

立法會
Legislative Council

LC Paper No. CB(1)393/20-21

(These minutes have been
seen by the Administration)

Ref : CB1/PL/DEV

Panel on Development

**Minutes of meeting
held on Tuesday, 27 October 2020, at 2:30 pm
in Conference Room 1 of the Legislative Council Complex**

Members present : Ir Dr Hon LO Wai-kwok, SBS, MH, JP (Chairman)
Hon LAU Kwok-fan, MH (Deputy Chairman)
Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, GBS, JP
Hon Tommy CHEUNG Yu-yan, GBS, JP
Hon Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung, GBS, JP
Hon Starry LEE Wai-king, SBS, JP
Hon CHAN Hak-kan, BBS, JP
Hon CHAN Kin-por, GBS, JP
Dr Hon Priscilla LEUNG Mei-fun, SBS, JP
Hon WONG Kwok-kin, SBS, JP
Hon Mrs Regina IP LAU Suk-yee, GBS, JP
Hon Paul TSE Wai-chun, JP
Hon Claudia MO
Hon Steven HO Chun-yin, BBS
Hon Frankie YICK Chi-ming, SBS, JP
Hon WU Chi-wai, MH
Hon MA Fung-kwok, GBS, JP
Hon Charles Peter MOK, JP
Hon CHAN Han-pan, BBS, JP
Hon LEUNG Che-cheung, SBS, MH, JP
Hon Alice MAK Mei-kuen, BBS, JP
Hon KWOK Wai-keung, JP
Dr Hon Fernando CHEUNG Chiu-hung
Dr Hon Helena WONG Pik-wan
Hon Martin LIAO Cheung-kong, GBS, JP

Hon POON Siu-ping, BBS, MH
Dr Hon CHIANG Lai-wan, SBS, JP
Hon Alvin YEUNG
Hon Andrew WAN Siu-kin
Hon Jimmy NG Wing-ka, BBS, JP
Dr Hon Junius HO Kwan-yiu, JP
Hon LAM Cheuk-ting
Hon Holden CHOW Ho-ding
Hon Wilson OR Chong-shing, MH
Hon CHAN Chun-ying, JP
Hon CHEUNG Kwok-kwan, JP
Hon LUK Chung-hung, JP
Hon Kenneth LAU Ip-keung, BBS, MH, JP
Dr Hon CHENG Chung-tai
Hon KWONG Chun-yu
Hon Jeremy TAM Man-ho
Hon Vincent CHENG Wing-shun, MH, JP
Hon Tony TSE Wai-chuen, BBS, JP

Members attending : Hon James TO Kun-sun
Prof Hon Joseph LEE Kok-long, SBS, JP
Dr Hon KWOK Ka-ki

Members absent : Hon Michael TIEN Puk-sun, BBS, JP
Hon Dennis KWOK Wing-hang

[According to the announcement made by the Hong Kong Special Administrative Region Government on 11 November 2020 pursuant to the Decision of the Standing Committee of the National People's Congress on Issues Relating to the Qualification of the Members of the Legislative Council ("LegCo") of the Hong Kong Special Administrative Region, Kenneth LEUNG, KWOK Ka-ki, Dennis KWOK Wing-hang and Alvin YEUNG were disqualified from being members of LegCo on 30 July 2020.]

Public officers attending : **Agenda item V**
Mr LIU Chun-san, JP
Under Secretary for Development

Mr Victor CHAN Fuk-yiu, JP
Principal Assistant Secretary (Works)2
Development Bureau

Mr Kelvin LO Kwok-wah, JP
Director of Drainage Services

Mr Tony LEUNG Ka-chung
Chief Engineer/Sewerage Projects (Ag.)
Drainage Services Department

Agenda item VI

Mr Thomas CHAN Tak-yeung
Principal Assistant Secretary (Works)3
Development Bureau

Mr HO Kai-ho
Chief Engineer/Design
Water Supplies Department

Mr CHIU Chung-ming
Senior Engineer/Design 2
Water Supplies Department

Agenda item VII

Mr Thomas CHAN Tak-yeung
Principal Assistant Secretary (Works)3
Development Bureau

Ms Mable LAM Lai-hang
Chief Engineer/Consultants Management
Water Supplies Department

Mr CHAN Man-yin
Senior Engineer/Consultants Management(5)
Water Supplies Department

Clerk in attendance : Ms Doris LO
Chief Council Secretary (1)2

Staff in attendance : Miss Rita YUNG
Senior Council Secretary (1)2

Mr Raymond CHOW
Senior Council Secretary (1)10

Mr Keith WONG
Council Secretary (1)2

Ms Alice CHEUNG
Senior Legislative Assistant (1)1

Ms Christina SHIU
Legislative Assistant (1)2

Ms Christy YAU
Legislative Assistant (1)8

Ms Clara LO
Legislative Assistant (1)9

Ms Haley CHEUNG
Legislative Assistant (1)10

Miss Joey LAW
Clerical Assistant (1)2

Action

- I Information paper(s) issued since the last meeting**
- (LC Paper No. CB(1)864/19-20(01) — Administration's paper on progress report on proposed registration scheme for tree management personnel
- LC Paper No. CB(1)871/19-20(01) — Administration's paper on report on implementation of Land Supply Strategy
- LC Paper No. CB(1)42/20-21(01) — Letter dated 19 October 2020 from Hon Kenneth LAU on issues relating to the opening up of the Sha Tau Kok Closed Area and

its long-term planning and development)

Members noted that the above information papers had been issued since the meeting on 23 June 2020.

