For information

Report on Significant Deviations between Accepted Tender Prices and Estimated Provisions in the Approved Project Estimates (for Capital Works Contracts Awarded in the Third Quarter of 2020)

On 21 April 2004, the Director of Audit published a report¹ on the value-for-money audit on the Harbour Area Treatment Scheme Stage I project. Among other observations, the Director of Audit took note of significant deviations between the accepted tender prices for some works contracts under this project and those estimated in the Approved Project Estimates (APE). The Public Accounts Committee (PAC) recommended in its June 2004 report that, in order to ensure effective monitoring on the use of funding, works departments should inform the Legislative Council (LegCo) when there is a difference of \$15 million or more between the accepted tender price and the estimated provision in the APE.

- 2. In response to the recommendation of PAC, the Administration had agreed to submit quarterly reports to LegCo on significant deviations between the accepted tender prices for capital works projects and the estimated provision in the APE when these "equal/exceed \$15 million or 10% of the original estimated provisions in the APE, whichever is the greater" ². We submitted the first report covering projects up to end December 2004 to PAC on 4 February 2005 and were directed by the Clerk to the Finance Committee that future reports should be addressed to the Public Works Subcommittee.
- 3. For the quarter ending September 2020, 23 capital works contracts meet the stipulated reporting criterion. Relevant details of the contracts are set out at the **Annex** attached.

Development Bureau Works Branch March 2021

¹ See Director of Audit's Report No. 42, Chapter 3

² See paragraph 25 of the Government's Minute in response to Report No. 42 of the Public Accounts Committee tabled at the LegCo on 20 October 2004

Report on Significant Deviations between Accepted Tender Prices and Estimated Provisions in the Approved Project Estimates (for Capital Works Contracts Awarded in the Third Quarter of 2020)

(1) Department: <u>Architectural Services Department</u>

Project Code Contract No.	Project Title Contract Title/ Award Date	Approved Project Estimate (APE)	(A) Sum Allowed in APE for the Contract	(B) Accepted Tender Price	(A) – (B) Difference
		\$	million (in	MOD prices	s)
3468RO	Improvement of Lam Wah Street Playground and adjacent area	145.50			
SS H516	Improvement of Lam Wah Street Playground and adjacent area/ 10 July 2020		115.30	89.35	25.95
		sum allowed due to ke market corrates in the key items follows - (a) Contra (b) Demol (c) Building	price is low or the contra- tition under hich resulte tenders. De ificant savi- ries (\$14.04 million); 3.88 million) 3.41 million	ct. This is prevailing d in lower etails of the ngs are as million);	

Project Code	Project Title	Approved	(A)	(B)	(A) – (B)
Contract No.	Contract Title/ Award Date	Project Estimate (APE)	Sum Allowed in APE for the Contract	Accepted Tender Price	Difference
			s million (ir	MOD price	es)
3288RS	Swimming pool complex and open space in Area 107, Tin Shui Wai	1,336.00			
SS J507	Construction of a swimming pool complex and open space in Area 107, Tin Shui Wai/ 3 September 2020		1,032.50	758.00	274.50
		The accepted tender price is lower that sum allowed in APE for the contract. is due to keen competition under prevents market conditions, which resulted in rates in the returned tenders. Details key items with significant savings a follows - (a) Contract preliminaries (\$112.19 mil (b) External works (\$94.33 million); (c) Building works (\$48.32 million); and (d) Building services installations and (\$19.66 million).			

(2) Department: <u>Civil Engineering and Development Department</u>

Project Code Contract No.	Project Title Contract Title/ Award Date	Approved Project Estimate (APE)	(A) Sum Allowed in APE for the Contract	(B) Accepted Tender Price	(A) – (B) Difference	
		\$	million (in	MOD prices	s)	
5001BX (block allocation)	Landslip Preventive Measures					
Item No. 1.112	Landslip Prevention and Mitigation Programme, 2019, package K, landslip prevention and mitigation works	179.96				
GE/2019/01	Landslip Prevention and Mitigation Programme, 2019, package K, landslip prevention and mitigation works in Hong Kong Island, Kowloon, New Territories and Outlying Islands/ 27 August 2020		137.43	119.66	17.77	
		The accepted tender price is lower than the sum allowed in APE for the contract. This due to keen competition under prevailing market conditions, which resulted in lower rates in the returned tenders. Details of the key items with significant savings are a follows - (a) Contract preliminaries and site clearance (\$9.01 million); (b) Geotechnical works (\$1.19 million); and (c) Ancillary works (\$7.57 million).				

