

**THE STANDING COMMITTEE ON  
LEGAL EDUCATION AND TRAINING**

**ANNUAL REPORT  
2022**

**1 January 2022 to 31 December 2022**

## CONTENTS

<b>ANNUAL REPORT</b>		<b>1</b>
<b>ANNEXURE 1:</b>	<b>Section 74A of the Legal Practitioners Ordinance</b>	<b>6</b>
<b>ANNEXURE 2:</b>	<b>Composition of the Standing Committee on Legal Education and Training</b>	<b>8</b>
<b>ANNEXURE 3:</b>	<b>City University of Hong Kong – Report on the LLB Programme</b>	<b>10</b>
	<b>City University of Hong Kong – Report on the PCLL Programme</b>	<b>14</b>
	<b>City University of Hong Kong – Report on the JD Programme</b>	<b>19</b>
<b>ANNEXURE 4:</b>	<b>The Chinese University of Hong Kong – Report on the LLB Programme</b>	<b>25</b>
	<b>The Chinese University of Hong Kong – Report on the PCLL Programme</b>	<b>30</b>
	<b>The Chinese University of Hong Kong – Report on the JD Programme</b>	<b>33</b>
<b>ANNEXURE 5:</b>	<b>The University of Hong Kong – Report on the LLB and JD Programmes</b>	<b>40</b>
	<b>The University of Hong Kong – Report on the PCLL Programme</b>	<b>43</b>
<b>ANNEXURE 6:</b>	<b>Key Statistics of the 2022/23 LLB, JD and PCLL Programmes</b>	<b>46</b>
<b>ANNEXURE 7:</b>	<b>Composition of the Hong Kong Conversion Examination Board</b>	<b>47</b>

# ANNUAL REPORT OF THE STANDING COMMITTEE ON LEGAL EDUCATION AND TRAINING

(1 January 2022 to 31 December 2022)

This is the seventeenth annual report of the Standing Committee on Legal Education and Training (“SCLET”). Section 74A of the Legal Practitioners Ordinance Cap. 159 (“Ordinance”) providing for the establishment of SCLET and its functions is at Annexure 1.

## Meetings

1. SCLET met on two occasions during the reporting period from 1 January 2022 to 31 December 2022 (“Reporting Period”). Its composition is at Annexure 2.

## Major Matters Dealt with by SCLET

### Comprehensive Study on Legal Education and Training

2. SCLET continued to consider the Final Report of the Consultants on the Comprehensive Review of Legal Education and Training in Hong Kong. Two major outstanding issues remain, namely, the proposals of the Law Society of Hong Kong (“Law Society”) for (i) the Law Society Examination (“LSE”) and (ii) the Common Entrance Examination (“CEE”).
3. As we have explained in last year’s Annual Report, these proposals are designed to serve different purposes. The Postgraduate Certificate in Laws (“PCLL”) is currently provided by The University of Hong Kong (“HKU”), the City University of Hong Kong (“CityU”) and The Chinese University of Hong Kong (“CUHK”). PCLL students do not sit a common examination. The Law Society wishes to ensure uniformity of standards by requiring all PCLL graduates to undertake the CEE before entering into a training contract.
4. The other proposal, the LSE, may have a more substantial impact on entrants to the solicitors’ branch of the legal profession and legal education in general. Currently, the aggregate maximum number of targeted new PCLL students each year is 776. These places are available to law graduates, local or overseas, who wish to enter into the legal profession in Hong Kong. SCLET was informed by the Law Society that the Law Society is of the view that because the places are limited, some suitably qualified law graduates have been unable to enter the solicitors’ branch of the legal profession.
5. The Law Society has started engaging the major stakeholders in a dialogue to explore the way forward.

6. By letter dated 11 February 2022 addressed to the Chairman of SCLET (“Chairman”), Mr. Stephen W.S. Hung, Chairman of the Working Party on the LSE and Related Topics of the Law Society (“Working Party”), supplied “*a preliminary draft*” of a Report “*which sets out, inter alia, the rationales, the scope and the logistics of the LSE*” (“draft Report”). This letter was sent in conjunction with a press release dated 9 February 2022, by the Law Society stating that “*the target implementation date of the proposals will not be earlier than the academic year 2024/25.*” The letter also stated that the purpose of the draft Report “*is to engage the major stakeholders to explore the way forward. Amendments may be made to the draft after discussions with the major stakeholders and as such the draft is not intended to be a public document.*”
7. The draft Report supplied is 49 pages long and bore the title “*Report. The Law Society Examination. Syllabus and Outcomes*” and stamped “*DRAFT, Private and Confidential*”.
8. The letter also asked for a meeting “*to explain the draft in detail and to answer any questions*”. Thinking that the Working Party wanted a meeting with SCLET, the Chairman suggested calling a special meeting of SCLET with the Working Party but was told that the Working Party wanted a meeting with the Chairman only. Furthermore, Mr. Hung also informed the Chairman that the Working Party had written similar letters to the individual stakeholders within SCLET, with the exception of its two lay members.
9. A remote meeting was held between the Chairman, Mr. Hung, and other members of the Working Party on 3 March 2022. The Chairman raised certain queries but did not express any personal view during this meeting.
10. By letter of 15 December 2022, Mr. Hung wrote to inform SCLET that the draft Report had been sent “*under cover of the Law Society’s letter of 11 February 2022, to [the Chairman], the Chief Justice, the then Secretary for Justice (“SJ”) and the 3 Law Schools for the purpose of engaging the major stakeholders in a dialogue to explore the feasibility of its implementation.*” The letter went on to say that the Law Society has conducted meetings with various stakeholders, and concluded by saying that “*The Law Society has sought a meeting with the Chief Justice, but the Chief Justice is of the view that the proposal should continue to be deliberated and considered by SCLET. A meeting with the Chief Justice, if any, will therefore be arranged after SCLET has indicated its stance.*” Earlier on 11 February 2022, the Law Society supplied to SCLET the draft Report.
11. SCLET took this letter as a request to state its stance on the establishment of the LSE as explained in the draft Report. On 20 December 2022, the Working Party was informed that the matter would be discussed at the next meeting of SCLET.
12. Accordingly the draft Report was discussed at the SCLET meeting on 12 January 2023.
13. At the meeting, Members repeated concerns which had been raised in the past. These concerns include: queries over the benefit or rationale of the LSE as an alternative to PCLL especially since the law schools are prepared to increase the

available PCLL places to accept suitably qualified law graduates;<sup>1</sup> the LSE syllabi and the accreditation process and mechanism for LSE courses and providers; whether the LSE could be established without any amendment to the Ordinance or its Rules. It was pointed out by the solicitor member present at the meeting that from the public interest perspective, given the diverse and evolving legal environment and the changing demand of the global legal service market, the introduction of the LSE ensures appropriate access to the solicitors' profession through expansion of the pathways and opportunities for admission, thus attracting suitably qualified candidates to enrich the profession.

14. SCLET shall continue to discuss the draft Report and looks forward to further information from the Law Society.<sup>2</sup> We shall endeavour to bring our deliberation to a conclusion and make known our stance on the Law Society's proposal as soon as possible.

#### Bachelor of Laws ("LLB"), Juris Doctor ("JD") and PCLL Programmes

15. SCLET continued to monitor the following legal education programmes:
  - (a) The LLB, JD and PCLL programmes of CityU. The reports are at Annexure 3;
  - (b) The LLB, JD and PCLL programmes of CUHK. The reports are at Annexure 4; and
  - (c) The LLB, JD and PCLL programmes of HKU. The reports are at Annexure 5.
16. A table consolidating the key statistics of the LLB, JD and PCLL programmes of the three Law Schools is at Annexure 6.

#### PCLL Conversion Examination

17. The Conversion Examination Board met on two occasions during the Reporting Period to oversee the administration of the PCLL Conversion Examination ("Conversion Examination"). Matters considered by the Conversion Examination Board in the meetings and by paper circulation included the following:

---

<sup>1</sup> The three Law Schools which are PCLL providers are prepared, if necessary, to increase the number of PCLL places. Prior to 27 April 2023, the Law Society prescribed PCLL Benchmarks required, *inter alia*, a "not lower than a high 2:2" qualifying law degree. This might have resulted in lower admissions in the past. On 27 April 2023, the Law Society informed the PCLL providers that the PCLL Benchmarks have been revised such that the requirement of a qualifying degree of not lower to a high 2:2 has been replaced by the requirement of a qualifying law degree not lower than 2:2. It is probable that this lowering of requirement would enable the PCLL providers to increase PCLL admissions.

<sup>2</sup> On 24 April 2023, SCLET was informed that the Law Society has no update on the LSE for the time being and asked SCLET to exclude the item on the LSE from the agenda of the SCLET meeting scheduled on 27 April 2023. The meeting went ahead on 27 April 2023.

- (a) Vetting of applications for exemption from sitting the Conversion Examination;
  - (b) Review of examination results, reports of the Examiners, irregularities in the examinations;
  - (c) Review of exemptions granted to the examination subjects of Criminal Procedure and Civil Procedure;
  - (d) Appointment of examiners and reviewers;
  - (e) Fees of the Examiners;
  - (f) Scholarships granted to candidates and their eligibility;
  - (g) Review of examination schedule;
  - (h) Decisions of the Chief Examiner on the appeals against examination results;
  - (i) Review of syllabi and book lists; and
  - (j) Applications for special arrangements to sit the Conversion Examination.
18. In order to facilitate overseas students who, due to various reasons, could not return to Hong Kong to attend the June 2022 Conversion Examination, special arrangements were made by the Conversion Examination Board to hold an additional Conversion Examination in August 2022. However, results of the August Examination would not be available in time to meet the requirements for admission to the PCLL in September 2022. Students were only allowed to register for either the June 2022 Conversion Examination or the August Examination. This special arrangement only applied to 2022 and would not form any precedent in the future.
19. 410 and 286 candidates took part in the Conversion Examination in eight different prerequisite subjects in January and June 2022 as compared to 536 and 523<sup>3</sup> candidates respectively in the January and June 2021 Conversion Examination. 151 candidates took part in the August Examination.
20. The average pass rate of the subjects examined in January 2022 was 62.63% (as compared to 64.75% in the January 2021 results) and that in June 2022 was 60.88% (as compared to 65.24% in the June 2021 results). The average pass rate of the subjects examined in August 2022 was 65%.
21. The composition of the Conversion Examination Board is at **Annexure 7**.

### **Chairmanship**

22. SCLET is chaired by Mr. Justice Robert Tang.

---

<sup>3</sup> Including one candidate who sat the August 2021 Conversion Examination.

## **Overall position**

23. Various stakeholders in the field of legal education and training contributed their views from different perspectives and the meetings of SCLET have provided a useful forum for the exchange of views on different issues.

