittee, and the Subcommittee would then conclude its work and prepare a report on its deliberations for submission to the Panel. Members noted that the report, once ready, would be circulated to members for consideration.

6. There being no other business, the meeting ended at 12:25 pm.

**Proceedings of the fifth meeting of the
Subcommittee on Issues Relating to the Development of Chinese Medicine
on Friday, 3 July 2020, at 10:45 am
in Conference Room 2 of the Legislative Council Complex**

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)/Discussion	Action required
<i>Agenda item I: Regulatory regime for and professional development of Chinese medicine practitioners</i>			
000557 - 000720	Chairman	Opening remarks	
000721 - 001208	Chairman Admin	Briefing by the Administration on the regulatory regime for and professional development of Chinese medicine practitioners ("CMPs") [LC Paper No. CB(2)1266/19-20(01)].	
001209 - 002111	Chairman Dr Helena WONG Admin	<p>Dr Helena WONG enquired about the manpower and qualification requirements, pay scale and career pathway of CMPs and Chinese medicine pharmacists under the future Chinese Medicine Hospital ("CMH"). To attract talents to join the Chinese medicine profession, she considered that the details of the above should not be left for the operator of CMH to decide alone.</p> <p>The Administration advised that while it would specify the minimum requirements on qualification, remuneration and ranks of the CMPs to be employed by the operator of CMH, the detailed manpower requirements and remuneration packages were to be proposed by the tenderers for the operation of CMH through the tendering process. In response to Dr Helena WONG's follow-up enquiry, the Administration advised that the minimum requirements could not be disclosed at this stage as the tender for selecting a non-profit-making organization to operate CMH was underway.</p>	
002112 - 004757	Chairman Ms CHAN Hoi-yan Admin HA	<p>Ms CHAN Hoi-yan noted with concern that the longest waiting time of new stable cases for the orthopaedics and traumatology specialist outpatient service of the Kowloon West Cluster of the Hospital Authority ("HA") was 105 weeks. She suggested that the Administration should formulate a policy direction on the development of Chinese medicine specialization in the longer term (such as the specialty of Chinese medicine orthopaedics and traumatology) so that CMPs could assume a role in the provision of specialized outpatient ("SOP") services in order to relieve the burden of SOP services of HA which had constant complaint of long waiting time due to medical manpower constraint.</p> <p>Sharing Ms CHAN Hoi-yan's view, the Chairman queried about the way forward of the development of Chinese medicine specialization and CMH's role in this regard. He remarked that six years had passed since the Hong Kong Chinese Medicine Specialty Development Working Group ("the Working Group") was established by the Chinese medicine profession and the Schools of Chinese medicine of the three local universities in July 2014 with an aim to draw up a Chinese medicine specialty structure as well as training and qualification accreditation</p>	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)/Discussion	Action required
		<p>mechanism in this regard, but the Working Group (including its Acupuncture Sub-group, the Chinese Medicine Orthopaedics and the Traumatology Sub-group, and Internal Medicine Sub-group) had yet put forth any recommendations for consideration of the Chinese Medicine Development Committee.</p> <p>Pointing out that the theory and practice of Chinese medicine and Western medicine were distinct in nature, Mr SHIU Ka-chun was concerned about whether the Chinese medicine specialization would be based on the specialties of Western medicine and how the services of CMH would be integrated into the existing healthcare system whereby Western medicine played the dominant role.</p> <p>The Administration and HA advised that:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (a) integrated Chinese-Western medicines ("ICWM") services for selected disease areas (i.e. stroke, low back pain, shoulder and neck pain, and cancer palliative care) had been provided in designated public hospitals for years. HA had been exploring future development of such services where practicable. CMH would provide pure Chinese medicine services, services with Chinese medicine playing the predominant role with support from Western medicine in accordance with clinical needs as well as ICWM services; (b) for the specialized services to be provided by CMH, it was agreed amongst members of the Chinese medicine industry that the operator of CMH shall provide services of Chinese medicine internal