# 立法會 Legislative Council

LC Paper No. CB(1)1165/20-21 (These minutes have been seen by the Administration)

Ref: CB1/BC/1/20/2

Bills Committee Formed on 16 October 2020 to Study the Waste Disposal (Charging for Municipal Solid Waste) (Amendment) Bill 2018

# Minutes of the fifth meeting held on Friday, 25 June 2021, at 8:30 am in Conference Room 1 of the Legislative Council Complex

**Members present**: Hon Frankie YICK Chi-ming, SBS, JP (Chairman)

Hon Steven HO Chun-yin, BBS (Deputy Chairman)

Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, GBS, JP Hon Tommy CHEUNG Yu-yan, GBS, JP

Hon CHAN Hak-kan, BBS, JP Hon Paul TSE Wai-chun, JP Hon YIU Si-wing, BBS

Hon MA Fung-kwok, GBS, JP

Hon KWOK Wai-keung, JP

Hon Martin LIAO Cheung-kong, GBS, JP Ir Dr Hon LO Wai-kwok, SBS, MH, JP

Hon CHUNG Kwok-pan

Dr Hon Junius HO Kwan-yiu, JP Hon Wilson OR Chong-shing, MH

Dr Hon Pierre CHAN

Dr Hon CHENG Chung-tai

Hon Vincent CHENG Wing-shun, MH, JP

Hon Tony TSE Wai-chuen, BBS, JP

**Members absent**: Hon Elizabeth QUAT, BBS, JP

Hon SHIU Ka-fai, JP

**Public Officers** attending

: For item II

Mr TSE Chin-wan, BBS, JP Under Secretary for the Environment

Mr Bruno LUK

Deputy Director of Environmental Protection (Waste Reduction Policy)

**Environmental Protection Department** 

Miss Jessica CHENG Assistant Director (Waste Reduction Policy) Environmental Protection Department

Mr Ken WONG Assistant Director (Environmental Compliance)

**Environmental Protection Department** 

Principal Environmental Protection Officer (Strategic Facilities Development and Planning)/Acting Assistant Director (Waste Infrastructure Planning)
Environmental Protection Department

Ms Theresa WU

Mr Michael LUI

Principal Environmental Protection Officer (Community Relations)
Environmental Protection Department

Mr LEUNG Yat-king Assistant Director (Operations)3 Food and Environmental Hygiene Department

Mr LAI Siu-kwong Senior Superintendent (Municipal Solid Waste Charging)

Food and Environmental Hygiene Department

Mr Gilbert MO Deputy Law Draftsman Department of Justice

**Clerk in attendance:** Ms Angel SHEK

Chief Council Secretary (1)1

**Staff in attendance**: Miss Evelyn LEE

Assistant Legal Adviser 10

Mr Jason KONG

Senior Council Secretary (1)1

Action

#### I. Confirmation of minutes

(LC Paper No. CB(1)713/ — Minutes of the meeting held on 20-21 27 January 2021

LC Paper No. CB(1)765/ — Minutes of the meeting held on 20-21 25 February 2021)

The minutes of the meetings held on 27 January and 25 February 2021 were confirmed.

### **II.** Meeting with the Administration

## Matters arising from previous meetings

(LC Paper No. CB(1)746/ — Information note on "Administration's 20-21(01) Response to Various Issues Raised by Members" provided by the Administration

LC Paper No. CB(1)880/ — List of follow-up actions arising from 20-21(01) the meeting on 25 February 2021

LC Paper No. CB(1)880/ — Administration's response to the list of follow-up actions arising from the meeting on 25 February 2021

LC Paper No. CB(1)1013/ — Information note on "Legislative Intent 20-21(01) of Proposed Sections 20K to 20P for the Waste Disposal Ordinance (Cap. 354) in relation to the Mandatory Use of Designated Garbage Bags or Designated Labels" provided by the

Administration

LC Paper No. CB(1)1013/ — Information note provided by the 20-21(02) Administration on its proposed

amendments (enclosing the draft amendments)