II Election of Deputy Chairman

2. The Chairman drew members' attention to the letters each from a number of members addressed to the Secretariat (issued to all Members vide LC Paper No. CB(1)15/20-21 by email on 15 October 2020) indicating that they would not accept nomination, if any, for the position of Deputy Chairman of the Panel. The Chairman then called for nominations for the deputy chairmanship for the 2020-2021 legislative session. Mr LUK Chung-hung nominated Mr LAU Kwok-fan and the nomination was seconded by Mr Abraham SHEK. Mr LAU accepted the nomination.

3. There being no other nominations, the Chairman declared that Mr LAU Kwok-fan was elected as the Deputy Chairman of the Panel for the 2020-2021 legislative session.

III Items for discussion at the next meeting

(LC Paper No. CB(1)26/20-21(01) — List of outstanding items for discussion

LC Paper No. CB(1)26/20-21(02) — List of follow-up actions)

4. Members agreed that the next regular meeting would be scheduled for Tuesday, 24 November 2020, from 2:30 pm to 5:30 pm to discuss the following items proposed by the Administration:

- (a) Provision for Capital Works Reserve Fund block allocations in 2021-2022;
- (b) Tung Chung New Town Extension — Site formation and infrastructure works, and the District Cooling System for Tung Chung East area;
- (c) PWP Item No. 51CG — District Cooling System at the Kwu Tung North New Development Area; and

- (d) PWP Item No. 172CD — Rehabilitation of underground stormwater drains — Remaining works.

(Post-meeting note: At the request of the Administration and with the concurrence of the Chairman, item (a) will be discussed separately at a joint meeting with the Panel on Information Technology and Broadcasting to be held on 24 November 2020 from 2:30 pm to 4:00 pm. The regular meeting on 24 November 2020 has been changed to be held from 4:15 pm to 6:30 pm to discuss items (b) to (d). Members were informed of the above changes and meeting arrangements on 12 November 2020 vide LC Paper Nos. CB(1)175/20-21 and CB(1)176/20-21.)

Suggestions on discussion items for future meetings

5. The Chairman said that members who have any proposals on items for discussion by the Panel in the 2020-2021 session were invited to proposed in writing for his consideration. The Chairman said that in line with past practice, he and the Deputy Chairman would meet with the Secretary for Development to discuss the work plan of the Panel for the 2020-2021 session. Members' suggestions on items to be discussed at future meetings would be considered when drawing up the work plan.

IV Proposed appointment of the Joint Subcommittee to Monitor the Implementation of the West Kowloon Cultural District Project in the 2020-2021 session

(LC Paper No. CB(1)26/20-21(03) — Paper on proposed appointment of Joint Subcommittee to Monitor the Implementation of the West Kowloon Cultural District Project in the 2020-2021 session prepared by the Legislative Council Secretariat)

6. The Chairman referred to the paper on proposed appointment of Joint Subcommittee to Monitor the Implementation of the West Kowloon Cultural District Project ("the Joint Subcommittee") in the 2020-2021 session prepared by the Legislative Council Secretariat (LC Paper No. CB(1)26/20-21(03)). The Chairman sought members' views on the proposed appointment of the Joint Subcommittee under the Panel on Development ("DEV Panel") and the Panel on Home Affairs ("HA Panel").

7. Dr Helena WONG, Dr CHENG Chung-tai and Mr KWONG Chun-yu expressed support for the proposed appointment of the Joint Subcommittee. Dr CHENG suggested that the West Kowloon Cultural District Authority should be requested to give an account of the early departure of its Chief Executive Officer, Mr Duncan PESCOD, at the first meeting of the Joint Subcommittee in this session. Mr KWONG requested that the Joint Subcommittee be briefed on the latest financial position of the West Kowloon Cultural District Project at the first meeting. The Chairman instructed the Clerk to put down on record Dr CHENG's and Mr KWONG's views for reference by the Joint Subcommittee, if activated in this session.

8. Members agreed to the proposed appointment of the Joint Subcommittee and endorsed the proposed Terms of Reference, work plan and time frame for completion of work as set out in LC Paper No. CB(1)26/20-21(03).

9. The Chairman said that HA Panel would consult their members on the proposed appointment of the Joint Subcommittee at its coming meeting. If the proposed appointment of the Joint Subcommittee in the 2020-2021 session was endorsed by DEV Panel and HA Panel, arrangements for its activation would be subject to the relevant decision of the House Committee.

(Post-meeting note: At its meeting on 9 November 2020, HA Panel agreed to the proposed appointment of the Joint Subcommittee and endorsed the proposed Terms of Reference, work plan and time frame for completion of work as set out in LC Paper No. CB(1)26/20-21(03)).

