立法會 Legislative Council

LC Paper No. CB(4)619/20-21(04)

Ref.: CB4/PL/TP

Panel on Transport Meeting on 19 March 2021

Updated background brief on Route 11 (between North Lantau and Yuen Long)

Purpose

This paper provides updated background information on Route 11 (between North Lantau and Yuen Long) (hereafter referred to as the Route 11). It also summarizes the major views and concerns expressed by Legislative Council ("LegCo") Members on the above and related subjects.

Background

Route 11 (between North Lantau and Yuen Long)

2. In view of the long-term developments in the Northwest New Territories ("NWNT"), including the Hung Shui Kiu New Development Area, Yuen Long South development, housing developments along the West Rail Line, Yuen Long Industrial Estate Extension, the proposed logistics and other industrial developments in Tuen Mun Areas 38 and 49 and the rezoning of land parcels within the region, the Administration reviewed in 2015 the overall traffic demands of the NWNT in the next 10 years or even in the longer term. In July 2015, the Panel on Transport ("the Panel") was briefed on the Administration's planning work in respect of the NWNT Traffic and Infrastructure Review (please refer to LC Paper CB(4)1306/14-15(04) for details). Regarding the long term planning of the major trunk roads of NWNT, the Administration pointed out that a new strategic route ("Route 11") would be needed to connect NWNT and the urban areas to cope with the increase in transport demand.

- 3. According to the Administration, the proposed Route 11 will be a strategic highway to support the proposed developments in the NWNT. A plan showing the preliminary alignment of Route 11 is at **Appendix I**. Based on the traffic forecast provided by the Administration in 2017, after the commissioning of Tuen Mun-Chek Lap Kok Link ("TM-CLKL") and Tuen Mun Western Bypass ("TMWB"), Tuen Mun Road, Tai Lam Tunnel and Ting Kau Bridge would experience serious traffic congestion during peak hours in around 2036. The Administration also considered it necessary to improve the "external connectivity" of Lantau and the airport island. The Route 11 will provide a third strategic access to Lantau on top of Tsing Ma Bridge and TM-CLKL, thus enhancing the robustness of the road network connecting to the airport.
- The Administration proposed to commence a feasibility study on Route 4. 11 to facilitate the development of the NWNT in a timely manner and to cope with the associated traffic demand. On 13 April 2018, the Finance Committee ("FC") approved the Administration's proposal to upgrade 870TH, entitled "Feasibility Study on Route 11 (between North Lantau and Yuen Long)" ("the Study"), to Category A at an estimated cost of \$87.7 million in money-of-the-day prices to engage consultants for carrying out the Study and the associated site investigation work. The project scope comprised an engineering feasibility and infrastructure study; an alignment options study; a port operations, and marine traffic impact and safety study arising from Route 11 crossing the channel between Tsing Lung Tau and North Lantau; a preliminary environmental review; consultation exercises with relevant stakeholders and the public; and supervision of associated site investigation works.
- 5. The Study commenced in May 2018 and was expected to be completed in 2020. After completing the Study, the Administration would consider the way forward according to the results of the Study and the availability of sufficient resources.

Major views and concerns of Members

6. The major views and concerns of LegCo Members on Route 11, including those expressed during meetings of FC, Public Works Subcommittee ("PWSC") and the Panel, are summarized in the ensuing paragraphs.

1

Route 11 is based on the concept of Route 10 - North Lantau to Yuen Long Highway ("ex-Route 10"). The background information of ex-Route 10 is set out in paragraphs 23 to 26 of LC Paper No. CB(4)578/16-17(05).

