LegCo Panel on Constitutional Affairs

A summary of views received on the Development of the Hong Kong Special Administrative Region's Political System

(as at 7 April 2000)

Person/body	System of government		
LC Paper	(Ministerial system, Executive-	Election of CE and LegCo	Others
No. CB(2)	Legislature relationship)	Members	
1. Dr Anthony B L CHEUNG, Head and Associate Professor, Department of Public and Social Administration, City University of Hong Kong 1076/99-00(01)	 CE should interpret BL restrictions on Major government policy advisory legislators. Chief Secretary to hold regular meet parties. Not practical to have overlapping meand to appoint party leaders to ExCob collective responsibility of ExCo. ExCo Members should be more visib full-time ExCo Members and undesiral portfolios. Appointment of principal officials on by the second CE term. They should be ExCo Members. 	committees should be opened to etings with leaders of major LegCo embership between ExCo and LegCo because of the rules of confidence and le politically. But unrealistic to have ble for them to be in charge of policy political contracts may be introduced	Political parties are not highly relevant to the existing political order which is built on an executive-led system.

D // 1		Ţ
Person/body LC Paper No. CB(2)	System of government (Ministerial system, Executive- Legislature relationship) Election of CE and LegCo Members	Others
	 Long term solutions - Both CE and LegCo are to be elected by universal suffrage so that each can claim to derive political mandate and legitimacy from the people and there is a genuine balance of power and authority. (There should not be undue worry of keeping an executive-led system within a democratic form of government as both the British Westminster model and the US-style presidential system feature a strong executive government). Removal of constitutional restrictions on private Member's bills. Ways to move to a democratically elected LegCo - All 60 LegCo seats directly elected on a GC basis, or 30 seats directly elected on a GC basis and the remaining 30 seats on a territory-wide single-list system, or 30 seats directly elected on a GC basis and 30 FC seats on a universal franchise basis (Each voter is eligible to vote in both one GC and one FC). To allay concerns of the business community about direct election, the number of LegCo seats can be increased to say 100 or 120 to provide greater chance for elite members of the community to be elected to LegCo under the proportional representation voting system. 	

Person/body LC Paper No. CB(2)	,	Election of CE and LegCo Members	Others
	• All ministerial posts (Chief Secretary, Justice and other secretaries, but not Confunctional principal official posts stipula turned into political appointments whose the CE. These appointees should be passist him full time in leading and appointees can come from both civil servants should leave the civil service at Role of ExCo needs to be re-examined as	ommissioner of Police and similar ated in the BL) should preferably be term should coincide with that of politically in alliance with CE and directing the government. While service and private sector, civil and be recruited on contract terms.	
2. Mr YU Tong 1076/99-00(02)	• Executive-led system of government is ineffective and should be abolished.	• Existing electoral system is outdated and should be changed.	
3. Hong Kong Christian Institute 1076/99-00(03)	 CE and principal officials should be accountable to the Legislature. CE should appear before LegCo 6-8 times a year to answer questions. 	government should be introduced soonest. A referendum on the matter can be conducted by the Government and supervised by the United Nations.	

Person/body	System of government		
LC Paper	(Ministerial system, Executive-	Election of CE and LegCo	Others
No. CB(2)	Legislature relationship)	Members	
		• 60 LegCo Members should be returned by 60 GCs under a "one person, one vote" and simple majority voting system in 2000 or 2004 the latest.	
*4. Professor Joseph Y S CHENG, Professor of Political Science, City University of Hong Kong 1111/99-00(02)	political parties to control a majority "executive-led government" advocate is no incentive to reform as the HK majority support in LegCo and the political crisis. • A "ministerial system" of appointing servants from the private sector Another option for managing the civi	is already an established practice. il service which can be introduced at ion is to offer contracts to top civil todel. This may further justify the t system throughout the civil service. all parties to introduce important bills ge to the "executive-led" system of the preceived to be influential. CE can	Also gives an analysis of the HKSAR's political development and system.