V Proposed creation of one permanent post of Chief Engineer in the Drainage Services Department for cavern development projects, and PWP Item No. 399DS — Relocation of Sha Tin Sewage Treatment Works to caverns

(LC Paper No. CB(1)26/20-21(04) — Administration's paper on proposed creation of one permanent post of Chief Engineer in the Drainage Services Department for cavern development projects, and PWP Item No. 399DS — Relocation

of Sha Tin Sewage
Treatment Works to
caverns)

Relevant paper

(LC Paper No. CB(1)45/20-21(01) — Submission from two Sha Tin District Council members dated 21 October 2020 (Restricted to Members))

10. The Chairman reminded members that in accordance with Rule 83A of the Rules of Procedure of the Legislative Council ("LegCo"), they should disclose the nature of any direct or indirect pecuniary interests relating to the subjects under discussion at the meeting before they spoke on the subjects.

11. At the invitation of the Chairman, Under Secretary for Development ("USDEV") gave an introductory remark on the relocation of Sha Tin Sewage Treatment Works ("STSTW") to caverns ("relocation project"), and the proposed creation of one permanent post of Chief Engineer ("CE") in the Drainage Services Department ("DSD") for cavern development projects. He said that the Government actively explored rock cavern development to exploit land resources and as a viable source of long-term land supply. DSD was currently implementing the relocation project which was the largest cavern development project ever built in Hong Kong. The site preparation and access tunnel construction under Stage 1 Works commenced in February 2019 and were in good progress. DSD proposed to upgrade the Stage 2 Works of the relocation project to Category A, comprising main caverns complex construction and upstream sewerage works, with a view to achieving the target commissioning of the relocated Sha Tin Cavern Sewage Treatment Works ("the Cavern STSTW") in 2029 and releasing of the site of existing STSTW in 2031 for housing, community facilities and other beneficial uses.

12. With the aid of a powerpoint presentation, Chief Engineer/Sewerage Projects (Ag.), Drainage Services Department then briefed members on further details of the staffing proposal and the proposed Stage 2 Works of PWP Item No. 399DS — Relocation of STSTW to caverns — main caverns construction, upstream sewerage works and other related works.

(*Post-meeting note*: A soft copy of the powerpoint presentation materials was circulated to members vide LC Paper No. CB(1)68/20-21(01) by email on 28 October 2020.)

Proposed creation of one permanent post of Chief Engineer in the Drainage Services Department for cavern development projects

Need for a permanent Chief Engineer post

13. The Deputy Chairman, Mr Jeremy TAM, Mr KWONG Chun-yu, Mr Wilson OR and Mr WU Chi-wai considered that instead of creating the proposed permanent CE post (D1) to be designated as CE/Cavern Projects, the Administration should create a time-limited supernumerary CE post at the moment, and review the need for retaining, or making permanent the supernumerary CE post before the lapse of the post, taking into account the workload of the directorate officers within DSD at that time. Mr OR and Mr WU called on the Administration to critically review the manpower and workload of the directorate officers, and consider redeploying other existing directorate officers within DSD to take on the work of the proposed post.

14. In response, Director of Drainage Services ("D of DS") said that the proposed CE post would be responsible for the planning and implementation of a number of cavern sewage treatment facility projects. In view of the mega project scale and complexity of the relocation project, DSD implemented this \$40 to 50 billion worth project in stages, with a construction period longer than 10 years. The relocation project was being implemented in full swing under a highly compressed implementation programme. The proposed CE post would also take forward the planning and implementing of other existing and potential cavern sewage treatment facility projects, such as "Relocation of Sai Kung Sewage Treatment Works to Caverns" and "Relocation of Sham Tseng Sewage Treatment Works to Caverns". There was therefore an imminent and long-term need to create the permanent CE post to lead the new dedicated Cavern Projects Division ("CPD") overseeing the smooth delivery of these mega scale and highly complicated cavern projects.

15. D of DS further said that the Administration had critically examined the possibility of redeploying other existing directorate officers within DSD to take on the work of the proposed CE post. However, the other incumbent CEs were already fully engaged in their respective duties, including taking forward a large number of on-going and new drainage, sewage treatment and sewerage projects, overseeing the operation maintenance, and rehabilitation of existing drainage and sewerage systems,

as well as coordinating district drainage matters. It was operationally impractical for them to take up the new tasks without adversely affecting the discharge of their current duties.

Admin 16. Mr WU Chi-wai said that he opposed the submission of the staffing proposal to the Establishment Subcommittee ("ESC") for consideration. He requested the Administration to provide a projection of the project loading, taking into account the timeframe for completion of on-going projects as well as those planned/in the pipeline in the coming years, and the redeployment plan upon project completion for the existing CEs of DSD in order to provide full justifications on the long-term need for creating the proposed permanent post of CE/Cavern Projects.

17. Dr KWOK Ka-ki said that members belonging to the Civic Party did not support the submission of the staffing proposal to ESC for consideration.