# Annexure 1

## SECTION 74A OF THE LEGAL PRACTITIONERS ORDINANCE

### 74A. Standing Committee on Legal Education and Training

- (1) There is established by this section a Standing Committee on Legal Education and Training.
- (2) The functions of the committee are-
  - (a) to keep under review, evaluate and assess-
    - (i) the system and provision of legal education and training in Hong Kong;
    - (ii) without prejudice to the generality of subparagraph (i), the academic requirements and standards for admission to the Postgraduate Certificate in Laws programme;
  - (b) to monitor the provision of vocational training of prospective legal practitioners in Hong Kong by organizations other than the Society or the Hong Kong Bar Association;
  - (c) to make recommendations on matters referred to in paragraphs (a) and (b); and
  - (d) to collect and disseminate information concerning the system of legal education and training in Hong Kong.
- (3) The committee shall consist of-
  - (a) 17 members appointed by the Chief Executive of whom- (Amended 10 of 2005, s.184)
    - (i) 2 shall be persons nominated by the Chief Justice;
    - (ii) 1 shall be a person nominated by the Secretary for Justice;
    - (iii) 1 shall be a person nominated by the Secretary for Education (Amended L.N. 130 of 2007);
    - (iv) 2 shall be persons nominated by the Society;
    - (v) 2 shall be persons nominated by the Hong Kong Bar Association;



## Section 74A of the Legal Practitioners Ordinance

- (vi) 2 shall be persons nominated by the Vice-Chancellor of the University of Hong Kong;
  - (vii) 2 shall be persons nominated by the President of the City University of Hong Kong;
  - (viii) 2 shall be persons nominated by the Vice-Chancellor of The Chinese University of Hong Kong; (Added 10 of 2005 s.184)
  - (ix) 2 shall be members of the public; and
  - (x) 1 shall be a person nominated by the Federation for Self-financing Tertiary Education, a non-profit-making educational organization, from among its members which provide continuing legal education courses in Hong Kong; and (Amended 18 of 2014 s. 159)
- (b) a chairman appointed by the Chief Executive after consultation with the persons and organizations making nominations pursuant to paragraph (a)(i) to (viii) and (ix). (Amended 10 of 2005 s.184)
- (4) A member of the committee who is unable to attend a meeting of the committee, except for a member appointed pursuant to subsection (3)(a)(viii), may, subject to the consent of the chairman, send a substitute to attend the meeting in his place and the substitute shall be deemed to be a member of the committee for the purpose of that meeting.
  - (5) A member of the committee including the chairman shall hold office for a term not exceeding 2 years.
  - (6) A member of the committee including the chairman may at any time resign from the committee by giving notice in writing of his resignation to the Chief Executive.
  - (7) The Secretary for Justice may publish notice of the appointment or termination of membership of a member (including the chairman) appointed pursuant to this section in the Gazette.
  - (8) The committee shall report annually to the Chief Executive and its annual report shall be tabled in the Legislative Council.
  - (9) The committee may determine its own procedure.

## Annexure 2

### THE STANDING COMMITTEE ON LEGAL EDUCATION AND TRAINING

**Chairman:** The Honourable Mr. Justice Robert TANG Ching, G.B.M., S.B.S., J.P.

**Members:** The Honourable Madam Justice Susan KWAN  
(on the nomination of the Chief Justice)

The Honourable Mr. Justice Anderson CHOW Ka-ming  
(on the nomination of the Chief Justice)

Ms. Jenny FUNG  
Deputy Solicitor General (Policy Affairs), Department of Justice  
(on the nomination of the Secretary for Justice)

Mr. Derek LAI  
Principal Assistant Secretary (Higher Education), Education Bureau  
(on the nomination of the Secretary for Education)

Mr. Brian GILCHRIST  
(on the nomination of The Law Society of Hong Kong)

Mr. Dieter YIH, J.P.  
(on the nomination of The Law Society of Hong Kong)

Mr. Selwyn YU Sing-cheung, S.C.  
(on the nomination of Hong Kong Bar Association)

Mr. Michael YIN Chi-ming  
(on the nomination of Hong Kong Bar Association)

Professor FU Hualing  
Dean of Law, The University of Hong Kong  
(on the nomination of the Vice-Chancellor of The University of Hong Kong)

Mr. Wilson CHOW Wai-shun  
Head of the Department of Professional Legal Education,  
Faculty of Law, The University of Hong Kong  
(on the nomination of the Vice-Chancellor of The University of Hong Kong)

Professor TAN Cheng-han  
Dean & Chair Professor of Commercial Law, School of Law  
(from September 2019 to August 2022)  
Professor LIN Feng  
Acting Dean of School of Law,  
City University of Hong Kong  
(from August 2022)  
(on the nomination of the President of City University of Hong Kong)

Mr. Ubaid REHMAN  
Programme Director of the Postgraduate Certificate in Laws,  
School of Law, City University of Hong Kong  
(on the nomination of the President of City University of Hong Kong)

Professor Lutz-Christian WOLFF  
Dean, Faculty of Law, The Chinese University of Hong Kong  
(on the nomination of the Vice-Chancellor of The Chinese University of Hong Kong)

Mr. Dennis HIE Hok-fung  
Programme Director of Postgraduate Certificate in Laws Programme, The Chinese University of Hong Kong  
(on the nomination of the Vice-Chancellor of The Chinese University of Hong Kong)

Ms. CHAN Ching-chu, Rebecca  
(Member appointed under s74A(3)(a)(viii) of the Legal Practitioners Ordinance Cap.159 (“Ordinance”))

Mr. Rex LAI Tat-shing  
(Member appointed under s74A(3)(a)(viii) of the Ordinance)

Mr. LEE Chong-ting  
(on the nomination of The Federation for Self-financing Tertiary Education)

**Secretary:**

Ms. Kitty FUNG  
Deputy Principal Government Counsel  
Department of Justice

# Annexure 3



## **City University of Hong Kong Bachelor of Laws (LLB) 2022 Annual Report for Standing Committee on Legal Education and Training**

---

This is a status report on the Bachelor of Laws (LLB) programme offered by the School of Law (“the School”), City University of Hong Kong (CityU). The report covers the period from 1 January 2022 to 31 December 2022.

### **1. 2022/23 Admissions**

In the 2022/23 academic year, the School admitted 49 full-time LLB students in total, including, 25 JUPAS applicants (from HKDSE), 15 non-JUPAS local applicants and 9 non-local applicants (including 6 Mainland NUEE students).

The intake quota was met. The average score in English Language (HKDSE) for students admitted through JUPAS was 5.26. Minimum entry requirements were met and, for borderline applicants, admission interviews were also conducted.

Students were admitted to two double degree programmes via JUPAS route: 4 to the LLB&BBA(Accountancy) and 2 to the BSocSc(Criminology)&LLB.

### **2. Programme Structure**

The LLB programme is designed on the basis of adopted Major Intended Learning Outcomes (MILOs) which guide the Outcome Based Teaching and Learning (OBTL) of the various courses offered. These operate within the framework of a Discovery Enriched Curriculum which ensures that students develop skills and acquire experiences of independent learning.

The MILOs are met by a combination of core courses, Gateway Education courses and free electives. The core courses include the essential legal courses which underpin legal practice. Elective courses can be specialized or in-depth legal courses or can be courses from other disciplines which develop interdisciplinary knowledge and skills. Students can also earn credits by taking courses abroad, through internships, research work and participation in moot competitions. The LLB programme requires the study of 120-144 credits.

Students applying for the Postgraduate Certificate in Laws (PCLL) programme must complete the core courses and a set of electives which are prerequisites for professional studies.

LLB students who do not wish to enter the legal profession have the option of taking the LLB with Minors in any other discipline the university offers.

### 3. Learning and Developmental Opportunities for LLB Students

The LLB programme provides for the development of general and professional skills and the enhancement of learning experiences. Each student has the choice to study different areas and systems of law, explore other disciplines and develop a unique educational profile. In particular:

- (i) For the period of report 23 electives were offered to LLB students enabling them to study areas of law of interest to them. Some of the electives were offered by renowned visiting scholars.
- (ii) The Discovery-enriched Curriculum (DEC) gives students the opportunity to make an original discovery and/or innovation concerning the operation of the law and procedure in Hong Kong. This is implemented through several courses and, in addition, by the option of undertaking a research project.
- (iii) Legal placements have been incorporated as a credit-bearing course providing students with a structured opportunity to acquire practical experience through working in a legal working environment. In 2022, 45 students completed either a part-time or full-time legal placement across a range of diverse places, including barristers' chambers, local/international law firms, legal departments of international companies and financial institutions in Hong Kong.
- (iv) Students can engage with the edition of the *City University of Hong Kong Law Review (CityU LR)*. First launched in October 2009, the *CityU LR* publishes two issues annually. Student editors work under the mentorship of faculty members. This work is also credit-bearing.
- (v) Students have the option to participate in one of the several exchange programmes with foreign universities acquiring general transferable skills and legal knowledge. School-level exchange agreements with more than 40 universities are in place and in addition the universities which participate in the Themis network of law schools. Further opportunities are provided to LLB students to go on institutional exchange at the universities with law school among the 160 partner universities of CityU. An additional possibility of exchange is offered through G-LEAP, a one-month intensive mode programme at the University College Oxford. Incoming exchange students enrich the educational experience of our students.

In 2022, the School received 27 exchange students from overseas jurisdictions, including Australia, Canada, China, Denmark, Hungary, Luxembourg, Malaysia, Netherlands, Poland and the UK. The School sent out 12 LLB students to universities in France, Germany, Italy, Norway, Spain, Sweden, the UK and the US while 16 LLB students took part in G-LEAP.

- (vi) Mooting is also available to our students and is strongly supported by the School. Our students received training and support from our academic during their preparation for specific mooting competitions. In the academic year 2021-2022, 12 LLB students participated in the following international mooting competitions achieving significant success:

<b>Name of Competition</b>	<b>Award</b>
The 17th International Chamber of Commerce (ICC) International Commercial Mediation Competition - Paris, 7-15 February 2022 (held virtually)	Ranked at 18th out of 48 teams
The 2022 Philip C. Jessup International Law Moot Court Competition (Hong Kong Regional Rounds), 19-20 February 2022	Third Best Oralist – YUEN Justin Wilson
The International Investor-State Mediation Competition (IIMC) Colombo, 12-16 January 2022 (held virtually)	Best Counsel Award Semi-finalist/ Ranked fourth out of 16 teams
The 29th Annual Willem C. Vis International Commercial Arbitration Moot, 8 March - 14 April 2022 (held virtually)	Eric E. Bergsten Award for Best Team Orals (Honourable Mention)  Advanced to the top 16 out of 364 teams

#### **4. Quality Assurance**

The University operates a Departmental Academic Advisor Scheme as part of the University's quality enhancement and international benchmarking process. The School of Law including the LLB programme was reviewed in 2022. Quality assurance mechanisms are implemented for the development, teaching and examination of courses and the overall design of the LLB studies. The design and development of courses is considered by examining the suitability of the Course Intended Learning Outcomes (CILOs) against the substance of the course and their contributions to the MILOs of the LLB programme. This is undertaken by the LLB programme team. The quality of teaching is monitored through formal and informal feedback from the students as well as teaching observation. Moderation of examination papers and scrutiny of marks by the examiners board is the basis for ensuring quality in the assessment methods.

