

# 立法會

## *Legislative Council*

LC Paper No. CB(4)191/20-21  
(These minutes have been seen by  
the Administration)

Ref: CB4/PS/1/16

### **Panel on Transport**

#### **Subcommittee on Matters Relating to Railways**

#### **Minutes of meeting on Friday, 5 June 2020, at 8:30 am in Conference Room 1 of the Legislative Council Complex**

- Members present :** Hon LUK Chung-hung, JP (Chairman)  
Hon CHAN Han-pan, BBS, JP (Deputy Chairman)  
Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, GBS, JP  
Hon Tommy CHEUNG Yu-yan, GBS, JP  
Dr Hon Priscilla LEUNG Mei-fun, SBS, JP  
Hon Mrs Regina IP LAU Suk-yeet, GBS, JP  
Hon Claudia MO  
Hon Michael TIEN Puk-sun, BBS, JP  
Hon Frankie YICK Chi-ming, SBS, JP  
Hon LEUNG Che-cheung, SBS, MH, JP  
Dr Hon Helena WONG Pik-wan  
Hon POON Siu-ping, BBS, MH  
Ir Dr Hon LO Wai-ki, SBS, MH, JP  
Hon CHU Hoi-dick  
Hon LAM Cheuk-ting  
Hon Tanya CHAN  
Hon LAU Kwok-fan, MH  
Dr Hon CHENG Chung-tai  
Hon Jeremy TAM Man-ho  
Hon Tony TSE Wai-chuen, BBS
- Members attending :** Hon Andrew WAN Siu-kin  
Hon Holden CHOW Ho-ding

**Members absent** : Hon YIU Si-wing, BBS  
Hon Alvin YEUNG  
Dr Hon Junius HO Kwan-yiu, JP  
Hon Wilson OR Chong-shing, MH

**Public Officers attending** : **Agenda item II**

Mr Frank CHAN Fan, JP  
Secretary for Transport and Housing  
Transport and Housing Bureau

Mrs Sharon YIP LEE Hang-yee, JP  
Deputy Secretary for Transport and  
Housing (Transport)<sup>1</sup>  
Transport and Housing Bureau

Mr Andy LAM Siu-hong  
Principal Assistant Secretary for Transport and  
Housing (Transport)<sup>3</sup>  
Transport and Housing Bureau

Ms Doris HO Pui-ling, JP  
Deputy Secretary for Development  
(Planning and Lands)<sup>1</sup>  
Development Bureau

Mr Jimmy CHAN Pai-ming, JP  
Director of Highways  
Highways Department

Mr Robert CHAN Cheuk-ming, JP  
Principal Government Engineer/Railway  
Development  
Highways Department

Mr NGAI Hon-wah  
Government Engineer/Railway Development (2)  
Highways Department

Mr Patrick WONG Chi-kwong  
Assistant Commissioner/Bus and Railway  
Transport Department

**Agenda item III**

Mr Frank CHAN Fan, JP  
Secretary for Transport and Housing  
Transport and Housing Bureau

Mrs Sharon YIP LEE Hang-ye, JP  
Deputy Secretary for Transport and  
Housing (Transport)1  
Transport and Housing Bureau

Mr Peter MAK Chi-kwong  
Principal Assistant Secretary for Transport  
and Housing (Transport)7  
Transport and Housing Bureau

Mr Jimmy CHAN Pai-ming, JP  
Director of Highways  
Highways Department

Mr Robert CHAN Cheuk-ming, JP  
Principal Government Engineer / Railway  
Development  
Highways Department

Mr LAM Yu-chau  
Government Engineer / Railway Development (1)  
Highways Department

Mr Humphrey HO Hon-kit  
Assistant Director / New Buildings (2)  
Buildings Department

**Attendance by  
invitation** :

**Agenda item III**

MTR Corporation Limited

Mr Roger BAYLISS  
Projects Director

Mr James CHOW  
Divisional General Manager — Projects  
Construction

Mr Lam CHAN  
Deputy General Manager — Projects & Property  
Communications

**Clerk in attendance :** Ms Sophie LAU  
Chief Council Secretary (4)2

**Staff in attendance :** Ms Jacqueline LAW  
Council Secretary (4)2

Miss Mandy LAM  
Legislative Assistant (4)2

---

**I. Information paper(s) issued since the last meeting**  
(LC Paper Nos. CB(4)660/19-20(01) – (02))

Members noted the above papers which had been issued since the last regular meeting of the Subcommittee on Matters Relating to Railways ("the Subcommittee") held on 5 May 2020.

