

立法會

Legislative Council

LC Paper No. CB(4)1716/20-21
(These minutes have been seen by
the Administration)

Ref: CB4/PS/1/20

Panel on Transport

Subcommittee on Matters Relating to Railways

Minutes of meeting on Friday, 4 June 2021, at 8:30 am in Conference Room 1 of the Legislative Council Complex

Members present : Hon CHAN Han-pan, BBS, JP (Chairman)
Hon LUK Chung-hung, JP (Deputy Chairman)
Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, GBS, JP
Hon Tommy CHEUNG Yu-yan, GBS, JP
Dr Hon Priscilla LEUNG Mei-fun, SBS, JP
Hon Mrs Regina IP LAU Suk-yeet, GBS, JP
Hon Michael TIEN Puk-sun, BBS, JP
Hon Frankie YICK Chi-ming, SBS, JP
Hon YIU Si-wing, BBS
Hon POON Siu-ping, BBS, MH
Ir Dr Hon LO Wai-ki, SBS, MH, JP
Hon Wilson OR Chong-shing, MH
Hon LAU Kwok-fan, MH
Dr Hon CHENG Chung-tai
Hon Tony TSE Wai-chuen, BBS, JP

Members attending : Hon Holden CHOW Ho-ding

**Public Officers
attending** : **Agenda item II**

Mrs Sharon YIP LEE Hang-yee, JP
Deputy Secretary for Transport and Housing
(Transport)1
Transport and Housing Bureau

Ms Amy WONG Pui-man
Deputy Secretary for Transport and Housing
(Transport)2
Transport and Housing Bureau

Mr Nick CHOI Chi-kit
Principal Assistant Secretary for Transport and
Housing (Transport) 4
Transport and Housing Bureau

Mr Peter MAK Chi-kwong
Principal Assistant Secretary for Transport and
Housing (Transport)7
Transport and Housing Bureau

Mr Jimmy CHAN Pai-ming, JP
Director of Highways
Highways Department

Mr Robert CHAN Cheuk-ming, JP
Principal Government Engineer / Railway
Development
Highways Department

Mr LAM Yu-chau
Government Engineer / Railway Development (1)
Highways Department

Mr Honson YUEN Hong-shing
Assistant Commissioner/Bus & Railway
Transport Department

Agenda item III

Mrs Sharon YIP LEE Hang-yee, JP
Deputy Secretary for Transport and
Housing (Transport)1
Transport and Housing Bureau

Mr Peter MAK Chi-kwong
Principal Assistant Secretary for Transport and
Housing (Transport)7
Transport and Housing Bureau

Mr Jimmy CHAN Pai-ming, JP
Director of Highways
Highways Department

Mr Robert CHAN Cheuk-ming, JP
Principal Government Engineer / Railway
Development
Highways Department

Mr LAM Yu-chau
Government Engineer / Railway Development (1)
Highways Department

Agenda item IV

Mr Frank CHAN Fan, JP
Secretary for Transport and Housing
Transport and Housing Bureau

Mrs Sharon YIP LEE Hang-yee, JP
Deputy Secretary for Transport and
Housing (Transport)1
Transport and Housing Bureau

Mr Andy LAM Siu-hong
Principal Assistant Secretary for Transport and
Housing (Transport)3
Transport and Housing Bureau

Mr Vic YAU Cheuk-hang, JP
Deputy Secretary for Development (Planning and
Lands)1
Development Bureau

Mr Jimmy CHAN Pai-ming, JP
Director of Highways
Highways Department

Mr Robert CHAN Cheuk-ming, JP
Principal Government Engineer/Railway
Development
Highways Department