#### **5. Supporting our Students**

The School supports students through personal and year tutors as well as by providing career advice and opportunities to meet with potential employers.

The Student's Professional Development and Public Service Programme was set up to provide various workshops and Webinars including:

- The New Mainland Data Security and Personal Information Protection Laws - What Legal Practitioners and Law Students Need to Know by Mr. Wong Yu Yuen, Principal Legal Advisor - Mainland China and International Businesses of the MTR Corporation Limited;
- A Closer Look at the Work of Legal Counsels at the Securities and Futures Commission by the Deputy Chief Counsel and Senior Counsel;
- The Laws That You Can Bank on and the Opportunity to Meet with the Partners and Associates of Gallant by Mr Philip Wong, Managing Partner and Head of Commercial

Department of Gallant; Mr Wong, the Chairman of the Practice Management Committee of the Law Society of Hong Kong and the Honorary Legal Adviser of Po Leung Kuk;

- The Director's Hour - Advice to All Years on Summer and Career Planning;
- Career Talk on Legal Trainee Scheme by Department of Justice;
- Clifford Chance Information Session 2022: An Overview of Corporate, Global Financial Markets, Litigation & Dispute Resolution Practices
- What You Can Gain from Being a Student Member of the Law Society of Hong Kong? – Career Path and Choices for Law Graduates by the Hong Kong Law Society
- I am Now a Vacation Clerk - What Should I do to Secure my Training Contract by Minter Ellison

## **6. Graduation and Further Studies**

In 2022, 62 LLB students graduated. Most of them (88.7%) were awarded upper second class honours or above. Most of our students were admitted to the PCLL programme at CityU thus continuing their legal professional development.

Professor Michael Tsimplis  
LLB Programme Director  
School of Law  
City University of Hong Kong  
February 2023

## City University of Hong Kong Postgraduate Certificate in Laws (PCLL) 2022 Annual Report for Standing Committee on Legal Education and Training

---

### 1. 2022/23 Admissions

The School of Law (“the School”) received **430** applications for its PCLL programme for the academic year 2022/23. About **73.5%** of the applicants selected CityU as their first choice. **231** offers were made by the SLW, and eventually, **196** students were admitted to the PCLL programme.

Among the successful applicants, **53** received UGC-funded places, and **143** received non-UGC funded places. About **52.8%** of those UGC-funded places were given to graduates from universities in Hong Kong.

As of 31 October 2022, 194 students were studying in the CityU PCLL programme.

The 2022/23 PCLL programme is comprised of **49.5%** local graduates and **50.5%** graduates from overseas institutions. Appendix 1 contains a list of the universities from which these PCLL students graduated.

The following matters are noted in relation to the admissions process:

1. The Admissions Committee began reviewing applications in March 2022 and regularly thereafter. This enabled several early conditional and unconditional offers to be made to academically strong applicants.
2. **19** applicants to whom conditional offers were made were unable to take up their place (most of them being unsuccessful in one or more of the Conversion Exam Board examinations). **16** applicants declined our offers due to personal reasons.
3. No student was enrolled with a Third Class Law Degree [or equivalent]. All students enrolled attained the minimum IELTS standard.

### 2. Class Size

Our small group size is around 11 to 12 students for core and elective courses.



### 3. Assessment Regime and Outcomes

#### 3.1 Assessment Regime

The majority of assessments are taken under controlled conditions through online written examinations and performance-based assessments. In Semester B of 2021/22, the performance-based assessments were conducted and recorded via zoom whereas in Semester A 2022/23, the same assessments were conducted face-to-face on campus. Certain courses continue to be assessed by mid-term and end-of-term examinations.

We have been working with our technical staff and the CityU e-learning team to implement online examinations for all courses. The practice has been well received by course examiners and students alike.

#### 3.2 Assessment Outcomes

2020/21:

No. of students who failed to graduate from the PCLL programme:	11
---	----

No. of students who failed one or more subjects at first attempt and were required to take supplementary examinations:	70 (including the 11 who failed to graduate from the PCLL, 1 who graduated in 2021 after passing supplementary examination in December 2021)
--	--

2021/22:

No. of students who failed to graduate from the PCLL programme:	9
---	---

No. of students who failed one or more subjects at first attempt and were required to take supplementary examinations:	94 (including the 9 who failed to graduate from the PCLL, 1 who graduated in 2022 after passing supplementary examination in December 2022)
--	---

#### **4. Staffing**

In 2021/22, 12 full-time staff and 36 part-time staff (practitioners) taught in the PCLL programme.

In 2022/23, 12 full-time staff and 37 part-time staff (practitioners) taught in the PCLL programme.

Many teaching staff members have taught PCLL for some time while continuing their legal practice. We are continuing our efforts to bring into our teaching team experienced practitioners in different areas of practice with a view to further strengthening the PCLL programme.

#### **5. Curriculum**

There are eleven core courses: Interlocutory Advocacy and Interviewing; Trial Advocacy; Mediation and Negotiation; Litigation Writing and Drafting; Commercial Writing and Drafting; Conveyancing Practice; Wills and Probate Practice; Corporate and Commercial Practice; Civil Litigation Practice; Criminal Litigation Practice; and Professional Conduct and Practice.

Students must also take three courses from the following eight electives: Bar Course; Foundations in Mainland Related Legal Transactions; International Arbitration Practice; Family Law Practice; Financial Regulatory Practice; Personal Injuries Practice; Chinese for Legal Practice; and International Mooting and Advocacy.

##### Changes in 2021/22 and 2022/23 academic years

There are no major curriculum changes to be carried out in 2022/23. The course of International Mooting and Advocacy introduced since 2019/20 continues to be offered to enhance the choice of elective courses and to provide an opportunity for students to take part in mooting competitions.

#### **6. The Future**

Although the new office premises have fewer small group rooms, we can still offer small group teaching. However, there will no longer be a dedicated small group room for each group of students. We also plan to recruit additional qualified practitioners to teach on the programme.

In the future, we will collaborate closely with our technical personnel and the CityU e-learning team to ensure the availability of online exams for all PCLL courses.

#### **7. Involvement of the Profession**

We are happy to report that the profession has been very involved with training the CityU PCLL students. Involvement has been in the form of guest lectures, presentations on different topics, assistance in assessments and demonstrations in various advocacy

courses. The School of Law's Students' Professional Development and Public Service Program, in partnership with the legal profession, including law firms, companies, and NGOs, arranged a series of presentations on soft skills and engaging topics for law students, including PCLL students. Opportunities for jobs and internships were also sought for students during the year 2022.

## **8. Conclusion**

Our commitment lies in nurturing competent lawyers for the Hong Kong legal market through a holistic education approach. In addition to practical skills training, we emphasize instilling values such as collaboration, ethics, and community service in our students. We take pride in our graduates and aim to contribute assets to the legal community of Hong Kong with each graduating student.

Given Hong Kong's significance as a financial and multicultural hub, we aim to cultivate lawyers with a global mindset. Our curricula aim to achieve this objective by equipping students with the ability to analyze issues from various angles and effectively collaborate with lawyers from different regions.

We value input from the profession and are eager to collaborate with all stakeholders to elevate our programme to new heights of excellence.

Mr Ubaid Rehman  
PCLL Programme Director  
School of Law  
City University of Hong Kong  
February 2023

## Appendix 1

Students admitted to the 2022/23 PCLL programme graduated from the following universities:

BPP University, UK  
Cardiff University, UK  
Chinese University of Hong Kong  
City University of Hong Kong  
Coventry University, UK  
King's College London, UK  
London School of Economics and Political Science, UK  
Manchester Metropolitan University, UK  
Monash University, Australia  
Oxford Brookes University, UK  
Queen's University Belfast, UK  
University College London, UK  
University of Birmingham, UK  
University of Bristol, UK  
University of Canberra, Australia  
University of Durham, UK  
University of East Anglia, UK  
University of Edinburgh, UK  
University of Exeter, UK  
University of Hertfordshire, UK  
University of Hong Kong  
University of Kent, UK  
University of Law, UK  
University of Leeds, UK  
University of Leicester, UK  
University of Liverpool, UK  
University of London, UK (Birkbeck)  
University of London, UK (Royal Holloway)  
University of Manchester, UK  
University of Melbourne, Australia  
University of New South Wales, Australia  
University of Nottingham, UK  
University of Reading, UK  
University of Sheffield, UK  
University of Surrey, UK  
University of Sydney, Australia  
University of Warwick, UK  
University of York, UK

## **City University of Hong Kong Juris Doctor (JD) 2022 Annual Report for Standing Committee on Legal Education and Training**

---

### **1. Background**

The JD (Juris Doctor) programme is a graduate entry law programme for applicants who have a non-law bachelor degree or an undergraduate law degree from a non-common law jurisdiction. JD graduates may enter the legal profession in Hong Kong after completing the Postgraduate Certificate in Laws (PCLL) or use the gained legal knowledge and skills in other professions.

This status report on the JD Programme at the School of Law (“the School”) of City University of Hong Kong (CityU) covers the period from 1 January to 31 December 2022.

### **2. 2022/23 Admissions**

The minimum entry requirements for admission to JD is (i) a bachelor’s degree in a non-law discipline, or (ii) a bachelor’s degree in law from a non-common law jurisdiction obtained after at least eight semesters of full-time study. Moreover, applicants must also be proficient in English. For an applicant whose entrance qualification is obtained from an institution where the medium of instruction is not English, the minimum English language proficiency requirement is:

- a TOEFL score of 100 (internet-based); 71 (revised paper-delivered test; sum of reading, Listening and Writing section scores); or
- a band score of 7.5 or above in IELTS, with no individual score below 6.5, and a minimum score of 7.0 in the Academic Writing; or
- a total score of 520 in the Chinese Mainland's College English Test (Band 6).