LC Paper No. CB(3)97/ — The Bill 18-19

File Ref: EP CR/9/65/3 — Legislative Council Brief

LC Paper No. LS13/18-19 — Legal Service Division Report

LC Paper No. CB(1)205/ — Marked-up copy of the Bill prepared by the Legal Service Division (Restricted to Members)

LC Paper No. CB(1)205/ — Assistant Legal Adviser's letter dated 18-19(02) 4 December 2018 to the Administration

LC Paper No. CB(1)396/ — Administration's reply to Assistant Legal Adviser's letter dated 4 December 2018

LC Paper No. CB(1)875/ — Assistant Legal Adviser's letter dated 18-19(03) 25 March 2019 to the Administration

LC Paper No. CB(1)1000/ — Administration's reply to Assistant 18-19(04) Legal Adviser's letter dated 25 March 2019

LC Paper No. CB(1)1045/ — Assistant Legal Adviser's letter dated 20-21(01) 24 June 2021 to the Administration)

# Relevant paper

(LC Paper No. CB(1)849/ — Report of the Bills Committee on Waste 19-20 — Disposal (Charging for Municipal Solid Waste) (Amendment) Bill 2018)

#### Discussion

2. <u>The Bills Committee</u> deliberated and completed the clause-by-clause examination of the Bill as well as scrutiny of the draft amendments proposed by the Administration to the Bill (vide Annex to LC Paper No. CB(1)1013/20-21(02)) (index of proceedings attached at the **Annex**).

#### Action

# Follow-up action to be taken by the Administration

3. <u>The Administration</u> would provide a written response to the issues raised in the Assistant Legal Adviser's letter dated 24 June 2021 (LC Paper No. CB(1)1045/20-21(01)).

(*Post-meeting note*: The Administration's reply was circulated to members on 21 July 2021, vide LC Paper No. CB(1)1112/20-21(01).)

# III. Any other business

4. There being no other business, the meeting ended at 10:26 am.

Council Business Division 1 <u>Legislative Council Secretariat</u> 29 July 2021

# Bills Committee Formed on 16 October 2020 to Study the Waste Disposal (Charging for Municipal Solid Waste) (Amendment) Bill 2018

# Proceedings of the fifth meeting on Friday, 25 June 2021, at 8:30 am in Conference Room 1 of the Legislative Council Complex

Time marker	Speaker	Subject	Action required	
Agenda Ite	m I – Confirmation	of minutes		
000557 – 000630	Chairman	Confirmation of the minutes of the meetings held on 27 January and 25 February 2021.		
Agenda Ite	Agenda Item II – Meeting with the Administration			
000631 – 001340	Chairman Administration	The Administration briefed members on (a) its written response to the list of follow-up actions arising from the meeting on 25 February 2021 (LC Paper No. CB(1)880/20-21(02)); and (b) the information note on "Administration's Response to Various Issues Raised by Members" (LC Paper No. CB(1)746/20-21(01)).		
		The Chairman sought clarification on the Administration's undertakings in respect of the duration of the preparatory period (to be put in place after the passage of the Bill and before the actual implementation of the proposed municipal solid waste ("MSW") charging scheme) and the provision of free designated bags ("DBs") during the initial stage of the scheme's implementation.		
		The Administration affirmed that as a basic arrangement, the preparatory period would last for 18 months (after the Bill had been passed). As regards the provision of free DBs, the Administration was studying different options.		
001341 – 001819	Chairman Mr Vincent CHENG Administration	Mr CHENG reiterated that the Democratic Alliance for the Betterment and Progress of Hong Kong supported the Bill in principle but was concerned about the implementation details of the proposed MSW charging scheme and potential aggravation of illegal waste disposal.		
		Mr CHENG asked whether the Administration had set any indicators for assessing the need to extend the preparatory period.		
		The Administration advised that it would maintain close communication with stakeholders and take into account a host of factors including prevailing economic situation, readiness of relevant stakeholders for implementation of the proposed MSW charging scheme, etc., when considering the commencement date of the Bill (if it was passed). Mr CHENG asked about the details of the provision of free DBs, including the planned duration of the initiative. The		