Project Title Contract Title/ Award Date	Approved Project Estimate (APE)	(A) Sum Allowed in APE for the Contract	(B) Accepted Tender Price	(A) – (B) Difference
		million (in	MOD price	es)
Advance site formation and engineering infrastructure works at Kwu Tung North New Development Area and Fanling North New Development Area	17,320.10			
Fanling North New Development Area, phase 1: Fanling Bypass Eastern Section (Shek Wu San Tsuen North to Lung Yeuk Tau)/ 30 July 2020		2,945.88	2,148.00	797.88
	The accepted tender price is lower than the sum allowed in APE for the contract. This is due to			
	n lo	narket condi	itions, which	resulted in
	ii) adopting contractor's alte			bring in egies with ciency and
		-		significant
	(b) V m (c) N (d) S	\$338.07 mill laducts and nillion); loise barrie \$189.85 mill ewage pum	lion); d footbridge er and other lion); and uping station	r structures
	Advance site formation and engineering infrastructure works at Kwu Tung North New Development Area and Fanling North New Development Area Fanling North New Development Area, phase 1: Fanling Bypass Eastern Section (Shek Wu San Tsuen North to Lung Yeuk Tau)/	Title Contract Title/ Award Date Advance site formation and engineering infrastructure works at Kwu Tung North New Development Area and Fanling North New Development Area, phase 1: Fanling Bypass Eastern Section (Shek Wu San Tsuen North to Lung Yeuk Tau)/ 30 July 2020 The accesum allow is due to i) k n le a ii) a d c c h h Details saving: (a) D (3) (b) V n (c) N (d) (d) S	Title Contract Title/ Award Date Advance site formation and engineering infrastructure works at Kwu Tung North New Development Area and Fanling North New Development Area, phase 1: Fanling Bypass Eastern Section (Shek Wu San Tsuen North to Lung Yeuk Tau)/ 30 July 2020 The accepted tender sum allowed in APE is due to i) keen compe market cond lower rates and ii) adopting c design, wh construction higher cons hence resulte Details of the key savings are as folic (a) Depressed (\$338.07 mill (b) Viaducts an million); (c) Noise barrie (\$189.85 mill (d) Sewage pum	Title Contract Title/ Award Date Advance site formation and engineering infrastructure works at Kwu Tung North New Development Area and Fanling North New Development Area, phase 1: Fanling Bypass Eastern Section (Shek Wu San Tsuen North to Lung Yeuk Tau)/ 30 July 2020 The accepted tender price is low sum allowed in APE for the con is due to i) keen competition under market conditions, which lower rates in the return and ii) adopting contractor's design, which would construction methodole higher construction effi hence resulted in significal Details of the key items with savings are as follows — (a) Depressed road and (\$338.07 million); (b) Viaducts and footbridge million); (c) Noise barrier and other (\$189.85 million); and

Project Code	Project Title	Approved Project	(A) Sum	(B) Accepted	(A) – (B) Difference
Contract No.	Contract Title/ Award Date	Estimate (APE)	Allowed in APE for the Contract	Tender Price	
		\$	S million (in	MOD price	es)
ND/2019/07	Fanling North New Development Area, phase 1: site formation and infrastructure works/ 17 August 2020	sum allow is due to market c	wed in APE keen componditions, v	price is low for the concetition under which results	tract. This r prevailing ed in lower
		key item follows -	etails of the ngs are as a million); and		
		(c) Infras	structure wo	orks (\$55.95 i	million).