medicine, acupuncture, orthopaedics and traumatology, gynecology, paediatrics and external medicine. The above apart, CMH would provide Chinese medicine service in respect of special diseases for strategic development. In this regard, the operator of CMH shall provide at least four special disease programmes including stroke rehabilitation, cancer rehabilitation or palliative service, chronic pain and preventive care and health maintenance in Chinese medicine in the first year of service and develop the other special diseases programmes after commencement of services; (c) while the Administration would continue to facilitate the discussion on the development of Chinese medicine specialization, consensus should be reached within the profession before a concrete proposal could be put forth for implementation; and (d) at present, graduates of local full-time Chinese medicine undergraduate programmes might apply to work and receive training at the 18 Chinese Medicine Clinics cum Training and Research Centres ("the CM Clinics") as CMP trainees for a three-year on-the-job training scheme if selected. A new training programme adopting evidence-based medicine as an approach to develop solid clinical capability had been launched since March 2020. Junior and senior scholarship scheme was in place to encourage CMPs 	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)/Discussion	Action required
		<p>working at the CM Clinics to attend 13 types of courses (e.g. Chinese medicine gynecology, oncology, paediatrics, and bone-setting) offered by various Chinese medicine institutions in the Mainland.</p> <p>On Ms CHAN Hoi-yan's observation that Chinese medicine SOP services were currently provided at certain Tung Wah Group of Hospitals ("TWGHs"), such as Kwong Wah Hospital, TWGHs Wong Tai Sin Hospital and Tung Wah Eastern Hospital albeit that Chinese medicine specialization had yet been introduced, HA advised that the above Hospitals were prescribed hospitals specified in Schedule 2 to the Hospital Authority Ordinance (Cap. 113) (i.e. hospitals the management and control of which were vested in HA under agreements with persons other than the Government). With the support from its Board of Directors, TWGHs had long been running Chinese medicine services in these Hospitals. However, these services were not under the service scope of HA.</p>	
004758 - 005809	Chairman Ms CHAN Hoi-yan Admin	<p>Ms CHAN Hoi-yan asked about the divided views, if any, held by the Chinese medicine profession on the drawing up of a Chinese medicine specialty structure as well as training and qualification accreditation mechanism, and the timetable for the Working Group to make recommendations in this regard. In response, the Administration explained that it took time for the local profession to work out the recommendations as no such mechanism had been formulated beforehand, even in the Mainland. Consensus should be reached within the local profession before a concrete proposal could be put forth for implementation.</p> <p>In response to Ms CHAN Hoi-yan's follow-up enquiries, HA undertook to advise in writing details of the Chinese medicine SOP services provided by TWGHs in certain public hospitals and the qualification requirements for the CMPs providing these services. It further advised that in gist, Chinese medicine SOP services provided by TWGHs in Wong Tai Sin Hospital and Kwong Wah Hospital were operated by the Board of Directors of TWGHs. Thus, operation details, manpower arrangement as well as relevant data of these services were not under the ambit of HA.</p>	Admin/ HA
005810 - 010511	Chairman Admin	<p>The Chairman's concern about and HA's elaboration on the government-subsidized Chinese medicine outpatient services with an annual quota of 620 000 provided by the CM Clinics, and the arrangement that recipients of Comprehensive Social Security Assistance and Higher Old Age Living Allowance aged 75 or above would be waived from payment of the service fee.</p> <p>In response to the Chairman's call for the Administration to formulate salary structures and pay scales for various ranks of CMPs worked at the CM Clinics, HA advised that the terms of employment and remuneration packages of these CMPs were determined by the respective non-governmental organizations operating the CM Clinics having regard to market situation. In the financial year of 2019-2020, the monthly salary of those</p>	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)/Discussion	Action required
		CMPs with more than three years' experience of clinical practice was not less than \$35,000. The Administration would continue to keep in view the remuneration packages for staff of the CM Clinics, with a view to preparing for the development of CMH.	