Mr NGAI Hon-wah
Government Engineer/Railway Development (2)
Highways Department

**Attendance by
invitation** :

Agenda item II

MTR Corporation Limited

Dr Jacob KAM
Chief Executive Officer

Dr Tony LEE
Operations Director

Mr Sammy WONG
Chief of Operating

Ms Diane CHIU
General Manager – Business Insights & Growth

Mr Lam CHAN
Deputy General Manager – Projects & Property
Communications

Agenda item III

Dr Jacob KAM
Chief Executive Officer

Mr Roger BAYLISS
Capital Works Director

Mr James CHOW
General Manager – SCL & HSR

Mr Lam CHAN
Deputy General Manager – Projects & Property
Communications

Clerk in attendance : Ms Sophie LAU
Chief Council Secretary (4)2

Staff in attendance : Ms Jacqueline LAW
Council Secretary (4)2

Miss Mandy LAM
Legislative Assistant (4)2

I. Information paper(s) issued since the last meeting
(LC Paper Nos. CB(4)846/20-21(01) and CB(4)1064/20-21(01))

Members noted the above papers which had been issued since the last regular meeting of the Subcommittee on Matters Relating to Railways ("the Subcommittee") held on 9 April 2021.

II. Commissioning Arrangements of Tuen Ma Line
(LC Paper No. CB(4)1029/20-21(01))

2. At the invitation of the Chairman, Deputy Secretary for Transport and Housing (Transport) 1 ("DSTH(T)1") and Chief Executive Officer of the MTR Corporation Limited ("MTRCL") briefed members on the commissioning arrangements of Tuen Ma Line. Operations Director of MTRCL and Chief of

Action

Operating of MTRCL then briefed members on the details of the commissioning arrangements with the aid of a powerpoint presentation (LC Paper No. CB(4)1096/20-21(01)). The Subcommittee deliberated (index of proceedings attached at **Annex**).

3. On a member's request, the Administration undertook to follow up with the Antiquities and Monuments Office to provide information regarding the display arrangements of the archaeological relics discovered at Sung Wong Toi Station, including the target completion timeframe of the relevant works.

(Post-meeting note: the supplementary information provided by the Administration was circulated to members vide LC Paper No. CB(4)1172/20-21(01) on 25 June 2021.)

III. Progress update of the construction of Shatin to Central Link
(LC Paper Nos. CB(4)1029/20-21(02) – (03))

4. At the invitation of the Chairman, DSTH(T)1 briefed members on the progress update of the construction of Shatin to Central Link. Chief Executive Officer of MTRCL and Deputy General Manager – Projects & Property Communications of MTRCL then briefed members on the Investigation Panel report on the postponement of the commissioning of East Rail Line new signalling system and the mixed fleet operations with the aid of a powerpoint presentation (LC Paper No. CB(4)1096/20-21(02)). The Subcommittee deliberated (index of proceedings attached at **Annex**).

IV. Hung Shui Kiu Station
(LC Paper No. CB(4)1029/20-21(04))

5. At the invitation of the Chairman, Secretary for Transport and Housing briefed members on the proposed way forward of the Hung Shui Kiu Station project. Government Engineer/Railway Development (2) of Highways Department then briefed members on the details of the project with the aid of a powerpoint presentation (LC Paper No. CB(4)1096/20-21(03)). The Subcommittee deliberated (index of proceedings attached at **Annex**).

Action

V. Any other business

6. There being no other business, the meeting ended at 10:47 am.

Council Business Division 4
Legislative Council Secretariat
4 November 2021

Panel on Transport

Subcommittee on Matters Relating to Railways

**Proceedings of the meeting
held on Friday, 4 June 2021, at 8:30 am
in Conference Room 1 of the Legislative Council Complex**