JD programme has been quite competitive. The number and quality of applications has remained strong. The School received 379 applications for admission to JD in 2022/23. The School admitted 102 students in the JD programme in 2022/23. The intake quality of students admitted to the JD programme in 2022/23 maintained a high standard. Around 60% of admitted students received their postgraduate or bachelor’s degree from reputable universities, where their universities ranked top 200 in QS/ THE/ ARWU or top law schools from Mainland China. For students who were admitted to the programme with bachelor’s degree as main qualification, they achieved an average GPA 3.56 (base value as 4) or average mark of 85. For students who were admitted to the programme with postgraduate’s degree as main qualification, they achieved an average GPA 3.32 (base value as 4) or average mark of 88. This high GPA average is competitive with any law school in the world.

Several outreach initiatives (e.g., placing advertisements and advertorials in local newspapers and education supplements, holding online information talk and participating in online law fair) were taken to attract applicants from all over the world. Our applicants come from a diverse range of academic backgrounds such as accounting and finance, economics, business administration, property management, physics, chemical and biological engineering, molecular biomedical science, materials engineering, civil engineering, biotechnology, nutrition, food science, civil law, language, translation, European studies, architectural studies, psychology, sociology, criminology, social policy and administration, political science and journalism. This diversity of the JD student body enhances greatly the quality of class interactions and discussions.

Subsequent to students' admission to the programme, events and orientations for newly admitted students were organized. The events provided students an opportunity to know each other better and learn about various academic opportunities offered by the School.

### 3. Programme Structure

The JD programme comprises a total of 72 credit units. Students have to complete the following required courses (each worth 3 credits): Hong Kong Legal System; Legal Methods, Research and Writing. The remaining credits can be made up by enrolling in elective courses. The JD programme structure allows students to take 6 non-PCLL required electives (worth 18 credits) assuming that they are also going to take 48 credits worth of PCLL-required courses (16 courses) as far as PCLL entry is concerned.

The JD programme provides the necessary course requirements for admission to the PCLL programme. Apart from the requirement concerning the required courses, students are required to complete the following courses if they wish to pursue the PCLL programme: Law of Contract I & II, Law of Tort I & II, Constitutional Law, Administrative Law, Criminal Law I & II, Land Law I & II, Law of Evidence, Equity and Trusts I and II, Company Law I & II and Commercial Law.

Students who do not wish to join the legal profession can still benefit from the JD programme by choosing a range of elective courses offered by the JD, LLM and LLMArbDR programmes. The School offers a wide variety of elective courses such as Contemporary Issues of Human Rights Law, Introduction to Law and Economics, Introduction to Information Law, Legal and Operational Aspects of Corporate Governance, International Investment Law, Chinese Maritime Law, Banking Law, Cyber Law, Current Issues in WTO Law, Maritime Insurance Law and Charterparties Law. In 2022-23, the School also offered 1.5-credit intensive elective courses like Finance Basics for Lawyers, Cross-border Insolvency, Business Valuation in Practice, International Aviation Law and LawTech, Innovation, Entrepreneurship, SmartCity, Metaverse and Openverse taught by legal practitioner or faculties from other universities.

JD students have an option to specialise in any one of the following areas by taking any four elective courses (12 credits) from the respective specialisation list below:

- 1) **International Commercial Law:** LW6161E Competition Law; LW5631 Banking Law; LW5664 European Competition Law of Policy; LW5641 Intellectual Property: Theory, Copyright and Design; LW5643 Cyber Law, LW6144E International Trade Law: LW6140E Chinese and Comparative Commercial Law; LW6180E International Commercial Contracts and Uniform Sales Law; LW6167E Current Issues in WTO Law

- 2) **Alternative Dispute Resolution:** LW6401 Dispute Resolution in Theory and Practice; LW6405 Arbitration Law; LW6406 Mediation Practice; LW6407 Arbitration Practice and Award Writing; LW6408 International Arbitration; LW6142E International Investment Law; and LW5649 International Mooting and Advocacy (3 credits) OR LW5649B International Mooting and Advocacy (6 credits).
- 3) **Chinese and Comparative Law:** LW5626 Comparative Law; LW6127E Chinese and Comparative Intellectual Property Law; LW6134E Chinese and Comparative Company Law; LW6140E Chinese and Comparative Commercial Law; LW6141E Chinese Foreign Trade and Investment Law

Depending upon the interest of students and the course offering in the future, these specialised streams may be modified. The offering of the above courses may be reviewed and amended from time to time subject to the availability of teaching staff. We shall keep students informed regarding the offering of elective courses.

Students who choose or do not choose to specialise in any of the above areas will receive the award title as Juris Doctor (法律博士). In pursuance of City University's policy on streamlining award titles, it has been decided that the award titles do not include areas of specialisation. The specialised area, if elected by a student, will appear on the transcript.

The master implementation plan for the co-teaching programme has been successfully implemented. The co-teaching of common courses is regarded by the School as a means of better securing economies of scale with limited teaching resources, particularly for some courses for which recruitment has been challenging across all common law schools. It would also allow the School to offer a greater selection of electives to both LLB and JD students than would be possible if all electives were separately taught. In 2022/23 (as at Semester B, 2021/22), 30 electives were offered to JD students.

#### **4. Teaching and Learning**

The School promotes active and interactive learning. The teaching/learning activities and the assessment tasks are aligned with the Course Intended Learning Outcomes (CILOs). CILOs are then aligned with the Programme Intended Learning Outcomes (PILOs). The PILOs of the JD programme stipulate that after completing the programme, students should be able to:

- 1) explain and assess specified areas of the law and the legal system of Hong Kong, with particular emphasis on the law in action and the dynamic interplay between law and other social phenomena;
- 2) assess the common law system and its values, and its interaction with the law and the legal system of Mainland China, the East Asian region and the wider world;
- 3) explain, interpret and apply main principles of ethics, civil duty, and social and professional responsibility;
- 4) critically assess the strengths and weaknesses of law as a means of regulating society in the context of competing and conflicting interests; and

- 5) demonstrate and apply skills of legal analysis and reasoning, of legal research, problem solving, and of oral and written communication to a level appropriate to a graduate-entry degree in law.

To be in line with City University's initiative of Discovery-enriched Curriculum (DEC), various DEC elements have been incorporated into JD courses. Students are encouraged to think critically, explore new socio-legal issues and produce papers of high quality.

All course syllabuses were reformulated in a format called "SYL" with the incorporation of DEC elements.

Students get three direct contact hours for each course every week. Classes are generally conducted as a combination of lectures and small group tutorials, though certain courses are taught in a seminar style. JD students normally do not share tutorial classes with undergraduate LLB students for most courses.

In view of the pandemic, the campus-wide real-time e-learning platform has been implemented. The real-time online learning has enabled student learning throughout the year and have made it effective.

## **5. Assessment**

The assessment pattern for most courses is in the form of an assignment, in-class participation and final examination. Since all JD courses are offered at a postgraduate level and students are expected to achieve a suitable standard of competency, students are required to achieve a minimum of 40 per cent marks in each of the assessment components. For the 2022 cohort students, they are required to achieve a minimum of 50 per cent marks in each of the assessment components. Students are provided written feedback on their assignment before the final examination.

## **6. Academic Quality**

The EAA arrangements for JD programme has been discontinued. Thankfully, following the positive assessments and advice given by external advisors over the years, we feel sufficiently confident in the quality of our programmes. To maintain the academic quality of the JD programme, the examination papers are subjected to internal moderation.

## **7. Exchange Opportunities**

The School recognizes the importance of providing students with overseas exchange opportunities. Overseas exchanges provide a platform for students to exchange ideas and experiences about different legal issues and legal systems. The School has entered into collaborative agreements with several leading universities such as Amsterdam Law School, Bergen University, KU Leuven, Liège University, University of San Francisco, Case Western Reserve University, Montreal University, Mannheim University, Fribourg University, Victoria University of Wellington, National Chengchi University, National Taiwan University, Fudan University, China University of Political Science and Law, East China University of Political Science and Law, Jilin University, Shanghai Jiaotong University Koguan Law School, Shanghai University of Finance and Economics, Renmin University, Zhongnan University of Economics



& Law and Singapore Management University. We received one incoming postgraduate exchange students in Semester B 2020-21 from Shanghai Jiaotong U, China. The School sent out four JD students to the universities in Semester A and B 2022-23.

## **8. Co-curricular and/or Overseas Academic Activities**

The learning environment of JD students is immensely enriched by their participation in some of the following activities:

### ***International Mooting Competitions***

As participation in mooting competitions greatly enhances students' mooting and advocacy skills, the School continues to facilitate students' participation in various regional and international mooting competitions by providing extensive training and financial support for them.

### ***Legal Placement***

The credit-bearing Legal Placement course provides JD students with opportunities to do internships not only in Hong Kong but also in Mainland China and other parts of the world. The placement enhances students' hands-on experiences apart from theoretical learning. In Hong Kong, students were placed in various legal departments, financial institutions, chambers and law firms. In Summer 2022, 37 JD students participated in Legal Placement in Hong Kong. The placement programme in Mainland China was suspended due to the pandemic.

### ***Global Engagement***

To promote international collaboration and efficient student exchanges, the School of Law enters a collaborative agreement with Georgetown University (Georgetown). Our JD students will have the opportunity to study the LLM at Georgetown starting from 2022/23 academic year. The collaboration will provide our students with an opportunity to obtain a professional degree in the United States and Hong Kong. It will enhance students' employability in both jurisdictions with an overall reduction in study time.

We continue our effort to build up a formidable partnership with leading law schools around the world such as Association of Asian Law Schools, Center for Transnational Legal Studies of Georgetown University Law Center, Themis Network Agreement and The Private Law Consortium. We also have double degree agreement with the University Paris 1, Panthéon-Sorbonne. This arrangement enables participating students to obtain a master degree from Paris 1 University and also a JD from CityU. We have entered into an agreement with Fribourg University, Switzerland. Our JD students are provided with opportunity to study the LLM programme at Fribourg University.

Meanwhile, the School joins hands with College of Business to introduce an innovative professional degree collaboration across the law and business disciplines. This accelerated path to business and law courses will be offered by the JD and MBA programmes from the 2022/23 academic year onwards. Students may enroll in either the JD or MBA programme first, with opportunities to take courses from the partner programme. Credit units earned can then be used for credit transfer when the student subsequently enrolls in the other programme.

Global Legal Education Awareness Project (G-LEAP) aims to promote excellence in legal education with a view to providing opportunities for our law students to obtain a global perspective in the study of law. In the summer of 2022, 14 JD students spent a month at University College, Oxford (United Kingdom) to study a credit-bearing law course European Competition Law and Policy.

### ***City University of Hong Kong Law Review (CityU LR)***

CityU LR is the student-edited law journal. Every year, about twenty students are selected and trained by the Faculty Editor to edit the journal. This elective law course has been introduced to harness the writing and editing skills of the Board members. The *CityU LR* is available through HeinOnline and Westlaw. It ranks 17th of 49 among Asian Law Journals on the W & L law journal ranking scheme, which is highly competitive with other top rated faculty edited law journals and superior to many quality journals in the UK, China, Japan, Korea, Australia, US, the Netherlands and Singapore.