Need for a dedicated Cavern Projects Division

18. Mr Steven HO, Mr Tony TSE, Dr Helena WONG, Mr KWONG Chun-yu, Mr Wilson OR and Mrs Regina IP expressed concern about the need to set up a new dedicated CPD in DSD and asked about its major duties and staffing requirement. Mr HO and Mr OR called on DSD to consider the feasibility of internal redeployment to take on the new workload, so that fewer additional non-directorate posts would be required.

19. D of DS responded that the development of sewage treatment facilities in caverns was mega in scale and covered various engineering disciplines, including civil and structural engineering, geotechnical engineering, sewage treatment engineering, environmental engineering, electrical and mechanical engineering, and cavern-related building services and fire services engineering, etc. Cavern sewage treatment facility projects were far more complicated than general infrastructure projects and required a lot of cross-professional coordination and project management. DSD therefore needed to set up a new CPD comprising multi-disciplinary professional and technical staff for dedicated planning and implementation of cavern projects to accommodate sewage treatment works. The major duties of CPD included implementing the relocation project; conducting feasibility studies and associated planning work for another two projects on the respective relocation of the sewage treatment works in Sai Kung and Sham Tseng to caverns; overseeing and supervising the design and construction of cavern projects, etc. In addition to the proposed permanent post of CE/Cavern Projects, there would be 26 non-directorate

posts, including 14 existing permanent posts of professional grade, two existing time-limited posts of professional grade and another 10 additional permanent posts of technical and general grades to be created to support the daily operation of CPD. DSD considered the proposed establishment of CPD appropriate, and would review its manpower requirements timely to cope with actual needs based on the progress and workload of various cavern sewage treatment facility projects.

20. Dr Helena WONG said that members belonging to the Democratic Party opposed the submission of the staffing proposal to ESC for consideration. While expressing support in principle for the development of rock caverns as a viable source of long-term land supply, Dr WONG opined that the Administration should consider setting up an inter-departmental unit to implement and coordinate various cavern development projects and the relocation of government facilities to caverns, rather than setting up cavern sections under different government departments separately.

21. In response, USDEV said that a dedicated team in the Development Bureau was responsible for the formulation and implementation of the government policy in relation to rock cavern development. Whether there was a need for setting up a cavern section in a particular department would depend on the scale and complexity of the cavern projects to be implemented, and the manpower of the department concerned. The Administration did not see the need to set up an inter-departmental unit for cavern development projects at present.

22. Mr Jeremy TAM requested the Administration to provide the list of the 30 government facilities with higher relocation potential to caverns identified in the "Long-term Strategy for Cavern Development — Feasibility Study", and an overview of the latest follow-up progress, including planning, technical assessments, etc. conducted on these 30 facilities.

(Post-meeting note: The Administration's supplementary information was circulated to members vide LC Paper No. CB(1)284/20-21(01) on 26 November 2020.)

Concluding remarks

23. The Chairman concluded that a majority of the members who had spoken on the item did not oppose the submission of the staffing proposal to ESC for consideration. He called on the Administration to take note of members' views and concerns on the need to create the proposed permanent

post of CE/Cavern Projects, and to provide the supplementary information as requested by members.

24. Dr Helena WONG requested that the Administration should submit the staffing proposal for the creation of the permanent CE post in DSD and the funding proposal for the relocation project separately to the Finance Committee ("FC") for approval.

Proposed Stage 2 Works of PWP Item No. 399DS

Project cost and implementation

25. Dr Fernando CHEUNG enquired about the total project cost of the whole relocation project. USDEV replied that the estimated total construction cost of the relocation project was around \$40 to 50 billion in money-of-the-day prices.

26. Dr Fernando CHEUNG expressed concern about the high estimated cost of the relocation project, and asked whether the Administration had conducted any cost-benefit assessment in respect of the relocation project. The Deputy Chairman expressed support for the proposed Stage 2 Works of the relocation project, as well as the Administration's initiative to develop rock caverns to exploit land resources. He was however concerned about the cost-effectiveness and worthiness of cavern development as a long-term land supply option, and called on the Administration to review the cost-effectiveness of cavern development projects at appropriate times.

27. USDEV responded that DSD had conducted a detailed feasibility study on the relocation project. The study results confirmed that relocating STSTW to the proposed cavern site at Nui Po Shan of A Kung Kok was technically feasible and financially viable, and could release about 28 hectares ("ha") of land being occupied by the existing STSTW for housing, community facilities and other beneficial land uses. In addition to the benefits generated, the Administration had taken into account other factors in pursuing the relocation project. The existing STSTW was commissioned in 1982, and would have been in operation for almost 50 years by 2030. Regardless of whether it would be relocated to caverns, a major refurbishment of it was necessary. The Administration would review the effectiveness of different cavern projects, including the relocation project, upon their completion.

28. Dr Fernando CHEUNG requested the Administration to provide supplementary information to elaborate on the results of the cost-benefit assessment in respect of the relocation project.

(Post-meeting note: The Administration's supplementary information was circulated to members vide LC Paper No. CB(1)284/20-21(01) on 26 November 2020.)

29. Mr Kenneth LAU expressed support for rock cavern development and relocation of suitable existing government facilities to caverns which could release above-ground sites for housing and other land uses. Mr LAU and Mr KWONG Chun-yu urged the Administration to take appropriate measures to ensure that there would be no cost overrun when implementing the relocation project.