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
<i>Agenda Item I – Information paper(s) issued since the last meeting</i>			
000537 – 000840	Chairman Mr Tony TSE	Referring to the Administration's response to his letter (LC Paper No. CB(4)1064/20-21(01)), Mr TSE expressed his appreciation that the MTR Corporation Limited ("MTRCL") and its contractors would not be allowed in future to engage under the same project the same consultant to address concerns about potential conflict of interest. He hoped that more different consultancy firms would be engaged in future railway projects to enhance fair competition in the industry.	
<i>Agenda Item II – Commissioning Arrangements of Tuen Ma Line</i>			
000840 – 001020	Chairman Administration	Briefing by the Administration [LC Paper No. CB(4)1029/20-21(01)].	
001021 – 001715	Chairman MTRCL	Briefing by MTRCL with the aid of a powerpoint presentation [LC Paper No. CB(4)1096/20-21(01)].	
001716 – 002155	Chairman Mr POON Siu-ping Administration MTRCL	<p>Referring to paragraph 4 of Annex 2 to the Administration's paper, Mr POON enquired about the total amount paid by the Kowloon-Canton Railway Corporation ("KCRC") to MTRCL under the Supplemental Service Concession Agreement ("SSCA") for the Tuen Ma Line ("TML").</p> <p>The Administration advised that to prepare for the commissioning of TML Phase 1 ("TML1"), KCRC and MTRCL signed a two-year SSCA to grant the right to operate TML1 to MTRCL. Since the revenue generated during the first two years from the commissioning of TML1 would not be sufficient to cover the running cost, KCRC would need to temporarily pay an estimated sum of \$241 million (in money-of-the-day ("MOD") prices) to MTRCL according to SSCA. Given that the amount mentioned above covered the two-year concession period, and the full commissioning of TML had been advanced, the actual amount to be paid by KCRC would be reduced to cover the running cost of TML1 in the first year of operation only. According to the latest projection, KCRC would be able to recover the amount paid temporarily from</p>	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>the concession payment from MTRCL after the full commissioning of SCL.</p> <p>In response to Mr POON's enquiry, MTRCL advised that the train frequency of TML1 upon the full TML commissioning would be increased from 3.5 minutes to 3 minutes during the morning peak, which was on a par with that of the existing West Rail Line. In addition, short-haul special trips would be arranged to run between busy stations where necessary to ease passenger flow during peak hours.</p>	
002156 – 002603	Chairman Mr Tony TSE Administration MTRCL	<p>Mr TSE noted with concern that passengers travelling on TML upon its full commissioning would have to pay more for some journeys than those travelling further. For example, passengers travelling from Hung Hom to Hin Keng stations would be charged \$3.4 more than those travelling one station further to Tai Wai.</p> <p>MTRCL advised that alongside distance, the fare structure of new railway line would also take into account market factors including convenience and journey time. The example mentioned by Mr TSE was also influenced by historical factors. The issue would be addressed through the Fare Adjustment Mechanism over the coming years.</p> <p>As regard Mr TSE's enquiry about the levels of penalties stipulated under the amendment to the Operating Agreement ("AOA") for TML, the Administration advised that the AOA concerned would specify in detail the requirements imposed by the Administration in relation to the operation of TML, including the train service performance requirements, reliability of passenger service related equipment at the new stations, and other service performance standards. Notwithstanding that the performance requirements under AOA would be lower for two years from the commencement of revenue operations of new railway project, the penalties to be imposed in case MTRCL failed to meet such requirements would be on a par with those of existing lines.</p>	
002604 – 003051	Chairman Mr Wilson OR Administration MTRCL	<p>Mr OR followed up on Mr Tony TSE's question on the fare structure of TML and asked about the time required by MTRCL to address the issue.</p> <p>MTRCL advised that upon the full commissioning</p>	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>of TML, passengers would have more options on travelling routes. This might create irregularities under the existing TML fare structure. The issue would be addressed through the established mechanism, which would take some time. Tapping the experience gained from the existing West Rail Line (“WRL”), MTRCL was confident that the fare structure of TML would be rationalized. In addition, to celebrate the full commissioning of TML, special fare discounts were introduced, and the existing fare concessions had also been extended to cover the new stations along the TML.</p> <p>Mr OR enquired about the public transport reorganization plan for the full commissioning of TML and the relevant information paper that had been sent to the District Councils concerned.</p> <p>The Administration advised that the Transport Department (“TD”) expected that the travelling patterns and public transport modal choices of residents living in the vicinity of the TML new stations would change upon the full commissioning of TML. TD considered it necessary to review and, subject to the actual passenger demand, adjust the existing public transport services in the district concerned and had submitted an information paper in this regard to the relevant District Councils for reference.</p>	