required
he duration should be long enough to e. to allow the public to adapt to the te proper waste disposal habits.  vised that it would take time to study
I discuss operational details with ministration would consult the Panel Affairs ("EA Panel") on the al at an opportune time.
I's question about the quantity of free d to each person/household, the d that a reasonable quantity of DBs for the purpose. A waste producer se DBs if the quantity of free DBs ally satisfy his/her need.
airman asked whether the revenue charging was expected to fully cover nting the proposed MSW charging inistration responded that it had additional resources of no less than lion annually from the financial year was to be implemented to strengthen action and recycling. The amount of the commensurate with the estimated merated from MSW charging so as to redicated-fund-for-dedicated-use".
fectiveness of surveillance camera ening enforcement against illegal and demolition waste.
considered that the Administration's lace an 18-month preparatory period sentiment.
e initial plan for the provision of free ion advised that its initial idea was to Housing Department and property s ("PMCs") for provision of free DBs lic rental housing estates and other with PMCs respectively. The also studying potential modes of types of premises, such as "three-nil redination and manpower requirement did not object to the Bill but was

Time marker	Speaker	Subject	Action required
		concerned about the coordination among relevant government departments in implementing the proposed MSW charging scheme and preventing/tackling fly-tipping problems. The Administration responded that it would establish a Municipal Solid Waste Reduction Office (after the Bill had been passed) to coordinate the efforts of relevant government departments.	
		Ir Dr LO expressed concern about undue expansion of EPD's establishment for enforcing the proposed MSW charging scheme. The Administration explained that about 200 staff (most of which were non-civil service contract staff) had been recruited for the provision of outreaching services to assist in practising clean recycling at community level in preparation for the implementation of MSW charging. The Administration would critically examine the need to create additional posts for enforcing the proposed MSW charging scheme, having regard to the compliance situation and other factors, with a view to ensuring prudent use of public resources.	
003439 – 004227	Chairman Dr CHENG Chung-tai Administration	Provision of free designated bags  Dr CHENG expressed serious doubt over the justification for and practicability of the proposal of providing free DBs on a territory-wide basis in the initial stage of the implementation of the proposed MSW charging scheme (after the Bill had been passed), as this would involve a very large quantity of free DBs and complex administrative issues, and some PMCs might not be willing to participate in free DB distribution.	
		The Administration responded that the provision of free DBs through PMCs should be technically feasible, as most of them had been regularly providing garbage bags to individual households. That said, the Administration would need to discuss the operational details of free DB provision with PMCs.	
		Free collection and delivery service for food waste	
		As most residential premises had yet to be covered by the Administration's free food waste collection and delivery service, Dr CHENG expressed grave concern that the general public would be in effect subsidizing the operators of some commercial and industrial ("C&I") establishments and public institutions in terms of food waste handling, given that the Administration's recycling work would be funded by revenue to be generated from MSW charging.	
		The Chairman suggested that the Administration should	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject	Action required
		consider expanding the free food waste collection and delivery service to residential premises in the long run.  The Administration responded that while C&I and public sectors were initial service targets because it was easier to collect their source-separated food waste, the Administration had plans to gradually expand the service to residential premises in the long run, subject to the development progress of food waste treatment facilities.	
004228 – 005057	Chairman Mr Tony TSE Administration	Further discussion on the provision of free designated bags.  The Chairman suggested that the Administration should consider conducting informal meetings with Members on the operational details of the provision of free DBs.  Mr TSE asked how the Administration would assist the catering trade in practising source separation of food waste. The Administration responded that it planned to conduct more trials on source separation and collection of food waste in collaboration with associations of the catering trade during the preparatory period.	
005058 – 005722	Chairman Mr Martin LIAO Administration	Mr LIAO commented that getting buy-in from the community would be pivotal to the successful implementation of the proposed MSW charging scheme.  The Administration explained the three-pronged implementation strategy for the scheme, namely "education first", "community support" and "outreaching assistance". While evasion of MSW charges was likely to occur in the initial stage of the implementation of the proposed MSW charging scheme according to the experiences of other cities, it was envisaged that the provision of free DBs would help cultivate proper waste disposal habits and prevent fly-tipping or disposal of non-compliant waste ("NCW") to a certain extent.	
005723 – 010456	Chairman Mr KWOK Wai- keung Administration	Discussion on promoting the development of local green industries and creation of green-collar jobs through the proposed MSW charging scheme and other initiatives to promote waste separation and recycling.	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject	Action required
010457 – 010802	Chairman Mr Vincent CHENG Administration	Discussion on enforcement against non-compliance with the proposed MSW charging scheme (after the Bill had been passed).  Regarding the operational details of the provision of free DBs, the Administration advised that it would consider setting up a working group to better engage Members in relevant discussions and formulation of the implementation proposal.  In response to Mr CHENG's enquiry, the Administration advised that it would prioritize different target groups for the provision of free DBs based on their needs.	required
010803 – 011515	Chairman Dr CHENG Chung-tai Administration	Dr CHENG said that he did not support the Bill as the proposed MSW charging scheme would increase the financial burden on the public. He also expressed the following views and concerns:  (a) there might be a low level of buy-in from the grassroots for the proposed MSW charging scheme, which might lead to evasion of MSW charges;  (b) implementation of the proposed MSW charging	
		scheme might result in property management fee hikes; and  (c) some waste handlers might take small bribes for handling NCW in an illegal manner upon the implementation of the proposed MSW charging scheme.  Discussion on the design of DBs.	
011516 – 011737	Chairman Mr KWOK Wai- keung Administration Clerk	Preliminary discussion on the legislative timetable.	
011738 – 012318	Chairman Administration Assistant Legal Adviser ("ALA")	The Administration briefed members on LC Paper No. CB(1)1013/20-21(01) and the information note on its proposed amendments (LC Paper No. CB(1)1013/20-21(02)).  At the Chairman's invitation, ALA drew members' attention to the issues raised in her letter dated 24 June 2021 to the Administration (LC Paper No. CB(1)1045/20-21(01)). The	Admin (paragraph 3 of the
Clause-by-	clause examination	Administration advised that it would provide a written response to the issues.  of the Bill	minutes refers)