Project Code Contract No.	Project Title Contract Title/ Award Date	Approved Project Estimate (APE)	(A) Sum Allowed in APE for the Contract	(B) Accepted Tender Price	(A) – (B) Difference
		\$	S million (in	MOD price	es)
7831CL SD/2019/02	West Kowloon Reclamation—main works (remainder)—footbridge at the junction of Sham Mong Road and Hing Wah Street West in Sham Shui Po West Kowloon Reclamation—main works (remainder)—footbridge at the junction of Sham Mong Road and Hing Wah Street West in Sham Shui Po/ 13 July 2020	331.90	274.00	218.00	56.00
		The accepted tender price is lower than sum allowed in APE for the contract. T is due to keen competition under prevail market conditions, which resulted in lower rates in the returned tenders. Details of key items with significant savings are follows - (a) Contract preliminaries (\$8.90 million); (b) Piling works (\$6.90 million); (c) Roads, drainage, landscaping works water works (\$35.50 million); and (d) Ancillary works (\$4.70 million).			

Project Code	Project Title Contract Title/	Approved Project Estimate	(A) Sum Allowed	(B) Accepted Tender	(A) – (B) Difference
No.	Award Date	(APE)	in APE for the Contract	Price	
		\$	S million (in	MOD price	es)
7845CL	Hung Shui Kiu/Ha Tsuen New Development Area advance works Phases 1 & 2—site formation and engineering infrastructure and phase 3—detailed design and site investigation	495.90			
YL/2019/02	Hung Shui Kiu/Ha Tsuen New Development Area advance works phase 2—site formation and engineering infrastructure/ 3 August 2020		182.30	112.33	69.97
		The accepted tender price is lower than sum allowed in APE for the contract. is due to keen competition under prevair market conditions, which resulted in locates in the returned tenders. Details of key items with significant savings are follows - (a) Contract preliminaries (\$21.61 million (b) Land decontamination works (\$3 million); and (c) Site formation works and engineer infrastructure works (\$10.42 million).			

Project Code	Project Title	Approved Project	(A) Sum	(B) Accepted	(A) – (B) Difference	
Contract No.	Contract Title/ Award Date	Estimate (APE)	Allowed in APE for the Contract	Tender Price		
		\$	S million (in	MOD price	es)	
7473RO	The Establishment of an Agricultural Park in Kwu Tung South—Phase 1	176.60				
ND/2018/02	The establishment of an Agricultural Park in Kwu Tung South (Phase 1)/ 18 September 2020		142.60	119.99	22.61	
		The accepted tender price is lower the sum allowed in APE for the contract is due to keen competition under present market conditions, which resulted in rates in the returned tenders. Details key items with significant savings follows -				
		(a) Contract preliminaries (\$4.23 millior(b) Road works, formation of land associated park facilities (\$4.70 milliand			and and 70 million);	

Project Code Contract No.	Project Title Contract Title/ Award Date	Approved Project Estimate (APE)	(A) Sum Allowed in APE for the Contract	(B) Accepted Tender Price	(A) – (B) Difference
		\$	S million (in	MOD price	es)
B780CL CV/2018/03	Site formation and infrastructure works for public housing development at Wang Chau, Yuen Long Site formation and infrastructure	1,800.20	237.29	179.31	57.98
C 1/2010/00	works at Wang Chau, Yuen Long—Contract 2/ 7 September 2020		207.27	7,7,62	
		sum allow is due to market c rates in the key item follows - (a) Continuand (b) Road water	wed in APE keen componditions, whe returned s with signact prelimings, footbridgworks, Pai	price is low for the connection under which results tenders. Do nificant savi naries (\$34.4 ge, drainage, Lau, landscatks (\$23.57 m	tract. This r prevailing ed in lower etails of the ngs are as 41 million); sewerage, uping works

(3) Department: <u>Drainage Services Department</u>

Project Code Contract No.	Project Title Contract Title/ Award Date	Approved Project Estimate (APE)	(A) Sum Allowed in APE for the Contract	(B) Accepted Tender Price	(A) – (B) Difference	
		\$	million (in	MOD prices	s)	
4118CD	Drainage improvement in Northern New Territories— package B (remaining works)	65.50				
4163CD	Drainage improvement works at Ngong Ping	216.00				
4184CD	Drainage improvement in Southern Hong Kong Island—package 2A	134.70				
	Total:	416.20				
DC/2019/06	Drainage improvement works in Northern New Territories (remaining works), Southern Hong Kong Island and Ngong Ping/ 31 July 2020		279.40	207.06	72.34	
		The accepted tender price is lower than the sum allowed in APE for the contract. This is due to keen competition under prevailing market conditions, which resulted in lower rates in the returned tenders. Details of the key item with significant savings are as followed. (a) Drainage improvement works (\$72.3 million).				