## **9. Library and Other Facilities**

The library provides an extensive selection of print and online legal materials, including legal treatises, law books, law reports, statute sets, law journals and databases, etc. Most of the electronic resources can be accessed both on campus and remotely. Legal reference services are also offered by the library. Law library workshops are held throughout the year to equip students with the core research skills: finding cases and legislation, locating ADR legal materials, effective use of secondary materials, searching databases, and citing legal information. Library staff also compile different kinds of research guides and online tutorial. This is to ensure that students can get assistance at the point of need. The library continues to provide customized library collections and services to JD students. The essential readings for their courses are acquired and put on course reserve.

## **10. Looking Ahead**

The JD programme at CityU, the first of its kind in Hong Kong, is doing well and our JD graduates are highly sought after by local as well as international law firms. We aim to continue to offer an excellent global learning environment to our students. In the coming years, the School of Law aims to offer more elective courses, explore more overseas learning opportunities and streamline the learning & teaching platform.

Dr Mark Kielsingard  
JD Programme Director  
School of Law  
City University of Hong Kong  
February 2023

# Annexure 4

## The Chinese University of Hong Kong Faculty of Law

### Report on the LLB Programme

(January to December 2022)

#### 1. Admissions

The LLB programme's annual admission quota is 73 in the current triennium (2022-25). 73 students (including 45 JUPAS students, 26 non-JUPAS students and 2 Mainland Gaokao students) were ultimately admitted in the 2022 intake. Among the 26 non-JUPAS students, 12 were non-local students, from Mainland China and Thailand.

In addition to the review of minimum entry requirements the Faculty conducts short interviews as part of the admissions process, to allow for individualized assessment of the students and to give the students the opportunity to discuss their goals and interest in studying at CUHK LAW with a member of our faculty.

#### 2. Course Offering

Supplementing the core courses, the LLB programme continues to offer a wide range of electives. New electives are added to the programme on a regular basis. In the period in question, new elective course approved included:

- (i) *Copyright and the Law;*
- (ii) *Intellectual Property Law of the PRC;*
- (iii) *Merger Control;*
- (iv) *The Law of the Digital Commerce.*

#### 3. Use of Chinese Language

The Chinese University of Hong Kong implements bilingual education, and Chinese language courses form a compulsory part of the curriculum for all students admitted under both the JUPAS and non-JUPAS schemes. The LLB programme places great emphasis on improving the bilingual skills of our students.

All LLB students are required to fulfill 5 units of Chinese language courses, selected from the below options:

- (i) *University Chinese I* and *University Chinese II*;
- (ii) *Chinese Law* (Summer Course at Tsinghua University) and either *Oral Communication Skills* or *Chinese Business Planning*.

These courses are designed to strengthen students' ability to use Chinese. Students admitted under the non-JUPAS scheme may be granted exemption on a case-by-case basis after assessment of their Chinese language ability. Where exemption is granted, it is compulsory for the relevant student to take other Chinese language courses suitable for their level of linguistic ability.

In addition, the LLB programme normally offers two electives (*Chinese Law (Summer Course)* and *Chinese Law Internship*) conducted in Putonghua and delivered on the Mainland, which allow students to acquire a deeper understanding of Chinese law and the Chinese legal system, and to sharpen their Chinese language skills. Students who have taken these courses report that they have substantially improved their Chinese language reading, writing and communication skills.

Due to the coronavirus outbreak, *Chinese Law (Summer Course)* and *Chinese Law Internship* were cancelled in 2022. Students have been advised to take *University Chinese I* and *University Chinese II* to fulfill the Chinese language requirement for graduation.

#### **4. Experiential Learning**

The LLB programme continues to emphasize experiential learning as part of law students' university experience, recognizing its ability to broaden their learning horizons. In addition to a wide range of activities organized at the University and College levels the Faculty offers exchange programmes, internships and credit-bearing Summer Study Abroad Programmes (SSAPs) in Beijing and Toronto. The Faculty has established two 4-year Dual LLB-JD Degree Programmes, with the University of Exeter Law School and The Dickson Poon School of Law of King's College London (KCL), as well as a 4-year Dual LLB-LLM Degree Programme with the The Dickson Poon School of Law of King's College London. For the first two programmes, students study in the LLB programme at the partner university for two years, followed by two year in CUHK's JD programme. For the second programme, students study at CUHK for three years, after which they spend a year to obtain an LLM at KCL in London. The Faculty continues to work to identify exchange partner institutions, while also encouraging students to participate in exchange schemes over the course of a semester or two. CUHK LAW also organizes lectures by distinguished guests and visits to legal institutions, as well as social activities conducted as part of our Distinguished Professional Mentorship Scheme. We are most grateful for the strong support from the legal profession that has made these out-of-class learning activities a great success.

#### **5. Mooting Participation**

LLB students continue to participate in international mooting competitions, an area in which CUHK LAW has had extensive success in previous years. In the 2021-22 academic year, CUHK sent teams to participate in the following moots:

- Vis International Commercial Arbitration Moot (Hong Kong) (Vienna)

- Philip C. Jessup International Law Moot Court Competition
- Red Cross International Humanitarian Law Moot
- International Air Law Moot Court Competition
- Mandela World Human Rights Moot Court Competition

CUHK LAW's moot teams continued to excel in 2022. Some highlights included:

*International Air Law Moot Court*

- CUHK LAW's Air Law Moot Team won the 2022 International Air Law Moot Court Competition.

*Philip C. Jessup International Law Moot Court Competition*

- CUHK LAW's team won the Hong Kong regional tournament
- The team also won:
  - the Alona E. Evans Award for Second Best Memorial of the International Rounds (out of approximately 200 teams);
  - the award for Second Best Applicant Memorial for the International Rounds;
  - the 4th Best Oralist for the Advanced International Rounds (over out of approximately 400 oralists);
  - the Dillard Award for Memorial Writing (3<sup>rd</sup> Position) (for excellence in Memorial writing by comparing top Memorials across participating jurisdictions).

*Vis (Vienna) International Commercial Arbitration Law Moot*

- CUHK LAW's team was awarded Honourable Mention (top 10%) for Best Memorandum on Behalf of Claimant

*Vis (East) International Commercial Arbitration Law Moot*

- CUHK LAW's team was awarded third prize for Best Memorandum on Behalf of Claimant
- Two team members were awarded Honorable Mention (top 10%) for oral advocacy

The Faculty will continue to encourage mooting among our students and support their participation and success in these competitions.

## **6. Quality Assurance of Teaching and Learning**

Quality assurance mechanisms are in place to ensure that we deliver quality legal education to best serve the community.

To ensure the quality of our courses the Faculty administers teaching evaluation surveys to students to collect their feedback in a systematic manner. The Assistant Dean/LLB Programme Director and the Deputy LLB Programme Director meet LLB representatives from each year in each academic term to collect students' views and concerns in relation to teaching and learning. The Faculty responds to all student questions and concerns through written answers distributed to all students. A "staff-student consultative committee" has been established since 2019 to allow students to engage in conversations with one another as well as with teaching staff regarding their concerns in relation to all aspects of their studies and

university life. The Faculty will continue to work closely with our students to aid independent learning and ensure the best learning environment.

There is rigorous internal moderation of course outlines and exams. All new courses require a detailed outline and plan and must be approved by both the Committee on Undergraduate and Graduate Studies and the Faculty Board. Each semester, exam panels are convened to review proposed exam questions for quality and consistency. The Assistant Dean/LLB Programme Director and the Deputy LLB Programme Director then review all the exam questions a second time. This double-layer of review has proved effective in catching errors before the exams are printed and distributed to students. There is also an exam moderation procedure, under which two or three exam papers from each grading band and all failure grades will be marked again by a second member of staff, to ensure fairness and consistency.

## **7. Learning Resources**

Given the centrality of law reports, ordinances and scholarly writings to the study of law, the Faculty places great emphasis on its library resources. The Lee Quo Wei Law Library contains over 133,400 volumes and provides access to over 6,000 electronic law journals. There are 115 electronic legal databases available to students and staff. Wherever possible electronic format is the preferred option for books, law journals and serials. The Faculty is investing heavily in library materials to support future years of its law programmes.

## **8. Career Preparation**

The Academic Advisory System and the Distinguished Professional Mentorship Scheme provide pastoral care and support for our students. The Academic Advisory System ensures close faculty-student relations. The Distinguished Professional Mentors help link our students to the local practitioner community, providing an invaluable service in terms of helping them to understand and appreciate the working life of a legal practitioner, and obtain guidance as to their future career choices. The students also have access to alumni mentoring through the Faculty's e-mentoring programme.

Mr. Paul Mitchard, K.C., is Director of Career Planning and Professionalism. Together with the support the Faculty receives from local professionals, Mr. Mitchard provides our students with valuable guidance on career planning, job applications, interview techniques, professionalism and other matters relating to careers, including through a series of seminars matched to the stages of the annual recruitment rounds and through counselling sessions offered to students who require personalised assistance on career issues.

The Office of Career Planning and Professionalism has also continued to keep the Faculty's Virtual Careers Resource Centre up-to-date with a legal directory of law firms and chambers in Hong Kong and their information pertaining to their recruitment processes and offers. The Office also produces a biweekly newsletter on developments in legal business and arranges a series of career seminars, talks and workshops, delivered by international and local law firm associates and partners and members of the Hong Kong Bar. These events have been very well attended and well received by students.

Though the pandemic restrictions prevented us from conducting on-campus face-to-face career events and consultations, the Office remained actively engaged in providing career support online during the coronavirus outbreak.

## **9. Graduates**

As in previous years, the majority of our LLB graduates continue their PCLL studies at CUHK after completion of the LLB programme. Over 70% of our LLB graduates who applied for the PCLL programme at CUHK were admitted in 2022. Those not joining the PCLL programme pursued other postgraduate programmes in Hong Kong and abroad as well as other career paths.

Christopher Roberts  
Assistant Dean (Undergraduate Studies) and LLB Programme Director  
Faculty of Law  
The Chinese University of Hong Kong  
February 2023

**The Chinese University of Hong Kong  
Faculty of Law**

**Report on the PCLL Programme**

**(January to December 2022)**

**2021/2022 PCLL Programme**

**1. Admission and Completion Rates**

In the 2021 intake, we admitted 138 students to the PCLL. Including two students who were approved to defer studies from 2020/21 to the 2021/22 academic year, there were initially 140 students. Of these 140 students: one was approved to defer studies to the 2022/23 academic year. One was discontinued in accordance with the PCLL Assessment Regulations at the end of Term One. The remaining **138** students successfully completed the PCLL. The pass rate is a reflection of the quality of the students admitted to the Programme.