Time marker	Speaker	Subject	Action required	
`	[The Bill (LC Paper No. CB(3)97/18-19)] [Amendments to the Bill proposed by the Administration (Annex to LC Paper No. CB(1)1013/20-21(02))]			
[Amenamei	uts to the Bill propos	sea by the Aaministration (Annex to LC Paper No. CB(1)1013/2	0-21(02))]	
012319 – 012449	Chairman Administration	The Bills Committee decided to examine the Chinese text of the Bill with the amendments proposed by the Administration, as set out in Annex to LC Paper No. CB(1)1013/20-21(02).		
		Part 1 – Preliminary		
		Clause 1 – Short title and commencement		
		Clause 2 – Enactments amended		
		Members did not raise any question on the above clauses.		
012450 - 013142	Chairman Administration	Part 2 – Amendments to Waste Disposal Ordinance		
		<u>Clause 3 – Section 2 amended (interpretation)</u>		
		Clause 3(3)		
		In response to the Chairman's enquiry, the Administration explained that it proposed replacing the terms "public waste vehicle" and "private waste vehicle" with "waste vehicle in Government service" and "waste vehicle in private use (with compactor)" respectively. It also proposed defining a new term "waste vehicle in private use (without compactor)", the MSW collected through which would be subject to the gate fee.		
013143 -	Chairman	Clause 4 – Part IVB added		
014116	Administration ALA	<u>Division 1 – Purpose of Part IVB</u>		
		20J. Purpose of Part IVB		
		<u>Division 2 – Mandatory Use of Designated Bags or Designated Labels</u>		
		20K. Depositing non-compliant waste prohibited		
		20L. Depositing non-compliant waste by removal services provider prohibited		
		The Administration advised that the proposed section 20L of Cap. 354 sought to provide for an offence to prevent waste handlers from being requested or instructed to assist in disposing of NCW. The proposed section was not applicable to Government-employed waste handlers.		