**II. Tuen Mun South Extension**  
(LC Paper Nos. CB(4)646/19-20(01) – (02))

2. At the invitation of the Chairman, Secretary for Transport and Housing briefed members on the proposed way forward of Tuen Mun South Extension project. Government Engineer / Railway Development (2) of Highways Department briefed members on the proposed scope of the project with the aid of a powerpoint presentation (LC Paper No. CB(4)730/19-20(01)). The Subcommittee deliberated (index of proceedings at **Annex I**).

Action

Motions

3. The Chairman advised that two motions were received respectively from the Deputy Chairman and Mr Michael TIEN in relation to the agenda item under discussion. The Chairman referred members to the following motion moved by the Deputy Chairman –

"行政長官會同行政會議已批准政府邀請港鐵公司開展屯門南延線項目的詳細規劃及設計，預期於二零二三年動工，二零三零年落成。鑑於延線車站服務範圍涉及屯門碼頭一帶及未來16區發展項目，無論車站興建期間或落成通車後都對當區為數超過十萬名居民構成直接影響，為此，本會促請當局：

1. 必須設法保留或原區重置現有社區設施，包括天后廟行人橋及皇珠路行車橋等多條主要行人天橋、屯門泳池、消防局、綠在屯門、湖山路公園、擬建的16區運動場等；及
2. 要求港鐵公司承諾於延線通車後必須加密西鐵班次及加強服務，以應付現時及未來新遷入居民的出行需要。
3. 要求政府啟動屯荃葵沙鐵路建設方案進行研究，以應付未來新界西人口增長需求。"

(Translation)

"The Chief Executive in Council has given approval for the Government to invite the MTR Corporation Limited ("MTRCL") to proceed with the detailed planning and design of the Tuen Mun South ("TMS") Extension project, which is expected to commence in 2023 and complete in 2030. Given that the catchment area of the stations along TMS Extension covers the areas around Tuen Mun Ferry Pier and the future development projects at the Area 16 ("A16") site, the project will have direct impact on more than 100 000 residents in the district both during the construction period and after commissioning of the stations. In this connection, this Subcommittee urges the authorities to:

Action

1. explore every possible means to retain or re-provision the existing community facilities in-situ, including a number of major pedestrian and vehicular bridges such as Tin Hau Temple footbridge and Wong Chu Road flyover, Tuen Mun Swimming Pool, fire services station, Tuen Mun Community Green Station, the park at Wu Shan Road, the proposed sports ground at A16 site, etc.;

2. request MTRCL to undertake to increase the train frequency and enhance the service of the West Rail Line upon the commissioning of the TMS Extension, so as to meet the travelling needs of the existing and future residents; and

3. request the Government to commence the study on the proposed construction of the Tuen Mun-Tsuen Wan-Kwai Chung-Sha Tin Railway to meet the future demands of the growing population in New Territories West."

4. The Chairman put the motion to vote and ordered a division. Of the members present for voting, five members voted for the motion, no member voted against the motion, and three members abstained from voting (details of division were in the **Annex II**). The Chairman declared that the motion was carried.

5. The Chairman then referred members to the motion moved by Mr Michael TIEN –

"鑑於屯門南延線以「擁有權」模式為融資基礎，本委員會促請政府，以不耗費公帑為原則，要求港鐵興建的物業當中，至少七成為公營房屋，並由港鐵支付所有建築費，落成後將有關物業無條件交予政府。至於受興建第 16 區車站影響，而需重建的屯門泳池，需在新泳池落成後，舊泳池才能清拆，確保居民康樂設施不減。"

(Translation)

"Given that the Tuen Mun South Extension is financed under the ownership approach, this Subcommittee urges the Government to, under the principle of not incurring public funds, request the MTR Corporation Limited to designate at least 70% of its residential properties to be public housing, to pay all the construction costs therefor and to unconditionally hand over the

Action

residential properties concerned to the Government upon completion. As regards the Tuen Mun Swimming Pool which needs to be reprovisioned due to the construction of the Area 16 Station, the existing swimming pool should not be demolished until the construction of the new swimming pool has been completed, so as to ensure that there will be no reduction in recreational facilities available to residents."

6. The Chairman put the motion to vote and ordered a division. Of the members present for voting, six members voted for the motion, one member voted against the motion, and two members abstained from voting (details of division were in the **Annex III**). The Chairman declared that the motion was carried.