**2. Programme Delivery**

The teaching site for the 2021/22 Programme was our Graduate Law Centre in the Bank of America Tower, in Central. The Graduate Law Centre offers students a high quality learning environment. In addition to a Moot Court, we have a number of interactive lecture theatres and classrooms. These are all equipped with state-of-the-art facilities. There are also a number of breakout rooms available for student study and discussion. We retained the teaching model of a combination of Large Group Sessions and Small Group Sessions (LGSs and SGSs), as this has proved so effective in the past.

The same five core courses, as in previous years, were offered in Term One, namely: Professional Practice; Commercial Practice; Property and Probate Practice; Civil Litigation Practice; and Criminal Litigation Practice.

Thirteen elective courses were offered in Term Two/Summer Term. Out of these, the students had to select and complete five courses. The thirteen courses offered were: Writing and Drafting Litigation Documents\*; Conference Skills and Opinion Writing\*; Lending and Finance; Corporate Finance; Writing and Drafting Litigation Documents (in Chinese); China Practice; Writing and Drafting Commercial Documents (in Chinese); Alternative Dispute Resolution; Trial Advocacy\*; Writing and Drafting Commercial Documents; Personal Injuries Practice\*; Family Law Practice\* and Legal Practice and Technology.

Those students intending to enter pupillage as a barrister are required to study Trial Advocacy and two out of the other four Bar electives, marked above with asterisks. These five Bar electives are not confined to intending barristers. Many intending solicitors also chose to study one or more of these courses.

---

\* Bar Elective



With the exception of those teaching the Chinese language parts of the two Chinese drafting electives, nearly all teachers on the PCLL Programme are or have been practising lawyers. Throughout all of the courses, the emphasis was on the teaching of skills, and on the students' "learning by doing". On all courses the students were first taught skills which they would need in legal practice. They then practised those skills themselves in class exercises. Finally, they were assessed on those skills.

The PCLL Programme is rigorous. The students have to balance their time between different courses. In doing so they learn time management skills, which will be vital to them in practice.

### **3. Student Diversity**

The PCLL 2021/22 had a diverse student body. Of the 138 students admitted, 129 held local law qualifications while 9 held non-local law qualifications. Their academic backgrounds are as follows:

Law Qualifications	No. with overseas qualifications	No. with local qualifications	Total no. of students
Bachelor of Laws (LLB)	6	57	63
BA in Law	1	0	1
BA in Jurisprudence	2	0	2
Juris Doctor (JD)	0	72	72

While most of our students were local, we also had a number of students from the Mainland, who had qualified for admission by way of our Juris Doctor Programme, along with students who had studied for their law degrees in the UK.

### **4. Oversight by the Professions**

With the exception of Trial Advocacy, each PCLL course has assigned to it one or two external course assessors (ECAs), from the Law Society and the Bar Association. Both ECAs see the assessment papers before they are finalized. They are also sent a selection of marked answer scripts for review. These include all borderline and failed scripts, along with some of the highest-scoring scripts. Some of the Law Society ECAs attend Large Group and Small Group sessions of their choice. They provide written reports to the Law Society and to the Faculty on the teaching they have observed and the course materials used in the classes. The Director carefully studies their comments and passes them on to the teachers involved.

Students also give feedback on the courses and their teachers which is assessed by the Faculty with follow-up action taken if deemed necessary.

### **5. Contribution by the Judiciary and the Professions**

We are also very fortunate to have the support of members of the judiciary and senior practitioners. By way of example, in our Trial Advocacy course in May 2022 we staged a demonstration of a trial held before a magistrate, in Cantonese. This involved a Magistrate (a

CUHK LAW alumna) and members of the Bar (also CUHK LAW alumni) acting as the advocates.

We have also had throughout the years numerous guest speakers from the judiciary and both branches of the profession. The teaching staff and the students greatly appreciate their contribution.

## **6. Placement of the 2022 Graduates**

Our graduates in all fourteen years have been consistently placed in all areas of the legal profession following graduation. Our latest placement survey results comprise 94 student responses out of 138 graduates of the 2021/2022 cohort. The results show that over 90% have been employed by law firms or the Department of Justice, or have found places in sets of barristers' chambers.

### **2022/2023 PCLL Programme**

#### **Admissions for 2022/2023**

The Faculty received 294 applications to study for the PCLL in the academic year 2022/23. The Faculty made 157 offers which were accepted by 150 applicants. Of those accepting the offers, 147 were able to satisfy the pre-conditions and be admitted to the PCLL. Including one student who had been approved to defer studies to the 2022/23 academic year, the 2022/23 PCLL intake accordingly comprises **148** candidates.

With effect from the 2020-21 intake, we started to offer an alternative route to admit a limited number of PCLL candidates based on their academic strength supplemented by evidence of law-related working experience. One out of two eligible students was admitted through the alternative route in the academic year 2020-21. In the academic year 2021-22, two out of two eligible applicants were admitted. These students managed to pass the PCLL. In the academic year 2022-23, one out of two eligible applicants were admitted. We will continue to monitor the performance of students admitted to the PCLL through this route.

#### **Conclusion**

We believe that the emphasis we place on the acquisition of skills throughout the Programme produces graduates who will be useful and professional members of a legal team, from the very first day of their traineeship or pupillage. The feedback we have had from the professions on the quality of our PCLL graduates whom they have taken on as trainees or pupils bears this out.

We now have fourteen years of past PCLL intakes to build upon. We shall continue to develop and improve our Programme, so that our graduates will be able to meet the future challenges of legal practice in Hong Kong.

Dennis Hie  
PCLL Programme Director  
Faculty of Law  
The Chinese University of Hong Kong  
February 2023

**The Chinese University of Hong Kong  
Faculty of Law**

**Report on the Juris Doctor Programme**

**(January to December 2022)**

**1. Background**

The Juris Doctor (JD) is a graduate entry programme. CUHK LAW designed and offered it as a response to the recommendation of the *Redmond-Roper Report* “that there should be opportunity for mature age students, and graduates in other disciplines, to study law - both for equity and access reasons and for the richness and diversity this brings to the law schools and the legal profession” (*Report*, 11.4 at p. 271).

**2. Teaching philosophy and structure**

CUHK LAW teaches the JD exclusively at graduate level. JD students thus enjoy a dedicated programme. They share some courses with other students (i.e. those reading for the Master of Laws (LLM) and a small number of exchange and associate students).

CUHK LAW examines the JD as a graduate programme. Students thus must perform to graduate standards.

**3. Admission requirements**

CUHK LAW required applicants for admission to the 2022-23 JD to have:

- (i) graduated from a recognised university and obtained a bachelor's degree in a non-law subject or a law degree from a non-common law jurisdiction, normally with honours not lower than Second Class; or
- (ii) graduated from an honours programme of a recognised university with a bachelor's degree in a non-law subject or a law degree from a non-common law jurisdiction, normally achieving an average grade of not lower than "B" in undergraduate courses; or
- (iii) completed a course of study in a tertiary educational institution and obtained professional or similar qualifications equivalent to an honours degree.

Applicants must also have satisfied the JD’s English Language Proficiency Requirement by:

- possessing a bachelor's degree obtained by completing a programme of study in Hong Kong or an English-speaking country, or which was taught primarily in the English language; or

- achieving a result of Band 7.5 or better in the International English Language Testing System (IELTS), which result was obtained not more than two years prior to the date of applying to join the JD; or
- achieving a result of 600 (Paper Based Test), or 100 (Internet Based Test) or better in the Test of English as a Foreign Language (TOEFL), which result was obtained not more than two years prior to the date of applying to join the JD; or
- producing alternative evidence of English proficiency equivalent to one of the preceding measures.

#### **4. Programme philosophy and structure**

The JD is an intellectually enriching general education in law. It offers various Faculty core courses (details of which are below). It offers all subjects that the Hong Kong legal professions stipulate as pre-requisites for admission to the Postgraduate Certificate in Laws (PCLL). It also allows candidates to read a wide range of challenging elective courses in the common law, Chinese law, comparative law, international law and the law of trade, business and finance.

The JD consists of 72 credit units (a standard semester-length course being 3 credit units). Students have an average of 3 contact hours per week with teachers in each course. Students entering the JD complete it in full-time mode or part-time mode.

Full-time mode students can finish the JD in 24 months by completing courses in each summer term. Full-time students may take up to 48 months to complete the JD.

Part-time mode students can complete their studies in 42 months (although students may, in exceptional circumstances, apply to accelerate their studies and complete the JD in 36 months on CUHK LAW's recommendation and with the Graduate Council's permission). CUHK LAW lets part-time students take up to 84 months to complete the JD. The JD is currently the only qualifying law degree offered in part-time mode by a Hong Kong university.

To graduate, students must complete five Faculty-required courses. These are *LAWS6001 Legal System*, *LAWS6004 Legal Research, Analysis and Writing*, *LAWS6006 Comparative Legal Studies*, *LAWS6007 Ethics and Jurisprudence*, and either *LAWS6901 Independent Research* or *LAWS6902 Independent Research Dissertation*. These required components give JD students the essential foundational knowledge and skills for a well-rounded general legal education and a first-hand appreciation of the relationship between the legal system and the broader community that it serves and regulates.

Students aspiring to become Hong Kong-qualified barristers or solicitors must pursue particular courses mandated by the Hong Kong legal professions. Passing these courses entitles students to apply for admission to the PCLL Programme. These courses are also open to students who do not plan to apply for the PCLL.

In addition to the five required courses, CUHK LAW offers JD elective courses from a wide range of intellectually stimulating and professionally enhancing offerings. This arrangement enables students to complete their degrees and professional requirements while enhancing their range of courses and thus their academic and professional opportunities.

## JD Courses

CUHK LAW structures the JD to accommodate the interests both of those who intend to enter the legal profession and those who are reading the JD for other reasons. The JD comprises a mixture of required and elective courses:

### (i) Required courses

- Legal System
- Legal Research, Analysis and Writing
- Comparative Legal Studies#
- Ethics and Jurisprudence
- Independent Research\* OR Independent Research Dissertation\*

# Students may take *Legal Technologies* to substitute *Comparative Legal Studies*.

\* Students must complete either *Independent Research* (3 credits) or *Independent Research Dissertation* (6 credits).