30. D of DS responded that the construction period of the whole relocation project was expected to span over more than 10 years. In view of the long construction period, the Administration considered it more appropriate to take forward the project by stages in order to enable more reliable cost estimates to be made for better cost control at individual stages as well as more effective project management on the whole. In addition, the Administration had been adopting the New Engineering Contract ("NEC") in public works projects. The target cost option of NEC, which was generally more suitable for relatively large scale and complex projects, featured a pain-gain share mechanism under an open-book environment whereby the contracting parties were required to bear cost overrun and entitled to share savings from the target cost, and hence provided a common objective for the contracting parties to enhance project management and cost control. D of DS reiterated that there was an imminent need to create the proposed permanent post of CE/Cavern Projects to lead the new dedicated CPD in DSD overseeing the smooth delivery of the mega scale and highly complicated relocation projects, and minimizing the risk of cost overrun.

31. Mrs Regina IP expressed support for the relocation project which could release about 28 ha of land being occupied by the existing STSTW for housing developments. She called on the Administration to provide the detailed breakdown of the project costs of the proposed Stage 2 Works of the relocation project in the funding proposal to be submitted to the Public Works Subcommittee ("PWSC") for consideration. D of DS took note of Mrs IP's views.

32. Given the large scale of the relocation project, Mrs Regina IP expressed concern whether there would be limited competition in the tendering process, thereby driving up the tender prices, as only a few contractors would have the capacity for carrying out the proposed works. D of DS responded that the "List of approved contractors for public works" of the Development Bureau contained many contractors which were eligible to tender for the contracts of the relocation project. In fact, in view of the large scale of the relocation project, DSD would conduct global tendering exercises for the project with a view to receiving more tenders. Mrs Regina IP further asked whether Mainland contractors would be eligible for the global tendering exercises. D of DS replied in the affirmative.

33. In view of the expected completion of a number of residential developments in the Pak Shek Kok area in the coming few years, Mr Kenneth LAU asked whether the sewage treatment capacity of the Cavern STSTW could meet the demand brought about by the increased population in the area. D of DS replied that the sewage treatment capacity of the Cavern STSTW would be 340 000 cubic metres per day, which could meet the sewage treatment demand for the planned population within its service area in 2041.

34. The Deputy Chairman asked whether the rocks excavated from caverns would be reused as construction materials in other construction projects. D of DS advised that it was estimated that about 5 million tonnes of Grade I/II granite would be excavated from the caverns. The Administration had reserved suitable sites in Tsing Yi for temporary storage of the excavated rocks. The contractor of the relocation project could process the excavated rocks and sell on the market for use as construction materials in other projects. It was expected that this would offer incentives to encourage the contractors to submit lower tender prices for the project.

35. Dr KWOK Ka-ki said that members belonging to the Civic Party did not support the submission of the funding proposal to PWSC for consideration.

Public consultation

36. Mr Alvin YEUNG referred to a submission from two Sha Tin District Council ("STDC") members (LC Paper No. CB(1)73/20-21(01)) (Chinese version only) which was tabled at the meeting. He asked whether the Administration would consult the new term STDC on the proposed Stage 2 Works of the relocation project.

37. D of DS advised that the Administration consulted the Health and Environment Committee ("HEC") of STDC on the proposed relocation project in 2018. HEC of STDC generally supported the implementation of the relocation project. In June 2020, the Administration briefed the Development and Housing Committee of STDC on the latest project progress and the plan of commissioning the Cavern STSTW in 2029. In addition, a community liaison group ("CLG") was established in 2017 to enhance and streamline the communication between the project team and the nearby stakeholders including the members of STDC. During the construction phase of Stage 1 Works, the Administration had been keeping a close communication with the relevant stakeholders to listen to their views and give due responses. The Administration would continue to conduct CLG meetings, update STDC regularly on the project progress and maintain close communication with the public and relevant stakeholders.

Future land uses of the released site

38. Mr Tony TSE, Mr KWONG Chun-yu, Mr Wilson OR and Dr Fernando CHEUNG expressed concerns about the future land uses of the existing STSTW site to be released. Mr TSE and Mr OR called on the Administration to conduct the planning study of the released site in a timely manner, so that the development of the site could be commenced as soon as practicable. Mr KWONG and Dr CHEUNG urged that the released site should be used for residential and other beneficial uses, including construction of residential care homes and day care centres for the elderly and persons with disabilities.

39. USDEV responded that preliminary examination on the future land uses of the released site revealed that the site could be used for housing developments and "Government, Institution or Community" uses. The future land uses of the existing STSTW site to be released would be separately considered under a planning and engineering ("P&E") study focusing on the planning and development of the released site, in which appropriate development and land uses schemes would be formulated for further consultation with the public and stakeholders. As the completion of the entire relocation project would take more than 10 years (which meant that the existing site would not be available for other development purposes by 2031 at the earliest), and the above P&E study would normally take three to four years to complete, the Administration would commence the P&E study at an appropriate time to take into account the latest development needs of the district and community.