*(Post-meeting note: the Administration's response to the motions passed was issued to members vide LC Paper No. CB(4)745/19-20(01) on 23 June 2020.)*

**III. Progress update of the construction of Shatin to Central Link**

(LC Paper Nos. CB(4)646/19-20(03), CB(4)556/19-20(01), CB(4)673/19-20(01) and CB(4)646/19-20(04))

7. At the invitation of the Chairman, Divisional General Manager—Projects Construction of MTRCL briefed members on the progress update of the construction of the Shatin to Central Link ("SCL") with the aid of a powerpoint presentation (LC Paper No. CB(4)730/19-20(02)). The Subcommittee deliberated (index of proceedings at **Annex I**).

8. On a member's request, the Administration agreed to follow up with MTRCL to provide the following information:

- (a) whether the set of updated trigger levels currently adopted in the SCL project would be applied to other similar railway projects for monitoring the settlement of nearby structures; and
- (b) the number of building units which received financial assistance under the "To Kwa Wan Station Community Care Programme".

*(Post-meeting note: the Administration's response was circulated to members vide LC Paper No. CB(4)907/19-20(01) on 25 September 2020.)*

Action

9. The Chairman said that due to time constraints, the discussion on the agenda items "Progress update on Upgrading Signalling System for Railway Lines" and "Progress update on enhancement of MTR facilities and customer experience" would be deferred to a special meeting to be scheduled subject to members' availability. The motion on SCL raised by Mr Michael TIEN would also be dealt with at that special meeting.

*(Post-meeting note: in view of members' availability and with the concurrence of the Chairman, a special meeting was scheduled for Friday, 19 June 2020 at 9:00 am. Members were informed of the above arrangement on 12 June 2020 vide LC Paper No. CB(4)697/19-20. The wording of the motion moved by Mr Michael TIEN was issued to members vide LC Paper No. CB(4)719/19-20(01) on 17 June 2020.)*

**IV. Any other business**

10. There being no other business, the meeting ended at 10:46 am.

Council Business Division 4  
Legislative Council Secretariat  
17 November 2020



**Panel on Transport**

**Subcommittee on Matters Relating to Railways**

**Proceedings of the meeting  
held on Friday, 5 June 2020, at 8:30 am  
in Conference Room 1 of the Legislative Council Complex**