### (ii) Elective Courses

#### (a) Elective Courses Required for admission to the PCLL Programme

- |                                    |                                   |
|------------------------------------|-----------------------------------|
| - Principles of Administrative Law | - Principles of Equity and Trusts |
| - Principles of Commercial Law     | - Principles of Evidence          |
| - Principles of Company Law        | - Principles of Land Law          |
| - Principles of Constitutional Law | - Principles of Property Law      |
| - Principles of Contract           | - Principles of Tort              |
| - Principles of Criminal Law       |                                   |

#### (b) Other Elective Courses

The Faculty offers an extensive list of electives in the JD (which ones are offered depends on teacher availability and sufficient student interest). Other elective courses include:

- Business and the Law in Hong Kong
- Business Taxation: Principles and Practice
- Chinese Civil Law
- Chinese Company Law
- Chinese Contract Law
- Chinese Energy Law
- Chinese Environmental Law
- Chinese Financial Law
- Chinese Intellectual Property Law
- Chinese Investment Law
- Chinese Law and Society in an Age of Digital Technologies and Artificial Intelligence
- Chinese Law on Corporate Finance
- Chinese Tax Law
- Clean Technology Law
- Colonial Governance and the Rule of Law

- Common Law: Origins and Development
- Conflict of Laws
- Conflicts in International Commercial Litigation
- Copyright, Digital Subject Matter and Information Technology
- European Union Law
- International and Comparative Energy Law
- International and Comparative Intellectual Property Law
- International Environmental Law
- International Financial and Banking Law
- International Investment Law Policy and Development
- International Legal Advocacy I
- International Legal Advocacy II
- International Taxation
- Issues in Contract
- Issues in Human Rights
- Issues in Tort
- Law and Practice of Investment Arbitration
- Law of International Business Transactions I
- Law of International Business Transactions II
- Legal System and Methods in China
- Legal Technologies
- Merger Control
- Oil and Gas Law
- Principles of Art, Antiquities, Cultural Heritage and the Law
- Principles of Aviation Law
- Principles of Civil Procedure
- Principles of Competition Law
- Principles of Corporate Insolvency
- Principles of Criminal Procedure
- Principles of Employment Law
- Principles of Environmental Law
- Principles of Family Law
- Principles of Information and Privacy Law
- Principles of Intellectual Property
- Principles of Mediation
- Principles of Remedies
- Principles of Revenue Law
- Principles of Securities Regulation
- Principles of Unjust Enrichment
- Shipping Law
- The Law of Electronic Commerce
- The Laws and Legal System of the United States
- Trans-national Legal Problems
- World Trade Law

## 5. Student intake

The JD has proved to be a highly competitive programme. In the 2022-23 academic year, the programme received 619 applications meeting minimum admission requirements (483 applications for full-time mode and 136 applications for part-time mode). The admission requirements in section 3 above, are minimum requirements. In the 2022-23 intake, CUHK LAW did not offer places to a large proportion of applicants who satisfied these. The JD attracts students of the highest quality, and the student body is a rich and diverse mixture of well-educated fresh graduates and seasoned professionals who have already achieved considerable success in their fields. In 2022 CUHK LAW admitted 181 students, these being the top segment of applicants.

No. of applications received for academic year 2022-23 (full-time mode)	530
No. of students admitted for academic year 2022-23 (full-time mode)	121
No. of applications received for academic year 2022-23(part-time mode)	179
No. of students admitted for academic year 2022-23 (part-time mode)	60

All JD students admitted in 2022-23 hold at least an Upper 2<sup>nd</sup> bachelor's degree or a credit master's degree (or equivalent):

Band 1	30% (55)
Band 2	25% (45)
Band 3	45% (81)
Total	100% (181)

Band 1: 1<sup>st</sup> class bachelor's degree; or Cumulative GPA 3.5 (4-point scale) where no class of honours awarded; or PhD; or equivalent.

Band 2: Borderline 1<sup>st</sup> class bachelor's degree; or Cumulative GPA 3.4 (4-point scale) where no class of honours awarded; or master (Distinction); or equivalent.

Band 3: Upper 2<sup>nd</sup> class bachelor's degree; or Cumulative GPA 3.2-3.3 (4-point scale) where no class of honours awarded; or master (Credit); or equivalent.

As noted above, many JD students take the Programme to help them in their existing careers or to enhance their skills; they have no intention of entering the legal profession. Most part-time students are professionals with qualifications. These include qualifications such as Certified Anti-Money Laundering Specialist (CAMS), Certified Fraud Examiner (CFE), Certified Healthcare Simulation Educator (CHSE), Certified Management Accountant (CMA), Certified Private Banker (CPB), Certified Public Accountant (CPA), Chartered

Financial Analyst (CFA), Registered Professional Engineer (RPE) and Registered Social Worker (RSW).

Some students are members of professional bodies. These include Member of Hong Kong Institution of Engineers (MHKIE), Member of Institution of Civil Engineers (MICE), Member of the Chartered Institute of Arbitrators (MCI Arb) or registered professional in various disciplines for instance in engineer and social work.

In 2017 CUHK LAW and the CUHK Business School jointly introduced the BBA-JD Double Degree Programme. In 2022-23, the BBA-JD Programme admitted 24 year one students. Students in the BBA-JD Programme must achieve a second upper class honours in their BBA to be eligible to enroll in the JD. In July 2022, we had 15 BBA-JD students from the first cohort graduated in the Programme.

In 2018 CUHK LAW and The Dickson Poon School of Law of the King's College London (KCL) jointly introduced the Dual LLB-JD Degree Programme. Students in the LLB-JD Programme must satisfactorily complete all the KCL LLB Degree requirements for graduation and obtain an overall result which is equivalent to a Second Class Honours Upper Division and achieve a minimum CGPA of 2.0 in all JD courses taken at CUHK in the third year in order to be eligible to enrol in the JD. In 2022-23, 1 student from LLB-JD Degree Programme had completed her first 2-year studies at KCL and is now taking CUHK JD courses as an Associate student in her third year of studies. 2 students are now in their fourth year of studies and are expected to complete the Dual LLB-JD Degree Programme by July 2023.

## **6. Library**

Given the centrality of law reports, ordinances and scholarly writings to the study of law, the Faculty places great emphasis on its library resources. The Lee Quo Wei Law Library contains over 134,200 volumes and access to over 6,000 electronic law journals. There are 113 electronic legal databases available to students and staff. Wherever possible electronic format is the preferred option for books, law journals and serials. The Faculty is investing heavily in library materials to support future years of its law programmes.

The Lee Quo Wei Law Library houses the main law collection. The Legal Resources Centre (LRC) at the Graduate Law Centre (GLC), where JD teaching takes place, contains a short loan collection and a small collection of law reports and reference materials. CUHK LAW retains a daily courier service that provides research materials students need at the GLC.

The Law Library has developed an extensive array of resource guides and indices that are accessible via the Library website. Both locations provide reference services. CUHK LAW also includes Information Literacy in the JD curriculum.

## **7. Physical accommodation**

CUHK LAW teaches the JD at the GLC in Central. The GLC, covering 35,000 sq. feet, includes three lecture theatres, a state-of-the-art-moot court, small breakout rooms, multi-purpose classrooms, dedicated computer facilities and its Legal Resources Centre. The GLC's location in Central has proven ideal for organising events with practitioners in the



legal profession. Throughout the year, the JD students benefit from a wide offering of talks, information sessions and other events with prominent law firms, barristers' chambers, as well as members of the judiciary, government departments and other members of the legal industry.

## **8. Concluding Remarks**

The CUHK JD is now a well-established feature of the Hong Kong legal education landscape. JD students routinely receive job placement offers from top international and local law firms. Many undertake pupillage and develop careers at the Hong Kong bar. Some move on to further studies, often competing strongly in the world's most venerated universities (among them Oxbridge and the Ivy League). Others embark on or continue careers in other walks of Hong Kong or overseas. These fields include banking, commerce, academia and government. JD students are, as a whole, highly qualified and highly motivated. Classes are interactive, with students bringing expertise and experience to enrich the learning environment, both within and outside the classroom. Student satisfaction with the JD, which the University's Centre for Learning Enhancement and Research independently monitors, is very high. Students on the JD have taken the initiative to set up the Graduate Law Students Association and organised activities, which the Faculty supports, to benefit the student body. Mooting teams including JD students represent the Faculty at both regional and international competitions and have achieved outstanding results.

Some JD students will not choose a career in law. They continue to contribute to their respective professions – among them banking and finance, government, journalism and academia – and are all the better armed with all they have learned during their JD education.

Some JD students will choose to continue their studies in the PCLL Programme. In 2022-23, 118 JD graduates applied for admission to the CUHK PCLL Programme and 75% of them were successful. Those who progress to the PCLL have a great deal to offer the legal profession. They will continue to help answer the call in the Redmond Roper Report for increased diversity of practitioners in Hong Kong.

### **Elliot Fung**

JD Programme Director  
Faculty of Law  
The Chinese University of Hong Kong  
February 2023

# Annexure 5



## Department of Law The University of Hong Kong

### Report on the LLB and JD Programmes to the Standing Committee on Legal Education and Training

(January to December 2022)

In spite of the ongoing pandemic, the Department has continued to make great efforts to provide high-quality teaching to our students and is glad to report more than satisfactory progress overall.

#### 1. Admissions 2022-2023

The Bachelor of Laws (LLB) is the flagship programme of the Department of Law. It consistently admits the best and brightest students notwithstanding keen competition both locally and abroad. As such, the LLB and double-degree undergraduate programmes remain signature programmes of HKU, international recognition of which is evidenced by our robust admission figures.

The LLB is one of the top ten programmes at HKU and among the most competitive programmes across all tertiary institutions in Hong Kong. It has attracted excellent students through both the local Diploma of Secondary Education (DSE) scheme and the non-Joint University Programmes Admissions Scheme (non-JUPAS) routes.

To attract top students, we have established dual degree or double pathway programmes, which give students a wider range of options. For example, in 2016-2017, the Faculty introduced a dual LLB programme with University College London (UCL), which enables the students to obtain an LLB degree in both the UK and Hong Kong when they graduate upon completion of the 4 year program. In light of the growing interest in Chinese law, we have also introduced a 5-year dual LLB programme with Peking University (PKU) Law School in the Academic Year of 2019-2020. In 2022, we also introduced a new dual degree BSc & LLB Programme; the first batch of 12 students were admitted to this new Programme.

Furthermore, we have also established a pathways programme with King's College London (KCL) whereby students are able to obtain an LLB with HKU followed by an LLM with KCL. Similar arrangements have been made with the University of New South Wales (UNSW) and the National University of Singapore (NUS), buttressing HKU's established reputation for international excellence.

A total of 107 students were admitted to undergraduate programmes: 59 through the JUPAS scheme (including 4 to the HKU-PKU programme and 1 to the HKU-UCL programme); 43

through the non-JUPAS admissions process (including 3 to the HKU-PKU programme and 4 to the HKU-UCL programme); 4 through Mainland recruitment; and 1 through internal transfer.

In addition, 151 students were admitted to the four dual degree programmes: 87 to the BBA(Law) & LLB; 37 to the BSocSc (Govt & Laws) & LLB; 15 to the BA & LLB; and 12 to the BSc&LLB.

