

立法會

Legislative Council

LC Paper No. CB(4)510/20-21(04)

Ref : CB4/PL/TP

Panel on Transport

Updated background brief on the provision of and the assessment mechanism for hillside escalator links and elevator systems

Purpose

This paper provides updated background information on the provision of and the assessment mechanism for hillside escalator links and elevator systems ("HEL"). It also summarizes the major views and concerns expressed by Legislative Council ("LegCo") Members on the above subject including the construction of Braemar Hill Pedestrian Link in previous discussions.

Background

The 18 HEL proposals put forth since 2009

2. The Administration established in 2009 a set of scoring criteria for assessing proposals for HEL to determine the priority for conducting preliminary technical feasibility ("PTF") studies for the 20 project proposals received at that time. The Administration consulted the Panel on Transport ("the Panel") in May 2009, and upon completion of the assessment, reported the results to the Panel in February 2010. Two proposals were screened out initially, and 18 others were ranked.¹ The Administration indicated at that time that PTF studies for the proposals ranked top 10 would be conducted by batches, and that the remaining proposals would be followed up after the smooth implementation of the top 10 proposals.

3. The list of the 18 HEL proposals and their implementation progress provided by the Administration to LegCo Finance Committee in April 2020 are

¹ Details of the assessment results including the scores and resultant rankings are set out in the Administration's paper (LC Paper No. CB(1)1190/09-10(03)) issued in February 2010.

in **Appendix I**. In gist, five projects were completed and opened for public use and three of them are under construction. The remaining projects are at various stages of investigation and design.

Review of the assessment mechanism for HEL proposals

4. TD commenced a consultancy study in December 2017 to review and improve the assessment mechanism for HEL proposals. In accordance with the revised assessment mechanism, TD carried out initial screening, shortlisting and prioritization of a total of 114 HEL proposals received over the past years.² TD commenced consultation with the relevant DCs starting from December 2020 so as to finalize the first batch of projects for implementation.

Major views and concerns of Members

Implementation progress

5. Members had been closely monitoring the implementation progress of the 18 HEL projects which were put forward by the Administration since 2009, and expressed grave concern and dissatisfaction about their sluggish progress. Members found it totally unacceptable that as of May 2019, ten years after the Administration announced to take forward the 18-ranked proposals, only three projects were completed and opened for public use. In addition, all the three projects were constructed with the assistance of other public organizations including the Hospital Authority, Urban Renewal Authority and the MTR Corporation Limited who took on the HEL proposals while carrying out their own works projects concurrently at the relevant sites. Members requested the Administration to seriously look into the reasons for the prolonged delay and to implement immediate measures to expedite the completion of the remaining projects.

6. The Administration explained that in taking forward the HEL proposals, it was necessary to ascertain technical details including possible alignments, whether to opt for escalator or elevator system at the relevant locations, as well as to consult the views of the locals and liaise with relevant government departments and public utility companies regarding the location of underground utilities. Considerable time was required in carrying out the above tasks, and to sort out complicated issues such as resolving the objections received from local communities on the proposals. That said, the Administration would expedite actions to resolve the difficulties encountered in order to speed up the

² Details of the revised assessment mechanism and list of the 114 HEL proposals received are set out in the Administration's paper (LC Paper No. CB(4)105/19-20(01)) issued in November 2019.

delivery of the projects. In assessing the 114 new HEL proposals received, the Administration planned to adopt the revised assessment mechanism such that those proposals which were obviously infeasible or unjustified would be screened out, followed by a more comprehensive preliminary technical assessments in order to better ascertain the feasibility of the proposals at an early stage so as to facilitate the subsequent implementation of the proposals.