Time marker	Speaker	Subject	Action required
		ALA pointed out that in paragraphs 2 and 3 of LC Paper No. CB(1)1045/20-21(01), she had asked the Administration to provide clarifications on several issues in connection with the difference in treatment between Government-employed and non-Government-employed waste handlers. She would study the written response to be provided by the Administration, and further report to the Bills Committee on related issues if necessary.	
		20M. Delivering non-compliant waste to certain persons prohibited	
		20N. Depositing labelled municipal solid waste onto private waste vehicle prohibited [proposed to be deleted under the Administration's amendments to the Bill]	
		200. Delivering labelled municipal solid waste to certain removal services provider prohibited [proposed to be deleted under the Administration's amendments to the Bill]	
		The Administration advised that it had proposed deleting the proposed sections 20N and 20O of Cap. 354, to the effect that private waste collectors ("PWCs") would be allowed to use refuse collection vehicles with compactors for collecting MSW affixed with DLs. PWCs would therefore have more flexibility in their collection arrangements for oversized waste.	
		The Chairman agreed that the two proposed sections should be deleted.	
		20P. Depositing non-compliant waste in certain common areas prohibited	
		20Q. Defences to particular offences	
		20R. Penalties for particular offences	
		No question was raised on the above three proposed sections of Cap. 354.	
014117 – 014244	Chairman Administration ALA	20RA. Exemption from section 20K, 20L or 20M granted on application [proposed to be added under the Administration's amendments to the Bill]	
		20RB. Exemption from section 20K, 20L or 20M granted on Director's own initiative [proposed to be added under the Administration's amendments to the Bill]  The Administration advised that sections 20RA and 20RB were proposed to be added to Cap. 354 to empower the Director of Environmental Protection ("DEP") to grant	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject	Action required
		exemption, on a per application basis (20RA) or upon DEP's initiative (20RB), from the proposed sections 20K(1), 20L(1) and 20M(1) in relation to any deposit or delivery of MSW, if certain conditions were satisfied.	•
		ALA drew members' attention to the questions raised in LC Paper No. CB(1)1045/20-21(01) regarding the above two proposed sections.	
014245 - 014730	Chairman Administration	Division 3 – Designated Bags and Designated Labels	
014730	Administration	20S. Who may produce, sell or supply for free	
		20T. Director may specify requirements	
		20U. Sale by unauthorized person prohibited	
		20V. Sale at other than prescribed price prohibited	
		20W. Certain free supply prohibited	
		Members did not raise any question on the above proposed sections of Cap. 354.	
		<u>Division 4 – Miscellaneous Provisions</u>	
		20X. Prescribed signs	
		20Y. Waste vehicles must exhibit prescribed sign in certain circumstances	
		In response to the Chairman's enquiry, the Administration advised that specific requirements would be made on the specifications of the prescribed sign to be exhibited at refuse collection points and on waste vehicles as well as the ways of exhibition.	
		20Z. Vehicles must not exhibit prescribed sign in certain circumstances	
		20ZA. Designated bag not subject to Product Ecoresponsibility Ordinance	
		Members did not raise any question on the proposed sections 20Z and 20ZA of Cap. 354.	
		Clause 5 – Section 24 amended (when appeal may be brought)	
		Clause 6 – Section 31 amended (mental ingredients of	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject	Action required
		<u>certain offences under the Ordinance)</u>	•
		Clause 7 – Section 33 amended (regulations)	
		Clause 8 – Section 37 amended (amendment of Schedules)	
		Clause 9 – Schedule 14 added	
		Clause 10 – Schedule 14 amended	
		No question was raised on the above clauses.	
014731 – 015526	Chairman Administration	Part 3 – Amendments to Waste Disposal (Refuse Transfer Station) Regulation	
		Clause 11 – Title amended	
		Clause 12 – Section 2 amended (interpretation)	