Person/body LC Paper No. CB(2)	System of government (Ministerial system, Executive- Legislature relationship)	Election of CE and LegCo Members	Others
	 It is entirely feasible for the Govern reform until 2007 and even then, to lim in the number of directly-elected seats difficulties likely to be faced by the exa result of further democratization, community in the territory and the compolitical reform remain to be the obtained The initial stage of further democrate problems than solutions to the Government of the review in 2007 will be to expanse seats, and increase the number of direction where the interested in the pursuit of stability and sense of civic-mindedness will never a Active political participation among encouraged. 	nit the reforms to a moderate increase in LegCo. The "China factor", the recutive branch of the government as the conservatism of the business inmunity's lukewarm attitude towards estacles to democratic development. The proportion of directly-elected seats and the size of the Legislature to 90 thy elected seats to 60. Cal reforms? A community mainly diprosperity and which lacks a strong make Hong Kong a world-class city.	
5. Miss Eliza W Y LEE, Associate Professor, Department of Government & Public Administration,	Whether the ministerial system can enhance executive leadership, political accountability and political neutrality depends on the kind of political institutions the ministerial system is operated under. The adoption of a ministerial system is an		Also provides information on the political systems in the UK, USA, France and Germany.

Person/body LC Paper No. CB(2)	System of government (Ministerial system, Executive- Legislature relationship)	Election of CE and LegCo Members	Others
the Chinese University of Hong Kong 1111/99-00(03)	 indispensable part of the further development of a democratic system. However, adopting a ministerial system now will not bring about much improvement in the quality of governance immediately. In fact, things may get worse before they get any better. There are three common sources of ministers: political parties, the private sector and the civil service. If a minister system is implemented in HK, the option of appointing civil servants as ministers seems to be the most practicable one. In the long run, the choice of personnel is related to the kind of representative system that will be adopted in Hong Kong. 		
6. Mr K Y SHAW 1111/99-00(04)	Non civil servants appointed as principal officials should be on contract terms.	 CE should be elected by universal suffrage in 2012, using a simple majority voting system. The earliest time for all LegCo Members to be elected on a GC 	As BL does not have provisions on referendum, LegCo should enact legislation in this respect. Only constitutional issues may become the subject for referendum.

Person/body LC Paper No. CB(2)	System of government (Ministerial system, Executive- Legislature relationship)	Election of CE and LegCo Members	Others
		basis will be 2011. The delineation of GC boundaries is open to discussion, and the number of seats in a GC should be in direct proportion to the population of the GC.	
7. Dr LI Pang- kwong, Assistant Professor of Department of Politics and Sociology, Lingnan University & Director of the Research and Survey Programme of	 To endorse party politics; To co-opt elite members of the government and statutory bodies; To abolish the voting system of Members; 	 To co-opt elite members of the community in committees of the government and statutory bodies; To abolish the voting system on motions and bills introduced by Members; 	
Lingnan University 1130/99-00(01) & 1133/99-00(01) (Circulation restricted to Members only)	- To return CE by "popular election"	" .	 Election of CE and all LegCo Members by universal suffrage should be implemented as soon as possible; Persons responsible for formulation of policies (CE,

Person/body LC Paper No. CB(2)	System of government (Ministerial system, Executive- Legislature relationship)	Election of CE and LegCo Members	Others
			ExCo Members, principal officials) should resign if they have committed major policy mistakes;
			- However, respondents generally do not support political appointment of members of political parties to be principal officials. They generally support appointment of civil servants and persons not affiliated with political parties to be principal officials.
8. Hong Kong Institute of Real Estate Administration 1133/99-00(02)		FC system has its merits and should be retained. Democratic development should be introduced progressively in accordance with the timetable of BL.	
9. A Hong Kong citizen 1133/99-00(03)		Both CE and LegCo Members should be appointed.	

Person/body LC Paper No. CB(2)	System of government (Ministerial system, Executive- Legislature relationship)	Election of CE and LegCo Members	Others
10. Democratic Party 1133/99-00(04)		 All LegCo Members to be directly elected in 2004. In the absence of direct election, "one person, one vote" system is the most simple and effective voting system. However, the proportional representation system is acceptable if direct election is introduced in 2004. CE to be elected by universal suffrage in 2002. Amendments should be made to the Basic Law as soon as possible to allow election of CE and LegCo Members by universal suffrage. 	 Reference is also made to surveys conducted by the Democratic Party in 1998 and 1999. The results indicate that - - 65% of the respondents support the return of CE by direct election in 2002 (1998 survey); and - 65% of the respondents support LegCo Members to be directly elected in 2000 (1999 survey).
11. Citizens Party 1141/99-00(01)		 HKSAR's political system requires a comprehensive reform rather than changes made on a piece-meal basis. Election of CE and all LegCo Members by universal suffrage is the ultimate constitutional goal. 	Community-wide discussions on political reform should start now. Constitutional convention is the most effective formal process for the community to achieve a consensus (A paper on "An Open Process for Community Discussion" submitted to the