Justifications for the construction of Route 11

- 7. At the meetings of FC on 6 and 13 April 2018, some members opined that there was an imminent need to proceed with the Route 11 construction project in order to alleviate the traffic congestion problem in NWNT. Some other members, on the other hand, pointed out that the new development areas in Hung Shui Kiu and Yuen Long South would provide quite a number of jobs in the districts and were concerned if the Administration had overestimated the then demand for external traffic between the region and the urban area from residents who lived in these new development areas. Some members opined that the commissioning of TM-CLKL and the proposed TMWB could already alleviate the external traffic congestion problem facing NWNT and hence it might not be necessary to build Route 11.
- 8. The Administration advised that Route 11 was built mainly to cope with the traffic demand arising from various major development projects in NWNT up to 2036. Based on the traffic forecast available, even after the completion of both TM-CLKL and the proposed TMWB, many major roads in NWNT, including Tuen Mun Road, Tai Lam Tunnel and Ting Kau Bridge, would still be heavily congested during peak hours in 2036 in the absence of Route 11. Furthermore, although the Administration was committed to facilitating local employment for NWNT residents, the traffic needs of those working across districts should also be taken care of. Even though the new development areas in NWNT could provide employment opportunities, this still could not fully meet the employment, school-related and other traffic demands (such as logistics) of new population in the region. Therefore, the Administration considered that there was a need to implement Route 11 to cope with the external traffic demand between the region and the urban area arising from population intake.
- 9. At the same FC meetings, some members were concerned about whether the Administration had sought to pave the way for linking Route 11 with the proposed artificial islands in the central waters and further with Hong Kong Island West for the purpose of supporting the implementation of the proposed East Lantau Metropolis ("ELM").
- 10. The Administration explained that the concept of Route 11 originated from ex-Route 10. Although it was proposed that TM-CLKL and TMWB should be implemented first, it was also suggested that ex-Route 10 should be considered again when there was further development in the NWNT. Hence, Route 11 did not originate from the ELM development proposed in recent years. The plan to construct Route 11 was mainly to cope with the traffic demand arising from various large-scale developments in NWNT by 2036 and the traffic demand did not take into consideration the planning and relevant developments

of ELM.

Alignment of Route 11

- 11. Members were concerned that under the preliminary alignment of Route 11 worked out by the Administration, vehicles from NWNT reaching Northeast Lantau by Route 11 could only access the urban areas via the North Lantau Highway and the Lantau Link. They were worried that following the population growth in NWNT and Tung Chung, the alignment option would add traffic load to the road network on Lantau, and the Lantau Link would become a traffic bottle-neck. Members urged the Administration to consider identifying another connecting point for Route 11 to link up with the traffic network of the urban areas. They also opined that the Study should explore the feasibility of other alignment options of Route 11.
- 12. At the PWSC meeting on 17 January 2018, the Administration advised that the alignment of Route 11 being put forth at this stage was preliminary. The feasibility study would cover the specific alignment options of Route 11 and the impact on the traffic volume of surrounding roads (including the Lantau Link). The Administration would keep an open mind when considering all viable alignment options. As to how Route 11 would be linked up with the road networks in the urban areas in future, the subject would be examined in the context of the feasibility study, which would also look into the need to plan a link road between Tsing Yi and Lantau. The Administration would explore feasible options to meet the traffic demand arising from the development in NWNT and North Lantau when conducting the feasibility study on Route 11. The Administration would not accept any recommendations that would result in excessive traffic load on the North Lantau Highway and the Lantau Link.
- 13. At the PWSC meetings on 8 and 17 January 2018, members opined that not only did the preliminary alignment of Route 11 fail to provide NWNT residents with direct road connection with the urban areas, it would also attract the vehicular traffic of NWNT to Northeast Lantau. They enquired whether the Administration had considered making Route 11 a direct link between NWNT and the urban areas of Hong Kong Island and Kowloon before putting forth the preliminary alignment of Route 11, thus obviating the need of linking up with Northeast Lantau.
- 14. The Administration advised that the preliminary alignment which linked up NWNT and Northeast Lantau had been worked out on the basis of the study findings on ex-Route 10. The Administration did not have any plans to make Route 11 a direct link between NWNT and the urban areas of Hong Kong Island and Kowloon. However, it would examine under the feasibility study the idea

of reserving some space in Northeast Lantau for the construction of other roads linking up with Tsing Yi in future. The Administration also undertook to explore other alignment proposals under the feasibility study.

- 15. Noting from the traffic forecast that, even with Route 11, there would still be traffic congestion along Tung Mun Road and Tai Lam Tunnel in 2036, members enquired whether the Administration would consider building a new railway to link up NWNT with the urban areas and re-consider the proposal of constructing the Coastal Railway between Tuen Mun and Tsuen Wan. At the PWSC meeting on 13 December 2017, some members urged the Administration to explore the feasibility of making the cross-harbour section of Route 11 a dual-purpose structure with highways and railways, so that the West Rail Line could be extended from NWNT via the bridge to link up with the Tung Chung Line or the Airport Express.
- 16. The Administration advised that it would examine the need to construct a new cross-harbour railway to link up NWNT with the urban areas under the "Strategic Studies on Railways and Major Roads beyond 2030" ("RMR 2030+ Studies"). The Administration would ensure that the findings of the Study on Route 11 would be incorporated in the RMR 2030+ Studies for study purpose.
- 17. A member enquired at the PWSC meeting on 8 January 2018 whether the Administration would consider the provision of more feeder roads under the Study to link up Route 11 with interchanges at Ting Kau Bridge and Tai Lam Tunnel, so as to alleviate the current traffic load on Tuen Mun Road. A motion was passed by the Panel at its meeting on 17 March 2017, urging the Administration to examine in the feasibility study on Route 11 whether the slip road of Route 11 can be further extended to Castle Peak Road.
- 18. The Administration reiterated that the alignment set out in the discussion paper was preliminary. Instead of pre-determining any options, the Administration would make consideration in the course of the Study. The Administration would include in the Study the proposed extension of the slip road of Route 11 to Castle Peak Road.