010512 - 010944	Chairman	Suspension of meeting	
<i>Agenda item II: Latest progress of Chinese Medicine Development Fund</i>			
010945 - 011241	Chairman Admin	Briefing by the Administration on the latest progress of the Chinese Medicine Development Fund ("the CM Fund") [LC Paper No. CB(2)1266/19-20(03)].	
011242 - 012914	Chairman Mr SHIU Ka-fai Admin	<p>Mr SHIU Ka-fai called on the Administration to provide financial assistance under the CM Fund for the Chinese medicine drug sector to expand into the market of Guangdong-Hong Kong-Macao Greater Bay Area ("Greater Bay Area") and the market of the Belt and Road regions. Pointing out that many proprietary Chinese medicine ("pCm") manufacturers were in need of technical and hardware support with a view to reaching the Good Manufacturing Practice ("GMP") standards, he expressed disappointment that the Proprietary Chinese Medicine Quality and Manufacturing System Enhancement Funding Scheme was still at the stage of reviewing the applications from service providers but had yet opened for application from manufacturers. Noting that the approved applications for the CM Fund involved only a total amount of about \$28 million as at 31 May 2020, he urged the Administration to streamline the application procedures of the CM Fund and step up publicity to promote the CM Fund to stakeholders.</p> <p>In response to Mr SHIU Ka-fai's enquiries about the support provided under the CM Fund for persons engaged in the Chinese medicine drug industry, the Administration elaborated on the details of the Chinese Medicine Personal Training Scheme and the Chinese Medicine Industry Training Funding Scheme as set out in paragraphs 6 and 16 of LC Paper No. CB(2)1266/19-20(03) and advised that subject to the specified funding limit, the CM Fund would subsidize 90% of the course fees for level 5 or below training courses recognized under the Qualifications Framework, training courses with assessment and general training courses and 60% of the course fee for level 6 or above training courses recognized under the Qualifications Framework. Mr SHIU Ka-fai expressed concern that as at 31 May 2020, only 21 applications for registration of courses and only 100-odd funding applications from CMPs and persons engaged in Chinese medicine drug industry had been approved.</p>	
012915 - 014333	Chairman Admin	The Chairman shared Mr SHIU Ka-fai's views that application procedures of the CM Fund should be streamlined in order to shorten the application processing time and that publicity on the CM Fund should be strengthened. The Administration advised that details including application procedures of all the schemes launched had been uploaded onto the CM Fund website	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)/Discussion	Action required
		<p>(http://www.CMDevFund.hk). In addition, quarterly sharing sessions with the stakeholders of the Chinese medicine industry and consultation sessions for individual enterprises had been organized by the Hong Kong Productivity Council, which was the implementation agent of the CM Fund.</p> <p>The Chairman enquired about the assistance provided under the CM Fund to enable the Chinese medicine drug sector to expand into the market of Greater Bay Area and the international market and to facilitate the Chinese medicine clinics to make better use of information technology to improve their operations. In response, the Administration elaborated on the funding support provided under the GMP Basic Assessment Funding Scheme, the GMP Consultancy Funding Scheme and the GMP Equipment Funding Scheme as well as details of the Chinese Medicine Clinic Improvement Funding Scheme as set out in Annex 2 to and paragraph 9 of LC Paper No. CB(2)1266/19-20(03) respectively.</p> <p>In response to the Chairman's enquiries about the financial arrangement of and the priority funding areas under the CM Fund, the Administration advised that the operation period of the CM Fund was expected to be about five years, subject to the number of applications and the amount of the fund approved under the phased implementation of various schemes. Efforts had been and would continuously be made to consult the Chinese Medicine Development Committee and the Advisory Committee on Chinese Medicine Development Fund on the implementation of the funding schemes, taking into account relevant stakeholders' views.</p> <p>The Chairman's request for the Administration to update the Panel on Health Services on the implementation progress of the CM Fund on a regular basis.</p>	Admin
<i>Agenda item III: Any other business</i>			
014334 - 014409	Chairman	Way forward of the Subcommittee	