003052 – 003530	Chairman Mr YIU Si-wing MTRCL Administration	<p>Mr YIU enquired if the on-site archeological relics displayed inside Sung Wong Toi Station would be open for group visits; and if so, whether there were sufficient parking spaces for coaches near the station.</p> <p>MTRCL and the Administration advised that showcases were provided for displaying the on-site archaeological finds in the concourse of the station. Discussion regarding the display arrangements with the Antiquities and Monuments Office (“AMO”) was underway. The Administration understood that AMO also planned to display some of the archaeological relics unearthed during the construction of Sung Wong Toi Station in a park atop the station. TD would also review the public transport services and the provision of ancillary transport facilities including parking spaces in the district to tie in with the display and visit arrangements of the archaeological relics.</p>	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>Mr YIU called on MTRCL and AMO to arrange discussions with the travel industry on the visit arrangements of the on-site archaeological relics.</p>	
003531 – 003958	Chairman Dr CHENG Chung-tai Administration	<p>Dr CHENG was dissatisfied that both the Administration and MTRCL were not able to tell the time needed to rationalize the situation of higher fares for shorter journeys on certain section of TML.</p> <p>The Administration advised that since it would not be possible for the Administration to foresee the future fare adjustment rate under the Fare Adjustment Mechanism of MTRCL, and given the fluctuating economic situation in recent years, it would be difficult to estimate the time needed to rationalize the fare structure of TML.</p> <p>On Dr CHENG's enquiry about the adjustment of franchised bus and Green Minibus ("GMB") services after the full commissioning of TML, the Administration advised that TD had already devised the public transport reorganization plan for the full commissioning of TML. Having regard to the actual passengers' demand about six months after the commissioning of TML, TD would consider whether there was a need to revise the reorganization plan and adjust the bus and GMB services accordingly.</p>	
003959 – 004424	Chairman Administration	<p>The Chairman considered that the Administration had the responsibility to draw up a reasonable timeframe for rationalizing the fare structures of WRL, EAL and the former Ma On Shan Line, given that the above three railway lines were owned by the Government. He further asked about the objectives to be achieved upon the rationalization of the fare structures of these railway lines and the timeframe.</p> <p>The Administration advised that MTRCL would continue to adjust the fare levels of different railway lines through the existing mechanism, such that fares for short-haul trips would not be more expensive than those of long-haul trips. Regarding the suggestion that the Administration should consider lowering the concession payment payable by MTRCL so as to create more room to reduce the fares of WRL, the Administration considered that this would be equivalent to using public funds to subsidize MTR fares directly. It would be more appropriate for the Administration</p>	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>to provide fare subsidy to relieve the fare burden of the commuters who used local public transport services for daily commuting and whose public transport expenses are relatively high.</p> <p>Considering that the fare level of WRL was much higher than that of EAL, the Chairman opined that the Administration had to give an account to the public on the matter.</p>	
004425 – 004846	Chairman Dr Priscilla LEUNG MTRCL Administration	<p>Dr LEUNG pointed out that many building units in To Kwa Wan were suspected to have been affected by the works of SCL and that wall cracks and subsidence had been found in the affected buildings. The hygienic condition of the districts concerned was also worsened probably caused by the vibration generated by the construction works of SCL. Dr LEUNG asked about the follow-up actions that would be taken by MTRCL to address the above issues.</p> <p>MTRCL expressed gratitude to the local residents for their cooperation and understanding during the construction of SCL over the past years. Special fare promotions would be offered to passengers of the TML new stations to encourage the local communities to use the new railway service. Besides, MTRCL had established mechanisms to monitor the settlement situation in the vicinity of the construction sites of SCL throughout the construction process. In 2019, MTRCL launched a community care programme on a without prejudice basis to provide financial support to concerned owners of the residential units in the vicinity to carry out repair works. MTRCL and the Administration noted Dr LEUNG's concern over the hygienic condition of the districts concerned and would review the follow-up actions as appropriate.</p>	