Person/body LC Paper No. CB(2)	System of government (Ministerial system, Executive- Legislature relationship)	Election of CE and LegCo Members	Others
		Shares the public's inclination and advocates that CE should be elected by universal suffrage in 2002.	Panel is attached to the submission).
12. Hong Kong Association of Property Management Companies 1141/99-00(02)		 Not desirable to elect CE and all LegCo Members by universal suffrage in the next term. Democratic development should be implemented by means of a gradual and orderly process. 	
*13. Shun Tak Fraternal Association 1141/99-00(03)	system in HKSAR as outlined in the	future development of the political BL. The political structure set out in long term prosperity and stability of e political system now.	
*14. Pun Yue Industrial & Commercial		future development of the political are BL. Any radical approach would mmunity.	

Person/body LC Paper	System of government (Ministerial system, Executive-	Election of CE and LegCo	Others
No. CB(2) Fellowship Association Ltd. 1141/99-00(04)	Legislature relationship) Objects to any proposals to change the cha	Members e political system now.	
15. Ms FOK Chuiwan 1141/99-00(05)	Supports democratic development b and orderly.	ut implementation should be gradual	
16. 海外叟人 1141/99-00(06)			Makes comments on various provisions of the BL relating to the CE, the Executive Authorities and the Legislature
*17. Kwun Tong Resident Association 1141/99-00(07)	 Implementation of a "ministerial system" or a "party government" would contravene the BL and result in Hong Kong ruled by the mediocre. Not desirable to amend the BL at this stage. Supports a gradual process of political development and the continuation of an "executive-led" system. 	 elected by universal suffrage. Composition of LegCo before 2007 should follow that outlined in the BL. Not appropriate to decide on 	

Person/body LC Paper No. CB(2)	System of government (Ministerial system, Executive- Legislature relationship)	Election of CE and LegCo Members	Others
	• Can improve the Executive- Legislature relationship by enhancing communication between the two branches and by appointing outside persons as senior principal officials on contract basis.	point in time. A review should be conducted in 2007. Proposals can be made after the community has arrived at a consensus on the matter.	
18. Messrs TANG Kwan-chi and WONG Man- chong 1141/99-00(08) (Revised)		• Election of CE and LegCo Members by universal suffrage should only be introduced after implementation of 12-year free education.	• Also makes comments on the qualifications; terms of office; and allowances of CE and LegCo Members, village representative elections as well as other related issues (constitutional conventions and regulation of political parties).
*19. Mr Anthony K W LAW Lecturer of School of Law, City University of Hong Kong 1155/99-00(02)	 Implementation of a "ministerial system" should be considered carefully. Appointment of principal officials on contract basis might affect the morale of civil service. LegCo Members should be appointed as ExCo Members in turn. 	 CE should be elected by universal suffrage in 2008, using a simple majority voting system Reforms to the existing composition of LegCo should be introduced as soon as possible. The FC system should be reformed or abolished. 	

Person/body LC Paper No. CB(2)	System of government (Ministerial system, Executive- Legislature relationship)	Election of CE and LegCo Members	Others
*20. Dr J T H TANG Head of Department of Politics and Public Administration, the University of Hong Kong 1155/99-00(03)	 HKSAR's principal officials (i.e. Secretaries of policy bureaux) can be regarded as "ministers" who are officers entrusted with the management and administration of a division of governmental activities. The major difference between them and ministers of other democratic systems is that most of Hong Kong's "ministers" are also career civil servants. The difficulties in the Executive and Legislature relationship should not be exaggerated as the two institutions have managed their differences by engaging in the usual political give-and-take. But the Executive will find it increasingly difficult to maintain an executive-led style of governance without risking its political credibility if it does not have institutionalized political support and higher degree of legitimacy. 	 In the long run, it is the best solution for Hong Kong people to be able to elect CE and LegCo Members through universal suffrage. Political experiences all over the world have demonstrated that direct elections are a necessary step in realizing the vision presented by CE in his first policy address. 	Gives an analysis of the HKSAR's political system and a comparison between the political systems in Germany, France and Switzerland.