All these programmes continue to maintain outstanding admission standards.

Students in the JD programme come from diverse educational and other backgrounds. A large number of students received their undergraduate or graduate education at leading universities in North America or the UK. A significant, and increasing, number of JD students come from the Mainland and local universities. Over the years, we have also admitted a considerable number of students with significant professional experience.

JD admissions figures this year continue to be strong. We admitted 53 students from over 315 applications. Student profiles are diverse, with 40 fresh graduates and 13 with work experience.

### **Exchange**

The Faculty of Law has established academic links with 125 major universities in many parts of the world which allow students to participate in a rich variety of exchange programmes. We have therefore been well positioned to accommodate the demand of students for academic and cultural exchange over the past few years. Current figures for out-going law students comprise 113 students, undertaking studies in 11 countries, mostly in the UK (56), Canada (25), and USA (10). No virtual exchange was conducted.

At the postgraduate level, we have established an exchange arrangement with Pennsylvania Law School, whereby HKU JD students can spend an extra year at Pennsylvania to earn an LLM degree. Two students were admitted to this Programme. We are currently moving towards establishing further exchange opportunities with even more overseas institutions to broaden our students' exposure to other legal systems, equipping them with the necessary skills for complex, cross-border and international legal practice.

### **Curriculum**

Starting from Academic year 2021-2022, in order to provide more options for our senior year LLB students, the Department has cross-listed several LLM elective courses.

The LLB students may choose to specialize in one of the following streams, namely (i) PRC law; (ii) commercial, corporate and financial law; and (iii) international trade and economic law. They may also study a minor in another discipline.

Mooting has been introduced as a compulsory capstone course to integrate knowledge and skills across the curricula for all students. Building on the successful experience of the past few years of sending our LLB students to Shanghai to study the compulsory Introduction to Chinese Law course, we are exploring opportunities to collaborate with mainland universities in other cities for intensive teaching of the same course. The Shanghai programme was

suspended due to the pandemic and we hope to resume the programme in 2023 when the situation improves.

The Department promotes experiential learning for students to develop practical skills and to learn law in action. The Clinical Legal Education course and other experiential courses including the Social Justice Internship (in both Hong Kong and Mainland China), the Global Migration Legal Clinic, the Disability Rights Clinic, and the Law, Innovation, Technology and Entrepreneurship (LITE) Lab have all been in high demand. The Faculty has successfully recruited five full-time teaching-track staff for experiential learning during the academic year of 2019-2020, which further strengthens our student experiential learning programme. The ultimate goal is that all LLB students will be able to undergo experiential learning during their studies.

The JD is a two-year programme. The bulk of the programme consists of compulsory courses, which cover the fundamentals of the common law. It provides students with a breadth and depth of legal knowledge that enables them to gain admission to the PCLL in a comparatively short period of time. A wide range of electives is available to JD students to fulfill the requirements of taking at least one elective from a variety of Chinese law offerings and one from the “International, Comparative and Theoretical Perspectives in Law” grouping. The Department has continued to take steps during the last review to implement the proposals in the Report of the Review Panel for our JD programme and we are actively preparing for the upcoming internal review next year.

### **Career Advice**

The current in-house Career Development Advisor provides individual career advice consultation sessions to our students. In addition, we run a mentorship programme that matches students with the Faculty’s alumni as part of an informal curriculum.

### **Staffing**

Our staff has been able to offer a wide range of electives in the undergraduate programmes. The Faculty has been actively searching for academic staff at different levels. Eight new academic staff joined the Department in 2022. It is expected that more new staff will be able to join the Department in 2023.

### **Conclusion**

While our LLB and JD programmes are firmly established as among the best law programmes in Hong Kong and abroad, we acknowledge the need to maintain and enhance the competitiveness of our programmes. The Department is aware of the significant challenges facing legal educators, including the need for ongoing curriculum review to meet the changing demands of society and concerns about job opportunities. We will continue to take special measures to ensure that the rigour and diversity of teaching will not be compromised and we shall extend our efforts to provide additional support to students in terms of career advice. We look forward to meeting the challenges and to capitalizing on the opportunities ahead.

Professor Yun ZHAO  
Head, Department of Law  
February 2023

## **Report on the HKU PCLL**

January – December 2022

### Overview

1. The epidemic had continued to impact on teaching and learning of, as well as assessments in, the PCLL at HKU. In the midst of the fifth wave of COVID-19 hitting the city during the second semester of the academic year 2021/22, our Large Group Sessions (LGs) remained recorded while more of the teachers used live webinars and tested new ideas to make the recordings more interactive and engaging. The Small Group Sessions (SGs) were held online, typically via Zoom. As in the previous two academic years, all examinations in April/May 2022, as well as supplementary ones in July/August 2022, were conducted online proctored with the same system and software. With the understanding and support of the professional bodies, we succeeded in bringing another academic year to its end in time with no delay in graduation.
2. The first semester of the academic year 2022/2023 saw the return of face-to-face learning in SGs while, for pedagogical reasons, we have been utilising technologies in the delivery of our LGs to make overall learning even more effective from the students' perspective.

### Assessments and examination results 2021/22

3. The first-attempt pass rate in the full-time PCLL dropped to 80.6% (compared with 86.9% in 2020/21) but remained still within the acceptable and normal first-attempt pass rate of about 80% in comparable Legal Practice courses elsewhere. The first-attempt pass rate of part-time Year 2 further dropped to about 59.4% (compared with 61.1% in 2020/21), a record low, while the same of part-time Year 1 remained fluctuating over the years, with 67.9% in 2021/22 (compared with 66.3% in 2020/21). The pass rate after the supplementary exams in July/August were 97.1% (full-time), 89.4% (part-time Year 1) and 95.9% (part-time Year 2). The Board of Examiners awarded overall distinction to the top 10% of the cohort among over 370 full-time and part-time Year 2 students in total. Among the top ten students, all except one are HKU law graduates, holding an LLB, a mixed-degree LLB or a joint-LLB degree with UCL.

### Admissions 2022/2023

4. There were over 800 applications from 599 applicants, of whom 532 applicants designated HKU as first preference. Applicants, as in the past, had to make separate applications to the full-time and part-time programmes and many of them applied for both.
5. As one of the ways to address the perceived issue of the PCLL being the 'bottleneck' to the legal profession, we have prepared for a maximum of 300 full-time and 100

part-time students to the HKU PCLL if the quality of applicants so warranted. However, we have not been able to fill up all our places.

6. The number of PCLL students admitted in September 2022 was 285 to the full-time course and 91 to the part-time course. We have a maximum number of 15 discretionary part-time places based on a balance of candidates' legal knowledge and full-time working experience, as well as interview performance ('the WE Route'). We filled up 12 of those places after interviewing 23 candidates. We invited two PCLL academic board members, Mr. Edward Chan SC and Mr. Brian Gilchrist, to sit in those interviews. The purpose of the invitation was to let the PCLL Academic Board (and the profession) have a better understanding of the WE Route and its operation.
7. We continued to allocate the government-funded full-time places, all on academic merit. HKU law graduates (including JD) took up about 60% of such places. Other categories of applicants, of which UK LLB graduates who were mostly Hong Kong permanent residents represented the largest proportion, shared the remaining government-funded places.
8. About 70% of the full-time intake held a HKU law degree. The proportion in the part-time programme was much lower, just about 10%. Graduates of the Common Professional Examination operated by MMU/SPACE filled up most of the remaining part-time places.

#### Curriculum and teaching

9. Mr. Justice Anderson Chow, the Chief External Examiner, gave his comprehensive report on the programme. He raised no concerns that required attention. Indeed, he commended that our PCLL "was professionally and smoothly run" and he believed that the students who had successfully completed our PCLL "are well equipped to enter the professional world".
10. We (and students) have had more experience in, and got more used to, on-line learning, especially of transactional knowledge. We continue to reflect on these strategies and explore better utilisation of on-line classes, for both contingency planning and the "new normal", for effective facilitation of students' learning in addition to face-to-face practical sessions which are undoubtedly irreplaceable and indispensable.
11. In 2022/23, Employment Law and Practice, Matrimonial Practice and Procedure and Commercial Disputes Resolution continue to be the three most popular electives. A total of 127 students, full-time and part-time, opted for Trial Advocacy Elective. We are planning to roll out an additional elective on Financial Regulations and Practice in 2023/24.

#### Looking ahead

12. We are committed to use our best endeavours to contribute to the continuous improvement of the system, as reasonably recommended by SCLET in its final review report and agreed among the stakeholders after deliberation, in all aspects of the

PCLL in order to better serve the public interest and to avoid any double (or even multiple) jeopardy to students. Meanwhile, we continue to seek the co-operation with the profession via the professional bodies, firms and chambers, as well as individual members of the profession for the better development of the HKU PCLL.

Wilson Chow  
Head, Department of Professional Legal Education  
Faculty of Law  
February 2023

## Annexure 6

### Key Statistics of the 2022/23 LLB, JD and PCLL Programmes of City University of Hong Kong The Chinese University of Hong Kong The University of Hong Kong

	<b>City University of Hong Kong</b>	<b>The Chinese University of Hong Kong</b>	<b>The University of Hong Kong</b>
No. of Admissions to the LLB Programme	49 (25 JUPAS students, 15 non-JUPAS local students and 9 non-local students (including 6 Mainland NUEE students))	73 (45 JUPAS students, 26 Non-JUPAS students, 2 Mainland students)	107 (59 JUPAS students, 43 Non-JUPAS students, 4 Mainland students and 1 internal transfer)
No. of Admissions to the JD Programme	102	121 (full-time) 60 (part-time)	53
No. of Admissions to the PCLL Programme	196	148	285 (full-time) 91 (part-time)
No. of Admissions to the Double Law Degree Programmes	N/A	N/A	87 (BBA (Law) & LLB) 37 (BSocSc (Govt & Laws) & LLB) 15 (BA (Literary Studies) & LLB)



# Annexure 7

## THE HONG KONG CONVERSION EXAMINATION BOARD

- Chairperson** : The Honourable Madam Justice Maggie POON Man-kay  
Court of First Instance of the High Court
- Members** : Mr. Edward CHAN King-sang, S.C., J.P.  
Hong Kong Bar Association
- Ms. Serina CHAN  
(from August 2018 to July 2022)
- Mr Christopher Yu  
(from August 2022)  
The Law Society of Hong Kong
- Dr. Richard WU Wai-sang  
The University of Hong Kong
- Mr. Ubaid REHMAN  
City University of Hong Kong
- Prof. Dennis HIE  
The Chinese University of Hong Kong
- Secretary** : Dr. John CRIBBIN  
HKU School of Professional and Continuing Education