40. Dr Helena WONG said that members belonging to the Democratic Party opposed the submission of the funding proposal to PWSC for consideration. She asked whether the main cavern construction of the relocation project could be expedited, so that the existing STSTW site could be released for other development purposes sooner. D of DS advised that the future main caverns complex for the Cavern STSTW would be the largest of its type ever built in Hong Kong. The relocation project would be implemented expeditiously in stages through various interfacing contracts with close interfaces and overlapping works sites. The proposed implementation programme of the relocation project was formulated taking into consideration construction quality and safety, as well as compliance with the design requirements and operational effectiveness.

Other views

41. Dr Fernando CHEUNG asked about the latest position of the proposed reclamation at Ma Liu Shui. USDEV responded that the proposed reclamation at Ma Liu Shui had been put on hold, and there was no timetable for the implementation of the proposal. Given that the residents of the Shatin district had strong views against the proposed reclamation at Ma Liu Shui, Dr Fernando CHEUNG said that the proposal should be permanently shelved.

Concluding remarks

42. The Chairman concluded that a majority of the members who had spoken on the relocation project did not oppose the submission of the funding proposal to PWSC for consideration. He called on the Administration to continue to consult and update STDC and the nearby stakeholders when implementing the relocation project, and to provide the supplementary information as requested by members.

VI Improvement of water supply facilities in Sheung Wong Yi Au

(LC Paper No. CB(1)26/20-21(05) — Administration's paper on improvement of water supply facilities in Sheung Wong Yi Au)

43. At the invitation of the Chairman, Principal Assistant Secretary (Works)3, Development Bureau ("PAS(W)3/DEVB") briefed members on the proposal to upgrade the remainder of PWP Item No. 353WF — "Uprating of Sheung Wong Yi Au fresh water supply system" to Category

A at an estimated cost of \$136.5 million in money-of-the-day ("MOD") prices, for the construction of Sheung Wong Yi Au ("SWYA") No. 3 fresh water service reservoir and laying of the associated fresh water mains. With the aid of a powerpoint presentation, he briefed members on the details of the proposed works. Subject to the funding approval of FC, the Administration planned to commence the proposed works in the second quarter of 2021 for completion in the third quarter of 2024.

(Post-meeting note: A soft copy of the powerpoint presentation materials was circulated to members vide LC Paper No. CB(1)68/20-21(02) by email on 28 October 2020.)

44. The Chairman reminded members that in accordance with Rule 83A of the Rules of Procedure of LegCo, they should disclose the nature of any direct or indirect pecuniary interests relating to the subjects under discussion at the meeting before they spoke on the subjects.

Implementation of the proposed improvement works

45. Dr Helena WONG noted that the Government consulted the Environment, Housing and Works Committee of Tai Po District Council ("TPDC") on the proposed works in November 2018, and she asked whether, following the commencement of the sixth term TPDC on 1 January 2020, the Administration had consulted TPDC afresh in respect of the proposed works. She also asked about the temporary traffic arrangements during the works period to mitigate the traffic impact to be brought about by the works vehicles frequenting the site, and whether residents in the vicinity were consulted on these arrangements.

46. Chief Engineer/Design, Water Supplies Department responded that the Administration briefed relevant TPDC members, representatives of local villages and local residents on the implementation details of the proposed works in September 2020, and designated a contact point to maintain a close communication with the relevant parties during the construction of the proposed works. PAS(W)3/DEVB said that the traffic impact on the road leading to the construction site would be limited given that the forecast construction traffic flow there was only two vehicles per hour on average, and arrangements would be made to deliver construction materials to the site outside peak hours.

47. The Deputy Chairman supported the proposed improvement works. Noting that the Administration had sought funding approval from LegCo for the entire improvement project by two parts, with stage 1 (i.e. PWP Item No. 369WF — "Uprating of Sheung Wong Yi Au fresh water supply system — stage 1" to Category A for uprating of the existing Ha Wong Yi

Au fresh water pumping station and laying of the associated pumping mains at \$207.0 million in MOD prices) approved by FC not long ago in July 2020, the Deputy Chairman asked about the reasons for not seeking funding approval in one go. He also requested the Administration to provide information on the deviation, if any, between the accepted tender price and estimated provision in the approved project estimate for PWP item No. 369WF, and the latest expected completion date of the relevant works.

(Post-meeting note: The Administration's supplementary information was circulated to members vide LC Paper No. CB(1)228/20-21(01) on 16 November 2020.)

48. PAS(W)3/DEVB explained that as the construction of SWYA No. 3 fresh water service reservoir and laying of the associated fresh water mains under the proposed works involved application for change of land use, additional time was required during the works planning stage for seeking relevant permission from the Town Planning Board. To avoid delay in completing the water supply facilities improvement works, the Administration decided to implement the improvement works in two stages, with stage 1 already commenced in September 2020. Upon completion of stage 1 of the improvement works, the projected daily fresh water demand of 12 900 cubic metres ("m³") in 2022 arising from new housing developments within the supply zone could be met.