Person/body LC Paper No. CB(2)	System of government (Ministerial system, Executive- Legislature relationship)	Election of CE and LegCo Members	Others
*21. Dr LO Shiuhing Assistant Professor, Department of Politics and Public Administration, the University of Hong Kong 1155/99-00(04)	receive public views on political report in 2005. The committee survey or a referendum should be of the election of CE by universal streforms in LegCo; - LegCo should consider holding a from 2001 to 2006 to discuss of reform (seven topics proposed in a second consider holding a from 2001 to 2006 to discuss of reform (seven topics proposed in a second consider holding a from 2001 to 2006 to discuss of reform (seven topics proposed in a second consider holding a from 2001 to 2006 to discuss of reform (seven topics proposed in a second consider holding a from 2001 to 2006 to discuss of reform (seven topics proposed in a second consider holding a from 2001 to 2006 to discuss of reform (seven topics proposed in a second consider holding a from 2001 to 2006 to discuss of reform (seven topics proposed in a second consider holding a from 2001 to 2006 to discuss of reform (seven topics proposed in a second consider holding a from 2001 to 2006 to discuss of reform (seven topics proposed in a second consider holding a from 2001 to 2006 to discuss of reform (seven topics proposed in a second consider holding a from 2001 to 2006 to discuss of reform (seven topics proposed in a second consider holding a from 2001 to 2006 to discuss of reform (seven topics proposed in a second consider holding a second consider	political structure and the content of lic views on political reform - n independent committee in 2001 to reform with a view to producing a should decide whether an opinion conducted in 2006 on two key issues: uffrage and the scope of democratic series of constitutional conventions different topics concerning political the submission); and	 Constitutional conventions are important. It is necessary to consider whether constitutional conventions adopted before the handover should be maintained or even relaxed e.g. should the principle of "collective responsibility" be relaxed to allow more people with different political views to join the ExCo. More powers and responsibilities should be given to members of the District Councils. Allowing District Council members to be "ministers" in the 18 districts will train their political leadership from now to 2006.
22. Hong Kong Christian Council 1211/99-00(01)		Supports the election of CE by universal suffrage as early as possible under the parameters of the BL.	

Person/body LC Paper No. CB(2)	System of government (Ministerial system, Executive- Legislature relationship) Election Member	\mathcal{E}	Others
*23. Hong Kong Professional Teachers' Union 1284/99-00(01)	 Constitutional development is closely related to which is subject to restrictions under the BL. call to increase the pace of democratization is Government should have the determination Government about amending the BL in this rest. A pre-requisite for considering the implementation is the election of CE by universal suffrage. There will be no true accountability of the Election of the CE and all Members of LegCobe implemented as soon as possible. 	If there is a general public in Hong Kong, the HKSAR to discuss with the Central sect. Ition of a ministerial system executive to the Legislature on of ExCo.	
*24. Hong Kong Bar Association 1284/99-00(02)	government" in BL, if this means that the Executive shall prevail over LegCo. In fact, the constitutional framework clearly endorses the principle of separation of powers. BL 64 provides that the HKSAR Government is accountable to LegCo and the situations set out in BL 64 should not be exhaustive of the scope of the accountability. • BL form elect units that the HKSAR the will should not be exhaustive of the scope of the accountability.	of LegCo Members 68 requires a progress in the nation of LegCo towards tion of all Members by tersal suffrage. To freeze composition of LegCo as in its third term after 2008 be contrary to BL 68. ultimate aim of election of LegCo Members by tersal suffrage must be	<u></u>

Person/body LC Paper No. CB(2)	System of government (Ministerial system, Executive- Legislature relationship)	Election of CE and LegCo Members	Others
	of principal officials will require a system of sanction or removal from office.	achieved well before the end of the 50-year period guaranteed by BL.	
	The public should be widely consulted on any system of Executive Government, be it ministerial or otherwise. Any system adopted must comply with the requirement of accountability to both LegCo and the HKSAR as set out in BL.	 According to the Human Rights Committee, the electoral system for LegCo does not comply with the ICCPR. The concept of FC, which gives undue weight to the views of the business community, discriminates among voters on the basis of property and functions. Given the long history of direct election in Hong Kong, the interim nature of FC election and taking into account the international obligation under the ICCPR which is incorporated in BL 39, the requirement of progress in the political development in the HKSAR and the ultimate aim of direct election, LegCo should be constituted entirely by geographical election by universal suffrage after the third term. 	