Revised assessment mechanism for new HEL proposals

7. Members were consulted on the proposed revisions to the assessment mechanism at the Panel meeting on 14 December 2018, and received update on the progress of the review from the Administration at the meetings of the Subcommittee on Hillside Escalator Links and Elevator Systems ("the Subcommittee")³ held on 15 May and 13 November 2019. Some members expressed concern that HEL proposals connecting locations with high pedestrian flow, such as public transport facilities or public markets, would score lower points in the revised mechanism. They also took the view that the revised assessment mechanism imposed too many restrictions during the initial screening stage such that sound proposals with immense local needs might be easily screened out. For instance, if more than one HEL systems were actually required along hillside topography which was steep and inaccessible, HEL proposals that fell within 300 metres from an existing HEL system would be screened out. Also, members opined that it would be difficult to quantify the social benefits of a proposal.

8. In response, the Administration advised that initial screening served the purpose of screening out infeasible proposals at an early stage to streamline the whole assessment process for enhancing efficiency. In considering HEL proposals where similar facility had already been provided in the vicinity, the Administration would also consider factors such as level difference and gradient. Nearby HEL systems within 300 metres but linking to different destinations would also be considered if there was genuine need and keen local demand.

9. As regards the assessment of the social benefits of a proposal, the Administration explained that the revised assessment mechanism would accord detailed scoring to a HEL proposal along three factors, namely the number of beneficiaries and target, implementation readiness and convenience. Each proposal would be appraised on a comparative basis without any threshold

³ Subcommittee on Hillside Escalator Links and Elevator Systems was set up under the Panel to study and follow-up issues relating to the provision of hillside escalator links and elevator systems. The Subcommittee completed its work and issued report on 31 March 2020. Relevant papers and report of the Subcommittee have been uploaded onto the LegCo website (https://www.legco.gov.hk/yr19-20/english/panels/tp/tp_hel/reports/hel_rpt.htm).

requirement with respect to the social benefits aspects so that all proposals would be assessed according to the same assessment criteria when determining their priority for implementation.

Braemar Hill Pedestrian Link

10. At the meetings of the Panel and the Subcommittee held on 14 December 2018 and 15 May 2019 respectively, a member was deeply concerned about the slow progress in constructing the pedestrian link system at Braemar Hill of the Eastern District. Although the project was ranked the second in 2009, it was still at the stage of planning, investigation and design with little progress made up to 2019.

11. The Administration advised that those living in uphill and downhill areas had contrasting views towards the proposal. Throughout the process, the Highways Department ("HyD") had been working in full force to reconcile the diverse and long-established views of the parties concerned. Such efforts include consulting the Eastern District Council ("EDC") and attending the residents' meetings to explain the design scheme and address residents' concerns regarding the scheme. HyD also arranged site visits with residents and other stakeholders such as schools to gauge their views on the alignment. Subsequent to the comments received, HyD presented various new design revisions in 2018 and obtained the majority support from members of the Planning, Works and Housing Committee of EDC. HyD had proceeded to various pre-construction preparations, including detailed design and resolving objections under the Roads (Works, Use and Compensation) Ordinance (Cap. 370).

Relevant Questions raised at Council meetings and other relevant papers

12. The hyperlinks to the Questions relating to HEL raised at LegCo meetings and other relevant papers are in **Appendix II**.

Latest Development

13. The Administration will consult members on the funding proposal for upgrading 6170TB "Braemar Hill Pedestrian Link" to Category A at the Panel meeting to be held on 19 February 2021.

**Progress of the proposals of
the Hillside Escalator Links and Elevator Systems**

Five projects completed and open for public use

Rank	Proposal
13	Yuet Wah Street Pedestrian Linkage
14 (same ranking)	Lift and Pedestrian Walkway System between Lai King Hill Road and Princess Margaret Hospital
1	Pedestrian Link at Tsz Wan Shan
9	Lift and Pedestrian Walkway System at Waterloo Hill
3	Lift and Pedestrian Walkway System at Cheung Hang Estate, Tsing Yi

Three projects under construction

Rank	Proposal
5	Lift and Pedestrian Walkway System between Kwai Shing Circuit and Hing Shing Road
11	Lift and Pedestrian Walkway System between Tai Wo Hau Road and Wo Tong Tsui Street
6	Lift and Pedestrian Walkway System between Castle Peak Road and Kung Yip Street