<b>Time marker</b>	<b>Speaker</b>	<b>Subject(s)</b>	<b>Action required</b>
<i>Agenda Item I – Information paper(s) issued since the last meeting</i>			
001111 – 001511	Chairman Ms Tanya CHAN Mr LAM Cheuk-ting Mr Jeremy TAM The Clerk	<p>Members noted the information papers issued since the last regular meeting.</p> <p>In reply to Ms CHAN's enquiry, the Chairman said that the discussion on the Final Report of Commission of Inquiry into the Construction Works at and near the Hung Hom Station Extension under the Shatin to Central Link Project ("the Final Report") would be included under agenda item III on "Progress update of the construction of the Shatin to Central Link ("SCL")".</p> <p>Mr LAM urged the Chairman to allow sufficient time for members to discuss the item on "Progress update on Upgrading Signalling System for Railway Lines". Ms CHAN suggested holding a special meeting to discuss the Final Report. The Chairman responded that depending on the discussions at the present meeting, he would seek members' views and availability on the suggestion of holding a special meeting to complete the unfinished business on the agenda.</p>	
<i>Agenda Item II – Tuen Mun South Extension</i>			
001512 – 002732	Chairman Administration	Briefing by the Administration with the aid of a powerpoint presentation [LC Paper Nos. CB(4)646/19-20(01) and CB(4)730/19-20(01)].	
002733 – 003138	Chairman Mr Holden CHOW Administration	<p>Pointing out that the West Rail Line ("WRL") was already overloaded during peak hours, Mr CHOW enquired about the measures to enhance the signalling system of WRL so that the train frequency would be further increased to meet the additional passenger demand brought about by the commissioning of the Tuen Mun South ("TMS") Extension.</p> <p>The Administration advised that the busiest section of WRL during the morning peak was the section between Kam Sheung Road Station and Mei Foo Station. Upon commissioning of full Tuen Ma Line ("TML"), the train frequency of WRL would</p>	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>be increased by procuring more trains and enhancing the signalling system. Based on the Administration's estimation, WRL would be capable to cope with the additional passenger flow brought about by the TMS Extension upon its commissioning up to 2036.</p> <p>Mr CHOW relayed the concern of Tuen Mun residents about the timetable of the reprovisioning of the existing Tuen Mun Swimming Pool.</p> <p>The Administration advised that generally speaking, the existing Tuen Mun Swimming Pool would only be demolished after its reprovisioning so as to minimize the inconvenience to local residents. The Administration added that the target completion of the TMS Extension project could be advanced if the existing swimming pool could be demolished before completing the reprovisioning works.</p>	
003139 – 003547	Chairman Mr Andrew WAN Administration	<p>Noting that there were already a total of 110 000 residents living in the vicinity of the proposed TMS Station and Tuen Mun Area 16 ("A16") Station, Mr WAN enquired about the Administration's estimation on the future patronage of WRL upon the commissioning of TMS Extension and the resultant increase in train frequency of WRL in order to cope with the additional passenger demand.</p> <p>The Administration advised that the additional population to be housed by the residential development at the A16 site would depend on the detailed planning and design of the TMS Extension project. There would be no transport justification to provide a station at A16 if there were no additional population, as the transport demand of the existing population could be catered for by road transport.</p> <p>As for the services of WRL, the Administration advised that after commissioning of full TML, the MTR Corporation Limited ("MTRCL") could provide service at a maximum capacity of 24 train per hour per direction ("tphpd") in 2021 the earliest by procuring more trains and enhancing signalling system, thus increasing the carrying capacity of WRL by approximately 37% as compared with that in 2015.</p>	
003548 –	Chairman	While indicating support for the TMS Extension	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
004002	Ir Dr LO Wai-kwok Administration	<p>project, Ir Dr LO was dissatisfied with the Administration's slow progress in taking forward the project. He also urged the Administration to consider afresh the feasibility of the construction of the Coastal Railway between Tuen Mun and Tsuen Wan. In his view, this proposed railway project would be able to unlock the development potential and provide housing development opportunities along the coastline between Tuen Mun and Tsuen Wan.</p> <p>The Administration responded that it would work with MTRCL to expedite the implementation of the project. The Administration reiterated that if the existing Tuen Mun Swimming Pool could be demolished before its reprovisioning, the target completion of the project would be advanced by 10 to 11 months.</p>	
004003 – 004431	Chairman Dr CHENG Chung-tai Administration	<p>Dr CHENG asked about the final cost estimates of the TMS Extension as compared with that of the West Island Line ("WIL"). The Administration advised that the construction cost per kilometer of the proposed TMS Extension should be lower than that of WIL, given that the station structures of TMS Extension would be built above the ground. Nevertheless, the estimated capital cost of the TMS Extension would be confirmed upon completion of the detailed planning and design process.</p> <p>Dr CHENG was concerned about the noise impact caused to the nearby residents by the railway viaduct of the proposed A16 Station. The Administration responded that the detailed planning and design stage of the project would involve a number of activities, including carrying out environmental impact assessment. The noise impact on nearby residents arising from the railway alignment would be assessed at this stage.</p>	