Person/body	System of government	Election of CE and LocCo	Others
LC Paper No. CB(2)	(Ministerial system, Executive- Legislature relationship)	Election of CE and LegCo Members	Others
		• Alternatively, the people of Hong Kong should be given the opportunity to decide on this question, and the most appropriate means to do so is by way of a public referendum.	
		 Election of CE Given the short history of election of CE, the question of how the CE should be selected after 2007 is an appropriate subject for a public referendum. 	
		• The formation of the nomination committee for the selection of the CE should be open, transparent, participative, broadly representative of all walks of society and with a degree of check and balance. Any proposal must be easy to implement.	
		All members of the Election Committee should be returned by either direct or indirect election, and at least half of the	

Person/body LC Paper No. CB(2)	System of government (Ministerial system, Executive- Legislature relationship)	Election of CE and LegCo Members	Others
		members should be returned by GC election by universal suffrage.	
25. 1290/99-00(01) (Circulation restricted to Members only)			
26. The Frontier 1405/99-00(01)	 The executive should be accountable to the legislature. The legislature should have the power to raise questions on and veto the appointment of secretaries of policy bureaux 	 Objects to indirect elections of LegCo Members (such as FC and Election Committee elections) and selection of CE by a Election Committee. CE and all LegCo Members should be elected by universal suffrage as soon as possible. 	 The appointment system of DC members should be abolished. DC members should be elected by universal suffrage. HKSAR Government should establish a constitutional convention to consult the public on the relationship of the executive and legislature, the appointment of principal officials and the pace of democratization as soon as possible, with the ultimate aim of re-enacting the BL to achieve the principles of "Hong Kong people ruling Hong Kong" and "HKSAR exercises a high degree of autonomy".

Person/body LC Paper No. CB(2)	System of government (Ministerial system, Executive- Legislature relationship)	Election of CE and LegCo Members	Others
*27. Christian Joint Committee on Concern for Election 1422/99-00(01)		 CE should be elected by universal suffrage in 2002. All LegCo members should be elected by universal suffrage before or in 2004. Amendments should be made to Articles 45 and 68, Annexes I and II of the BL. HKSAR Government should consult the public on the future development of the political system and announce the timetable of consultation in 2000. The matter should eventually be decided by way of a referendum. 	
*28. Hong Kong Human Rights Monitor 1432/99-00(01)	A much wider debate on the form of government to be adopted by HKSAR is required.	 There is no justification for further delay in election of LegCo Members by universal suffrage. There are strong arguments that a CE who is indirectly elected through leading the majority 	• Hong Kong should hold a constitutional convention to work out future constitutional arrangements along the lines of the South African Constitutional Convention or the convention on the future of the monarchy held by Australia in 1998.

Person/body LC Paper No. CB(2)	System of government (Ministerial system, Executive- Legislature relationship)	Election of CE and LegCo Members	Others
		party in LegCo will be able to form a more stable and effective Government than one who is directly elected.	
*29. Mr Gordon Y S WU 1473/99-00(01)	 In Hong Kong, one-third of the popula exempt majority. With implemen system, taxpayers would not have their This situation of "taxation without taxpayers' confidence and threaten Hopast. Development of democracy should revolutionary process, as evidenced Hong Kong should implement the "ostep in order to achieve both democracy 	tation of a "one-person, one-vote" representation in LegCo guaranteed. t representation" would jeopardize long Kong's success achieved in the take an evolutionary rather than a by experiences in other countries. one-person, one-vote" system step by	
30. Mr Denis Edwards, Assistant Professor, School of Law (oral presentation at meeting on 21 February 2000)	 Constitutional conventions are important in the context of political accountability. Conventions and customs must be developed under the BL. To comply with the requirement of accountability to the HKSAR under BL 43, CE should appear before LegCo to answer questions on a more regular basis. 		Makes reference to different political systems.

Person/body LC Paper No. CB(2)	System of government (Ministerial system, Executive- Legislature relationship)	Election of CE and LegCo Members	Others
31. New Territories People's Association 1610/99-00(01)		 Election of all Members of LegCo by universal suffrage should be implemented in accordance with the principle of gradual and orderly progress as laid down in BL 68. Radical changes without regard to the actual situation in Hong Kong will cause instability to the community and hamper economic growth. The present electoral system provides channels for different interests to be represented in the LegCo, hence contributing to stability and the promotion of public participation in political affairs. 	
		• The ultimate aim of universal suffrage can only be satisfactorily achieved through a systematic approach to enhance political awareness and build up experience in election matters. It is pre-mature to introduce universal suffrage at	

Person/body LC Paper No. CB(2)	System of government (Ministerial system, Executive- Legislature relationship)	Election of CE and LegCo Members	Others
		this stage.	

Note: BL - Basic Law

CE - Chief Executive

ExCo - Executive Council

FC - functional constituency

GC -geographical constituency

HKSAR - Hong Kong Special Administrative Region

ICCPR - International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights

LegCo - Legislative Council

* Also give oral presentation to the Panel

C:\panel\CA\lib\0804\b1624e01