Ten proposals under investigation and design stages

Rank	Proposal
4	Escalator Link and Pedestrian Walkway System at Pound Lane
2	Braemar Hill Pedestrian Link
17	Lift and Pedestrian Walkway System between Hing Shing Road and Tai Wo Hau Road
7	Lift and Pedestrian Walkway System between Lai Cho Road and Wah Yiu Road
10	Lift and Pedestrian Walkway System between Lai King Hill Road and Lai Cho Road
12	Lift and Pedestrian Walkway System at Luen On Street
14 (same ranking)	Escalator Link System between Hong Sing Garden and Po Hong Road
16	Lift and Pedestrian Walkway System between Saddle Ridge Garden and Sai Sha Road
18	Escalator Link System between Sha Tin Sui Wo Court and MTR Fo Tan Station
8	Pedestrian Link near Chuk Yuen North Estate

(Source: Reply to an initial written question raised by Finance Committee Members in examining the Estimates of Expenditure 2020-2021 – Reply Serial Nos. THB(T)018 and 030, LC Paper No. CB(4)19/18-19(01))

List of relevant papers

Date of meeting / document	Committee	Minutes/Paper	LC Paper No.
15.3.2002	Panel on Transport	Administration's paper	CB(1)1266/01-02(03) http://www.legco.gov.hk/yr01-02/english/panels/tp/papers/tp0315cb1-1266-3e.pdf
		Minutes of meeting	CB(1)1517/01-02 http://www.legco.gov.hk/yr01-02/english/panels/tp/minutes/tp020315.pdf
6.2002	Panel on Transport	Administration's paper	CB(1)2130/01-02(04) http://www.legco.gov.hk/yr01-02/english/panels/tp/papers/tp0315cb1-2130-4e.pdf
22.5.2009	Panel on Transport	Administration's paper	CB(1)1613/08-09(06) http://www.legco.gov.hk/yr08-09/english/panels/tp/papers/tp0522cb1-1613-6-e.pdf
		Minutes of meeting	CB(1)2756/08-09 http://www.legco.gov.hk/yr08-09/english/panels/tp/minutes/tp20090522.pdf

Date of meeting / document	Committee	Minutes/Paper	LC Paper No.
26.2.2010	Panel on Transport	Administration's paper	CB(1)1190/09-10(03) http://www.legco.gov.hk/yr09-10/english/panels/tp/papers/tp0226cb1-1190-3-e.pdf
		Background brief prepared by the Legislative Council Secretariat	CB(1)1191/09-10 http://www.legco.gov.hk/yr09-10/english/panels/tp/papers/tp0226cb1-1191-e.pdf
		Administration's follow-up paper	CB(1)2983/09-10(02) http://www.legco.gov.hk/yr09-10/english/panels/tp/papers/tp0226cb1-2983-2-e.pdf
		Minutes of meeting	CB(1)1596/09-10 http://www.legco.gov.hk/yr09-10/english/panels/tp/minutes/tp20100226.pdf
9.1.2013	Legislative Council	Question raised by Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung	http://www.info.gov.hk/gia/general/201301/09/P201301080376.htm
17.1.2014	Panel on Transport	Administration's paper	CB(1)702/13-14(05) http://www.legco.gov.hk/yr13-14/english/panels/tp/papers/tp0117cb1-702-5-e.pdf
		Minutes of meeting	CB(1)1105/13-14 http://www.legco.gov.hk/yr13-14/english/panels/tp/minutes/tp20140117.pdf