Housing developments served by the water supply facilities in Sheung Wong Yi Au

49. Dr KWOK Ka-ki indicated that he did not object to improving the water supply facilities in SWYA to support the public housing developments in the district. However, he was concerned that the improved water supply in Tai Po South would encourage those private developers to develop more low-density luxury residential properties through the acquisition of small house concessionary rights in the area. He urged the Administration to resume Government land within the water supply zone of SWYA fresh water supply system for developing public housing, and requested the Administration to provide supplementary information on details of the planned new public housing developments within the supply zone.

(Post-meeting note: The Administration's supplementary information was circulated to members vide LC Paper No. CB(1)228/20-21(01) on 16 November 2020.)

50. Mr Kenneth LAU supported the funding proposal for the improvement works of water supply facilities in SWYA. He asked whether the water supply zone of SWYA fresh water supply system covered the new housing developments in Pak Shek Kok area. Pointing out that the new housing and commercial developments in Pak Shek Kok had brought about heavy loading to the transport and ancillary facilities in the surrounding areas, he called on the Administration to consider adding Pak Shek Kok Station along the East Rail Line.

51. PAS(W)3/DEVB said that based on the currently known housing developments within the water supply zone of SWYA fresh water supply system, it was estimated that the daily demand on fresh water in the zone would increase to 15 600 m³ in 2030. The improvement works of water supply facilities in SWYA were designed accordingly to cater for the increasing demand of fresh water within the supply zone. He clarified that the housing developments in Pak Shek Kok were not covered by the water supply zone of SWYA fresh water supply system.

Use of the space on the rooftop of the No. 3 fresh water service reservoir

52. Dr Helena WONG called on the Administration to open the rooftop of the proposed SWYA No.3 fresh water service reservoir for recreational use by members of the public.

53. PAS(W)3/DEVB responded that public access to the rooftop of service reservoir should be duly managed so as to avoid contaminating the water inside. While the rooftop of the proposed new service reservoir would not be open to the public under the current plan, public groups might approach the Water Supplies Department ("WSD") if they wished to use the rooftop for recreational use after obtaining policy support from relevant bureaux. He supplemented that WSD had consulted the Leisure and Cultural Services Department ("LCSD") regarding the management of the rooftop of the proposed new service reservoir. LCSD considered that it was unsuitable to convert the rooftop into a public recreational space under its management.

Other views

54. Dr Helena WONG considered that the Administration should reduce Hong Kong's reliance on Dongjiang water given the high purchase price, and allocate more resources and take immediate actions in expanding local water resources, such as building more reservoirs and water gathering grounds.

55. PAS(W)3/DEVB said that WSD had promulgated the Total Water Management Strategy ("the Strategy") in 2008 mapping out the strategy for sustainable use of water resources. In 2019, WSD updated the Strategy which adopted a two-pronged approach, with emphasis on containing fresh water demand growth and providing protection of local water resources including proper maintenance of water gathering grounds and catchwaters.

Submission of the funding proposal to the Public Works Subcommittee

56. The Chairman concluded that members generally supported the submission of the funding proposal to PWSC for consideration.

VII Investigation study, design and site investigation of Ngau Tam Mei Water Treatment Works extension

(LC Paper No. CB(1)26/20-21(06) — Administration's paper on investigation study, design and site investigation of Ngau Tam Mei Water Treatment Works extension)

57. With the aid of a powerpoint presentation, PAS(W)3/DEVB briefed members on the funding proposal for upgrading part of PWP Item No. 371WF, entitled "Ngau Tam Mei Water Treatment Works extension", to Category A at an estimated cost of \$136.6 million in MOD prices for the engagement of consultants to carry out the investigation study, design and associated site investigation works for the proposed Ngau Tam Mei Water Treatment Works ("NTM WTW") extension.

(Post-meeting note: A soft copy of the powerpoint presentation materials (Chinese version only) was circulated to members vide LC Paper No. CB(1)68/20-21(03) by email on 28 October 2020.)

58. The Chairman reminded members that in accordance with Rule 83A of the Rules of Procedure of LegCo, they should disclose the nature of any direct or indirect pecuniary interests relating to the subjects under discussion at the meeting before they spoke on the subjects.

Technologies adopted for Ngau Tam Mei Water Treatment Works

59. Dr Helena WONG asked about the water treatment technologies to be adopted for the proposed NTM WTW extension including whether the latest water treatment technologies would be introduced, and given that

NTM WTW was commissioned long ago in 2000, she asked if the Administration would also take this opportunity to upgrade and improve its existing facilities/technologies.

60. PAS(W)3/DEVB explained that under the current proposal, the consultants to be engaged would be required to identify the most suitable combination of design and technologies for the proposed NTM WTW extension, having regard to the latest developments in water treatment technologies available for the different stages of the water treatment process (i.e. clarification, filtration and disinfection), the target increase in water treatment capacity, as well as other factors including the physical conditions of the site, electricity demand and maintenance arrangements, etc. An overall review of the facilities/technologies currently used in NTM WTW would also be conducted.