004432 – 004906	Chairman Mr POON Siu-ping Administration	<p>Mr POON enquired about the views of the relevant District Council and local residents on the potential sites for reprovisioning of the Tuen Mun Swimming Pool and the Tuen Mun Community Green Station. The Administration advised that a potential site nearby for off-site reprovisioning of the swimming pool had been identified. Besides, site selection for reprovisioning of the Tuen Mun Community Green Station would be handled in the detailed planning and design stage. The Administration would consult the local community in respect of the</p>	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>potential sites for off-site reprovisioning of these public facilities in accordance with established procedures.</p> <p>Mr POON was concerned about the time needed for the Administration to negotiate with MTRCL on the funding arrangement. The Administration responded that the negotiation would be conducted concurrently with the detailed planning and design process of the project, during which the construction and operating costs of the project would be carefully examined.</p> <p>In response to Mr POON's enquiry about the re-planning of Tuen Mun West ("TMW") area, the Administration advised that the Development Bureau ("DEVB") and the Civil Engineering and Development Department were seeking the Legislative Council's funding approval to conduct a planning and engineering study in this regard. The Administration would carry out traffic impact assessment in the study to explore the need for and feasibility of connecting the TMW area to the proposed TMS Station and the existing railway network with a railway. If the funding application was approved within the current legislative session, this planning and engineering study would commence in the second half of 2020.</p>	
004907 – 005431	Chairman Deputy Chairman Administration	<p>The Deputy Chairman expressed dissatisfaction over the long lead time required for completion of the TMS Extension project. He was also seriously concerned about the loading of WRL during morning peak hours given that the proposed Hung Shui Kiu Station and the Northern Link would also be connected to WRL in the future. He requested the Administration to explain how the increase in train frequency of WRL would be able to cope with passenger demand during peak periods in view of the fast-growing population in New Territories West.</p> <p>The Administration reiterated that the signalling system of WRL would be enhanced after the commissioning of TML. The train frequency of WRL could increase from 21 tphpd to 24 tphpd by procuring more trains.</p> <p>As regards the Tuen Mun-Tsuen Wan-Kwai Chung-Sha Tin Railway proposed by the Deputy Chairman, the Administration advised that the</p>	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>Transport and Housing Bureau ("THB") was planning to take forward the "Strategic Studies on Railways and Major Roads beyond 2030" ("RMR2030+ Studies"). In the RMR2030+ Studies, THB would take into account the findings of the studies related to artificial islands in the Central Waters to be conducted by DEVB, under which the feasibility of a new strategic road and railway network linking the artificial islands, Hong Kong Island, Lantau and the coastal area of Tuen Mun would be studied.</p> <p>In response to the Deputy Chairman's concern, the Administration advised that similar swimming facilities as the existing ones would be provided in the reprovisioned swimming pool. When the details of a proposed reprovisioning scheme were available, the Administration would consult the public in accordance with established procedures.</p>	
005432 – 005847	Chairman Mr Frankie YICK Administration	<p>Mr YICK expressed support for the TMS Extension project. Noting that the carrying capacity of WRL had already reached its saturation, Mr YICK urged the Administration not to cancel the non-franchised bus routes providing residents' services ("RS") upon commissioning of TMS Extension. He pointed out that RS was an important mode of transportation for TMS residents commuting to work in urban areas.</p> <p>The Administration replied that the Government's transport policy was underpinned by public transport services with railways as its backbone. Other public transport services, including franchised bus, public light buses and non-franchised buses providing employees' and residents' services, played supplementary role. Upon commissioning of TMS Extension, the Administration would closely monitor the passenger traffic having regard to the population distribution in the district, and suitably adjust the public transport services to meet passenger demand.</p> <p>Mr YICK also called on the Administration to consider afresh the proposal to construct the Coastal Railway between Tuen Mun and Tsuen Wan. The Administration responded that as explained in different occasions, due to the technical difficulties involved, the construction cost of a railway along the coastline between Tuen</p>	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>Mun and Tsuen Wan was expected to be very high. Meanwhile, the local population was mainly concentrated at the eastern and western ends of the coastline between Tuen Mun and Tsuen Wan; while the development density of the remaining areas was relatively low and no basis for new source of passengers was anticipated. The Administration would consider revisiting the railway proposal if there were further changes in the development planning and population along the coastline between Tuen Mun and Tsuen Wan resulting in a long-term increase in transport demand.</p> <p>In response to Mr YICK's concern about the reprovisioning of the Tuen Mun Swimming Pool, the Administration advised that similar swimming facilities would be provided in the reprovisioned swimming pool. To complete the TMS Extension as soon as possible, the Administration would explore different schemes for reprovisioning the swimming pool and consult the residents in the district.</p>	