004847 – 005320	Chairman Ir Dr LO Wai-kwok Administration MTRCL	<p>Ir Dr LO appreciated MTRCL's effort to improve the linkage between Sung Wong Toi Station and the nearby streets in Kowloon City district by constructing an underground pedestrian walkway. Noting that the distance between Sung Wong Tai Station and Entrance B was quite long, he asked whether MTRCL would consider installing a traveller similar to the one in Tsim Sha Tsui Station on the walkway to facilitate pedestrian flow.</p> <p>MTRCL advised that an adit connecting Entrance B was provided in Sung Wong Toi Station with a view</p>	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>to improving the connectivity of Kowloon City district. Due to insufficient time, the Chairman asked MTRCL to further explain to Ir Dr LO on its relevant planning work after the meeting.</p> <p>At Ir Dr LO's request, the Administration undertook to follow up with AMO to provide information regarding the display arrangements of the archaeological relics.</p>	Admin (paragraph 3 of the minutes referred.)
005321 – 005820	Chairman Deputy Chairman MTRCL	In response to the Deputy Chairman's enquiry, MTRCL stressed that the fares between existing stations would remain unchanged, regardless of the passengers' choice of different routings after the commissioning of the TML. On the Deputy Chairman's enquiry about the fare concessions for passengers travelling on the existing WRL upon commissioning of TML, MTRCL advised that the existing fare concessions and promotions, including the fare discount provided under "Monthly Pass Extra", would be continued and extended to cover the full TML. Given that there were several types of "Monthly Pass Extra", the Chairman suggested MTRCL to provide the relevant fares information to the Deputy Chairman after the meeting.	
<i>Agenda Item III – Progress update of the construction of Shatin to Central Link</i>			
005821 – 010215	Chairman Administration	Briefing by the Administration [LC Paper No. CB(4)1029/20-21(02)].	
010216 – 010716	Chairman MTRCL	Briefing by MTRCL with the aid of a powerpoint presentation [LC Paper No. CB(4)1096/20-21(02)].	
010717 – 011056	Chairman Mr POON Siu-ping Mr Michael TIEN Administration MTRCL	<p>Mr POON enquired whether or not the target commissioning date of the "Hung Hom to Admiralty Section" in the first quarter of 2022 could be maintained with the implementation of delay recovery measures.</p> <p>The Administration and MTRCL responded that the target commissioning of the "Hung Hom to Admiralty Section" in the first quarter of 2022 remained a critical challenge. Both the Administration and MTRCL had been working together with best endeavor with a view to expediting the commissioning of the "Hung Hom to Admiralty Section" as much as possible. MTRCL and the Highways Department ("HyD") had been assessing the effectiveness of the delay recovery measures and public announcement would be made in due course. MTRCL added that it would</p>	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>continue to expedite the progress of the remaining two critical works on EAL, i.e. the bifurcation works and the introduction of new EAL 9-car trains.</p> <p>In respect of Mr POON's enquiry about the programme of train replacement on EAL, MTRCL advised that 12 sets of new 9-car trains were delivered to Hong Kong, of which 8 had been put into service. The existing 12-car trains on EAL would be replaced by the new 9-car trains as scheduled.</p>	
011057 – 011435	Chairman Dr CHENG Chung-tai MTRCL Administration	<p>Dr CHENG expressed concern about the impact of issues relating to the new EAL signalling system on the target commissioning of "Hung Hom to Admiralty Section".</p> <p>MTRCL advised that it was highly challenging to carrying out the relevant works and the regular maintenance work on the century-old EAL at the same time during non-traffic hours at night. Nevertheless, MTRCL would try its best endeavours to expedite the programme. Upon the completion of assessment, MTRCL would give an update to the public on the programme of the "Hung Hom to Admiralty Section".</p> <p>The Administration added that upon completion of the testing of the new signalling system by MTRCL, the relevant government departments would ascertain the safety and reliability of the new system through a stringent process before approving the commissioning of new signalling system for daily operation.</p>	
011436 – 011751	Chairman Deputy Chairman MTRCL	<p>The Deputy Chairman enquired whether the existing platforms at Hung Hom Station for the operation of 12-car trains would be retained, so that the 12-car trains could still be deployed to provide train service in case the carrying capacity of 9-car trains was found to be insufficient to meet the future passenger demand.</p> <p>MTRCL advised that the installation of Automatic Platform Gates ("APGs") would only commence when the EAL was fully run by the new trains due to the different door positions. Besides, the existing 12-car trains could not operate in Hong Kong Island, therefore the introduction of new trains was required for extending EAL across the harbour. Upon the commissioning of the "Hung Hom to Admiralty</p>	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>Section”, MTRCL advised that, the existing EAL platforms at Hung Hom Station would be decommissioned under the current plan.</p>	