Project	Project				
Code Contract No.	Title Contract Title/ Award Date	Approved Project Estimate (APE)	(A) Sum Allowed in APE for the Contract	(B) Accepted Tender Price	(A) – (B) Difference
		\$	•	MOD prices	s)
4186CD	Rehabilitation of underground stormwater drains—stage 2	515.10			
4440DS	Rehabilitation of underground sewers—stage 2	306.10			
4100DX (block allocation) Item DZD19E5	Engineering inspection for underground stormwater drains in Hong Kong and Islands 2020-21 programme	13.40			
4100DX (block allocation) Item DZD19E6	Engineering inspection for drainage box culverts in Hong Kong and Islands 2020-21 programme	18.90			
4100DX (block allocation) Item DZG19E7	Engineering inspection for underground stormwater drains in New Territories North 2020-21 programme	15.40			
4100DX (block allocation) Item DZF19E8	Engineering inspection for drainage box culverts in New Territories North 2020-21 programme	19.90			
4100DX (block allocation) Item DZF19E9	Engineering inspection for underground stormwater drains in Kowloon and New Territories South 2020-21 programme	18.20			
4100DX (block allocation) Item DZF19F0	Engineering inspection for drainage box culverts in Kowloon and New Territories South 2020-21 programme	9.50			
	Total :	916.50			

Page 12

					Page 12
Project Code Contract No.	Project Title Contract Title/ Award Date	Approved Project Estimate (APE)	(A) Sum Allowed in APE for the Contract	(B) Accepted Tender Price	(A) – (B) Difference
		\$	million (in	MOD prices	s)
DC/2019/04	Condition survey and rehabilitation of underground sewers and stormwater drains—stage 2/ 14 September 2020		636.90	431.99	204.91
		sum allowed due to ke market contrates in the key items follows - (a) Contrate (b) Rehabitand	ed in APE for compete the comp	price is low or the contra tition under hich resulted tenders. De ificant saving ries (\$21.19) orks (\$158.1	ct. This is prevailing d in lower stails of the ngs are as million); 3 million);

Project Code Contract No.	Project Title Contract Title/ Award Date	Approved Project Estimate (APE)	(A) Sum Allowed in APE for the Contract	(B) Accepted Tender Price	(A) – (B) Difference
		\$	million (in	MOD prices	s)
4389DS	Upgrading of West Kowloon and Tsuen Wan sewerage—phase 2	2,285.50			
4438DS	West Kowloon and Tsuen Wan village sewerage—phase 1	104.10			
	Total :	2,389.60			
DC/2019/11	Upgrading of West Kowloon and Tsuen Wan sewerage—phase 2A/ 9 July 2020		754.99	508.23	246.76
		sum allowed due to ke market contrates in the key items follows - (a) Contra (b) Pipelay (\$161.6 (c) Pipelay million (d) Dry	ed in APE freen compered in the compered in th	price is low or the contra- tition under hich resulted tenders. De ificant saving ries (\$14.46 by trenchled by open of flow miscellance	ct. This is prevailing d in lower stails of the ngs are as million); ess method cut (\$35.52 interceptor,

Project Code Contract No.	Project Title Contract Title/ Award Date	Approved Project Estimate (APE)	(A) Sum Allowed in APE for the Contract	(B) Accepted Tender Price	(A) – (B) Difference
		\$	million (in	MOD prices	s)
4430DS DC/2019/13	Tolo Harbour sewerage of unsewered areas, stage 2—phase 2 Tolo Harbour sewerage of unsewered areas, stage 2—phase 2/ 17 July 2020	308.10	185.55	134.41	51.14
		sum allowed due to keep rates in the key items follows -	ed in APE freen compenditions, we returned with sign	price is low or the contractition under hich resulted tenders. Desificant saving works (\$22.5)	ct. This is prevailing d in lower tails of the ngs are as 51 million);