		The Bills Committee noted that the Bill proposed adding the definitions of "Type A account-holder" and "Type B account-holder" to section 2 of the Waste Disposal (Refuse Transfer Station) Regulation (Cap. 354M). In response to the Chairman's enquiry, the Administration explained that a waste producer might register as a Type A account-holder for paying the gate fee directly; while a PWC might register as a Type B account-holder, who could pay the gate fee upfront and recoup it from its client.	
		Clause 13 – Section 3 amended (application)	
		Clause 14 – Section 4 substituted	
		4. Disposal of municipal solid waste at scheduled facilities	
		4A. Exemption from section 4 [proposed to be added under the Administration's amendments to the Bill]	
		4B. Supplementary provision for section 4A [proposed to be added under the Administration's amendments to the Bill]	
		<u>Clause 15 – Section 5 repealed (application for registration)</u>	
		Clause 16 – Sections 5A and 5B added	
		5A. Application for registration as Type A account-holder	
		5B. Application for registration as Type B account-holder	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject	Action required
		<u>Clause 17 – Section 6 repealed (Director may register account-holders and vehicles)</u>	
		Clause 18 – Sections 6A and 6B added	
		6A. Director may register Type A account-holders and vehicles	
		6B. Director may register Type B account-holders	
		Clause 19 – Section 7 repealed (registration of additional vehicle, etc.)	
		Clause 20 – Section 7A added	
		7A. Registration of additional vehicle etc. for Type A account-holders	
		<u>Clause 21 – Section 8 amended (register of account-holder)</u>	
		Clause 22 – Section 9 substituted	
		9. Recording of weight and time at weighbridge	
		<u>Clause 23 – Section 10 amended (charges for disposal of waste)</u>	
		Clause 24 – Section 11 amended (payment of charges and levy of surcharge)	
		Claude 25 – Section 12 repealed (deposit)	
		Clause 26 – Section 12A added	
		12A. Deposit	
		<u>Clause 27 – Section 13 amended (revocation of registration)</u>	
		Clause 28 – Sections 13A, 13B and 13C added	
		13A. Revocation of registration of Type A account-holder	
		13B. Revocation of registration of Type B account-holder	
		13C. Director to give notice of revocation of registration	
		<u>Clause 29 – Section 14 amended (Director may appoint designated officers)</u>	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject	Action required
		Clause 30 – Section 16 substituted	
		16. No charge for certain municipal solid waste	
		Clause 31 – Section 17 amended (notice, etc. given by the Director)	
		Clause 32 – Section 18 amended (offences and penalties)	
		Clause 33 – Sections 19 and 20 added	
		19. Secretary may revise charges in Schedule	
		20. Termination of pre-existing accounts	
		<u>Clause 34 – Schedule amended (charges for disposal of waste at refuse transfer stations)</u>	
		Members did not raise any question on clauses 13 to 34.	
015527 – 015637	Chairman Administration	Part 4 – Amendment to Waste Disposal (Charges for Disposal of Construction Waste) Regulation	
		Clause 35 – Section 25 added	
		25. Charges at above cost recovery level	
		Part 5 – Amendments to Fixed Penalty (Public Cleanliness and Obstruction) Ordinance	
		Clause 36 – Schedule 1 amended (scheduled offence)	
		Clause 37 – Schedule 2 amended (authorities and public officers)	
		Members did not raise any question on clauses 35 to 37.	
015638 - 015648	Chairman Administration	The Bills Committee completed clause-by-clause examination of the Bill.	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject	Action required
Agenda Ite	m III – Any other b	usiness	
015649 – 020017	Chairman Clerk Administration	Discussion on the legislative timetable.  The Chairman emphasized the need for the Administration to provide operational guidelines to cleansing service providers to clearly inform cleansing workers of the requirements of the proposed MSW charging scheme.  In response to the Chairman's suggestion, the Administration affirmed that it planned to collaborate with the Property Management Services Authority for dissemination of such operational guidelines.	

Council Business Division 1 <u>Legislative Council Secretariat</u> 29 July 2021