011752 – 012141	Chairman Mr Michael TIEN MTRCL Administration	<p>Given that the commissioning of the new EAL signalling system had been delayed, Mr TIEN asked how confident MTRCL was in commissioning the "Hung Hom to Admiralty Section" before the end of June 2022, given that MTRCL considered the target commissioning of this section in first quarter of 2022 a critical challenge. MTRCL reiterated its stance.</p> <p>Having regard to the comparatively higher fare levels of WRL and Tung Chung Line ("TCL") than those of EAL and the future SCL, Mr TIEN urged the Administration to consider lowering the concession payment payable by MTRCL under the Entrustment Agreement for the operation of TML, so as to create room to rationalize the difference in fares between WRL/TCL and EAL/future SCL. He was also concerned that the provision of fare subsidy to commuters might not be continued in the next term of the HKSAR Government.</p> <p>The Administration responded that the fare levels and the terms of service agreement of SCL would be determined in accordance with the consensus reached by the Administration and MTRCL in the past.</p>	
012142 – 012453	Chairman Ir Dr LO Wai-kwok MTRCL	<p>Referring to the media report that there were a total of 27 incidents related to the new EAL signalling system which led to service disruption of eight minutes or more since the new system and new trains commenced operation in February 2021, Ir Dr LO sought explanations from MTRCL in this regard.</p> <p>MTRCL advised that teething problems may occur during the initial period after commissioning of new signalling system and trains. When compared with the first two months of operation, the numbers of incidents related to the new EAL signalling and the new trains were decreasing. MTRCL was confident that such issues would be resolved progressively following the implementation of operational measures and the overall performance of the new EAL signalling and the new trains would be further improved.</p> <p>Ir Dr LO suggested MTRCL to make public the relevant data proactively so as to enhance the public's</p>	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		confidence in the new signalling system.	
012454 – 012826	Chairman Mr LAU Kwok-fan MTRCL	<p>Noting that the train frequency had not been increased since the new EAL signalling system and 9-car trains commenced operation, Mr LAU expressed concern that the congestion situation on EAL platforms would be aggravated once the existing 12-car trains were fully replaced by the new 9-car trains. Mr LAU thus sought confirmation of whether the carrying capacity of EAL would be increased when the train fleet of EAL was fully replaced by the new 9-car trains.</p> <p>MTRCL advised that there was capacity to enhance the train frequency under the new EAL signalling system upon the commissioning of the “Hung Hom to Admiralty Section”. Besides, about 10% of EAL passengers had been diverted to use TML1 upon its commissioning which had relieved the crowdedness of the critical section of EAL. MTRCL expected that the diversion effect would be more significant upon full commissioning of TML. In the meantime, MTRCL would continue to strengthen measures to manage the passenger flows and arrange short-haul special trips when appropriate.</p>	
012827 – 013135	Chairman Mr Wilson OR MTRCL	<p>Mr OR was of the view that MTRCL should actively communicate with the public on the works progress of SCL. MTRCL noted Mr OR's view and responded that it would continue to enhance its communication with different stakeholders in a transparent and proactive manner.</p> <p>As to Mr OR's concern about the impact of the Coronavirus Disease 2019 pandemic on the overall progress of SCL project, MTRCL advised that a number of measures had been implemented to minimize the impact, including identifying alternative suppliers of materials and using technology to facilitate collaboration with overseas experts on overseeing the works.</p>	
013136 – 013514	Chairman Mr YIU Si-wing Administration MTRCL	<p>In response to Mr YIU's enquiry, the Administration advised that the use of the topside development at the Exhibition Centre Station was yet to be finalized, and that the construction works at Exhibition Centre Station had not been affected and were substantially completed as reported by MTRCL.</p> <p>Mr YIU enquired about the most critical challenges affecting the programme for the "Hung Hom to</p>	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>Admiralty Section". MTRCL further explained that the two driving critical paths (i.e. bifurcation works and signalling testing) to the commissioning of "Hung Hom to Admiralty Section" and the Corporation is using its best endeavours to expedite the programme.</p>	