Date of meeting / document	Committee	Minutes/Paper	LC Paper No.
26.11.2014	Legislative Council	Question raised by Hon Michael TIEN	http://www.info.gov.hk/gia/general/201411/26/P201411260360.htm
16.1.2015	Panel on Transport	Minutes of meeting	CB(4)1390/14-15 http://www.legco.gov.hk/yr14-15/english/panels/tp/minutes/tp20150116.pdf
28.12.2015	Panel on Transport	Administration's paper responding to the letter from Hon CHAN Han-pan	CB(4)414/15-16(01) http://www.legco.gov.hk/yr15-16/english/panels/tp/papers/tpcb4-414-1-e.pdf
20.1.2017	Panel on Transport	Administration's paper	CB(4)413/16-17(03) http://www.legco.gov.hk/yr16-17/english/panels/tp/papers/tp20170120cb4-413-3-e.pdf
20.10.2017	Panel on Transport	Administration's paper	CB(4)54/17-18(03) http://www.legco.gov.hk/yr17-18/english/panels/tp/papers/tp20171020cb4-54-3-e.pdf
		Minutes of meeting	CB(4)417/17-18 http://www.legco.gov.hk/yr17-18/english/panels/tp/minutes/tp20171020.pdf
18.4.2018	Finance Committee	Replies to initial written questions raised by Finance Committee Members in examining the Estimates of Expenditure 2018-2019 (THB(T)076 and 097)	http://www.legco.gov.hk/yr17-18/english/fc/fc/w_q/thb-t-e.pdf

Date of meeting / document	Committee	Minutes/Paper	LC Paper No.
19.10.2018	Panel on Transport	Administration's paper	CB(4)19/18-19(01) https://www.legco.gov.hk/yr18-19/english/panels/tp/papers/tp20181019cb4-19-1-e.pdf
10.4.2019	Finance Committee	Replies to initial written questions raised by Finance Committee Members in examining the Estimates of Expenditure 2019-2020 (Reply Serial No. THB(T)016)	https://www.legco.gov.hk/yr18-19/english/fc/fc/w_q/thb-t-e.pdf
14.12.2018	Panel on Transport	Administration's paper	CB(4)288/18-19(06) https://www.legco.gov.hk/yr18-19/english/panels/tp/papers/tp20181214cb4-288-6-e.pdf
		Background brief prepared by the Legislative Council Secretariat	CB(4)288/18-19(07) https://www.legco.gov.hk/yr18-19/english/panels/tp/papers/tp20181214cb4-288-7-e.pdf
		Minutes of meeting	CB(4)1186/18-19 https://www.legco.gov.hk/yr18-19/english/panels/tp/minutes/tp20181214.pdf
6.4.2020	Finance Committee	Replies to initial written questions raised by Finance Committee Members in examining the Estimates of Expenditure 2020-2021 (Reply Serial Nos. THB(T)018 and 030)	https://www.legco.gov.hk/yr19-20/english/fc/fc/w_q/thb-t-e.pdf

Date of meeting / document	Committee	Minutes/Paper	LC Paper No.
25.10.2019	Panel on Transport	Administration's paper	CB(4)13/19-20(01) https://www.legco.gov.hk/yr19-20/english/panels/tp/papers/tp20191025cb4-13-1-e.pdf
18.12.2020	Panel on Transport	Administration's paper	CB(4)275/20-21(01) https://www.legco.gov.hk/yr20-21/english/panels/tp/papers/tp20201218cb4-275-1-e.pdf
26.3.2019	Subcommittee on Hillside Escalator Links and Elevator Systems	Background brief prepared by the Legislative Council Secretariat	CB(4)668/18-19(01) https://www.legco.gov.hk/yr18-19/english/panels/tp/tp_hel/papers/tp_hel20190326cb4-668-1-e.pdf
13.11.2019		Administration's paper	CB(4)105/19-20(01) https://www.legco.gov.hk/yr19-20/english/panels/tp/tp_hel/papers/tp_hel20191113cb4-105-1-e.pdf
13.11.2019		Administration's follow-up paper	CB(4)389/19-20(02) https://www.legco.gov.hk/yr19-20/english/panels/tp/tp_hel/papers/tp_hel20191113cb4-389-2-e.pdf
31.3.2020		Report of the Subcommittee	CB(4)434/19-20 https://www.legco.gov.hk/yr19-20/english/panels/tp/tp_hel/reports/tp_helcb4-434-e.pdf

Council Business Division 4
Legislative Council Secretariat
11 February 2021