Timetable for construction and estimated construction costs

19. On members' enquiry raised at the Panel meeting on 17 March 2017 about the estimated construction cost of Route 11, the Administration advised that only after the completion of the Study would the Administration have a clearer picture of the estimated construction cost of Route 11, so the estimated construction cost could not be provided to members at the moment.

20. Some members expressed concern about the lengthy time required for conducting the Study and the construction of Route 11 which might not be able to meet the traffic demand in NWNT in time. The Administration advised that implementation of large infrastructure projects normally took more than 10 years, and the time for individual project would vary due to different project designs and challenges in the construction process. The Administration would consult relevant stakeholders during the Study. It was hoped that with their views duly taken into consideration at the initial stage of project design, the possibility of works delays due to objections in the community could be reduced.

Road network in the Northwest New Territories

21. A member enquired at the Panel meeting on 17 March 2017 whether the planning for Route 11 had taken into account the traffic impact of TM-CLKL and the proposed TMWB on NWNT, as well as dovetailing with the "Hong Kong 2030+: Towards a Planning Vision and Strategy Transcending 2030" study. The Administration advised that Route 11 would be instrumental in relieving the traffic congestion of Tuen Mun Road, Tai Lam Tunnel and Ting Kau Bridge, the volume to capacity ("v/c") ratios of which with and without Route 11 during the morning peak hours of 2036 had thus been pinpointed in the Administration's paper to the Panel in 2017. As for TM-CLKL and TMWB, given that they would be located farther away from Route 11, the Administration had not provided their projected v/c ratios in the above paper. Notwithstanding that, the Administration affirmed that the traffic implications of TM-CLKL and TMWB on NWNT had been taken into account in the planning for Route 11.

Latest position

22. The Administration plans to consult members on the funding proposal for the investigation study for Route 11 and associated major roads at the Panel meeting to be held on 19 March 2021.

Relevant papers

23. A list of relevant papers is in **Appendix II**.

Council Business Division 4
<u>Legislative Council Secretariat</u>
12 March 2021

附錄I Appendix I



List of relevant papers

Date of meeting	Meeting	Minutes/Paper	LC Paper No.
17.7.2015	Panel on Transport	Administration's paper on planning of transport infrastructure in Northwest New Territories	CB(4)1306/14-15(04) http://www.legco.gov.hk/yr1 4-15/english/panels/tp/paper s/tp20150717cb4-1306-4-e.p df
		Minutes	CB(4)228/15-16 http://www.legco.gov.hk/yr1 4-15/english/panels/tp/minut es/tp20150717.pdf
7.4.2016	Finance Committee (Special meeting)	Replies to initial written questions raised by Finance Committee members in examining the Estimates of Expenditure 2016-2017 (Session No.: 14) (Reply Serial No. THB(T)091)	http://www.legco.gov.hk/yr1 5-16/english/fc/fc/w_q/thb-t- e.pdf
23.11.2016	Council meeting	Hon LEUNG Che-cheung raised a question on Tuen Mun-Chek Lap Kok Link and Tuen Mun Western Bypass	http://www.info.gov.hk/gia/ general/201611/23/P201611 2300495.htm
20.1.2017	Panel on Transport	Administration's paper on transport-related policy initiatives of the Transport and Housing Bureau under the 2017 Policy Address and Policy Agenda	http://www.legco.gov.hk/yr1

Date of meeting	Meeting	Minutes/Paper	LC Paper No.
8.2.2017	Council meeting	Hon LEUNG Che-cheung raised a question on traffic situation in Northwest New Territories	http://www.info.gov.hk/gia/ general/201702/08/P201702 0800489.htm
17.3.2017	Panel on Transport	Administration's paper on public works programme item No. 870TH - Feasibility Study on Route 11 (between North Lantau and Yuen Long) funding application	CB(4)578/16-17(05) https://www.legco.gov.hk/yr 16-17/english/panels/tp/pape rs/tp20170317cb4-578-5-e.p df
		Administration's follow-up paper	CB(4)1249/16-17(01) https://www.legco.gov.hk/yr 16-17/english/panels/tp/pape rs/tp20170317cb4-1249-1-e. pdf
		Minutes	CB(4)1470/16-17 https://www.legco.gov.hk/yr 16-17/english/panels/tp/min utes/tp20170317.pdf
5.4.2017	Finance Committee (Special meeting)	Replies to initial written questions raised by Finance Committee members in examining the Estimates of Expenditure 2017-2018 (Session No.: 13) (Reply Serial Nos. THB(T)267, 268 and 277)	https://www.legco.gov.hk/yr 16-17/english/fc/fc/w_q/thb- t-e.pdf
18.10.2017	Council meeting	Hon Kenneth LAU raised a question on traffic situation in Yuen Long	https://www.info.gov.hk/gia/general/201710/18/P201710 1700772.htm