Safety of on-site Chlorine Generation Facilities at Ngau Tam Mei Water Treatment Works

61. Dr Helena WONG pointed out that there were a few chlorine leakage incidents occurred at the on-site Chlorine Generation Facilities ("OSCGF") at NTM WTW in the past, and she was concerned about its operational reliability and safety, as well as the effectiveness of the incident reporting mechanism. In view of the proposed NTM WTW extension, Dr WONG further asked if additional OSCGF would be installed there; and if so, any risk assessments had been conducted.

62. PAS(W)3/DEVB said that the chlorine leakage incidents involving the OSCGF at NTM WTW occurred during its test operation, which was not uncommon when a new system was brought in. As illustrated in these incidents, the safety devices and incident reporting mechanism were proved to be effective. In gist, when the chlorine detection sensors detected chlorine in the air inside the plant room reaching 1 part per million ("ppm"), an alarm signal would be sent to the control room for the operator on duty to follow up, and when the chlorine in the air inside the plant room was detected to reach 3 ppm, the "contain and absorb" system would be automatically triggered and an alarm signal would be promptly sent to the Fire Services Department for emergency response, including investigation and evacuation if necessary. The OSCGF at NTM WTW had been functioning properly since it was put into operation. Regarding whether there was a need for installing additional OSCGF to cater for the proposed NTM WTW extension, PAS(W)3/DEVB advised that this might not be necessary but would depend on the water disinfection technologies used for the extension, and the consultants to be engaged would also look into this.

Implementation of the proposed extension

63. The Deputy Chairman expressed support for the funding proposal. Given the expected increase in water demand arising from various planned developments in Yuen Long area and that NTM WTW would not be able to cope with the increase by 2028, he saw a pressing need to take forward the proposed NTM WTW extension in order to expand the water treatment capacity of NTM WTW to the planned 440 000 cubic metres per day. While the Administration had planned to complete the investigation study, design and site investigation by the third quarter of 2024 and the main extension works by the fourth quarter of 2028, the Deputy Chairman was worried about possible delays, such as due to delays in funding approval by LegCo, and he urged the Administration to make contingency plans. The Chairman also suggested that the Administration should explore compressing the time required for the investigation study, design and site investigation.

64. PAS(W)3/DEVB replied that the investigation study, design and site investigation would take about three and a half years, including about a year for the tendering process, and about two years for finalizing the design. He hoped that the funding approval could be secured in time for completion of the relevant works on schedule. Meanwhile, the Administration would try exploring the feasibility of further compressing the schedule although it was already quite tight.

65. The Deputy Chairman asked whether the extended NTM WTW had reserved capacity to cope with the projected increase in water demand in the two potential development areas of San Tin and Lok Ma Chau covered under the "Study on Phase One Development of New Territories North — San Tin/Lok Ma Chau Development Node — Feasibility Study" to be completed in around 2021. PAS(W)3/DEVB advised that the extended NTM WTW would be able to serve a population of about 800 000 and meet the long term water demand in and around Yuen Long.

66. Dr Helena WONG asked if the Administration had already commenced the tendering process for the consultancy contract of the investigation study, design and site investigation of the proposed NTM WTW extension, and whether the consultancy contract would be awarded to the consultant of the Tai Po Water Treatment Works expansion project. PAS(W)3/DEVB advised that the tendering process had not yet commenced, and the tender selection would be conducted in accordance with the established procedures.

Environmental implications

67. Dr CHENG Chung-tai urged the Administration to give a clear account of the environmental implications of the proposed NTM WTW extension and the relevant mitigation measures, as there was a lack of clear information regarding whether the extension works would pass through existing country park and conservation area. Also, Dr CHENG relayed that little information about the associated environmental issue was provided by the Administration to the Housing, Town Planning and Development Committee ("HTP&DC") of the Yuen Long District Council ("YLDC") when the Committee was consulted on the proposed works on 29 April 2020. He urged the Administration to provide more relevant information to YLDC, including a more detailed location plan of the proposed NTM WTW extension.

68. The Chairman said that the proposed NTM WTW extension would include an Environmental Impact Assessment ("EIA") Study under the Environmental Impact Assessment Ordinance ("EIAO") (Cap. 499), which would be carried out as a part of the investigation study accordingly. Members could refer to the EIA Study Brief (Reference No. under EIAO: ESB-333/2020) for the proposed NTM WTW extension for information.

69. PAS(W)3/DEVB and Chief Engineer/Consultants Management, Water Supplies Department, responded that the fresh water trunk mains to be laid would be located under the existing roads in the country park and conservation area, and the EIA Study would include an assessment of the environmental implications of the mainlaying works on the said country park/conservation area. The Administration had further explained the arrangements of the mainlaying works to the Chairman of HTP&DC of YLDC over the phone. While the Administration would avoid the country park/conservation area concerned for site investigation works, it would carry out such works if deemed necessary. The Administration would follow the statutory procedure under the EIAO to obtain an environmental permit before commencing site investigation works within these areas.

Submission of the funding proposal to the Public Works Subcommittee

70. The Chairman concluded that members generally supported the submission of the funding proposal to PWSC for consideration.

VIII Any other business

71. There being no other business, the meeting ended at 4:55 pm.

Council Business Division 1
Legislative Council Secretariat
7 January 2021