Project Code Contract No.	Project Title Contract Title/ Award Date	Approved Project Estimate (APE)	(A) Sum Allowed in APE for the Contract	(B) Accepted Tender Price	(A) – (B) Difference
		\$	million (in	MOD prices	s)
4431DS	Port Shelter sewerage, stage 2, package 3	515.90			
4432DS	Port Shelter sewerage, stage 3, package 2	668.20			
	Total:	1,184.10			
DC/2019/09	Provision of village sewerage in Sai Kung/ 16 July 2020	sum allowed due to keep market contrates in the key items follows - (a) Contrates (b) Village works station (\$64.33)	ed in APE freen compered in the compered in th	price is low or the contratition under hich resulted tenders. Desificant saving ries (\$30.41 works and cated sewage wage treatment 2.40 million)	ct. This is prevailing d in lower stails of the ngs are as million); construction e pumping nent plants

(4) Department: <u>Highways Department</u>

Project Code Contract No.	Project Title Contract Title/ Award Date	Approved Project Estimate (APE)	(A) Sum Allowed in APE for the Contract	(B) Accepted Tender Price	(A) – (B) Difference
		\$	million (in	MOD prices	s)
6832TH	Retrofitting of noise barriers on Long Tin Road	304.00			
HY/2019/11	Retrofitting of noise barriers on Long Tin Road/ 17 July 2020		247.90	211.57	36.33
		sum allowed due to keep market contrates in the key items follows - (a) Contrate (b) Noise (c) Associatraffic	ed in APE feen compenditions, we returned with sign ct prelimina barriers (\$25 ated street 1	price is low or the contra tition under hich resulte tenders. De ifficant saving ries (\$7.68 m 5.65 million) ighting, slop s and landsca	ct. This is prevailing d in lower etails of the ngs are as million); ; and se, drainage,

(5) Department: <u>Home Affairs Bureau</u>

Project Code Contract No.	Project Title Contract Title/ Award Date	Approved Project Estimate (APE)	(A) Sum Allowed in APE for the Contract	(B) Accepted Tender Price	(A) – (B) Difference
		\$	million (in	MOD prices	s)
8044QJ	Youth Hostel Scheme—construction works by Po Leung Kuk for the youth hostel project in Ma Tin Pok, Yuen Long	1,444.70			
G14-016- C02	Main contract works for Po Leung Kuk Youth Hostel/ 28 August 2020		812.09	440.73	
		sum allowed due to keep market co rates in the key items follows - (a) Building (b) Building million	ed in APE freen compered in a	price is low or the contra tition under hich resulte tenders. De ificant savi	ct. This is prevailing d in lower etails of the ngs are as on);

(6) Department: <u>Water Supplies Department</u>

Project Code Contract No.	Project Title Contract Title/ Award Date	Approved Project Estimate (APE)	(A) Sum Allowed in APE for the Contract	(B) Accepted Tender Price	(A) – (B) Difference
		\$	million (in	MOD prices	s)
7803CL	Development of Anderson Road Quarry Site—site formation and associated infrastructure works	7,693.40			
4/WSD/19	Development of Anderson Road Quarry Site—construction of grey water treatment plant/ 9 September 2020		374.43	333.00	41.43
		sum allowed due to keep rates in the key items follows -	prevailing d in lower etails of the ngs are as million); nical works		

Project Code Contract No.	Project Title Contract Title/ Award Date	Approved Project Estimate (APE)	(A) Sum Allowed in APE for the Contract	(B) Accepted Tender Price	(A) – (B) Difference	
		\$	million (in	MOD prices	s)	
9196WC 13/WSD/19	Implementation of Water Intelligent Network—remaining works Construction of pressure management and district metering installations under Water Intelligent Network—remaining works/ 22 July 2020					
		sum allowed due to ke market corrates in the key items follows - (a) Contra (b) Ground (\$22.33) (c) Pipewo and	ed in APE freen competed in APE freen competed in the competed	price is low or the contra tition under hich resulte tenders. De ificant saving ries (\$51.97 tion and sit tings (\$62.9	ct. This is prevailing d in lower etails of the ngs are as million); e clearance of million);	