Name	Date of meeting	Meeting	Minutes/Paper	LC Paper No.
https://www.legco.gov.hk 17-18/english/fc/pwsc/mi es/pwsc20171213.pdf PWSC126/17-18 https://www.legco.gov.hk 17-18/english/fc/pwsc/mi es/pwsc20180108.pdf PWSC127/17-18 https://www.legco.gov.hk 17-18/english/fc/pwsc/mi es/pwsc20180117.pdf 6.4.2018 Finance Administration's paper FCR(2017-18)65 https://www.legco.gov.hk 17-18/english/fc/fc/papers 7-65e.pdf Minutes FC146/18-19 https://www.legco.gov.hk 17-18/english/fc/fc/minut c20180406.pdf FC133/18-19	13.12.2017 8.1.2018		870TH - Feasibility Study on Route 11 (between North Lantau and Yuen	https://www.legco.gov.hk/yr 17-18/english/fc/pwsc/paper
13.4.2018 Committee https://www.legco.gov.hk 17-18/english/fc/fc/papers 7-65e.pdf Minutes FC146/18-19 https://www.legco.gov.hk 17-18/english/fc/fc/minute c20180406.pdf FC133/18-19 FC133/18-19			Minutes	https://www.legco.gov.hk/yr 17-18/english/fc/pwsc/minut es/pwsc20171213.pdf PWSC126/17-18 https://www.legco.gov.hk/yr 17-18/english/fc/pwsc/minut es/pwsc20180108.pdf PWSC127/17-18 https://www.legco.gov.hk/yr 17-18/english/fc/pwsc/minut
				https://www.legco.gov.hk/yr 17-18/english/fc/fc/papers/f1 7-65e.pdf FC146/18-19 https://www.legco.gov.hk/yr 17-18/english/fc/fc/minutes/f c20180406.pdf

Date of meeting	Meeting	Minutes/Paper	LC Paper No.
18.4.2018	Finance Committee (Special meeting)	Replies to initial written questions raised by Finance Committee members in examining the Estimates of Expenditure 2018-2019 (Session No.: 9) (Reply Serial Nos. THB(T)064 and 088)	https://www.legco.gov.hk/yr 17-18/english/fc/fc/w_q/thb- t-e.pdf
19.10.2018	Panel on Transport	Administration's paper on transport-related policy initiatives of the Transport and Housing Bureau under the 2018 Policy Address and Policy Agenda	CB(4)19/18-19(01) https://www.legco.gov.hk/yr 18-19/english/panels/tp/pape rs/tp20181019cb4-19-1-e.pd f
5.12.2018	Council meeting	Hon Steven HO raised a question on external transport services for Tuen Mun and Tsuen Wan	https://www.info.gov.hk/gia/general/201812/05/P201812 0500542.htm
10.4.2019	Finance Committee (Special meeting)	Replies to initial written questions raised by Finance Committee members in examining the Estimates of Expenditure 2019-2020 (Session No.: 9) (Reply Serial Nos. THB(T)028, 038 and 262)	https://www.legco.gov.hk/yr 18-19/english/fc/fc/w_q/thb- t-e.pdf
8.7.2020	Council meeting	Dr Hon KWOK Ka-ki raised a question on external transport for Tuen Mun	https://www.info.gov.hk/gia/general/202007/08/P202007 0800332.htm
4.11.2020	Council meeting	Hon Holden CHOW raised a question on transport infrastructure for the Tuen Mun District	https://www.info.gov.hk/gia/general/202011/04/P202011 0400319.htm

Date of meeting	Meeting	Minutes/Paper	LC Paper No.
16.12.2020	Council meeting	Hon Holden CHOW raised a question on development of and ancillary facilities for Tung Chung	general/202012/16/P202012
13.1.2021	Council meeting	Hon Holden CHOW raised a question on public housing development projects and the transport infrastructure in the Area 54 of Tuen Mun	general/202101/13/P202101 1300416.htm

Council Business Division 4
<u>Legislative Council Secretariat</u>
12 March 2021