013515 – 013939	<p>Chairman Mr Tony TSE MTRCL</p>	<p>In response to Mr TSE's enquiry, MTRCL advised that the new EAL signalling system and 9-car trains commenced service in early February 2021 and that had been delayed for about eight months. The track bifurcation works scheduled to be carried out in 10 selected Sundays were over 50% completed. The relevant works were expected to be completed by October 2021.</p> <p>As regards the aforementioned 27 incidents related to the new EAL signalling system which led to service disruption of eight minutes or more, MTRCL advised that all the seven incidents which happened in May 2021 were related to the new trains, and that the operation of the new signalling system was smoothing.</p>	
013940 – 014343	<p>Chairman Mrs Regina IP Administration MTRCL</p>	<p>Mrs IP enquired about the follow-up actions taken by the Administration to pursue the responsibilities of MTRCL in respect of the construction of SCL. The Administration responded that pursuant to the Entrustment Agreement of SCL, should it be established that MTRCL had not fulfilled the obligation as stipulated in the Agreement thus causing a loss to the Government, the Government would reserve the rights to pursue the responsibilities of MTRCL. Given that the SCL project was yet to complete, the Administration would ensure proper documentation of the construction works concerned for taking follow-up actions against MTRCL as and when appropriate.</p> <p>On Mrs IP's concern about the project management cost payable to MTRCL, the Administration reiterated its position that it disagreed to any additional project management cost as the justification submitted by MTRCL for the proposed additional project management cost was insufficient.</p> <p>In response to Mrs IP's enquiry on the number of MTRCL staff who had received vaccination, MTRCL responded that the Corporation was encouraging staff to get vaccinated while acknowledging that it was entirely voluntary.</p>	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
014344 – 014651	Chairman MTRCL	<p>The Chairman opined that the information provided in the Administration's paper in respect of the performance of the new EAL signalling system was insufficient.</p> <p>MTRCL responded that the trend of incidents regarding the new signalling system was decreasing and most are related to teething issues. Regarding the progress recovery, MTRCL advised that it was targeted to commence the full line train testing of the new signaling system in the third or fourth quarter of 2021, and the statutory inspections by end 2021.</p>	
<i>Agenda Item IV – Hung Shui Kiu Station</i>			
014652 – 015806	Chairman Administration	Briefing by the Administration with the aid of a powerpoint presentation [LC Paper No CB(4)1096/20-21(03)].	
015807 – 020122	Chairman Deputy Chairman Administration	<p>Noticing that the Hung Shui Kiu ("HSK") Station project would be implemented under the ownership approach, the Deputy Chairman enquired if the MTR Corporation Limited ("MTRCL") would seek funding from the Legislative Council ("LegCo") for the construction of the HSK Station or not. He was also concerned with the high construction cost and urged the Administration to speed up the HSK Station project. He further asked if any property development projects would be implemented on top of the HSK Station, and if yes, what would be the profit-sharing arrangement among the Government and MTRCL or whether MTRCL would have to pay a land premium to the Government.</p> <p>The Administration advised that under the ownership approach, the owner of the railway, i.e. MTRCL, would be responsible for the financing, design, construction, operation and maintenance of the new railway. Granting property development rights or capital grant would be considered as possible means for providing financial support to bridge the funding gap for the railway project, if necessary. The Administration said that there will be no property development atop the HSK Station, though adjoining land had been reserved for providing financial support if necessary. The Administration would engage independent consultants to carry out cost checking and ascertain the funding gap.</p>	
020123 – 020440	Chairman Ir Dr LO Wai-kwok	The Chairman decided to extend the meeting for 15 minutes.	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
	Administration	<p>Ir Dr LO was dissatisfied that the HSK Station project was implemented seven years after the Railway Development Strategy 2014 ("RDS-2014") was announced. The Chairman shared the same view.</p> <p>Ir Dr LO considered the construction cost of \$4.1 billion was expensive as only a new station would be constructed along an existing railway line. He had no objection to adopting Railway-plus-Property approach to implement the HSK Station project, as it was considered as an effective way of providing housing supply to the market. He asked the Administration to brief members on the overall development related to the HSK Station as soon as possible.</p> <p>The Administration advised that railway projects involved huge investment. The Government had to be prudent in planning future railway projects having regard to population, construction cost and other development programme. The Administration had been implementing the railway projects recommended under the RDS-2014 progressively and had already briefed members on the proposed way forward of the Tung Chung Line Extension, Tuen Mun South Extension and Northern Link (and Kwu Tung Station) projects. The estimated construction cost for HSK Station was only a preliminary estimate. The Administration would carefully and rigorously examine the costs of the project when negotiating with MTRCL.</p>	