005848 – 010318	Chairman Administration	<p>The Chairman expressed dissatisfaction at the Administration's slow progress in taking forward the TMS Extension project. He urged the Administration to speed up the negotiation with MTRCL on the funding arrangement of the project such that the time needed for completing the detailed planning and design process could be shortened to less than three years. The Chairman was also concerned if the revenue generated from the topside property developments at the proposed A16 Station would be enough to fully bridge the funding gap of the TMS Extension project.</p> <p>The Administration responded that the "Railway-plus-Property" development model had been very successful in Hong Kong. The Administration would ascertain with MTRCL the estimated capital cost of the project, property development rights to be granted to MTRCL and the arrangement to bridge the funding gap of the project in the course of negotiation.</p> <p>The Administration added that since the TMS Extension project would be taken forward under the ownership approach, MTRCL would bear all the commercial risks associated with the construction and operation of the new railway.</p>	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>The Administration also would have no obligation to provide any further funding support even if the future revenue arising from the new railway turned out to be substantially lower than expected.</p>	
010319 – 010739	<p>Chairman Mr Tony TSE Administration</p>	<p>In response to Mr TSE's concern about the estimated capital cost of the TMS Extension project submitted by MTRCL, the Administration advised that the Financial Services and the Treasury Bureau would be involved in the negotiation with MTRCL in respect of the funding arrangement of the project. The Administration would engage a financial consultant to examine the cost estimates submitted by MTRCL as well. Given that a stringent mechanism was in place for examining the construction and operating costs of the railway project, the Administration was confident that the TMS Extension project would be taken forward at a fair price based on professional assessment.</p>	
010740 – 011236	<p>Chairman Mr Michael TIEN Administration</p>	<p>Mr TIEN said that he would support the development projects in the Northwest New Territories ("NWNT") which would bring about additional population, including the proposed TMS Extension project, provided that a fifth cross-harbour railway system connecting Tuen Mun and urban areas would be constructed to relieve the traffic pressure arising from the population growth in NWNT. Besides, Mr TIEN opined that the proposed Coastal Railway between Tuen Mun and Tsuen Wan would only aggravate the crowdedness of WRL and Tsuen Wan Line.</p> <p>Mr TIEN urged the Administration to demolish the existing Tuen Mun Swimming Pool only after a new swimming pool had been constructed. Mr TIEN further said that according to his understanding, the estimated capital cost of the TMS Extension project would be around \$17 billion to \$18 billion. He estimated that around 11 000 to 12 000 housing units in total could be provided at the topside developments at A16 site. If the ratio of public and private housing supply was 7:3, about 3 000 to 4 000 private housing units could be provided thereat. He estimated that based on the current data of the property market, the revenue to be generated from the topside developments of these 3 000 to 4 000 private housing units would be sufficient to fully finance the project and to cover the construction cost of</p>	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>around 7 000 to 8 000 public housing units atop. In this connection, he urged the Administration to request MTRCL to designate 70% of housing supply at A16 site to be public housing and to bear the construction cost incurred in full.</p> <p>The Administration responded that demolition of the existing Tuen Mun Swimming Pool after phased completion of its reprovisioning could help expedite the implementation of the project. In response to Mr TIEN's suggestion that revenue to be generated from the topside developments would be enough to cover the construction cost of the railway project and the public housing units atop, the Administration responded that the construction of public housing units would only be possible, if the revenue would be more than enough to finance the railway project, taking into account the actual land premium to be paid and other factors.</p>	
011237 – 011821	Chairman Mr Jeremy TAM Administration	Mr TAM enquired about the interface of TMS Extension with the possible future railway projects. The Administration responded that subject to the funding approval of the Finance Committee, DEVB planned to commence the studies related to artificial islands in the Central Waters to ascertain the feasibility of the priority road and rail links between the Hong Kong Island, the artificial islands in the Central Waters, Lantau and the coastal areas of Tuen Mun. The TMS Station might become an important interchange station for the above-mentioned proposed rail links. Close liaison would be maintained between THB and DEVB to ensure coordination in the design of TMS Extension, thereby enabling its interface with the possible future railway project.	
011822 – 012146	Chairman Deputy Chairman Mr Michael TIEN	Voting on motions proposed by members.	
<i>Agenda Item III – Progress update of the construction of Shatin to Central Link</i>			
012147 – 012806	Chairman Administration	Briefing by the Administration [LC Paper No. CB(4)646/19-20(03)].	
012807 – 013305	Chairman MTRCL	Briefing by MTRCL with the aid of a powerpoint presentation [LC Paper No. CB(4)730/19-20(02)].	
013306 – 013709	Chairman Mr Jeremy TAM Administration	Mr TAM enquired about the progress of discussion with MTRCL on the proposed additional project management cost of about \$1,371 million. The	



Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>Administration advised that the discussion with MTRCL was underway and both sides had yet to reach a settlement over this matter. The Administration stressed its stance that it would not fund any expenses in relation to the Hung Hom Station Extension incidents, which were estimated to be about \$2 billion. Further, the Administration did not see sufficient justifications to increase the project management cost of SCL payable to MTRCL.</p> <p>In response to Mr TAM's concern about the incidents of new signalling system test and drill exercises on East Rail Line happened on 23 and 25 May 2020 during non-traffic hours, the Administration said that MTRCL and relevant government departments would brief members on the incidents under another item of the agenda.</p>	
013710 – 014158	Chairman Ms Tanya CHAN Administration	<p>Ms CHAN pointed out that according to paragraph 285 of the Final Report, a strength reduction factor of 68.3% was applied in respect of the capping beam coupler connections. Notwithstanding that the station box structures were found to be safe according to the conclusion of the Commission of Inquiry into the Construction Works at and near the Hung Hom Station Extension under the Shatin to Central Link Project ("COI"), Ms CHAN asked the Administration whether it was acceptable that MTRCL failed to execute the SCL project in accordance with the standards and procedures specified in the relevant contracts; and whether the Administration would pursue the liabilities of MTRCL through legal means according to the Entrustment Agreement.</p> <p>The Administration responded that it would study the Final Report submitted by COI in detail and would pursue the liabilities of MTRCL for any loss incurred according to the Entrustment Agreement if the latter was found to be at fault. Since the construction of the Hung Hom Station Extension, North Approach Tunnels ("NAT"), South Approach Tunnels ("SAT") and Hung Hom Stabling Sidings ("HHS") spanned over a few years from 2013 to 2017, the Administration would require some time to review the works carried out thereat by MTRCL.</p>	
014159 – 014632	Chairman Ir Dr LO Wai-kwok Administration	Ir Dr LO urged the Administration and MTRCL to seriously follow up on COI's recommendations in relation to the adequacy of MTRCL's project	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
	MTRCL	<p>management system and the Administration's monitoring mechanism. He further opined that the Board of MTRCL should put more emphasis on the Corporation's risk management.</p> <p>Ir Dr LO sought details on the suitable measures implemented at the Hung Hom Station Extension as well as the technology to be adopted for the ongoing monitoring of the station structure. MTRCL advised that the Administration accepted in July 2019 MTRCL's two final reports on the holistic assessment strategy for the Hung Hom Station Extension and the verification study on as-constructed conditions of adjacent structures of Hung Hom Station. The suitable measures recommended in these two reports involved a combination of slab and wall thickening, additional dowel bar reinforcement, and some additional struts &amp; columns. The suitable measures were targeted to complete in June 2020.</p>	
014633 – 015230	Chairman Mr Michael TIEN Administration MTRCL	<p>Noting the COI's view that MTRCL and its contractor, Leighton Contractors (Asia) Limited ("Leighton"), were responsible for the serious deficiencies in their management and supervision systems, Mr TIEN asked whether the Administration would consider not paying MTRCL the amount of the project management cost for the construction works at the Hung Hom Station Extension. Mr TIEN estimated that the amount concerned was about \$700 million.</p> <p>The Administration reiterated that based on the conclusions of the Final Report, the Administration would study the responsibilities of MTRCL and follow up according to the Entrustment Agreement.</p> <p>Mr TIEN opined that the Administration should hold accountable the main government officials who were then responsible for designing and establishing such a site supervision mechanism.</p> <p>The Administration responded that it was currently studying measures to improve the site supervision mechanism and was actively following up with the COI's recommendations, with a view to enhancing the Administration's monitoring mechanism.</p> <p>In response to Mr TIEN's enquiry about the retrofitting of Automatic Platform Gates ("APG") along the East Rail Line, MTRCL advised that</p>	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>relevant preparatory works were substantially completed. The installation of new APGs would commence soon after the existing train fleet of the East Rail Line was fully replaced by the new trains. The retrofitting works would be carried out in four batches and the first batch is expected to complete by the end of 2022.</p>	
015231 – 015701	Chairman Dr Helena WONG Administration	<p>Upon Dr WONG's request, the Administration undertook to follow up with the MTRCL to provide information on whether the set of updated trigger levels currently adopted in the SCL project would be applied to other similar railway projects for monitoring the settlement of nearby structures; and the number of building units which received financial assistance under the "To Kwa Wan Community Care Programme".</p> <p>Referring to paragraph 21 of the Administration's paper, Dr WONG enquired if any legal proceedings in relation to the Hung Hom Station Extension incident had commenced. The Administration understood that the Buildings Department ("BD") prosecuted Leighton under the Buildings Ordinance (Cap. 123) in May 2020. Since the case had entered the judicial process, it was not appropriate to comment at this stage. THB did not have information on hand regarding the criminal investigations and prosecutions in respect of the Hung Hom Station Extension incident (if any), given that the responsibility to investigate any criminal offences rested with the relevant law enforcement agencies. The Administration stressed that the redaction of parts of the Final Report was based on legal considerations to avoid any prejudice (actual or perceived) to relevant criminal investigations and any potential prosecutions of any criminal offences in the future.</p>	Admin (paragraph 8 of the minutes referred)