Project Code Contract No.	Project Title Contract Title/ Award Date	Approved Project Estimate (APE)	(A) Sum Allowed in APE for the Contract	(B) Accepted Tender Price	(A) – (B) Difference
		\$	million (in	MOD prices	s)
9368WF	Improvement to Dongjiang water mains P4 at Sheung Shui and Fanling	1,071.40			
5/WSD/19	Improvement to Dongjiang water mains P4 at Sheung Shui and Fanling/ 4 September 2020		1,066.50	438.80	627.70
		sum allowed due to ke market co prices in the key items follows -	price is low or the contra tition under hich resulted tenders. De ificant saving mains by contillion); and mains by illion).	ct. This is prevailing d in lower etails of the ngs are as	

Project Code Contract No.	Project Title Contract Title/ Award Date	Approved Project Estimate (APE)	(A) Sum Allowed in APE for the Contract	(B) Accepted Tender Price	(A) – (B) Difference
		\$	million (in	MOD prices	s)
9369WF 2/WSD/19	Uprating of Sheung Wong Yi Au fresh water supply system—Stage 1 Mainlaying and uprating of Ha Wong Yi Au Fresh Water Pumping Station/ 10 September 2020	207.00	153.00	102.75	50.25
		sum allowed due to kee market con rates in the key item w	ed in APE freen compenditions, we returned the ith significations.	price is low or the contra tition under hich resulte tenders. De nt savings ar (\$50.25 mill	ct. This is prevailing d in lower etails of the re as follows

(7) Department: <u>Non-governmental organisations</u>

Project Code	Project Title	Approved	(A)	(B)	(A) – (B)
Contract No.	Contract Title/ Award Date	Project Estimate (APE)	Sum Allowed in APE for the Contract	Accepted Tender Price	Difference
		\$	million (in	MOD prices	s)
8004MJ 8110080459	Expansion of United Christian Hospital Tender for superstructure and associated works for main works package 2 for Expansion of United Christian Hospital/27 July 2020	sum allowed due to keep market contractes in the key items follows - (a) Basem (b) Buildin (c) Buildin million (d) Draina million (e) Alteraty blocks	ed in APE freen competed in APE freen competed in APE freen competed in the co	1,344.31 mill installation kternal work dition works illion); and	ct. This is prevailing d in lower stails of the ngs are as ion); as (\$295.66 ks (\$80.32)

Project Code Contract No.	Project Title Contract Title/ Award Date	Approved Project Estimate (APE)	(A) Sum Allowed in APE for the Contract	(B) Accepted Tender Price	(A) – (B) Difference	
		\$	million (in	MOD prices	s)	
8005MP 8110080470	Redevelopment of Grantham Hospital, phase 1—demolition, site formation and foundation works Main works package 1—demolition, foundation and associated works for redevelopment of Grantham Hospital (Phase 1) / 7 August 2020					
		sum allowed due to keep rates in the key items follows - (a) Contra (b) Demolexcava (\$222.9	ed in APE freen compenditions, we returned with signs of the prelimination, fountion and personal works	price is low or the contra tition under hich resulte tenders. De ificant savi ries (\$5.82 n dation, site lateral supp and and draina	ct. This is prevailing d in lower etails of the ngs are as million); formation, port works	

Project Code	Project Title	Approved Project	(A) Sum	(B) Accepted	(A) – (B) Difference
Contract No.	Contract Title/ Award Date	Estimate (APE)	Allowed in APE for the Contract	Tender Price	
		\$	million (in	MOD prices	s)
B075MC	Community health centre-cum- residential care home for the elderly at Tuen Mun Area 29 West	1,046.40			
20190505	Construction of public housing development at Tuen Mun Area 29 West/ 24 August 2020		709.50	417.02	292.48
		sum allowed due to keep market contraction to the second of the second o	ed in APE freen compered in the compered in th	price is low or the contra tition under hich resulte tenders. De ificant saving ries (\$71.60 100.38 million estimated productuation to trrent market	ct. This is prevailing d in lower stails of the ngs are as million); on); and rovision for taking into