020441 – 020800	Chairman Mr LAU Kwok-fan Administration	<p>Mr LAU was dissatisfied that, similar to Northern Link (and Kwu Tung Station), HSK Station could not tie in with the timetable of developments nearby. He urged the Administration to catch up to follow the construction programme as recommended under RDS-2014. He also cast doubt on the long construction time for the station, which was double of the originally planned time.</p> <p>The Administration advised that the primary function of HSK Station was to serve the population of Hung Shui Kiu/Ha Tsuen New Development Area ("HSK/HT NDA") of which major population intake would only start in 2030. Before 2030, other public transport would be sufficient to satisfy the need of new population of around 4 000. The Administration explained that to reduce the impact</p>	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>on the existing railway line and ensure normal operation of the West Rail Line ("WRL"), the construction of the HSK Station would have to be carried out during non-traffic hours. Certain advance works, e.g. modification of overhead line for WRL, would commence beforehand to shorten the construction time as far as possible.</p>	
020801 – 021141	Chairman Mr Michael TIEN Administration	<p>Mr TIEN also shared the view of Mr LAU Kwok-fan, that the HSK Station project had originally been planned to commence in 2021 and complete in 2024 to meet the transport need of the first population intake of the HSK/HT NDA. The commissioning target by 2030 seemed to be contradictory to the "infrastructure-led, capacity creating" planning approach.</p> <p>The Administration explained that the implementation of the HSK Station largely depended on the need of the population nearby. According to the latest development programme, major population intake in the HSK/HT NDA would only take place in 2030. The timetable in RDS-2014 was only preliminary and the implementation of the HSK Station should match with the actual population intake programme of HSK/HT NDA. It was considered more cost-effective to serve the first batch population intake with other modes of public transport before the completion of the HSK Station.</p>	
021142 – 021505	Chairman Mr POON Siu-ping Administration	<p>Mr POON noted that a total population of around 218 000 would move into the HSK/HT NDA upon full development and 150 000 new jobs would be created. He enquired about the types of new jobs to be created. In view of current heavy loading on WRL, he asked about the impact of the commissioning of the HSK Station on the loading of WRL and what actions would be undertaken to ensure the normal operation of the WRL during the construction of the HSK Station. He further asked when the Administration would be certain on the construction cost.</p> <p>The Administration advised that the estimation of 150 000 new jobs was based on the new commercial floor area and industrial floor area being planned in HSK/HT NDA. More accurate cost estimation would be available when the detailed planning and design of the HSK Station was completed, which would be examined with support of independent consultants.</p>	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
021506 – 021809	Chairman Mr Holden CHOW Administration	<p>Mr CHOW opined that the transport need of the first population intake of around 4 000 at 2024 should not be overlooked, and asked if the Administration had considered any extra transportation means for these residents. He was also worried about possible delay in station construction.</p> <p>The Administration advised that the first batch population intake of HSK/HT NDA would live outside the 500m catchment area of HSK Station. In view of their transport need, the services of bus, Light Rail and minibus would be reviewed. In anticipation of the proposed establishment of the Railways Department with a view to enhancing monitoring and control regime for new railway projects, the Administration was confident that the HSK Station would be completed on time.</p>	
021810 – 022020	Chairman Administration	<p>The Chairman asked whether train frequency would be enhanced for the WRL after the completion of the HSK Station. Noticing that there would be two public transport interchanges near the HSK Station, he requested the Administration to consider providing parking facilities and concession under the Park & Ride Scheme. He also suggested the Administration to consider alternative construction methods to reduce construction time.</p> <p>The Administration advised that the train services for the WRL would be reviewed upon completion of the HSK Station. To encourage the general public to use public transportation, the Administration would proactively consider providing concessions under the Park & Ride Scheme for the HSK Station. The Administration welcomed members' suggestions on possible means to shorten the construction time. The Administration assured that members' views were duly noted and would work closely with MTRCL on the detailed planning and design of the HSK Station.</p>	
<i>Agenda Item V – Any other business</i>			
022021 – 022034	Chairman	Closing remarks	

4 November 2021