015702 – 020113	Chairman Mr LAM Cheuk-ting Administration	<p>Mr LAM was dissatisfied with the Administration's position that the Hung Hom Station Extension incident was mainly an issue of site supervision. He took the view that the Secretary for Transport and Housing ("STH") should be held accountable and step down.</p> <p>The Administration advised that as mentioned in previous occasions, the observations raised and shortfalls identified by COI in its Final Report were mainly issues related to site management and supervision. Insofar as the railway development in</p>	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>Hong Kong was concerned, THB was responsible for the overall planning and formulation of policies, while the Highways Department was responsible for the planning and delivery of railway projects. As the former Chairman of the Board of MTRCL had said before, the Board of MTRCL had not been notified about the works quality problems at Hung Hom Station Extension before they were revealed by the media in May 2018.</p>	
020114 – 020616	<p>Chairman Dr CHENG Chung-tai Administration</p>	<p>Dr CHENG expressed dissatisfaction that paragraphs 228 and 229 of the Final Report were redacted. In his view, these two paragraphs contained important information on the COI's findings in respect of the alleged cutting of threads from the end of steel reinforcement bars at the Hung Hom Station Extension.</p> <p>In reply to Dr CHENG's enquiry, STH said that he did not have sight of the redacted parts of the Final Report. The Administration advised that the Department of Justice had been consulted on the manner of publication of the Final Report.</p>	
020617 – 021035	<p>Chairman Deputy Chairman Administration</p>	<p>The Deputy Chairman enquired how and when the Administration would follow up the responsibilities of MTRCL in the Hung Hom Station Extension incident. The Administration reiterated that it was actively following up with the COI's comments and recommendations and would study the responsibilities of MTRCL based on the COI's conclusions. The Administration would pursue the liabilities of MTRCL for any loss incurred according to the Entrustment Agreement if the latter was found to be at fault.</p> <p>The Deputy Chairman enquired whether the Administration would reduce the project management cost of SCL payable to MTRCL taking into account the responsibilities of MTRCL for the works quality problems in the construction of SCL project. The Administration reiterated its position in this regard.</p>	
021036 – 021523	<p>Chairman Administration</p>	<p>The Chairman also asked whether the Administration would reduce the project management cost of SCL payable to MTRCL having regard to the mismanagement on the part of MTRCL. The Administration reiterated its position in this regard.</p>	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>Noting that the Administration was examining the feasibility of establishing a new department specifically tasked to supervise and monitor the planning and delivery of railway projects following the direction as recommended by COI, the Chairman enquired about the division of responsibilities between the proposed new department and the Railway Branch of the Electrical and Mechanical Services Department ("EMSD"). The Administration advised that it would put in place measures to promote synergy and collaborative culture between the proposed new department and the Railway Branch of EMSD.</p> <p>The Chairman also called on the Administration to leverage on the technology to streamline the site supervision mechanism. The Administration noted that COI in its Final Report had made recommendations in respect of the adoption of technology on site. The Administration and MTRCL had been actively following up with the recommendations with a view to ensuring that the recommended measures would be properly implemented. Additionally, the Administration would conduct independent follow-up audit on the progress of implementation of the measures recommended in both the COI's Interim Report and Final Report.</p>	
021524 – 021927	Chairman Dr Priscilla LEUNG Administration MTRCL	<p>Dr LEUNG considered that apart from holding the management of MTRCL accountable for the works quality issues of the SCL project, the Administration should reduce the project management cost payable to MTRCL. She further asked whether compensations or fare concessions would be provided to residents living in the vicinity of SCL stations who were affected by the project delay.</p> <p>MTRCL advised that in view of the public concern, MTRCL launched the "To Kwa Wan Community Care Programme" on a "without prejudice basis" to provide financial support to owners of residential buildings in the vicinity of the construction sites of To Kwa Wan Station to carry out the repairing works. The programme was concluded in late 2019 and more than 200 cases were handled in total.</p> <p>Dr LEUNG enquired about the use of technology for ongoing monitoring of the structure of Hung</p>	

<b>Time marker</b>	<b>Speaker</b>	<b>Subject(s)</b>	<b>Action required</b>
		<p>Hom Station Extension so as to provide assurance to the public.</p> <p>In response, the Administration advised that to promote assurance on railway safety, MTRCL had to submit to the Government the Certification of Completion together with relevant documents for vetting and approval upon completion of the relevant works. The government departments concerned including the Fire Services Department, BD and EMSD would conduct stringent statutory inspections to ensure safe and smooth operation of various systems in preparation for the commissioning of new railway line.</p>	
021928-022024	Chairman Mr Jeremy TAM	<p>Discussion on the special meeting arrangement.</p> <p>Mr TAM's enquiry about the Administration's response to his letter on the incident of the new signalling system testing on Tsuen Wan Line, and the Chairman's response.</p> <p>Closing remarks.</p>	